## Cryptanalysis on SHA-1

Xiaoyun Wang, Andrew C Yao, and Frances Yao

Xiaoyun Wang Tsinghua University \& Shandong Unversity Andrew C Yao Tsinghua University
Frances Yao City University of Hong Kong

## Outline

- Obstacles for further improvement on SHA-1 attack
- New collision path for SHA-1 (First iteration path)
- Comparing new collision path with previous path
- Strategies for message modification
- Details of message modification
- The complexity of searching for collisions


## Obstacles for Further Improvement on SHA-1 Attack

- Unlike SHA-0 and MD5, many message conditions and chaining variable conditions must co-exist in each step of differential path

|  | $m_{6,1}=1, m_{6,2}=0, m_{6,5}=1, m_{6,7}=0, m_{6,29}=0, m_{6,31}=0, m_{6,32}=0$ |
| :--- | :--- |
|  | $a_{7,1}=0, a_{7,3}=1, a_{7,4}=0, a_{7,6}=0, a_{7,7}=0, a_{7,9}=0, a_{7,10}=1$ |
|  | $a_{7,12}=0, a_{7,16}=1, a_{7,17}=1, a_{7,18}=1, a_{7,19}=1, a_{7,20}=1, a_{7,21}=1, a_{7,22}=1$ |
|  | $a_{7,23}=1, a_{7,24}=1, a_{7,25}=1, a_{7,26}=1, a_{7,27}=1, a_{7,28}=0, a_{7,30}=0$ |
| $m_{6}$ | $m_{23,7}=m_{22,1}, m_{23,6}=m_{23,7}+1, m_{23,30}=m_{19,5}, m_{25,7}=m_{24,1}+1, m_{27,6}=m_{26,1}+1$, |
|  | $m_{27,31}=1+m_{22,1}, m_{29,7}=m_{28,2}+1, m_{30,7}=m_{29,2}+1, m_{31,6}=m_{30,1}+1, m_{31,31}=m_{26,1}+1$ |
|  | $m_{34,7}=m_{33,2}+1, m_{34,2}=m_{34,1}+1, m_{35,6}=m_{35,7}+1, m_{35,7}=m_{34,2}+1, m_{35,31}=m_{30,1}+1$ |
|  | $m_{37,7}=m_{36,1}+1, m_{38,7}=m_{37,2}+1, m_{39,31}=m_{34,2}+1, m_{41,7}=m_{40,2}+1, m_{42,2}=m_{40,2}+1$ |
|  | $m_{45,7}=m_{44,2}+1, m_{47,7}=m_{44,2}+1, m_{49,7}=m_{44,2}+1, m_{51,7}=m_{44,2}+1, m_{52,2}=m_{44,2}+1$ |
|  | $m_{67,8}=m_{66,3}+1, m_{70,9}=m_{69,4}+1, m_{71,1}=m_{66,3}+1, m_{73,10}=m_{72,5}+1, m_{74,2}=m_{69,4}+1$ |
|  | $m_{75,9}=m_{74,4}+1, m_{76,11}=m_{75,6}+1, m_{77,3}=m_{72,5}+1, m_{79,12}=m_{78,7}+1, m_{79,2}=m_{74,4}+1$ |

## Obstacles for Further Improvement on SHA-1 Attack (continued)

- Difficult, because message space available is tight:
-- 50 message conditions in steps 17-80
-- hence 50 message conditions in steps 12-16
-- resulting in 50 message bit equations
-- most message bits are involved

