Module Title: The People's Health, c.1800-1939

Module Leader: Dr Martin Gorsky,

Taught at: The University of Wolverhampton,

Division of History and War Studies

2000-2003

Aim/Brief Module Description

The module examines the history of public health before the coming of the welfare state in Britain. It aims to analyse and explain the growing role of the state as the provider of health services in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Early sessions consider the principal causes of sickness and death in urban, industrial society and discuss the development of medical science. Subsequent themes include: the birth of the hospital, women and the medical profession, lunacy and the rise of the asylum, friendly societies and sickness insurance, public health reform and the decline of mortality, the arguments for a National Health Service.

Outcomes

Module Outcomes

Understand the main public health problems facing Britain 1800-1939 and the strategies adopted to address them.

Scope: Mortality, morbidity, welfare arrangements. Assessment component 2 (graded)

Understand the respective roles of the state, the market and the voluntary sector in the delivery of medical care and the reasons for the changing balance of the contribution of each.

Scope: public health legislation; voluntary hospitals; friendly societies; general practice Assessment component 2 (graded)

Understand the respective roles of medical science, institutional care and social intervention in the decline of mortality since c.1870

Scope: germ theory; immunization; laboratory science; general and isolation hospitals; health policies of national and local state

Assessment component: 2 (graded)

Personal Transferable Skills

Communicate Effectively: Writing Skills

Scope: coursework assignements, examination

Assessment component: 1 (graded)

Act Independently

Scope: present written findings of individual research

Assessment component: 1 (graded)

An expertise in reading, analysing and reflecting critically upon a variety of kinds of historical text.

Scope: E.Chadwick 'Report on the Sanitary Condition of the Labouring Population'; Samuel Tuke 'Description of the Retreat'; Florence Nightingale 'Notes on Nursing'; A.J.Cronin, 'The Citadel'

Assessment component: 1 (graded)

Address historical problems in depth in a manner using primary sources in print and in manuscript and advanced secondary literature including learned articles and theses.

Scope: secondary literature, and primary sources as for PO3

Assessment component: 1, 2 (graded)

Show an awareness of changes and continuity over an extended time span

Scope: national and local legislation, professionalisation of medicine; impact of institutionalisation; health as measured by mortality and morbidity indicators

Assessment component: 2 (graded)

Understand the problematic nature of attempts to reconstruct the past which are both intrinsic and extrinsic in nature

Scope: all aspects of the module Assessment component: 1, 2 (graded)

Weekly programme

Week One

Lecture The Demographic Framework

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: mortality and morbidity

Week Two

Lecture Environment and Epidemics.

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: Cholera in the Black Country

Week Three

Lecture Medical Science in the Early Nineteenth Century

Seminar Discussion: Smallpox vaccination: a medical breakthrough?.

Week Four

Lecture The Birth of the Hospital

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: early annual reports of voluntary hospital

Week Five

Lecture Doctors and the Making of the Medical Profession

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: Select Committee on Medical Education; 'The Lancet'.

Week Six

Lecture Women and the Medical Profession

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: Nightingale 'Notes on Nursing'

Week Seven

Lecture Public Health Reform

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: Chadwick's Report

Week Eight

Lecture Madness and the Rise of the Asylum

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: Tuke's 'Description of the Retreat'

Week Nine

Lecture Medical Science Advances

Seminar Discussion: why was the progress of scientific medicine slow?

Week Ten

Lecture Medicine in Inter-War Britain

Seminar Source Analysis Workshop: Cronin's 'The Citadel'

Week Eleven

Lecture The coming of the NHS

Seminar Tutorial session: appointments to discuss progress

Week Twelve

LectureReading weekSeminarReading week

Key Learning Resources

- + on order
- * not available in University library

R – on reserve collection

Books

Roy Porter The Greatest Benefit to Mankind

W.F.Bynum Science and the Practice of Medicine in the Nineteenth Century

Christopher Lawrence Medicine in the Making of Modern Britain, 1700-1920

Anne Hardy Health and Medicine in Britain since 1860

Steven Cherry Medical Services and the Hospitals in Britain, 1860-1939

Dorothy Porter *Health, Civilization and the State: a history of public health from ancient to modern times* Virginia Berridge 'Health and Medicine' in F.M.L.Thompson ed. *The Cambridge Social History of Britain,*

1750-1950 Vol 3, Social Agencies and Institutions

R.Cooter and J.Pickstone ed. *Medicine in the Twentieth Century*,

Websites

US National Library of Medicine:

History of Medicine Division http://www.nlm.nih.gov/hmd/hmd.html Medline (medical encyclopaedia) http://www.nlm.nih.gov/medlineplus/

Wellcome Institute for the History of Medicine:

Medical Photographic Library
Recent exhibitions
http://www.wellcome.ac.uk/en/1/homlibmpl.html
http://www.wellcome.ac.uk/en/1/misexh.html

British Poor Law (incl. medicine) http://www.workhouses.org

The Demographic Framework

T.McKeown The Modern Rise of Population

T.McKeown The Role of Medicine: dream mirage or nemesis?

