Surface Protein Characterization of Human Adipose Tissue-Derived Stromal Cells

STAN GRONTHOS,¹ DAWN M. FRANKLIN,² HOLLY A. LEDDY,³ PAMELA G. ROBEY,¹ ROBERT W. STORMS,⁴ and JEFFREY M. GIMBLE⁵*

¹Craniofacial and Skeletal Diseases Branch, National Institute of Dental and Craniofacial Research, Bethesda, Maryland

²Zen-Bio, Inc., Research Triangle Park, North Carolina

³Department of Biomedical Engineering, Duke University Medical Center, Durham,

North Carolina

⁴Department of Medicine, Duke University Medical Center, Durham, North Carolina ⁵Artecel Sciences, Inc., Durham, North Carolina

Human bone marrow stromal cells are a multipotent population of cells capable of differentiating into a number of mesodermal lineages as well as supporting hematopoeisis. Their distinct protein and gene expression phenotype is well characterized in the literature. Human adipose tissue presents an alternative source of multipotent stromal cells. In this study, we have defined the phenotype of the human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells in both the differentiated and undifferentiated states. Flow cytometry and immunohistochemistry show that human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells have a protein expression phenotype that is similar to that of human bone marrow stromal cells. Expressed proteins include CD9, CD10, CD13, CD29, CD34, CD44, CD 49_d, CD 49_e, CD54, CD55, CD59, CD105, CD106, CD146, and CD166. Expression of some of these proteins was further confirmed by PCR and immunoblot detection. Unlike human bone marrow-derived stromal cells, we did not detect the STRO-1 antigen on human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells. Cells cultured under adipogenic conditions uniquely expressed C/EBP α and PPAR δ , two transcriptional regulators of adipogenesis. Cells cultured under osteogenic conditions were more likely to be in the proliferative phases of the cell cycle based on flow cytometric analysis of PCNA and Ki67. The similarities between the phenotypes of human adipose tissue-derived and human bone marrow-derived stromal cells could have broad implications for human tissue engineering. J. Cell. Physiol. 189: 54–63, 2001. © 2001 Wiley-Liss, Inc.

The bone marrow microenvironment contains a unique population of multipotent stromal cells; these can differentiate along the adipocyte, osteoblast, and other mesodermal pathways (Owen, 1988; Gimble, 1990; Gimble et al., 1996; Bianco and Robey, 2000; Nuttall and Gimble, 2000). Bone marrow stromal cells also support the proliferation and differentiation of hematopoietic stem cells (Kincade et al., 1988). This support is apparently dependent upon cell-cell interactions mediated by specific adhesion molecules expressed on the stromal cells (Kincade et al., 1988). The gene and protein expression profile of both murine and human bone marrow stromal cells has been defined. Significant antigens include VLA-4, VCAM-1, CD44, among others (Thomas et al., 1988; Gimble et al., 1989; Miyake et al., 1990, 1991a,b; Simmons and Torok-Storb, 1991a,b; Haynesworth et al., 1992; Gronthos et al., 1994, 1997, 1999; Simmons et al., 1994; Bruder et al., 1997, Bruder et al., 1998; Barry et al., 1999; Pittenger et al., 1999; Conget and Minguell, 1999, 2000; Deschaseaux and Charbord, 2000; Shin et al., 2000).

Bone marrow-derived mesenchymal stromal cells have clinical importance in applications for tissue engineering; however, they may only be obtained by bone marrow biopsy, a potentially painful procedure. It is hypothesized that similar multipotent stromal cells exist in tissue sites outside the bone marrow microenvironment. Support for this concept comes from a rare pathological condition known as progressive osseous heteroplasia (Kaplan et al., 1994). The subcutaneous adipose tissue in these patients forms ectopic bone for unknown reasons, suggesting that adipocytes or adipocyte progenitor cells may differentiate into osteoblasts (Kaplan et al., 1994). Improved methods have been

*Correspondence to: Jeffrey M. Gimble, Artecel Sciences, Inc., 801 Capitola Dr., Suite F, Durham, NC 27703. E-mail: jgimble@artecel.com

Received 10 November 2000; Accepted 25 May 2001

developed to isolate and culture human subcutaneous adipose tissue-derived stromal cells (Hauner et al., 1989; Halvorsen et al., 2001). Under appropriate culture conditions, these cells differentiate along both the adipocyte and osteoblast pathways. The current work set out to define the gene and protein expression phenotype of the human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells in their undifferentiated and differentiated states. These results are compared to those of bone marrow stromal cells as defined in the literature.

MATERIALS AND METHODS Materials

All chemicals were purchased from Sigma-Aldrich (St. Louis, MO) or Fisher (Norcross, GA) unless otherwise noted. Type I collagenase was obtained from Worthington Biochemical (Lakewood, NJ). Bovine serum albumin (BSA), dexamethasone, biotin, pantothenate, Krebs-Ringer buffer, isoproterenol, and isobutyl methyl-xanthine (IBMX) were purchased from Sigma (St. Louis, MO). Human recombinant insulin was obtained from Boehringer Mannheim (Indianapolis, IN). The fetal bovine serum (FBS) was from HyClone (Logan, Utah). The Dulbecco modified Eagle's medium, phosphate buffer saline (PBS), and Ham's F-10 nutrient broth were obtained from Biologos (Naperville, IL) and the BGJ_b medium (Fitton–Jackson modification) from Gibco/BRL (Gaithersburg, MD). The thiazolidinedione

TABLE 1. Monoclonal antibodies

BRL49653 was a gift from Coelacanth (New Brunswick, NJ). Dihydroxy (1,25) vitamin D_3 was purchased from BioMol (Plymouth Meeting, PA). All tissue culture flasks and plates were obtained from Corning (Corning, NY); 8-well chamber slides were obtained from Nalge Nunc International (Naperville, IL). Antibodies and their sources are listed in Table 1. NuPageTM polyacrylamide gels and immunoblot transfer reagents were purchased from Invitrogen (Carlsbad, CA).