$$
\begin{array}{|}
m_{13,29}=m_{0,2}+m_{0,24}+m_{0,25}+m_{0,28}+m_{0,29}+m_{0,30}+m_{1,0}+m_{1,3}+m_{1,26}+m_{1,27}+m_{1,28}+m_{1,29} \\
+m_{1,30}+m_{2,0}+m_{2,2}+m_{2,3}+m_{2,24}+m_{2,25}+m_{2,29}+m_{2,30}+m_{2,31}+m_{3,2}+m_{3,3}+m_{3,4}+m_{3,25}+m_{3,27} \\
+m_{3,28}+m_{3,31}+m_{4,2}+m_{4,3}+m_{4,4}+m_{4,28}+m_{4,30}+m_{4,31}+m_{5,0}+m_{5,3}+m_{5,25}+m_{5,26}+m_{5,29}+m_{5,31}+m_{6,0} \\
+m_{6,3}+m_{6,26}+m_{6,27}+m_{7,1}+m_{7,4}+m_{7,28}+m_{7,29}+m_{8,2}+m_{8,3}+m_{8,24}+m_{8,25}+m_{8,26}+m_{8,27}+m_{8,28}+m_{8,29} \\
+m_{8,31}+m_{9,0}+m_{9,1}+m_{9,2}+m_{9,3}+m_{9,4}+m_{9,26}+m_{9,28}+m_{9,31}+m_{10,1}+m_{10,2}+m_{10,3}+m_{10,5}+m_{10,28}+m_{10,29} \\
+m_{11,0}+m_{11,2}+m_{11,3}+m_{11,25}+m_{11,26}+m_{11,27} \\
+m_{11,28}+m_{11,29}+m_{11,30}+m_{11,31}+m_{12,1}+m_{12,2}+m_{12,5}+m_{12,28}+m_{12,30}+m_{13,0}+m_{13,1}+m_{13,3}+m_{13,24}+m_{13,25}+m_{13}
\end{array}
$$

-- in addition, 51 chaining variable conditions in steps 10-16
-- extra chaining variable conditions and message conditions coming from the message modification

## Table 1 New Collision Path for SHA-1 (First Iteration)

| $i$ | $x_{i-1}$ | $\Delta m_{i-1}$ | $\Delta a_{i}$ | $\Delta b_{i}$ | $\Delta c_{i}$ | $\Delta d_{i}$ | $\Delta e_{i}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 80000001 | $\begin{aligned} & 1,-2 \\ & -30,-32 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline 32,-1 \\ & 30,-31 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |  |
| 2 |  | $\begin{aligned} & -5,6 \\ & 30 \end{aligned}$ | -3,30 | $\begin{aligned} & 32,-1 \\ & 30,-31 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |  |
| 3 | 40000001 | 30,31 | $\begin{aligned} & -31,32 \\ & 3,8,9, \ldots,-23 \end{aligned}$ | -3,30 | $\begin{aligned} & 30,-31 \\ & 28,-29 \end{aligned}$ |  |  |
| 4 | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & \hline-2,-4,-6 \\ & -30,31,-32 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -2,6,-7 \\ & 8,13,-14,32 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -31,32 \\ & 3,8,9,-23 \end{aligned}$ | -1, 28 | $\begin{aligned} & 30,-31 \\ & 28,-29 \end{aligned}$ |  |
| 5 | 2 | -1,2,7,30 | $\begin{aligned} & 5,-6 \\ & 8,-9,-23,28 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -2,6,-7 \\ & 8,13,-14,32 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -29,30 \\ & 1,6,7, \ldots-21 \end{aligned}$ | -1,28 | $\begin{aligned} & 30,-31 \\ & 28,-29 \end{aligned}$ |
| 6 | 80000002 | $\begin{aligned} & \hline-7 \\ & 29,-30,-32 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline-32 \\ & -11,12 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5,-6 \\ & 8,-9,-23,28 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -32,4,-5 \\ & 6,11,-12,30 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -29,30 \\ & 1,6,7, \ldots-21 \end{aligned}$ | -1,28 |
| 7 | 1 | $\begin{aligned} & -1,2,-5,7 \\ & 29,31,32 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & -16,-27,28 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline-32 \\ & -11,12 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5,-6 \\ & 6,-7,-21,26 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -32,4,-5 \\ & 6,11,-12,30 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -29,30 \\ & 1,6,7, \ldots-21 \end{aligned}$ |
| 8 |  | $\begin{aligned} & -2,6 \\ & 29,31,32 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | $\begin{aligned} & 1 \\ & -16,-27,28 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -30 \\ & -9,10 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5,-6 \\ & 6,-7,-21,26 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -32,4,-5 \\ & 6,11,-12,30 \end{aligned}$ |
| 9 | 80000001 | -30 | $\begin{aligned} & 32,1 \\ & 9,-10 \end{aligned}$ | 4 | $\begin{aligned} & 31 \\ & -14,-25,26 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -30 \\ & -9,10 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & 5,-6 \\ & 6,-7,-21,26 \end{aligned}$ |
| 10 | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & -2,5,6 \\ & 30,-31 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & 32,1 \\ & 9,-10 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & 31 \\ & -14,-25,26 \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & -30 \\ & -9,10 \end{aligned}$ |
| 11 | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & 1,-2,-7 \\ & 30,31 \end{aligned}$ | 9,-10 | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & 30,31 \\ & 7,-8 \end{aligned}$ | 2 | $\begin{aligned} & 31 \\ & -7-14,-25,26 \end{aligned}$ |
| 12 | 2 | 7,-30 | 2 | 9,-10 | 32 | $\begin{aligned} & 30,31 \\ & 7,-8 \end{aligned}$ | 2 |
| 13 |  | $\begin{aligned} & -2,-7 \\ & -30,31,32 \end{aligned}$ |  | 2 | 7,-8 | 32 | $\begin{aligned} & 30,31 \\ & 7,-8 \end{aligned}$ |
| 14 |  | 2,-30,-31 |  |  | 32 | 7,-8 | 32 |
| 15 | 1 | 1,32 | 1 |  |  | 32 |  |
| 16 |  | 6 |  | 1 |  |  | 32 |