T.McKeown & R.G.Record 'Reasons for the decline of mortality in England and Wales during the 19th. century' *Population Studies* 16 (1962)

D.Coleman and J.Salt The British Population, Patterns, Trends and Processes (ch.2, sections 2.1-2.8)

N.L. Tranter, *Population and Society* (chapter 3 on mortality)

R.Woods *The Population of Britain in the 19th. Century* (ch.2, 5 and 6)

R. Woods, The Demography of Victorian England and Wales

M. Anderson, 'Demography' in F.M.L.. Thompson, *The Cambridge Social History of Britain* (vol. 2, ch. 1)

J.Winter 'The Decline of Mortality' in T.Barker & M.Drake Population and Society in Britain

Environment and Epidemics.

a) General

Edwin Chadwick Report on the Sanitary Condition of the Labouring Population

A.S.Wohl Endangered lives: public health in Victorian Britain

Anne Hardy The Epidemic Streets

W.F.Bynum Science and the Practice of Medicine in the Nineteenth Century ch3

F.B.Smith *The People's Health*

John V.Pickstone, 'Ferriar's Fever to Kay's Cholera: Disease and Social Structure in Cottonopolis', *History* of Science xxii (1984)

R.Cooter 'Anticontagionism and History's Medical Record' in P.Wright and A.Treacher, *The Problem of Medical Knowledge*

R C.Hamlin 'Predisposing Causes and Public Health in early Nineteenth Century Medical Thought', *Social History of Medicine*, v, (1992)

C.Hamlin 'Providence and Putrefaction: Victorian Sanitarians and the Natural Theology of Health and Disease, *Victorian Studies*, xxviii (1985)

D.Porter Health, Civilization and the State: a history of public health from ancient to modern times ch 6

MG R.Woods & J.Woodward Urban Disease and Mortality in Nineteenth Century England

T.Dormandy, The White Death: a history of tuberculosis

b) Cholera

R.J.Morris Cholera, 1832

Sheldon J.Watts, Epidemics and history: disease, power, and imperialism ch 5 pp167-9, 186-99

Roger M Brotherton, Cholera and public health in Bilston 1830-1850.

Margaret Pelling, Cholera, fever and English medicine, 1825-1865.

Norman Longmate, King Cholera: the biography of a disease.

R W.R.Winterton 'The Soho Cholera Epidemic, 1854', *History of Medicine* viii, (1980)

M.Callcott 'The Challenge of Cholera: the Last Epidemic at Newcastle on Tyne', *Northern History* xx (1984)

Reverend, W Leigh, An authentic narrative of the melancholy occurrences at Bilston

Joseph Price, A brief narrative of the events relative to the cholera at Bilston

G. F.Lawley, Authentic list of the victims of the first Asiatic Cholera visitation in Bilston

Medical Science from the Early Nineteenth Century

a) General

W.F.Bynum Science and the Practice of Medicine in the Nineteenth Century chs 1-2

R.Porter Disease, Medicine and society in Britain 1550-1860

R.Porter The Greatest Benefit to Mankind ch x, xi

b) The conquest of smallpox

+ P.Razell The Conquest of Smallpox

Sheldon J.Watts, *Epidemics and history: disease*, power, and imperialism ch 6

Derrick Baxby,. Jenner's smallpox vaccine: the riddle of vaccinia virus and its origin

R D.Brunton 'Smallpox Inoculation and Demographic Trends in Eighteenth Century Scotland', *Medical History*, xxxvi (1992)

D.and R.Porter 'The Politics of Prevention: Anti-Vaccinationism and Public Health in Nineteenth Century England', *Medical History* xxxii, 1988

A.Hardy, 'Smallpox in London: Factors in the Decline of the Disease in the Nineteenth Century', *Medical History*, xxvii (1983)

R EP Hennock 'Vaccination policy against smallpox, 1835-1914: A comparison of England with Prussia and Imperial Germany', *Social History of Medicine* 11: (1) 49-71 APR 1998

D.Williams 'The implementation of compulsory health legislation - infant smallpox vaccination in England and Wales, 1840-1890' *Journal of Historical Geography* 20: (4) 396-412 oct 1994

R N.Durbach 'They might as well brand us': working-class resistance to compulsory vaccination in Victorian England *Social History of Medicine* 13: (1) 45-62 Apr 2000

R E.Meynell 'French reactions to Jenner's discovery of smallpox vaccination - the primary sources' <u>Social History of Medicine</u> 8: (2) 285-303 Aug 1995

R N.Williams 'The implementation of compulsory health legislation - infant vaccination and the 1871-1872 smallpox epidemic *Social History of Medicine* 4: (2) 394-395 Aug 1991

* G.Miller The Adoption of Inoculation for Smallpox in England and France

The Birth and Development of the Hospital

Roy Porter, 'The gift relation: philanthropy and provincial hospitals in eighteenth-century England' in Lindsay Granshaw and Roy Porter (eds), *The hospital in history*, London 1989, 149-78

Brian Abel-Smith The Hospitals, 1800-1914

John Woodward To do the sick no harm

Mary Fissell Patients, Power and the Poor chs. 6-9.