Tissue preparation

The subcutaneous adipose was acquired from elective surgeries with the patient's consent as approved by the Institution Review Boards. The tissues used were from female patients of ages between 23 and 58 with a mean $(\pm SEM)$ of 39.4 ± 3.1 years. The patients displayed a mean body mass index (kg/m²) (\pm SEM) of 32.2 ± 4.6 (summarized in Table 2). Liposuction tissues were transported to the laboratory in saline solution within 2 h post-surgery. The tissue was washed at least three times with 2 volumes of Krebs-Ringer-bicarbonate (KRB; Sigma) to remove blood. The tissue was then digested with one volume of collagenase type I (1 g/liter of KRB with 1% BSA) for 60 min at 37°C with intermittent shaking. The floating adipocytes were separated from the stromal-vascular fraction by centrifugal force (300g) for 5 min. The preadipocytes in the stromal-vascular fraction were plated in tissue culture

Antigen	Clone	Application	Source
CD9, Tetraspan	B2C11	Н	DSHB
CD9, Tetraspan	ALB6	F	IT
CD10, CALLA	ALB1	F	IT
CD11a, Integrin α_L /LFA-1	G-25.2	F	BD
CD11b, Integrin $\alpha_{\rm M}$ /Mac-1	D12	F	BD
CD11c, Integrin $\alpha_{\rm X}$	3.9	F	BS
CD13, Aminopeptidase N	L138	F	BD
CD14	$M\Phi P9$	F	BD
CD18, Integrin β_2	L130	F	BD
CD29, Integrin β_1	4B4	F	С
CD31, PECAM-1	L133.1	F	BD
CD34	8G12(HPCA-2)	F	BD
CD44, Pgp-1	L178	F	BD
CD44, Pgp-1	H4C4, H9H11	H, W	DSHB
CD45, LCA	J.33	F	IT
CD49d, Integrin α_4	L25	F	BD
CD49e, Integrin α_5	SAM1	F	IT
CD49e, Integrin α_5	BIIG2	Н	DSHB
CD50, ICAM-3	152-2D11	F	BS
CD54, ICAM-1	LB-2	F	BD
CD55, DAF	IA10	F	Р
CD56, NCAM	MY31	F	BD
CD56, NCAM	AG1, B58	Н	DSHB
CD59, Complement protectin	P282(H19)	F	Р
CD62E, E-selectin	P2H3	F	DSHB
CD105, Endoglin	P4A4	F, H	DSHB
CD106, VCAM-1	P8B1	F, H	DSHB
CD146, Muc-18	CC9	H, W	S. Gronthos
CD166, ALCAM	RD1-CD166-3FT	F	RD
HLA-ABC	G46-2.6	F	Р
HLA-DR	L243	F	BD

Abbreviations: ALCAM, Activated Leukocyte Adhesion Molecule; BD, Becton-Dickinson; BS, BioSource; C, Coulter; CALLA, Common Acute Lymphocytic Leukemia Antigen; CD, cluster of differentiation; DAF, Decay Accelerating Factor; DSHB, Developmental Studies Hybridoma Bank, Iowa City, IA; F, fluorescence activated cell sorting; H, Immunohistochemistry; ICAM, Intercellular Adhesion Molecule; IT, Immunotech; LCA, Leukocyte Common Antigen; NCAM, Neural Cell Adhesion Molecule; P, Pharmingen; PECAM-1, Platelet Endothelial Cell Adhesion Molecule; Pgp-1, Phagocytic glycoprotein-1/Hyaluronate Receptor; RD, Research Diagnostics; VCAM, Vascular Cell Adhesion Molecule; W, Western Immunoblot.

TABLE 2. Tissue donor information

Lot number	Age (years)	BMI (kg/m ²)	Experimental use
1	42	27.34	Н
2	39	55.10	Н
3	37	34.64	Н
4	42	24.10	Н
5	27	73.33	Н
6	57	27.55	Н
7	23	22.55	F,W
8	32	23.81	ŕ
9	41	20.29	F
10	58	27.48	W
11	45	25.11	F
12	30	22.71	F,W
$Mean \; (\pm SEM)$	39.4 ± 3.1	32.6 ± 4.6	,

All lots were obtained from female patients. There was no significant difference in age or BMI between lots used for immunohistochemistry (H), fluorescence activated cell sorting (P), or Western immunoblot analysis (W) (ANOVA, P = 0.66 for age and P = 0.11 for BMI).

flasks at 3,500 cells/cm² in Dulbecco's modified Eagle's– Ham's F-10 medium (vol/vol, 1:1) supplemented with 10% FBS, 15 mM HEPES (pH 7.4), 100 U/ml penicillin, 100 µg/ml streptomycin, and 25 ng/ml amphotericin B (pre-adipocyte medium). The primary cells were cultured for 4–5 days until they reached confluence and were defined as "Passage 0". The cells were then harvested by digestion with 0.5 mM EDTA/ 0.05% trypsin (Biologos), centrifuged at 1200 rpm for 5 min, resuspended in pre-adipocyte medium, and plated at a density of approximately 10,000 cells/cm². The cells were passaged twice and were then used for assays or cyropreserved in liquid nitrogen in media supplemented with 7% dimethyl sulfoxide (DMSO) prior to subsequent experimentation (Halvorsen et al., (in press)).

Osteogenic conditions

To induce mineralization, the stromal cells were harvested using trypsin/EDTA and re-plated in multiple-well plates at 30,000 cells/cm² for 16 h to allow attachment in pre-adipocyte medium (Day 0). On Day 1, the medium was changed to BGJ_b medium (Fitton–Jackson Modification) supplemented with 10% FBS, 100 U penicillin/ml, 100 μ g streptomycin/ml, 10 mM β -glycerophosphate, and 50 μ g/ml 2-phosphate ascorbate. Additional supplements included 10 nM 1,25 vitamin D₃ and/or 10 nM dexamethasone. Cultures were fed every 3rd day throughout the study.

