1 2 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 3 4 NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 5 CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY, a non-profit corporation; SIERRA CLUB, a non-profit corporation; and PUBLIC EMPLOYEES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RESPONSIBILITY, 6 a non-profit corporation, Case No: C-00-0927 WHA (JCS) 8 Plaintiffs, 9 v. 10 BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT 11 Defendant, 12 REVISED STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER CONCERNING 13 INJUNCTIVE RELIEF FOR THE and, PENINSULAR RANGES BIGHORN HIGH DESERT MULTIPLE USE 14 SHEEP COALITION, DESERT VIPERS 15 MOTORCYCLE CLUB, SAN DIEGO OFF-ROAD COALITION, CALIFORNIA 16 ASSOCIATION OF 4-WHEEL DRIVE CLUBS, and THE BLUE RIBBON 17 COALITION, 18 **Defendant-Intervenors** 19 20 21 WHEREAS, Plaintiffs, Center for Biological Diversity, Sierra Club and Public Employees for 22 Environmental Responsibility ("Plaintiffs") filed this action on March 16, 2000, alleging that the federal 23 defendant, Bureau of Land Management ("BLM") was in violation of Section 7 of the Endangered 24 Species Act ("ESA") by failing to enter into formal consultation with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service 25 ("FWS") on the effects of the adoption and implementation of the California Desert Conservation Area 26 Plan, as amended, ("CDCA Plan") on threatened and endangered species. 16 U.S.C. § 1536(a)(2); 27 WHEREAS, in a Stipulation approved by the Court on August 25, 2000, BLM acknowledged 28 that because activities authorized, permitted, or allowed under the CDCA Plan may adversely affect REVISED STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER

5

12

13

16

23

2526

27

28

of the CDCA Plan is not likely to jeopardize the continued existence of any threatened or endangered species or to result in the destruction or adverse modification of the critical habitat of any such species;

WHEREAS, the parties would like to avoid unnecessary litigation of the need for an immediate injunction.

THEREFORE, the parties agree as follows:

- 1. BLM will maintain in effect all existing voluntary recreation trail closures on public lands managed by BLM in Peninsular Bighorn Sheep habitat, including the existing lambing season closures of the Art Smith, North Lykken, and Boo Hoff/Guadalupe trails and Cathedral Canyon trail and canyon. In addition, BLM will initiate lambing season voluntary trail closures of the Morrow, Clara Burgess, Bear Creek Oasis and Dunn Road trails.
- 2. BLM will provide five (5) full time employees during the period January 1 through June 30 of each year for which this agreement is in effect. These five employees will be known as "Sheep Ambassadors." The Sheep Ambassadors' primary duty will be to ensure the implementation of voluntary closures on the public land sections of seven (7) recreational trails from January 1 through June 30 each year. Sheep Ambassadors will generally occupy trailheads and patrol the trails intercepting potential trail users and informing them of the voluntary closure and the reasons for it. Periodically, Sheep Ambassadors will patrol high use or problem areas where trail use is most likely to occur. The seven trails are the Boo Hoff/Guadalupe Trail, the Morrow Trail, the Clara Burgess Trail, the Cathedral Canyon Trail (and canyon), the Bear Creek Oasis Trail, the Art Smith Trail and the Dunn Road. The relevant patrol locations or trailheads are the Art Smith Trail, Clara Burgess/Lower Dunn/Cathedral Canyon, the Upper Dunn and those at La Quinta Cove and Lake Cahuilla (the La Quinta Cove and Lake Cahuilla trailheads serve the Boo Hoff/Guadalupe, Morrow and Bear Creek Oasis trails). On weekends a law enforcement ranger will be available to support these trail monitoring efforts and the Dunn Road Closure. A Sheep Ambassador will visit the Martinez Canyon Road Cherrystem on weekends primarily to monitor OHV use but should otherwise assist in monitoring higher use areas. The Sheep Ambassadors will also monitor the seven trail areas for illegal OHV use that will be immediately reported to law enforcement for timely response. The Sheep Ambassadors will keep daily logs of their efforts to implement the voluntary closures, of their success, and of any OHV use observed.