J.Barry & C.Jones Medicine and Charity Before the Welfare State (Hilary Marland's chapter)

Ornella Moscucci The Science of Woman

F.N.L.Poynter ed. The Evolution of Hospitals in Britain

F.F.Cartwright A Social History of Medicine

A.Borsay, "Persons of honour and reputation": the voluntary hospital in an age of corruption', *Medical History* 35 (1991), 281-94

A.Wilson 'Conflict, consensus and charity - politics and the provincial voluntary hospitals in the 18th century', *English Historical Review* 111: (442) 599-619 1996

Percy B Carpenter, *History of Walsall Hospitals* (1838-1998)

Keir Waddington Charity and the London Hospitals, 1850-1898, (Woodbridge, 2000)

J.V.Pickstone Medicine and Industrial Society

* G.RivettThe Development of the London Hospital System, 1823-1982

Guenter B. Risse. Mending Bodies, Saving Souls: A History of Hospitals ch5

Hilary Marland Medicine and Society in Wakefield and Huddersfield 1780-1870

Doctors and the Making of the Medical Profession

A.J.Cronin The Citadel

R.Porter Disease, Medicine and society in Britain 1550-1860 (chs. 2, 4, 5)

Irvine Loudon Medical Care and the General Practitioner, 1750-1850

Christopher Lawrence Medicine in the Making of Modern Britain, 1700-1920

I.Waddington The Medical Profession in the Industrial Revolution

Mary Fissell Patients, Power and the Poor

L.Granshaw & R.Porter *The Hospital in History* (chapter by Granshaw)

Anne Digby Making a Medical Living: Doctors and Patients in the English Market for Medicine,

Anne Digby. The Evolution of British General Practice, 1850-1948

Steven Cherry Medical Services and the Hospitals in Britain, 1860-1939 ch3

Bernard Shaw The Doctor's Dilemma Act One

B.Hamilton 'The Medical Professions in the Eighteenth Century' Economic History Review (1951)

N.Jewson 'The disappearance of the sick man from the medical cosmology' Sociology 10, 1976

- + N. & J.Parry The Rise of the Medical Profession chs. 6 & 7
- + M.J.Peterson The Medical Profession in Mid-Victorian London
- + Roy Porter Health For Sale: Quackery in England, 1660-1850

Hilary Marland Medicine and Society in Wakefield and Huddersfield 1780-1870 (ch.6, 7, 8)

Women and the Medical Profession

a) General

Margaret Stacey The Sociology of Health and Healing (ch.6)

* E.Moberly Bell Storming the Citadel

Ornella Moscucci The Science of Woman

b) Midwifery

Jean Donnison Midwives and Medical Men

Mitchell and Oakley *The Rights and Wrongs of Women* (chapter by Ann Oakley)

B.Ehrenreich & D.English Complaints and Disorders: The Sexual Politics of Sickness

Edward Shorter A History of Women's Bodies chs. 3-6

R Enid Fox 'An Honourable Calling or a Despised Occupation' *Social History of Medicine* August 1993

Irvine Loudon Medical Care and the General Practitioner, 1750-1850 (ch.4)

- + Adrian Wilson, The Making of Man-Midwifery: Childbirth in England, 1660-1770
- * N. & J.ParryThe Rise of the Medical Profession ch.8
- * H.Roberts ed. Women, Health and Reproduction (ch. by Verluysen)

b) Nursing

Florence Nightingale Notes on Nursing

B. Abel-Smith A History of the Nursing Profession

M.E.Baly Florence Nightingale and the Nursing Legacy

C.Woodham Smith Florence Nightingale 1820-1910

Celia Davies *Rewriting Nursing History* (ch. by Dean and Bolton)

J.Barry & C.Jones *Medicine and Charity Before the Welfare State* (chapter by Ann Summers)

Ann Summers 'Pride and Prejudice: ladies and nurses in the Crimean War' *History Workshop* 16, 1983.