Adipogenic conditions

To induce adipogenesis, the stromal cells were harvested using trypsin/EDTA and plated in multiplewell plates at 30,000 cells/cm² for 16 h to allow attachment in pre-adipocyte medium (Day 0) (Halvorsen et al., 2001). On Day 1, the medium was then changed to Dulbecco's modified Eagle's –Ham's F-10 medium (vol/vol, 1:1) supplemented with 3% FBS, 15mM HEPES (pH 7.4), biotin (33 μ M), pantothenate (17 μ M, Sigma), human recombinant insulin (100 nM, Boerhinger Mannheim), dexamethasone (1 μ M), 1-methyl-3-isobutylxanthine (IBMX) (0.25 mM), and BRL49653 (1 μ M) (differentiation medium) for a 3-day period. From Day 4 onwards, the cells were fed every 3rd day with the same medium without IBMX and BRL49653 supplementation (adipocyte medium).

Histochemistry

Cells were cultured under each condition in 8-well chamber slides for 9 days. All subsequent steps were carried out at room temperature. Prior to immunostaining, the specimens were washed with PBS and then fixed in 95% ethanol with 5% glacial acetic acid for 3 min. After washing in PBS the specimens were treated with 5% DMSO containing 0.25% Triton-X 100 for 10 min and then washed three times in PBS containing 0.05%Tween 20 (PBS-T). Non-specific antibody binding was blocked by pre-incubating the slides with 5% normal goat serum for 1 h. Subsequently, the normal goat serum was removed and the slides were incubated with saturating levels of primary antibodies (Table 1) for 1 h. Replicate samples were treated with the appropriate negative control isotype-matched mouse antibodies, or with pre-immune rabbit serum under the same conditions. The slides were washed with PBS-T and then incubated with the respective secondary antibodies (biotin-conjugated goat anti-rabbit antibody, Vector Laboratories, Burlingame, CA, or biotin-conjugated goat anti-mouse antibody, Caltag Laboratories, San Francisco, CA) diluted 1/200, for 45 min. After washing three times in PBS-T the slides were incubated with peroxidase/ streptavidin complex (ABC kit, Vector Laboratories) for 30 min. Peroxidase activity was assessed using a peroxidase AEC substrate kit (Vector Laboratories) according to the manufacturer's recommendations. The specimens were washed in water and mounted using Vectormount.

Immunofluorescent analysis of cell cycle

Adherent monolayers for each condition were harvested with trypsin/EDTA to obtain single cell suspensions then washed twice in cold PBS. Approximately, 2×10^5 cells were pelleted into several 4 ml polypropylene tubes (Becton Dickinson, Lincoln Park, NJ). The cells were fixed for 10 min with cold 70% ethanol on ice. The cells were then washed three times with PBS and then incubated with the monoclonal antibodies specific for Ki-67 (FITC-conjugated) and PCNA (PE-conjugated) (DAKO Corp., Carpinteria, CA) for 45 min on ice. Replicate tubes were incubated with FITC- and PEconjugated isotype-matched control antibodies of irrelevant specificity (Becton Dickinson). After washing twice in PBS the cells were analysed using a FACS Calibur flow cytometer (Becton Dickinson Immunocytometry Systems). Positive expression was defined as the level of fluorescence greater than 99% of the corresponding isotype-matched control antibodies.

Flow cytometry

For flow cytometric analyses, cells cultured under either control or differentiation conditions were harvested using trypsin-EDTA digestion, centrifuged for 5 min at 1200 rpm, and resuspended at a concentration of 10^6 cells/ml in Iscove's modified Dulbecco's medium/ 2% FBS. Aliquots containing 10^5 cells were incubated with individual primary antibodies (Table 1) for 15 min at room temperature. The cells were washed in PBS containing 2% FBS. When necessary, the cells were

Gene		Primer	Size (bp)	$T_{m}\left(^{\prime }C\right)$
Actin	F	AGCCATGTACGTTGCTA	745	60
	R	AGTCCGCCTAGAAGCA		
Collagen type I	F	TGACGAGACCAAGAACTG	599	60
0 11	R	CCATCCAAACCACTGAAACC		
CD 10	F	TTGTAAGCAGCCTCAGCCG	459	60
	R	TTGTCCACCTTTTCTCGGAG		
CD 13	\mathbf{F}	GCCGTGTGCACAATCATCGCACT	449	60
	R	CACCAGGGAGCCCTTGAGGTG		
CD 44	\mathbf{F}	GATCCACCCCAATTCCATCTGTGC	674	60
	R	AACCGCGAGAATCAAAGCCAAGGCC		
CD 59	F	ACACTCTACTACATGTGACTG	439	58
	R	TGCAAAAGTCAGCCTATGCC		
CD 105	\mathbf{F}	TGTCTCACTTCATGCCTCAGCT	377	58
	R	AGGCTGTCCATGTTGAGGAGT		
CD 166	F	AGATACCATTATCATCATACCTTGCCGACT	157	60
	R	TGTCTTTGTATTCGTGTACATCGTCG		

TABLE 3. Oligonucleotide primers for polymerase chain reaction

Abbreviations: F, forward primer; R, reverse primer.

incubated with a fluorescent conjugated secondary antibody at room temperature. Finally, the cells were fixed in 10% formalin prepared in PBS containing 2% FBS. Samples were analyzed using a FACSCalibur cytometer (Becton Dickinson Immunocytometry Systems).