Table 2 An Sample Solution to 1-10 Steps Differential

| M | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \mathrm{b} 67 \mathrm{fd} 432 \\ & 172193 \mathrm{ca} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \hline \text { 15fdd1d6 } \\ & 2132 \mathrm{f639} \end{aligned}$ | $\begin{gathered} \text { 8627ed48 } \\ 58 d e 2 c e \end{gathered}$ | $\begin{aligned} & \text { a5fcd96b } \\ & 7 c 7 e 019 a \end{aligned}$ | 83 dad005 ccceb003 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $M^{\prime}$ | 167 fd 431 | $35 \mathrm{fdd1e} 6$ | e627ed48 | 45 fc 1941 | a3dad046 |
|  | a721938a | f132f66a | d58de2ec | 5c7e019a | acceb031 |
| $\triangle M$ | a0000003 | 20000030 | 60000000 | e000002a | 20000043 |
|  | b0000040 | d0000053 | d0000022 | 20000000 | 60000032 |

## Comparison between New Collision Path and Previous Collision Path

- Comparison:

1. Message conditions
2. Chaining variable conditions in steps 10-16 51
3. Message space in steps $10-16$ available for direct modification
4. Message space in steps 10-16 available for searching collision before advanced message modification

Old
50
$2^{47}$
$2^{55}$
$2^{123} \quad 2^{151}$

New
42

## Strategies for Message Modification

- Determine which message bits are possible candidates (control bits) for modification (Table 3).
- The message modification process must respect all chaining variable conditions and message conditions.
--require adding extra chaining variable conditions in steps 1-16 and message conditions.
Especially Consider the carry effect.
-- message modification follow certain topological order coming from correlations among chaining variable conditions.


## 42 Message Conditions in Steps 17-80 for SHA-1 First Iteration

| 0 | $m_{17,7}=m_{16,2}+1, m_{17,31}=1$ |
| :---: | :--- |
| 1 | $m_{18,7}=m_{17,2}+1, m_{18,31}=0$ |
| 2 | $m_{19,30}=m_{17,5}, m_{19,31}=1$ |
| 3 | $m_{23,7}=m_{22,1,} m_{23,6}=m_{23,7}+1, m_{23,30}=m_{19,5}$ |
| $6-7$ | $m_{25,7}=m_{24,1}+1, m_{26,7}=m_{25,2}+1$ |
| 8 | $m_{27,6}=m_{26,1}+1, m_{27,31}=1+m_{22,1}$ |
| $10-12$ | $m_{29,7}=m_{28,2}+1, m_{30,7}=m_{29,2}+1, m_{31,6}=m_{30,1}+1$ |
| $13-15$ | $m_{31,31}=m_{26,1}+1, m_{34,7}=m_{33,2}+1, m_{34,2}=m_{34,1}+1$ |
| $16-18$ | $m_{35,6}=m_{35,7}+1, m_{35,7}=m_{34,2}+1, m_{35,31}=m_{30,1}+1$ |
| $19-21$ | $m_{37,7}=m_{36,1}+1, m_{38,7}=m_{37,2}+1, m_{39,31}=m_{34,2}+1$ |
| $22-24$ | $m_{41,7}=m_{40,2}+1, m_{42,2}=m_{40,2}+1, m_{45,7}=m_{44,2}+1$ |
| $25-27$ | $m_{47,7}=m_{44,2}+1, m_{49,7}=m_{44,2}+1, m_{51,7}=m_{44,2}+1$ |
| $28-30$ | $m_{52,2}=m_{44,2}+1, m_{67,8}=m_{66,3}+1, m_{70,9}=m_{69,4}+1$ |
| $31-33$ | $m_{71,1}=m_{66,3}+1, m_{73,10}=m_{72,5}+1, m_{74,2}=m_{69,4}+1$ |
| $34-36$ | $m_{75,9}=m_{74,4}+1, m_{76,11}=m_{75,6}+1, m_{77,3}=m_{72,5}+1$ |
| $37-38$ | $m_{79,12}=m_{78,7}+1, m_{79,2}=m_{74,4}+1$ |