Robert Dingwall An Introduction to the Social History of Nursing

R Keir Waddington 'The Nursing Dispute at Guy's Hospital' <u>Social History of Medicine</u> August 1993 Christopher Maggs *The Origins of General Nursing*

MG R.Huntsman et al. 'The Contribution of Elizabeth Fry and the Institution of Nursing Sisters to Nursing Reform', *Medical History*, 3, 2002

MG C.Helmstadter, 'Robert Bentley Todd, St John's House, and the origins of the modern trained nurse' Bulletin of the History of Medicine, 1993

* Charles Rosenberg Healing and History (ch. by Rosenberg 'Florence Nightingale')

Public Health Reform

Sir Edwin Chadwick Great Britain, Poor Law Commission. - Report on the sanitary condition of the labouring population of Great Britain (ed M.Flinn) and available in Parliamentary Papers Health General 3: Chadwick Report, Sessions 1837-42, starts p.109

Christopher Hamlin. Public Health and Social Justice in the Age of Chadwick: Britain, 1800-1854

C.Hamlin 'Muddling in Bumbledom: on the Enormity of Large Sanitary Improvement in Four British Towns', *Victorian Studies*, xxxii (1988)

S.E.Finer Life and Times of Edwin Chadwick

D.Fee, R.Acheson A History of education in public health: health that mocks the doctors' rule.

EP Hennock 'The urban sanitary movement in England and Germany, 1838-1914: a comparison' *Continuity And Change* 15: 269 Part 2 Aug 2000

A.S.Wohl Endangered lives: public health in Victorian Britain

W.M.Frazer History of English Public Health, 1834-1939

M. W. Flinn, Public health reform in Britain.

Anne Hardy The Epidemic Streets

C.Pennington 'Mortality and medical care in 19th century Glasgow', *Medical History*, 23, 1979

R Simon Szreter 'The Importance of Social Intervention in Britain's Mortality Decline', <u>Social History of Medicine</u>, 1, (1988)

R Sumit Guha 'The Importance of Social Intervention in Britain's Mortality Decline', <u>Social History of Medicine</u>, (1994)

R Simon Szreter 'Mortality in England: A Reply to Sumit Guha' Social History of Medicine, (1994)

R D.Evans (1992) 'Tackling the Hideous Scourge: The Creation of Venereal Disease Treatment Centres in Early Twentieth-Century Britain', *Social History of Medicine*, 5, 3, p.413-33

D.Oddy 'Food, drink and nutrition' in F.M.L.Thompson ed. *The Cambridge Social History of Britain, 1750-1950 Vol 3, Social Agencies and Institutions*

R. Woods, The Demography of Victorian England and Wales

MG R.Woods & J.Woodward Urban Disease and Mortality in Nineteenth Century England

* J.M.Eyler Victorian Social Medicine. The Ideas and Methods of William Farr

Madness and the Rise of the Asylum

Samuel Tuke Description of the Retreat

a) General

A.Scull Museums of Madness. The Social Organization of Insanity in Nineteenth Century England V.Skultans English Madness, Ideas on Insanity 1580-1890 (ch. 4-8)

Roy Porter A Social History of Madness

Anne Digby Changes in the Asylum: the Case of York, 1777-1815' Economic History Review (1983)

W.Bynum et. al The Anatomy of Madness vol II and vol III

R Andrew Scull 'Museums of Madness Revisited' Social History of Medicine, 1, 1993

Andrew Scull ed. Mad-houses. Mad-doctors and Madmen (chs. by Scull, Walton, Showalter)

Wiliam Parry-Jones The Trade in Lunacy: A Study of Private Madhouses in England in the 18th and 19th Centuries

R L.D.Smith 'Behind Closed Doors; Lunatic Asylum Keepers, 1800-60' Social History of Medicine, Dec. 1988

T.Szasz ed. *The Age of Madness* (document collection- see chs. 1, 3, 5)

Anne Digby Madness, Morality and Medicine

K. Jones, Mental health and Social Policy, 1845-1959

- * A.D.King ed. Buildings and Society
- * T.Markus ed. *Order and Space in Society* (chapter by T.Markus)
- * Kathleen Jones Lunacy, Law and Conscience, 1744-1845. The Social History of Care of the Insane (ch.iii-x)

b) Was Insanity on the Increase

- **R** Edward Hare 'Was Insanity on the Increase?' <u>British Journal of Psychiatry</u> 142, (1983)
- **R** A.Scull 'Was Insanity Increasing? A Resonse to Edward Hare' *British Journal of Psychiatry* 144, (1984)

J.Walton 'Lunacy in the Industrial Revolution: a Study of Asylum Admissions in Lancashire, 1848-1850' *Journal of Social History* (1979-80)

Elaine Showalter *The Female Malady*

- **R** Forsythe B, Melling J, Adair R 'The New Poor Law and the county pauper lunatic asylum The Devon experience 1834-1884' *Social History of Medicine*, 9: (3) 335-355 Dec 1996
- **R** Adair R, Forsythe B, Melling J. 'A danger to the public? Disposing of pauper lunatics in late-Victorian and Edwardian England: Plympton St Mary Union and the Devon County Asylum, 1867-1914' *Medical History* 42: (1) 1-25 Jan 1998

Adair R, Melling J, Forsythe B. 'Migration, family structure and pauper lunacy in Victorian England: admissions to the Devon County Pauper Lunatic Asylum, 1845-1900', *Continuity And Change* 12: 373-Part 3 Dec 1997