Immunoblots

Undifferentiated human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells were rinsed three times in ice cold PBS containing 0.1 mM $Na_{3}VO_{4}$ (PBS-V) and lysed in 100 μl of buffer containing 10% glycerol, 2% sodium dodecyl sulfate, 11.3 µg/ml aprotinin, 6.86 µg/ml leupeptin, 0.686 mM PMSF, 6.86 µM Na₃VO₄, 0.637% NP40, 12.6 mM Tris-HCl (pH 8.0), 95.1 mM NaCl, 0.634 mM EDTA, 0.0634% Na N_3 . Aliquots containing μ g of boiled protein lysate were loaded onto 4-12% bis-Tris acrylamide gels, electrophoresed, and transferred to nitrocellulose membranes. The immunoblots were blocked in PBS with 5% non-fat powdered milk and 0.1% Tween for 1 h at room temperature and incubated with primary antibodies (murine hybridoma supernatants) diluted 1:20 in PBS with 1% non-fat powdered milk and 0.1% Tween overnight with rocking at 4° C. After four washes with PBS/0.1% Tween, the immunoblots were incubated with horseradish peroxidase coupled goat anti-mouse Ig secondary antibodies diluted 1:10,000 in PBS with 0.2% non-fat powdered milk and 0.1% Tween with rocking for 1 h at room temperature and washed three times with PBS/0.1% Tween. Antibody complexes were visualized using the ECL plus chemiluminescent kit (Amersham Pharmacia, Piscataway, NJ) and autoradiographic exposure.

RNA isolation and polymerase chain reaction

Human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells were cultured under control conditions or were induced with either the adipocyte differentiation or mineralization protocol for 9 days. Total RNA was isolated from these cells using TriReagent (Molecular Research Center, Cincinnati, OH) (Chomczynski and Sacchi, 1987). Reverse transcriptase reactions were performed with 1 μ g of total RNA using the GeneAmp RNA PCR Kit (Perkin Elmer, Branchburg, NJ). Polymerase chain reactions were performed using a 5 min 94°C; a cycle of 30 sec at 94° C, 1 min at a primer set specific annealing temperature, and 1 min at 72° C; and an 8 min extension at 72° C (annealing temperatures are indicated in Table 3 for each oligonucleotide primer pair). Oligonucleotide primer sets (forward, F; reverse, R) specific for the listed human cDNAs (28,29) were synthesized by Gibco-BRL (Gaithersburg, MD).

RESULTS

Surface protein expression by undifferentiated adipose tissue-derived stromal cells

Initial studies used flow cytometry to quantify the surface protein expression on stromal cells derived from human adipose tissue. In these preliminary experiments, the stromal cells were cultured in the absence of any inductive stimuli. Representative histograms are shown in Figure 1. Positive staining was defined as a fluorescent intensity greater than 99% of that obtained with the isotype-matched control antibody ("M1" bracket in histogram panel). The mean results obtained using a panel of 25 antibodies on stromal cells from 2 to 5 individual donors are summarized in Table 4. The undifferentiated stromal cells were consistently positive for the following surface proteins: class I histocompatibility antigen (HLA-ABC), CD9, CD10, CD13, CD29, CD34, CD44, CD49e, CD54, CD55, CD59, CD105, and CD166.

These results were confirmed using polymerase chain reactions performed with reverse transcribed cDNA from the undifferentiated adipose derived stromal (Fig. 2). In addition, the expression of CD44 and CD146 were confirmed by Western immunoblotting (Fig. 3).

Relative protein expression by adipose tissuederived stromal cells cultured under adipogenic, osteogenic, and undifferentiated conditions

After 14 days or more of induction with appropriate culture media, the human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells display morphologic features consistent with adipogenesis or osteogenesis. Representative photomicrographs in Figure 4 show adipocytes stained positive with Oil Red O and mineralized cultures stained positive with Alizarin Red. To examine whether cell antigen expression changed with differentiation, adipose tissue



Fig. 1. Flow cytometric analysis of undifferentiated human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells. Undifferentiated stromal cells from an individual donor were stained with monoclonal antibodies directed against either HLA-ABC, CD29, CD49_e, or CD55 and coupled to phycoerythrin (PE) or directed against either CD9, CD44, CD105, or

derived stromal cells from five different donors were cultured on chamber slides for 9 days to maintain them as undifferentiated cells or after induction of adipogenesis or osteogenesis.

Immunohistochemical staining was then performed on fixed cultures using a panel of monoclonal or polyclonal antibodies. Representative photomicro-



CD166 and coupled to fluorescein isothiocyanate (FITC); these signals are indicated as solid lines. An isotype matched monoclonal antibody served as a control; these signals are indicated as dotted lines. The "M1" window represents fluorescent intensity exceeding that of 99% of the antibody control stained cells. Representative of n = 5 donors.

graphs are shown in Figure 5 the average results from five different donors are summarized in Table 5. The expression profile for the majority of cell surface proteins was similar under undifferentiated, adipogenic, and osteogenic conditions (Table 5). Only the transcriptional regulators of adipogenesis, CCAAT/ enhancer binding protein α (C/EBP α) and peroxisome

TABLE 4. Flow cytometric analysis of human adipose derived stromal cells (undifferentiated) $% \left({\left[{{{\rm{TABLE}}} \right]_{\rm{TABLE}}} \right)$

Antigen	Mean % positive cells (\pm SEM)	
HLA- ABC	93 ± 3	
HLA- DR	1 ± 0	
CD9	28 ± 8	
CD11a	0	
CD11b	1 ± 0	
CD11c	0	
CD10	79 ± 5	
CD13	99 ± 2	
CD14	0	
CD18	0	
CD 29	98 ± 1	
CD 31	1 ± 1	
CD34	28 ± 13	
CD44	60 ± 15	
CD45	0	
CD49d	9 ± 2	
CD49e	22 ± 7	
CD50	0	
CD54	42 ± 8	
CD55	56 ± 8	
CD56	0	
CD59	97 ± 1	
CD62e	2 ± 1	
CD105	36 ± 9	
CD166	27 ± 9	

Results are the mean \pm standard error of the mean (SEM) of flow cytometry of 5,000–10,000 cells obtained from 3–5 donors except for CD10, which is the mean of two donors. Percent positive is defined as fluorescent intensity greater than 99% of isotype matched antibody control.



Fig. 2. Gene expression by undifferentiated human adipose tissuederived stromal cells based on polymerase chain reaction. Total RNA isolated from undifferentiated human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells was reverse transcribed and amplified with primers specific for the indicated cDNAs: (1) 100 bp DNA ladder; (2) actin, 800 bp; (3) CD166, 157 bp; (4) collagen type I, 599 bp; (5) CD10, 459 bp; (6) CD13, 449 bp; (7) CD44, 674 bp; (8) CD59, 434 bp. Representative of n = 3donors.