12 13

14 15

> 16 17

19

18

2021

2223

2425

26

27

28

BLM will provide the Plaintiffs with these daily logs and any other monitoring or other reports generated by these employees upon request and/or quarterly.

- 3. Consistent with BLM Environmental Assessment CA-066-96-43, dated September 24, 1996 and signed November 28, 2000, BLM shall close the Art Smith Trailhead by maintaining a closed gate from February 1 through June 30 of each year to minimize the disturbance to Bighorn Sheep during this vulnerable period.
- 4. BLM will initiate a "hot season" or "water stress" trail signing and education program from July 1 to September 30 each year. This "hot season" trail signing and education program will take place on the Art Smith, Boo Hoff/Guadalupe, Bear Creek Oasis, Dunn Road, and Carrizo Canyon trails. This "hot season" trail signing and education program will be implemented by placing prominent signs at the following locations: (A) for the Art Smith Trail, at BLM Section 2 at least 1/2 mile southeast of a slot canyon with palm oasis, and at the western boundary of BLM Section 22 in Magnesia Spring Canyon; (B) for the Guadalupe Trail, at the junction with the Boo Hoff Trail; (C) for the Bear Creek Oasis Trail, where the trail leaves the wash and starts up the hill (the junction with the Bear Creek Canyon Trail); (D) for the Dunn Road, by the Art Smith Trail signs listed above; and (E) for Carrizo Canyon, by two access points where hikers enter the Canyon from Highway 74 on BLM land. These signs shall state "Sensitive Bighorn Sheep Watering Area Ahead Please Turn Around Here To Avoid Disturbing Bighorn Sheep in this Area From July 1 to September 30." In addition, on the Boo Hoff Trail, within 1/2 mile to either side of the "Mystery Canyon" dead-end trail, BLM shall place signs reading "Sensitive Bighorn Sheep Area. Please Stay on Trail." Finally, to accomplish this "hot season" trail signing and education program BLM shall maintain at least one of the Sheep Ambassadors to implement this program. This "summer" Sheep Ambassador will generally patrol the trail locations listed above. The summer Sheep Ambassador will keep daily logs of his/her efforts to implement the hot season trail signing and education program and of his/her success. BLM will provide the Plaintiffs with these daily logs and other monitoring or other reports generated by this employee upon request and/or quarterly.
- 5. BLM will increase its environmental education efforts concerning the effects of recreational trails on Peninsular Bighorn Sheep lambing habitat and watering areas. BLM's educational

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

regular maintenance, and replacement of damaged or stolen signs which are on BLM managed public lands, and a revised informational flyer for distribution at trailheads by the Sheep Ambassadors and for placement in any existing or new BLM kiosk boxes. BLM's revised informational flyer will also be available at all BLM offices throughout the CDCA and will be provided to adjacent Forest Service and State Parks offices within the historic range of the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep. BLM's public education campaign will also include an opinion/editorial, consistent with the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep Recovery Plan. The opinion/editorial will discuss the importance of the voluntary trail closure program and the importance of the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep to our natural heritage. The opinion/editorial will be officially signed by BLM and distributed to English and Spanish language newspapers in Southern California by March 15, 2001. BLM shall also issue at least one widely distributed press release to English and Spanish language newspapers in Southern California by March 15, 2001 announcing the voluntary trail closure program and BLM shall purchase several radio advertisements, from stations in the Coachella Valley and Inland Empire doing the same. In addition, BLM shall prepare an 17 informational presentation or slide show on the voluntary trail closure program and present this 18 informational show to schools in the vicinity of Peninsular Bighorn Sheep habitat.

- 6. BLM will not open the gate to the parking lot for the Art Smith trail during the period January 1 through June 30 of each year, and will seek the California Department of Fish and Game's cooperation in keeping the gate closed during that time period.
- 7. BLM will install new signs at logical and historical access points to Carrizo Canyon from the Art Smith Trail. These signs will inform the public of State closures affecting Carrizo Canyon. BLM will coordinate the placement and the wording of these new signs with the California Department of Fish and Game and the Plaintiffs. BLM shall install the signs by April 15, 2001.
- 8. BLM will not improve or maintain or authorize improvement or maintenance of the Martinez Canyon/Cactus Spring Trail beyond the Martinez Canyon cherry-stem. BLM will not authorize or permit the use of pack stock to assist in the restoration of the Martinez Canyon Cabin.