Medical Science Advances

W.F.Bynum Science and the Practice of Medicine in the Nineteenth Century chs 4-6

R.Porter The Greatest Benefit to Mankind ch xiv, xvii-xix

Steven Cherry Medical Services and the Hospitals in Britain, 1860-1939 ch 2

R.Cooter 'The meaning of fractures', Medical History, 31, 3, 1987

Anne Hardy Health and Medicine in Britain since 1860

F.B.Smith (1988: London) The Retreat of Tuberculosis

R Steve Sturdy and Roger Cooter (1998) 'Science, Scientific Management, and the Transformation of Medicine in Britain c.1870-1950' *History of Science*, xxxvi, pp.421-66

Roger Cooter 'The Politics of a Spatial Innovation: Fracture Clinics in Inter-war Britain', in J.Pickstone (ed)., *Medical Innovations in Historical Perspective*, pp.146-64

M.Worboys (1992: London) 'The Sanatorium Treatment for Consumption in Britain, 1890-1914' in J.Pickstone (ed) *Medical Innovations in Historical Perspective*, pp. 47-71

J.Pickstone (ed)., Medical Innovations in Historical Perspective,

Guenter B. Risse. Mending Bodies, Saving Souls: A History of Hospitals ch7

* A.J.Youngson The Scientific Revolution in Victorian Medicine

Medicine in Inter-War Britain

Anne Hardy Health and Medicine in Britain since 1860

A.J.Cronin The Citadel

a) Hospitals

Steven Cherry Medical Services and the Hospitals in Britain, 1860-1939

- **R** S.Cherry 'Beyond National Health Insurance. The Voluntary Hospitals and Hospital Contributory Schemes: A Regional Study' *Social History of Medicine* 5, 3, (1992)pp.455-482
- S.Cherry 'Before the National Health Service: financing the voluntary hospitals, 1900-1939' *Economic History Review*, (1997) L, 2, pp.305-326

Steven Cherry 'The Modern Hospital in History, c.1720-1948', Refresh, Spring, 26, (1998) pp.5-8

M.Gorsky, J.Mohan, and M.Powell 'British Voluntary Hospitals, 1871-1938: the Historical Geography of Provision and Utilization', *Journal of Historical Geography* 1999

Nuffield Provincial Hospitals Trust The Hospital Surveys: The Domesday Book of the Hospital Services

R Martin Powell 'An Expanding Service: Municipal Acute Medicine in the 1930s', *Twentieth Century British History*, (1997) 8, 3, pp.334-57

J.V.Pickstone Medicine and Industrial Society

* F.K.Prochaska Philanthropy and the Hospitals of London: The King's Fund, 1897-1990

b) Origins of the NHS

* Frank Honigsbaum Health, Happiness and Security: the Creation of the National Health Service Harry Eckstein The English Health Service: Its Origins, Structure and Achievement

Daniel M.Fox Health Policies, Health Politics: The British and American Experience, 1911-1965 Helen Jones Health and Society in Twentieth-Century Britain

J.Pater, The Making of the National Health Service

PEP (Political and Economic Planning) Report on the British Health Services (1937)

- Dorothy Porter Health, Civilization and the State: a history of public health from ancient to modern times, ch 11
- Charles Webster *The Health Services since the War: Volume I, Problems of Health Care, The National Health Service before 1957* (Ch 1)
- **R** Charles Webster 'Conflict and Consensus: Explaining the British Health Service', *Twentieth Century British History*, (1990) 1, 2, , pp.115-51

Charles Webster The National Health Service: A Political History (Ch 1)

John Stewart 'The Battle for Health': A Political History of the Socialist Medical Association, 1930-51, (Ashgate, 1999)

c) The 1930s

C.Webster 'Health, welfare and unemployment during the depression', *Past and Present*, 109, 1985 M.Mayhew, 'The 1930s nutrition controversy', *Journal of Contemporary History*, 23 (1988)

John Stewart "For a Healthy London": The Socialist Medical Association and the London County Council in the 1930s', *Medical History*, (1997) 42, pp.417-36

Recommended for Purchase

Choose from

Roy Porter *The Greatest Benefit to Mankind*W.F.Bynum *Science and the Practice of Medicine in the Nineteenth Century*Christopher Lawrence *Medicine in the Making of Modern Britain, 1700-1920*Steven Cherry *Medical Services and the Hospitals in Britain, 1860-1939*Anne Hardy *Health and Medicine in Britain since 1860*

Highly Recommended

A.J.Cronin The Citadel

Learning/Teaching Methods

Weekly lectures and seminars

Assessment Methods and Weightings

There are two components..

Component 1: 50% 2000 word essay on one of the key themes of the module

Component 2: 50% 2000 word contextual study of a primary source

Assessment tasks

Component 1

You are required to submit a 2000 word essay on one of the key themes of the module. **Or**, if you prefer, you may devise a title of your own choice in consultation with Martin Gorsky.