Fig. 3. Immunoblot detection of proteins expressed by undifferentiated human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells. Total cell lysates from three individual donors (18 μ g in **lane 1**, 32 μ g in **lanes 2** and **3**) were electrophoresed on 4–12% Bis-Tris acrylamide gels, transferred and immunoblotted with antibodies directed against the following antigens (sizes indicated in kDa): CD146 (115 kDa), CD44 (90 kDa), actin (42 kDa).

proliferator activated receptor γ (PPAR γ), increased under adipogenic conditions relative to the other culture conditions.

Differentiation events are associated with altered cell cycle regulation. Cell cycle events can be distinguished based on expression of proliferating cell nuclear antigen (PCNA) and Ki67; cells in G_0/G_1 are PCNA⁻/Ki67⁻, in S phase are PCNA⁺/Ki67⁺ or PCNA⁺/Ki67⁻, and in G_2/M are PCNA⁻/Ki67⁺ (Landberg et al., 1990). Both PCNA and Ki67 were examined by flow cytometry in stromal cells from two individual donors maintained for 9 days under each differentiation condition (Fig. 6). While the majority of cells under undifferentiated conditions were in $G_0/G1$ phase (69%), a greater percentage of cells under adipogenic or osteogenic conditions were in S phase (47 and 77%).

DISCUSSION

This study has defined the gene and protein expression profile of human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells; these results are summarized in Table 6. The phenotype of the human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells is similar to that of human bone marrow-derived stromal cells (Kuznetsov et al., 1997; Filshie et al., 1998; Nutall et al., 1998; Conget and Minguell, 1999; Gronthos et al., 1999; Park et al., 1999; Pittenger et al., 1999). In general, the two stromal cell populations share the same adhesion and receptor molecules (Simmons and Torok-Storb, 1991a,b; Haynesworth et al., 1992; Galmiche et al., 1993; Simmons et al., 1994; Li et al., 1995; Rickard et al., 1996; Gronthos et al., 1997, 1999; Kuznetsov et al., 1997; Bruder et al., 1997, 1998; Filshie et al., 1998; Hicok et al., 1998; Majumdar et al., 1998; Barry et al., 1999; Conget and Minguell, 1999; Pittenger et al., 1999; Remy-Martin et al., 1999). Two of these common surface markers, CD105 and CD166, have been used to define a bone marrow stromal cell population defined as mesenchymal stem cells or MSCs which are capable of adipogenesis, chondrogenesis, osteogenesis, and hematopoietic support (Haynesworth et al., 1992; Bruder et al., 1998; Majumdar et al., 1998, 2000; Barry et al., 1999; Cortes et al., 1999; Pittenger et al., 1999). A number of the surface markers have been implicated in hematopoietic support. For example, antibodies directed against CD9 (Oritani et al., 1996; Aoyama et al., 1999), CD29 (Jacobsen et al., 1992; Wu et al., 1994), CD44 (Miyake et al., 1990), CD49_d (Miyake et al., 1991a), and CD106 (Miyake et al., 1991b; Funk et al., 1995) interfere with the proliferation and differentiation of hematopoietic stem cells. Preliminary studies indicate that adipose tissue-derived stromal cells are capable of supporting hematopoiesis in vitro (R.W.S.,



Control



Fig. 4. Representative phase contrast photomicrographs of human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells cultured under control, adipogenic, or osteogenic conditions. Adipogenic cultures were stained with Oil Red O 14 days after induction while osteogenic cultures were stained with Alizarin Red after 21 days of culture.



Fig. 5. Histochemical detection of protein expression by human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells cultured under control (undifferentiated), adipogenic, or osteogenic conditions. Adipose tissue-derived stromal cells were maintained for 9 days under each growth condition, fixed, and immunohistochemically stained with antibodies detecting

 $\alpha\text{-smooth}$ muscle actin, CD44, or CD146 and an appropriate peroxidase coupled secondary antibodies. No histochemical staining was obtained on slides stained with the secondary antibody alone. Representative of n = 5 donors.

Marker	Pre-adipocyte	Adipocyte	Mineral
CD14		_	_
CD29	++/+	++	++/+
CD31	_	_	_
CD34	_	_	_
CD44	++/+	++/+	++/+
CD45	_	_	_
CD105	+	+	+
CD106	+	+	+
CD146	++/+/-	++/+/-	++/+/-
MyoD	_	_	_
Myoblast	_	_	_
α-SM actin	++/+/-	++/+/-	++/+/-
FIIIV-rag	_	_	_
STRO-1	_	_	_
Collagen-I	++/+	++/+/-	++/+
Collagen-III	++/+	++/+	++/+
Osteonectin	++/+	++/+	++/+
Osteopontin	+/	+/	+/-
C/EBPa	+/	++/+	++/+/-
ΡΡΑRγ	-	++/+/-	+/

TABLE 5. Immunohistochemistry of differentiated adipose derived stromal cells

Strong staining (++); Weak staining (+); Negative (-); Subpopulation (/). Abbreviations: VCAM-1, vascular cell adhesion molecule; α -SM actin, α -smooth muscle actin; FIIIV-rag, factor VIII related antigen; C/EBP α , CAAT/enhancer binding protein α ; PPAR γ , peroxisome proliferator activated receptor γ .

H.A.L., D.M.F., J.M.G., unpublished observations) in addition to their adipogenic and osteogenic capabilities.

The current study is not an exhaustive examination of the adipose tissue-derived stromal cell's surface protein profile; the bone marrow and other literature suggests that additional markers should be evaluated in the future. Candidate proteins include the integrins $\alpha_v \beta_3$ and $\alpha_v \beta_5$, which play a role in osteoclast support (McHugh et al., 2000) and adenoviral transduction (Conget and Minguell, 1999, 2000), respectively. The cadherin family also deserves further examination. Recent studies using murine embryonic fibroblasts indicate that the levels of N-cadherin, R-cadherin, and cadherin-11 change in association with adipocyte and ostoblast differentiation (Shin et al., 2000). The behavior of cadherin proteins on differentiating human adipose tissue-and bone marrow-derived stromal cells remains to be determined.