## Details for Message Modification

Available Message Bits to Correct Sufficient Conditions (Table 3)

| 0 | 7 | 5 | 15 | 3 | 10 | $0^{*}$ | $0^{*}$ | O* | O* | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | $0^{*}$ | 0 | 0 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | 1 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 5 | 3 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 4 | 11 | 15 | 14 | 9 | 15 | 14 | 15 | 7 |
| 1 | 6 | 12 | 12 | 13 | 4 | 3 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3 | 0 | 1 |
|  | 0 | 0 | 2 | 0 | 7 | 5 | 1 | 7 | 5 | 5 | 9 | 10 | 12 | 12 | 16 | 13 |
| 2 | 11 | 8 | 19 | 10 | 12 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 |
|  | 1 | 5 | 4 | 0 | 7 | 3 | 7 | 6 | 12 | 15 | 14 | 13 | 14 | 12 | 19 | 14 |
| 3 | 14 | 13 | 14 | 18 | 10 | 3 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 1 | 3 | 0 | 1 |
|  | 0 | 4 | 2 | 3 | 7 | 6 | 1 | 5 | 8 | 14 | 14 | 13 | 15 | 14 | 15 | 9 |
| 4 | 11 | 11 | 14 | 7 | 4 | 6 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4 | 4 |
|  | 2 | 3 | 0 | 1 | 2 | 4 | 5 | 4 | 9 | 5 | 8 | 15 | 16 | 11 | 13 | 13 |
| 5 | 14 | 9 | 11 | 10 | 6 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $0^{*}$ | $0^{*}$ | 0 | 0 | 1 | $0^{*}$ | O* | $0^{*}$ |
|  | 2 | 5 | 5 | 3 | 0 | 7 | 1 | 5 | 7 | 10 | 11 | 12 | 12 | 17 | 15 | 14 |
| 6 | 10 | 6 | 10 | 10 | 14 | 3 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 0 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | 4 | 0 |
|  | 2 | 0 | 3 | 3 | 4 | 4 | 5 | 7 | 8 | 4 | 15 | 18 | 12 | 14 | 21 | 15 |
| 7 | $8$ | 13 | 14 | 16 | 10 | 3 | $1$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $0$ | $0$ | $\mathrm{O}$ | $\mathrm{O}$ | $O^{*}$ |  | 0 | 3 |
|  | $2$ | 2 | 3 | O | 2 | 3 | $8$ | $4$ | $1$ | $8$ | $5$ | $7$ | $14$ | $12$ | 13 | 10 |
| 8 | 11 | 9 | 16 | 12 | 1 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 0 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | O* | 1 | 0 | 0 |
|  | 1 | 1 | 5 | 5 | 5 | 4 | 8 | 5 | 12 | 16 | 16 | 13 | 22 | 15 | 7 | 12 |
| 9 | 13 | 19 | 14 | 8 | 13 | 7 | 1 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 0 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 3 | 1 | 2 |
|  | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | 2 | 1 | 7 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 8 | 8 | 7 | 8 | 13 | 13 | 14 | 10 | 15 | 14 |
| 10 | 8 | 17 | 10 | 14 | 6 | 4 | 0 | 0 | O | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | O* | 4 |
|  | 4 | 6 | 2 | 3 | 2 | 1 | 6 | 6 | 4 | 8 | 10 | 7 | 13 | 19 | 17 | 17 |
| 11 | 12 | 7 | 16 | 19 | 9 | 1 | 0 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ |
|  | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 4 | 1 | 3 | 5 | 7 | 3 | 5 | 7 | 15 | 14 | 15 | 11 | 19 | 16 | 6 |
| 12 | 8 | 8 | 10 | 11 | 4 | 4 | 2 | 0 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $0^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | O* | O* | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 4 | 1 |
|  | 2 | O* | 2 | 1 | 1 | 4 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 4 | 9 | 5 | 9 | 12 | 14 | 12 | 15 | 17 |
| 13 | 15 | 10 | 11 | 9 | 9 | 1 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | $0^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | O* | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ |
|  | 1 | 2 | 4 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 6 | 1 | 1 | 6 | 13 | 11 | 11 | 7 | 10 | 12 | 11 | 14 |
| 14 | 5 | 9 | 5 | 8 | 8 | 9 | $0^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $0^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $0^{*}$ | O* | 4 | $0^{*}$ | 2 |
|  | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 3 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 6 | 4 | 6 | 8 | 4 | 2 | 9 | 10 | 5 | 9 | 9 | 9 |
| 15 | $6$ | $4$ | $1$ | $6$ | $6$ | 2 | $1$ | 1 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | O* | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 3 |
|  | $1$ | $3$ | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | 2 | 1 | 1 | $\mathrm{O}^{*}$ | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 | 1 |