NB Please ensure that you do <u>not</u> work on the same topic as that which you have chosen for your contextual study, ie:

If you are working on Tuke's *Description*, you may not answer q.10 If you are working on Chadwick's *Report*, you may not answer q.8 If you are working on Nightingale's *Notes*, you may not answer q.6 If you are working on Cronin's *Citadel*, you may not answer q.12

Essay Questions

- 1. What were the principal trends in mortality in Britain between 1800 and 1939? Why do historians have such difficulty in agreeing about the cause of mortality decline?
- 2. Discuss the validity of the claim that the British ruling classes could have done more to protect the people from the threat of cholera.
- 3. Does Jenner deserve his reputation as the conqueror of smallpox?
- 4. Who benefitted most from the voluntary hospitals before 1914: patients, doctors or philanthropists?
- 5. Why and how was the medical profession 'made' in the nineteenth century?
- 6. Would you agree that the position of women within the medical profession improved between 1800 and 1914?
- 7. Edwin Chadwick, hero or villain?
- 8. Evaluate the importance of sanitary reform to mortality decline after 1870.
- 9. Why was insanity on the increase in nineteenth century Britain?
- 10. To what extent, by the early twentieth century, had medicine in Britain been transformed by science?
- 11. Would you agree that the health services of interwar Britain failed to provide adequately for the population?

Component 2

You will be required to submit a 2000 word contextual study of a primary source. This may be based on any one of the following sources.

Edwin Chadwick Report on the Sanitary Condition of the Labouring Population Samuel Tuke Description of the Retreat Florence Nightingale Notes on Nursing

A.J.Cronin, The Citadel

The study should show a firm grasp of the content of the source, and an ability to place it in the context of the period in which it was produced Further details of each source and the related assignment are given on the following pages.

The Citadel by A.J.Cronin

Archibald Cronin (1896-1981) was a doctor who turned to writing fiction. He trained at the Glasgow Western Infirmary and had his first job as a GP's assistant in rural Scotland; this experience was later to provide the basis for his popular 1960s TV drama serial *Dr Finlay's Casebook*. In 1921 he started to practice in a mining area of South Wales, and then became Medical Inspector of Mines for Great Britain, during which time he completed his MD thesis on the dangers of coal dust inhalation. From 1926 to 1930 he worked as a general practitioner in the Bayswater area of London. After developing an ulcer he decided to forsake medicine to become a novelist. He was an instant success and his fifth novel, *The Citadel* (1937) became a best-seller. Soon after its publication he moved to the USA and achieved further success with the film version of his *The Keys of the Kingdom* (1942).

The Citadel tells the story of the young doctor, Andrew Manson, whose experiences are closely modelled on Cronin's own medical career in Wales and London. The book is not great literature but was a huge popular success, remaining in print till the present day and has subsequently been adapted for film and television. Its interest to the historian of medicine lies in the very detailed and critical picture of the profession at work in the 1920s and 1930s. At the time of Cronin's death one obituarist even commented that *The Citadel* was 'much more responsible for Britain's National Health Revolution than any other contributing factor' (*The Lancet*, April 25, 1981), even the Beveridge Report. The narrative covers several key themes of our course:

Club practice in an industrial community

Occupational health of coal miners

The difficulties which an underprivileged doctor faced in establishing a career

The life of a GP's assistant

Attitudes in the profession towards innovations in medical science

Controversy over the treatment of tuberculosis

The role of local government in improving sanitation

The role the voluntary hospital in relation to other health services

The nature of commercial medicine for the better-off

The mercenary side of the profession.

Your essay should provide a critical analysis of the source. What can it tell the historian of medicine? You should show your understanding of Cronin's attitude towards the various medical subjects he discusses. Use secondary sources to place Cronin's story in the context of the time. What conclusions does he wish us to draw? Is his depiction of the medical profession unfair...one-sided...principally for dramatic effect? Or is he making a realistic and important criticism of medicine in the period. Finally, how useful is fiction as a historical source?

Reading: Because of the wide range of themes in the book, you should be able to draw on several secondary sources, though your reading should be geared towards the situation in the early 20th century. However, some good starting points are:

Anne Hardy, *Health and Medicine in Britain since 1860*, **ch3**, provides a good, short introduction to the major health issues and medical advances of the interwar period, set in the context of the depression

Anne Digby, *The Evolution of British General Practice 1850-1948*: this is the 'big book' on the history of GPs in our period; **chs 5, 6, 8, and 10** are the most relevant)

Anne Digby, 'Doctors and patients in an era of national health insurance', *Economic History Review*, xli, 1 1988, 74-94 is a briefer study of the development of the profession of GP in the period.

David Green, *Working Class Patients and the Medical Establishment* has some useful sections on club practice, and contains an attack on Cronin's depiction of the Welsh miners' Medical Aid Association.