The protein expression profile of adipose tissuederived stromal cells is not identical to that of reported for bone marrow-derived stromal cells in the literature. While adipose derived stromal cells are STRO-1 negative, cultured bone marrow stromal cells are reported as STRO-1 positive; however, it should be noted that these STRO-1 positive cells represent less than 3-5% of the total bone marrow stromal population (Simmons et al., 1991; Simmons and Torok-Storb, 1991a,b; Gronthos et al., 1994, 1999; Oyajobi et al., 1999; Stewart et al., 1999; Walsh et al., 2000). Indeed, there are conflicting reports concerning bone marrow stromal cell expression of specific proteins. For example, bone marrow stromal cells are reported as both CD49_d negative (Pittenger

Fig. 6. Flow cytometric analysis of cell proliferation markers PCNA and Ki-67. Human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells were maintained for 9 days under control, adipogenic, or osteogenic growth conditions. Fixed cells were double stained with a FITC-conjugated Ki-67 antibody (X-axis) and a PE-conjugated PCNA antibody (Y-axis) and analyzed by flow cytometry. The percentage of cells in different stages of the cell cycle are indicated. Representative of n = 2 donors.



	Positive		Negative	
Integrins	$ \begin{array}{c} \beta_1 \\ \alpha_4 \\ \mathbf{a}_a \end{array} $	$\begin{array}{c} \text{CD29} \\ \text{CD49}_{\text{d}} \\ \text{CD49}_{\text{e}} \end{array}$	$\beta_1 \\ \alpha_L \\ \alpha_M \\ \alpha_T$	CD18 CD11a CD11b CD11c
Metalloproteinase	CALLA Aminopeptidase N	CD10 CD13	u _X	obiit
Adhesion Receptor molecule	Tetraspan Hyaluronate ICAM-1 Endoglin VCAM Muc18 ALCAM	$\begin{array}{c} {\rm CD9} \\ {\rm CD44} \\ {\rm CD54} \\ {\rm CD105} \\ {\rm CD106} \\ {\rm CD146} \\ {\rm CD166} \end{array}$	PECAM ICAM-3 NCAM E Selectin	CD31 CD50 CD56 CD62e
Extracell matrix	Collagen Type I Collagen Type III Osteopontin Osteonectin		STRO-1 Factor VIII related A	Ag
Smooth Muscle Hematopoietic	$\substack{\alpha \text{-smooth muscle actin}\\ \text{CD34}^1 }$		LCA	CD14 CD45
HLA Other	A,B,C (Class I) DAF Complement protectin	CD55 CD59	DR (Class II)	

TABLE 6. Undifferentiated human adipose stromal cell protein summary^a

^aData presented is based on results obtained by flow cytometry or immunohistochemical staining of human adipose tissue-derived stromal cells. Superscript "1" indicates positive staining based on flow cytometry but negative staining based on immunohistochemistry. Abbreviations: ALCAM, activated lymphocyte cell adhesion molecule; CALLA, common acute lymphocytic leukemia antigen; CD, cluster of differentiation; DAF, decay

Abbreviations: ALCAM, activated lymphocyte cell adhesion molecule; CALLA, common acute lymphocytic leukemia antigen; CD, cluster of differentiation; DAF, decay accelerating factor; E selectin, endothelial selectin; HLA, histocompatibility locus antigens; ICAM, intercellular adhesion molecule; LCA, leukocyte common antigen; NCAM, neural cell adhesion molecule; PECAM, platelet endothelial cell adhesion molecule; VCAM, vascular cell adhesion molecule.

et al., 1999; Conget and Minguell, 1999) and as weakly positive (Simmons et al., 1994). While Pittenger et al. (1999) and Simmons et al. (1994) detected CD106 by flow cytometry, Conget and Minguell (1999) did not. Likewise, human bone marrow stromal cells have been described as both CD34 positive (Simmons and Torok-Storb, 1991a,b) and negative (Pittenger et al., 1999, Conget and Minguell, 1999). Some of these discrepancies may reflect the proliferative stage of the cells in culture. Alternatively, donor heterogeneity may be responsible. Additional studies will be required to fully define the differences between human adipose tissueand bone marrow-derived stromal cells.

While the bone marrow has been the major source of multipotent stromal cells, other tissues may prove to be alternatives. For example, mesenchymal progenitor cells capable of multiple differentiation pathways were recently isolated from umbilical cord blood (Erices et al., 2000). The current findings now identify the adipose tissue as another site containing stromal cells with phenotypic characteristics resembling those of stromal cells from the bone marrow microenvironment.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

The authors would like to thank the following individuals for their assistance: Nicole Ellis, Danuta Sujkowski, Dr. Anindita Sen, and Dr. Y. Renee Lea-Currie at Zen-Bio, Inc. for tissue preparation and critical comments; Dr. Yuan-Di C. Halvorsen and Dr. William O. Wilkinson at Artecel Sciences, Inc. for critical comments; Geoffery Erickson at Duke University Medical Center for technical comments and assistance; Dr. Sam Wurster (Cary, N.C.), Dr. Ron Riefkohl (Durham, N.C.), Dr. Vern Lanier (Durham, N.C.), and Dr. George Cowan and Dr. Cynthia Buffington (Memphis, TN) and their patients for tissue donation and collection.