## Details for Message Modification -

## Control bit and Control path

- Choices for control bit: a message bit m_\{i',j'\} (i'<16) which does not appear explicitly in 42 message conditions or chaining variable conditions. (marked by $0^{*}$ and 0 in Table 3)
0*: No appearance in 42 message bit equations and no chaining variable condition in the same bit position
0 : No appearance in 42 message bit equation, but a chaining variable condition in the same bit position
- Control Path: A chain of intermediate variable bits which can transmit a bit change from control bit m_\{i',j'\} to the target bit a_\{i,j\}.
- An example for Control Path:
$m_{14,10} \longrightarrow a_{18,11} \longrightarrow a_{20,11} \longrightarrow a_{21,16} \longrightarrow a_{22,21} \longrightarrow a_{23,26} \longrightarrow a_{24,31}$


## Details for Message Modification — Topological Order

- A preferred order for processing a set of conditions a_\{i,j\} so as to minimize the chance that a previously enforced condition may later get undone.
- An example of topological order

$$
\begin{aligned}
& a_{18,2} \rightarrow a_{17,31} \rightarrow a_{17,32} \rightarrow a_{17,2} \rightarrow a_{16,31} \rightarrow a_{17,4} \rightarrow a_{20,4} \\
& \rightarrow a_{19,32} \rightarrow a_{19,2} \rightarrow a_{18,30} \rightarrow a_{18,32} \rightarrow a_{20,30} \rightarrow a_{21,30} \rightarrow a_{21,2} \rightarrow a_{22,3} \\
& \rightarrow a_{24,4} \rightarrow a_{23,1} \rightarrow a_{24,31} \rightarrow a_{25,31} \\
& \quad a_{18,29} \rightarrow\left(a_{19,2}, a_{18,30}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Details for Message Modification ------Error Probability

- Error probability In spite of topological order, there is some probability that at the end of the message modification process, not all conditions are satisfied . We refer to this probability as error probability.
- Calculation of error probability (See Table 4)


## Table 4 An Example for One Condition Correction

| step | $\Delta w_{i}$ | Additional Cons | Control bits | Closest Cons | $P r_{1}$ | $\mathrm{Pr}_{2}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 11 | $2^{11}$ | $a_{11,12}=m_{10,12}$ | $a_{11,12}$ | $a_{11,30}$ | $\frac{1}{2^{18}}$ |  |
| 12 | $2^{16}$ | $m_{11,17}=1+m_{10,12}$ |  |  |  |  |
| 13 |  | $c_{12,12}=d_{12,12}$ |  | $a_{13,32}$ |  |  |
| 14 |  | $b_{13,10}=0$ |  | $a_{14,32}$ |  |  |
| 15 |  | $b_{14,10}=1$ |  | $a_{15,1}$ |  |  |
| 16 | $2^{9}$ | $m_{15,10}=1+m_{10,12}$ |  | $a_{16,31}$ |  |  |
| ... | ... | ... | ... | ... | $\ldots$ | ... |
| 19 | $2^{10}, 2^{12}$ |  | $\mathrm{a}_{19,11}, a_{19,13}$ | $a_{19,32}$ | $\frac{1}{219}$ |  |
| 20 | $2^{17}$ |  | $\mathrm{a}_{20,16}, a_{20,18}$ | $a_{20,4}$ | $\frac{1}{2^{20}}$ |  |
| 21 |  |  | $a_{21,11}, a_{21,13}, \mathrm{a}_{21,21}, a_{21,23}$ | $a_{21,30}$ | $\frac{1}{2^{9}}$ |  |
| 22 | $2^{12}, 2^{13}$ |  | $a_{22,9}, \ldots . ., a_{22,18}, \mathrm{a}_{22,26}, a_{22,28}$ | $a_{22,3}$ | $\frac{1}{2^{9}}$ |  |
| 23 | $2^{18}$ |  | $a_{23,1}, \ldots . ., a_{23,23}, \mathbf{a}_{23,31}$ | $a_{23,1}$ |  |  |
| 24 |  |  | $\mathbf{a}_{\mathbf{2 4 , 4}} a_{24,6}, a_{24,10}, \ldots ., a_{24,28}$ | $a_{24,31}$ |  | $\frac{1}{2^{8}}$ |