Steven Cherry, *Medical Services and the Hospitals in Britain, 1860-1939* will give you some background on the development of the voluntary hospital in the period

John Benson *British Coalminers in the Nineteenth Century: A Social History* (slightly earlier period but still all relevant; especially good on the risk of accidents, includes material on disease and sick clubs)

P.D'Arcy Hart 'Chronic Pulmonary Disease n South Wales Coals Mines', *Social History of Medicine*, 11, 3, 1998 (**borrow from Martin Gorsky**) (an eye-witness account of a researcher in the 1930s, at the time when investigation of pneumoconiosis was just beginning)

A.J.Cronin Obituaries + extracts from his autobiography, *Adventures in Two Worlds* may be **borrowed from Martin Gorsky**

Description of The Retreat by Samuel Tuke

Samuel Tuke (1784-1857) was a Quaker philanthropist living in the city of York. He developed an interest in the care of the mentally ill following his family's involvement in setting up a new charity to provide institutional treatment for the 'mad'. Organised as a subscription charity like the voluntary hospitals, the York Retreat was a new kind of asylum; hitherto madness had been treated either by private 'madhouses' and Poor Law workhouses (as well as the long-established 'Bedlam' - Bethlem Hospital - in London). Opened in 1796, the Retreat claimed to have pioneered a new method of treatment, sometimes called 'moral therapy', which was more gentle and humane than what had gone before. Tuke's interest in the subject led him to visit other asylums and familiarise himself with the theory and practice of 'alienists' (mad-doctors) in different parts of world. He was therefore very much a lay expert on insanity both before and after the publication of the *Description* in 1813.

As the title suggests the book is principally a detailed discussion of the buildings, and environment of the Retreat, and the treatment which the inmates experienced. In contrast to the use of physical restraints and jail-like conditions of other asylums the practises described in Tuke's book suggest the healing virtues of a structured paternalistic atmosphere. Indeed some historians have seen this book as representing a turning point in the care of the insane - a shift from 'physical to moral management'. However, the book should also be understood in its local context. Within York itself Tuke and his supporters were locked a bitter dispute over conditions in the City Asylum, and The Description must also be understood as part of the battle against other approaches to the treatment of the mad.

You should write a critical analysis of Tuke's book, placing it in the context of the history of the institutional care of the mentally ill in the late 18th and early 19th centuries. Discuss the various themes which Tuke covers, such as the physical design of the asylum, the organisation of the charity, the treatment which patients received, and the statistics at the end, which show the causes of admission and the outcomes of treatment. You should also refer to secondary sources, particularly Digby's studies of the reality of life in the Retreat, to establish what 'moral therapy' was really like in practice. And did the new treatment propounded by Tuke represent a genuine revolution on the care of the insane?

Reading: The early section of the chapter on 'Psychiatry' in Porter, *The Greatest Benefit to Mankind* is a good starting point. The books listed under the 'Madness and the Rise of the Asylum' section of the Module Guide will be useful. Another key reading is the <u>editor's introduction</u> to the new edition of the *Description*, which explains the situation in York at the time the book was written. Copies may be borrowed from Martin Gorsky. Other key references are:

Roy Porter , Mind Forg'd Manacles (final sections of ch.4)

W.Bynum et. al The Anatomy of Madness vol II, ch. 3 by Digby

Anne Digby, 'Changes in the Asylum: the Case of York, 1777-1815', Economic History Review (1983)

Anne Digby, Madness, Morality and Medicine (still on order at the library)

Report on the Sanitary Condition of the Labouring Poor by Edwin Chadwick

Edwin Chadwick (1800-90) was born in Manchester, trained as a lawyer then went into journalism. He became a friend and follower of Jeremy Bentham, whose utilitarian doctrine argued that the role of law-making should be to secure the greatest happiness for the greatest number. Chadwick was largely responsible for the Poor Law Report of 1834 which led to the Amendment Act of the same year, and he was subsequently appointed Secretary to the Poor Law Board. He used this position to initiate a large survey of sanitary conditions in Britain, and the resulting Report, was presented to Parliament in 1842. From 1848 to 1854 he headed the Board of Health but his over-bearing manner made him unpopular and he eventually lost his job, although he received a knighthood in 1889.

The origins of the Report lay in disputes over Poor Law spending in 1838, when the Board clashed with local Guardians, who, convinced that sickness caused poverty, wanted to use the rates to address sanitation,. Chadwick asked three doctors sympathetic to this idea, Drs Arnott, Kay, and Southwood Smith to prepare reports on illness in London, and these were appended to the 4th Report of the Poor Law Board. Chadwick used these to argue that prior to legislation on matters such as building regulations a fully fledged national report on sanitary conditions in Britain was needed. The House of Lords voted in favour of the report in 1839 and Chadwick circularised and wrote to Poor Law Guardians, Poor Law Medical Officers, doctors, factory inspectors, general practitioners and others to elicit evidence for the enquiry.