LITERATURE CITED

- Aoyama K, Oritani K, Yokota T, Ishikawa J, Nishiura T, Miyake K, Kanakura Y, Tomiyama Y, Kincade PW, Matsuzawa Y. 1999. Stromal cell CD9 regulates differentiation of hematopoietic stem/ progenitor cells. Blood 93:2586-2594.
- Barry FP, Boynton RE, Haynesworth S, Murphy JM, Zaia J. 1999. The monoclonal antibody SH-2, raised against human mesenchymal stem cells, recognizes an epitope on endoglin (CD105). Biochem Biophys Res Commun 265:134–139.
- Bianco P, Robey PG. 2000. Marrow stromal stem cells. J Clin Investig 105:1663-1668.
- Bruder SP, Horowitz MC, Mosca JD, Haynesworth S. 1997. Monoclonal antibodies reactive with human osteogenic cell surface antigens. Bone 21:225-235.
- Bruder SP, Ricalton NS, Boynton RE, Connolly TJ, Jaiswal N, Zaia J, Barry FP. 1998. Mesenchymal stem cell surface antigen SB-10 corresponds to activated leukocyte cell adhesion molecule and is involved in osteogenic differentiation. J Bone Miner Res 13655– 13663.
- Chomczynski P, Sacchi N. 1987. Single step method of RNA isolation by acid guanidium, isothiocyanate-phenol-chloroform extraction. Anal Biochem 162:156-159.
- Conget PA, Minguell JJ. 1999. Phenotypical and functional properties of human bone marrow mesenchymal progenitor cells. J Cell Physiol 181:67–73.
- Conget PA, Minguell JJ. 2000. Adenoviral mediated gene transfer into ex vivo expanded human bone marrow mesenchymal progenitor cells. Exp Hematol 28:382–390.
- Cortes F, Deschaseaux F, Uchida N, Labastie MC, Friera AM, He D, Charbord P, Peault B. 1999. HCA, an immunoglobulin-like adhesion molecule present on the earliest human hematopoietic precursor cells, is also expressed by stromal cells in blood-forming tissues. Blood 93:826–837.
- Deschaseaux F, Charbord P. 2000. Human marrow stromal precursors are alpha1 integrin subunit-positive. J Cell Physiol 184:319–325.
- Erices A, Conget P, Minguell J. 2000. Mesenchymal progenitor cells in human umbilical cord blood. Br J Haematol 109:235–242.

- Filshie RJ, Zannettino AC, Makrynikola V, Gronthos S, Henniker AJ, Bendall LJ, Gottlieb DJ, Simmons PJ, Bradstock KF. 1998. MUC18, a member of the immunoglobulin superfamily, is expressed on bone marrow fibroblasts and a subset of hematological malignancies. Leukemia 12:414-421.
- Funk PE, Stephan RP, Witte PL. 1995. Vascular cell adhesion molecule 1-positive reticular cells express interleukin-7 and stem cell factor in the bone marrow. Blood 86:2661-2671.
- Galmiche MC, Koteliansky VE, Briere J, Herve P, Charbord P. 1993. Stromal cells from human long-term marrow cultures are mesenchymal cells that differentiate following a vascular smooth muscle differentiation pathway. Blood 82:66-76.
- Gimble JM. 1990. The function of adipocytes in the bone marrow stroma. New Biol 2:304-312.
- Gimble JM, Pietrangeli C, Henley A, Dorheim MA, Silver J, Namen A, Takeichi M, Goridis Ć, Kincade PW. 1989. Characterization of murine bone marrow and spleen-derived stromal cells: analysis of leukocyte marker and growth factor mRNA transcript levels. Blood 74:303-311.
- Gimble JM, Robinson CE, Wu X, Kelly KA. 1996. The function of adipocytes in the bone marrow stroma: an update. Bone 19:421 428
- Gronthos S, Graves SE, Ohta S, Simmons PJ. 1994. The STRO-1⁺ fraction of adult human bone marrow contains the osteogenic precursors. Blood 84:4164-4173.
- Gronthos S, Stewart K, Graves SE, Hay S, Simmons PJ. 1997. Integrin expression and function on human osteoblast-like cells. J Bone Miner Res 12:1189-1197.
- Gronthos S, Zannettino ACW, Graves SE, Ohta S, Hay SJ, Simmons PJ. 1999. Differential cell surface expression of the STRO-1 and alkaline phosphatase antigens on discrete developmental stages in primary cultures of human bone cells. J Bone Min Res 14:47–56.
- Halvorsen Y-DC, Bond A, Sen A, Franklin DM, Lea-Currie YR, Ellis PN, Wilkison WO, Gimble JM. 2001. Thiazolidinediones and glucocorticoids synergistically induce differentiation of human adipose tissue stromal cells: biochemical, cellular and molecular analysis. Metabolism 50:407-413.
- Hauner H, Entenmann G, Wabitsch M, Gaillard D, Ailhaud G, Negrel R, Pfeiffer EF. 1989. Promoting effect of glucocorticoids on the differentiation of human adipocyte precursor cells cultured in a chemically defined medium. J Clin Invest 84:1663-1670.
- Haynesworth SE, Baber MA, Caplan AI. 1992. Cell surface antigens on human marrow-derived mesenchymal cells are detected by monoclonal antibodies. Bone 13:69-80.
- Hicok KC, Thomas T, Gori F, Rickard DJ, Spelsberg TC, Riggs BL. 1998. Development and characterization of conditionally immortalized osteoblast precursor cell lines from human bone marrow stroma. J Bone Min Res 13:205-217
- Jacobsen K, Miyake K, Kincade PW, Osmond DG. 1992. Highly restricted expression of a stromal cell determinant in mouse bone marrow in vivo. J Exp Med 176:927-935.
- Kaplan FS, Hahn GV, Zasloff MA. 1994. Heterotopic ossification: two rare forms and what they can teach us. J Am Acad Orthop Surg 2.288 - 296
- Kincade PW, Lee G, Pietrangeli CE, Hayashi S-I, Gimble JM. 1988. Cells and molecules that regulate B lymphopoiesis in bone marrow. Annu Rev Immunol 7:111-143.
- Kuznetsov SA, Krebsbach PH, Satomura K, Kerr J, Riminucci M, Benayahu D, Robey PG. 1997. Single-colony derived strains of human marrow stromal fibroblasts form bone after transplantation in vivo. J Bone Min Res 12:1335-1347.
- Landberg G, Tan EM, Roos G. 1990. Flow cytometric multiparameter analysis of proliferating cell nuclear antigen/cyclin and Ki-67 antigen: a new view of the cell cycle. Exp Cell Res 187:111–118. Li J, Sensebe L, Herve P, Charbord P. 1995. Nontransformed colony-
- derived stromal cell lines from normal human marrows. II. Phenotypic characterization and differentiation pathway. Exp Hematol 23:133-134
- Majumdar MK, Thiede MA, Mosca JD, Moorman M, Gerson SL. 1998. Phenotypic and functional comparison of cultures of marrowderived mesenchymal stem cells (MSCs) and stromal cells. J Cell Physiol 176:57-66
- Majumdar MK, Banks V, Peluso DP, Morris EA. 2000. Isolation, characterization, and chondrogenic potential of human bone marrow-derived multipotential stromal cells. J Cell Physiol 185: 98-106.