BLM agrees to place signs on Martinez Canyon Road and Trail, warning against illegal use of OHVs and to enforce the OHV prohibition at the Wilderness boundary. BLM will coordinate the placement of these new boundary signs with the Plaintiffs. Plaintiffs shall be consulted by March 15, 2001 and the signs shall be in place by March 30, 2001.

- 9. The parties agree that nothing in this stipulation shall prevent BLM from cooperating with responsible wildlife agencies in their trail use research, monitoring and enforcement efforts.
- 10. BLM will discuss the impacts of aircraft flights over Peninsular Bighorn Sheep habitat with the Desert Manager's Group (DMG). BLM will also discuss the overflight issue with the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep Recovery Team, the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, the Federal Aviation Administration, the Department of Defense, and other appropriate governmental agencies. BLM will present the views of the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep Recovery team and the results of existing studies, to the overflight working group of the DMG at its next scheduled meeting and will discuss with the working group at that meeting the question of whether there is a need for restrictions on overflights of Bighorn Sheep habitat, including a limit on the distance above the ground for military and all other overflights.
- 11. The parties agree that nothing in this Stipulation shall be construed to prohibit BLM or FWS permits for research, inventory, and monitoring activities involving helicopter flights over and landings on public land, so long as the flights and landings are for the purpose of legitimate research, inventory, and monitoring developed in consultation with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service.
- 12. BLM will not approve any new lands or minerals authorizations, or modifications of any existing lands or minerals authorizations, within Peninsular Bighorn Sheep habitat with the following exceptions:
 - a. authorizations within the I-8 utility corridor;
 - b. exchanges or acquisitions of land designed to benefit Peninsular Bighorn Sheep;
- c. authorizations that do not involve any new surface disturbance or other new disturbance affecting Bighorn Sheep.
- BLM will notify the Plaintiffs of any new proposed authorizations and any exchanges or acquisitions designed to benefit Peninsular Bighorn Sheep for at least 90 days before reaching any final decision on

EVISED STIPULATION

the proposed authorization, exchange, or acquisition.

- 13. BLM shall close and block the Painted Gorge Road, leading to the top of Carrizo Peak in the Coyote Mountains in Imperial County, at the first practical location past or above (Northwest of) the Imperial County mineral material pit, from January 1 to July 30 each year.
- 14. BLM will not issue any new or re-issue any existing special recreation or other special use permits for use between January 1 and September 30 which "may affect" Peninsular Bighorn Sheep within the meaning of Section 7 of the ESA.
- 15. A review of survey records for the Santa Rosa Wilderness boundary indicated the possibility of a trespass by the Quarry Golf Course onto public lands. BLM will further investigate this trespass and any other trespass by the Quarry Golf Course onto public lands and initiate a trespass action by notice to the landowner by February 20, 2001. BLM shall pursue full restoration of the public lands and removal of any Golf Course modifications from the designated Wilderness area if the trespass is verified.
 - 16. Concerning the Dunn Road, BLM will:
- a. Not authorize, permit, or carry out any improvement of the Dunn Road on public lands (including improvement by private parties). *BLM will require prior approval for any maintenance of the Dunn Road which exceeds that which can be accomplished by one or two persons without the aid of mechanized and/or motorized equipment. Major maintenance or any maintenance on public lands involving the use of mechanized or motorized equipment must be approved prior to initiation of the activity. In reviewing any request for maintenance under this provision, BLM shall undertake all analyses required by the National Environmental Policy Act, the Endangered Species Act, and any other applicable provisions of statute or regulation;*
 - b. Not grant any rights of way over the Dunn Road;
- c. Close all gates on public lands which affect access along the Dunn Road and secure them with new locks by March 15, 2001;
- d. Repair all fences, to prevent unauthorized vehicular access to the Dunn Road on the public lands adjacent to these access gates by January 30, 2001 and will construct new/additional fences to prevent unauthorized access, as necessary, by October 30, 2001, and maintain them thereafter;