The *Report on the Sanitary Condition of the Labouring Poor* is widely held to inspired the era of public health reform, leading eventually to better sanitation and to slum clearance. It provides a great deal of descriptive evidence about the living conditions of the poor and the likely impact of environment on health. However, the aim of Report was to influence opinion in favour of extension of state intervention in medicine, and it must also be understood as an example of propaganda in favour of legislative change.

Some historians have been sceptical about the *Report*'s significance. Thomas McKeown's study of mortality decline advanced the argument that public health reform contributed relatively little to the conquest of infectious disease. To him, improvements in diet were most important. More recent historians, notably Christopher Hamlin, have argued that Chadwick's reputation as the hero of sanitary reform is undeserved. Did he, by shifting the blame for ill health entirely onto the issue of drainage and fresh water, obscure the role of low wages and poor working conditions?

When you read the *Report* you should concentrate particularly on the Summary, the Conclusions and beginnings and endings of the different chapters and sections. This is where Chadwick makes his argument. The full *Report* is very long, as a great deal of it is taken up with evidence collected from around the country: you do not need to read all this, but you should select some relevant illustrations of the different points.

Your study should provide a critical analysis of the *Report*. What is the argument Chadwick makes, why is he making it, and how convincing is the evidence he advances? To provide the context for the *Report* you should use secondary sources such as Wohl's *Endangered Lives* for background on the problems of poor health in the 19th century city. You should also consider Hamlin's important critique of Chadwick....do you agree with him that sanitary reform was achieved at the expense of social justice?

Reading: The most relevant of the general texts are the appropriate chapters in Dorothy Porter's *Health, Civilization and the State: a history of public health from ancient to modern times.* CHECK In addition to those listed in the 'Public Health Reform' section of the module guide, you should make use of Flinn's recent introduction to the 1965 reprint of the *Report* (available to **borrow from Martin Gorsky**) Another <u>essential</u> book is

Christopher Hamlin. Public Health and Social Justice in the Age of Chadwick: Britain, 1800-1854

David Sunderland 'A monument to defective administration'? The London Commissioners of Sewers in the early nineteenth century, *Urban History*, 26, 3, Dec. 1999, 349-72, is another recent, and important critique of Chadwick and the *Report*.

T.McKeown's *The Modern Rise of Population* makes the claim that nutrition, not public health reform, was more important in the decline of mortality. Other works by him in 'The Demographic Framework' reading list may also be used

Notes on Nursing by Florence Nightingale

Born into an upper class family Florence Nightingale (1820-1910) was motivated by religious impulses to a life in nursing at a time when this was socially unacceptable for a woman of her background. She succeeded in training in Paris and Prussia and then became nurse superintendent in a London hospital. The outbreak of the Crimean War in 1854 gave her the opportunity to make her name, when she volunteered her services to the Secretary of War, Sidney Herbert, to organise nursing for the soldiers. With a small team of nurses she transformed the running of the huge military hospital at Scutari, greatly reducing the death rates. Press publicity about the success of the 'Lady with the Lamp' established her reputation and when she returned to Britain she used her fame to raise money to found a nursing school at St Thomas's Hospital. Her aim was to train matrons who would then be able to supervise nurses in the methods which she advocated, and to spread those methods by setting up other training schools throughout the world.

Nightingale is remembered as the key figure in the transition of British nursing from a low status occupation to a skilled profession. Her book *Notes on Nursing*, first published in 1859 and subsequently revised several times, was instrumental in setting out the essential aspects of the theory and practice of nursing. The book is mostly concerned with nursing in the home rather than the hospital, but it is the general principles which are of interest. The chapters cover such themes as advice on ventilating and cleaning the house, the management of the sick room, the patient's diet, and techniques of observing the patients' progress.

Your study should show a familiarity with the advice on theory and practice of nursing which Nightingale gives, and then set the work within the context of the time it was written. You need to show what the nature of nursing was prior to the 1850s, and how Nightingale's influence altered this. You should also relate her understanding of health to the prevailing theories of disease and sanitation in the 'age of Chadwick'. You should also comment, perhaps from a women's history perspective, on Nightingale's position in the gender and class structure of the time; how might her own social position and outlook have shaped the development of women's role in medicine?

Reading: The 'Women and the Medical Profession' list in the module guide should give you what you need. Ch 6 of Stacy's Sociology of Health and Healing offers a good introduction to the broader issues of gender and the medical profession. Standard histories of nursing are Abel-Smith's A History of the Nursing Profession, and Dingwall, Rafferty and Webster An Introduction to the Social History of Nursing. There are plenty of copies of these in several of the University's learning centres, but not at Dudley...you will need to order them! Also look at some biographies of Nightingale, such as Baly's Florence Nightingale and the Nursing Legacy (Monica Baly was an ex-President of the Royal College of Nursing) and Woodham Smith's Florence Nightingale. A recent article by Keir Waddington on the 'Nursing Dispute at Guy's' provides an interesting insight into how far the power of nurses in hospitals had advanced by the late Victorian period.

Martin Gorsky July 2002 2002/03