## Table 5 Conditions can be Corrected by Advanced Message Modification (with Star)

| 10 | $a_{10,2}=0, a_{10,4}=1, a_{10,7}=0, a_{10,8}=0, a_{10,11}=a_{9,11}, a_{10,12}=a_{9,12}, a_{10,30}=1, a_{10,31}=1$, |
| :---: | :---: |
| 11 | $a_{11,4}=0, a_{11,7}=1, a_{11,8}=1, a_{11,9}=0, a_{11,10}=1, a_{11,30}=0, a_{11,31}=1, a_{11,32}=1$, |
| 12 | $a_{12,2}=0, a_{12,7}=1, a_{12,8}=0, a_{12,32}=1$ |
| 13 | $a_{13,7}=1, a_{13,8}=1, a_{13,32}=1$ |
| 14 | $a_{14,3}=a_{13,4}+1=m_{16,1}, a_{14,32}=1$, |
| 15 | $a_{15,1}=0$, |
| 16 | $a_{16,1}=0, a_{16,2}=a_{15,2}, a_{16,31}=1$ |
| 17 | $a_{17,2}=m_{17,2}+m_{19,7}+1^{*}, a_{17,32}=m_{20,30}{ }^{*}, a_{17,4}=m_{19,2}+m_{17,2}{ }^{*}, a_{17,31}=0^{*}$ |
| 18 | $a_{18,2}=m_{17,2}{ }^{*}, a_{18,32}=1^{*}, a_{18,30}=1^{*}$ |
| 19 | $a_{19,32}=1+m_{19,5}{ }^{*}, a_{19,2}=a_{18,2}+a_{17,2}{ }^{*}$, |
| 20 | $a_{20,30}=1+a_{17,32}+a_{18,32}{ }^{*}, a_{20,4}=m_{22,1}+1+a_{19,4}{ }^{*}$ |
| 21 | $a_{21,2}=a_{18,4}+a_{17,4}{ }^{*}, a_{21,2}=m_{21,7}+1^{*}, a_{21,30}=1+m_{22,30}+a_{20,32}{ }^{*}$ |
| 22 | $a_{22,3}=m_{24,1}+a_{21,3}{ }^{*}$ |
| 23 | $a_{23,1}=1+m_{22,1}{ }^{*}$ |
| 24 | $a_{24,4}=w_{26,2}+1+a_{23,4}{ }^{*}, a_{24,31}=w_{25,31}+a_{22,1}{ }^{*}$ |
| 25 | $a_{25,2}=m_{24,1}, a_{25,31}=w_{26,31}+a_{23,1}{ }^{*}$ |
| 26 | $a_{26,2}=w_{25,2}, a_{26,3}=w_{28,1}+1+a_{25,3}$ |

## Complexity Estimation

## ----Complexity for Second Iteration

- There are 83 conditions in steps 17-80
- After advanced message modification, there are 65 conditions left in 17-80 steps
- Searching for two conditions in steps 25-26 by one computation
- Relax one condition in the final step
- 62 conditions left
- Error probability for correcting 17-25 conditions amounts to one failed condition.
- The complexity is about $2^{63}$ computations.


## Complexity Estimation ---Total Complexity

- Complexity for first iteration: further relax 3 conditions in the final 2 steps.
The complexity is about $2^{60}$ computations
- Complexity for the second iteration $2^{63}$ computations
- Total complexity

$$
2^{63}+2^{60}=1.125 \times 2^{63} \sim 2^{63}
$$

Thanks!