- McHugh KP, Hodivala Dilke K, Zheng MH, Namba N, Lam J, Novack D, Feng X, Ross FP, Hynes RO, Teitelbaum SL. 2000. Mice lacking B3 integrins are osteosclerotic because of dysfunctional osteoclasts. J Clin Invest 105:433-440.
- Miyake K, Medina KL, Hayashi S, Ono S, Hamaoka T, Kincade PW. 1990. Monoclonal antibodies to Pgp-1/CD44 block lympho-hemopoiesis in long-term bone marrow cultures. J Exp Med 171:477-488.
- Miyake K, Medina K, Ishihara K, Kimoto M, Auerbach R, Kincade PW. 1991a. A VCAM-like adhesion molecule on murine bone marrow stromal cells mediates binding of lymphocyte precursors in culture. J Cell Biol 114:557-565.
- Miyake K, Weissman IL, Greenberger JS, Kincade PW. 1991b. Evidence for a role of the integrin VLA-4 in lympho-hemopoiesis. J Exp Med 173:599-607.
- Nuttall ME, Gimble JM. 2000. Is there a therapeutic opportunity to prevent or treat osteopenic disorders by inhibiting marrow adipogenesis? Bone 27:177-184.
- Nuttall ME, Patton AJ, Olivera DL, Nadeau DP, Gowen M. 1998. Human trabecular bone cells are able to express both osteoblastic and adipocytic phenotype: implications for osteopenic disorders. J Bone Min Res 13:371-382.
- Oritani K, Wu X, Medina K, Hudson J, Miyake K, Gimble JM, Burstein SA, Kincade PW. 1996. Antibody ligation of CD9 modifies production of myeloid cells in long term cultures. Blood 87:2252-2261
- Owen M. 1988. Marrow stromal stem cells. J. Cell Sci Suppl 10:63-76.
- Oyajobi BO, Lomri A, Hott M, Marie PJ. 1999. Isolation and characterization of human clonogenic osteoblast progenitors immunoselected from fetal bone marrow stroma using STRO-1 monoclonal antibody. J Bone Min Res 14:351–361. Park SR, Oreffo ROC, Triffitt JT. 1999. Interconversion Potential of
- Cloned Human Marrow Adipocytes in vitro. Bone 24:549-554
- Pittenger MF, Mackay AM, Beck SC, Jaiswal RK, Douglas R, Mosca JD, Moorman MA, Simonetti DW, Craig S, Marshak DR. 1999. Multilineage potential of adult human mesenchymal stem cells. Science 284:143-147.
- Remy-Martin JP, Marandin A, Challier B, Bernard G, Deschaseaux M, Herve P, Wei Y, Tsuji T, Auerbach R, Dennis JE, Moore KA, Greenberger J.S, Charbord P. 1999. Vascular smooth muscle differentiation of murine stroma: a sequential model. Exp Hematol 27:1782-1795.
- Rickard D.J, Kassem M, Heggeran T.E, Sarkar G, Spelsberg T.C, Riggs B.L. 1996. Isolation and characterization of osteoblast precursor cells from human bone marrow. J Bone Min Res 11:312 - 324.
- Shin CS, Lecanda F, Sheikh S, Weitzmann L, Cheng SL, Civitelli R. 2000. Relative abundance of different cadherins defines differentiation of mesenchymal precursors into osteogenic, myogenic, or adipogenic pathways. J. Cell Biochem 78:566-577.
- Simmons P.J, Torok-Storb B. 1991a. Identification of stromal cell precursors in human bone marrow by a novel monoclonal antibody, STRO-1 Blood 78:55-62.
- Simmons PJ, Torok-Storb B. 1991b. CD34 expression by stromal precursors in normal human adult bone marrow. Blood 78:2848-2853
- Simmons PJ, Gronthos S, Zannettino A, Ohta S, Graves SE. 1994. Isolation, characterization and functional activity of human marrow stromal progenitors in hemopoiesis. Prog Clin Biol Res 389:271-280
- Stewart K, Walsh S, Screen J, Jefferiss CM, Chainey J, Jordan GR, Beresford J.N. 1999. Further characterization of cells expressing STRO-1 in cultures of adult human bone marrow stromal cells. J Bone Min Res 14:1345-1356.
- Thomas PS, Pietrangeli CE, Hayashi S, Schachner M, Goridis C, Low M, Kincade PW. 1988. Demonstration of neural cell adhesion molecules on stromal cells that support lymphopoiesis. Leukemia 2:171 - 175
- Walsh S, Jefferiss C, Stewart K, Jordan GR, Screen J, Beresford JN. 2000. Expression of the developmental markers STRO-1 and alkaline phosphatase in cultures of human marrow stromal cells: regulation by fibroblast growth factor (FGF)-2 and relationship to the expression of FGF receptors 1-4. Bone 27:185-195.
- Wu X, Miyake K, Medina KL, Kincade PW, Gimble JM. 1994 Recognition of murine integrin β_1 by a rat anti-stromal cell monoclonal antibody. Hybridoma 13:409–416.