1	h.	BLM	may provide o
2	cannot be accessed by	motor	rized vehicle e
3		(1) La	ndowners mu
4		(2) Ge	enerally, no m
5		only o	one of these tri
6		exit fr	om the same g
7		(3)	A "trip" will
8		Road.	If the destinat
9		and th	e Dunn Road,
10		of the	trip is South
11		trip m	ust enter and
12		(4)	A "trip" may
13		(5)	Trips must b
14		appro	priate gate. L
15		Dunn	Road within I
16		or dur	ing emergence
17		have o	demonstrated
18		(6)	Keys to the
19		return	ed to BLM on
20		(7)	Each month
21		lando	wner trips if th
22		needs	
23		(7)	Trips by the
24		lando	wner trips unl
25		natura	al and cultural
26		(8)	Trips by the
27		Servic	ce for emerger
28		the Co	alifornia Depa
	il .		

- h. BLM may provide conditional access to non-federal landowners whose lands cannot be accessed by motorized vehicle except via the Dunn Road on the following terms:
 - (1) Landowners must obtain approval from BLM for each trip on the Dunn Road.
 - (2) Generally, no more than two landowner trips a week may be permitted and only one of these trips may be on a weekend. All landowner trips must enter and exit from the same gate;
 - (3) A "trip" will consist of one journey in and one journey out along the Dunn Road. If the destination of the trip is North of the juncture of the Art Smith Trail and the Dunn Road, the trip must enter and exit from the North. If the destination of the trip is South of the juncture of the Art Smith Trail and the Dunn Road, the trip must enter and exit from the South.
 - (4) A "trip" may include no more than eight motorized vehicles;
 - (5) Trips must be met by a BLM ranger or Sheep Ambassador at the appropriate gate. Landowners will be advised not to stop their vehicles on the Dunn Road within Bighorn Sheep habitat other than when on their own property or during emergencies such as vehicle breakdowns or flat tires. Landowners who have demonstrated non-compliance may be denied future access;
 - (6) Keys to the locks on the gates will be loaned to the landowner and returned to BLM on the next BLM business day.
 - (7) Each month, BLM may authorize a reasonable number of additional landowner trips if the two trips per-week limit cannot accommodate landowner needs.
 - (7) Trips by the Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians will count as landowner trips unless these trips are for emergency purposes or for purposes of natural and cultural resource management;
 - (8) Trips by the Agua Caliente Band of Cahuilla Indians or the U.S. Forest Service for emergency purposes or for natural and cultural resource management, the California Department of Fish and Game for natural resource management,

the Forest Service for tamarisk removal efforts, the Coachella Valley Mountains
Conservancy for the purposes of carrying out its statutory duties, the Riverside
County Flood Control and Water Conservation District for the purposes of
inspecting and maintaining its rain sensors, and trips by the Palm Springs Police
and Fire Departments and Cathedral City Police and Fire Departments for
emergency purposes will not count as landowner trips, but must be reported to the
BLM;

- (9) All trips and use of specific keys will be logged and recorded by BLM. BLM will provide the Plaintiffs with all trip and key records upon request and/or quarterly;
- (10) If a key is lost, BLM will notify and consult with plaintiffs regarding corrective action.
- i. No commercial use of the Dunn Road will be authorized by permit or otherwise,
 except the current permit holder will have the right to use the Dunn Road until the current permit
 expires on June 30, 2001;
- j. The above limitations will not apply to trips by entities conducting legitimate research, inventory and monitoring and this Stipulation will not be construed to limit or hinder legitimate research, inventory and monitoring efforts as approved in consultation with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service;
- k. BLM will install at least two traffic counters on the Dunn Road by March 15, 2001. These traffic counters will be placed to ensure all vehicle trips are recorded. BLM will provide that at least one of the traffic counters records the date and time on which a vehicle passes the counter. All records produced by these traffic counters will be provided to the Plaintiffs upon request and/or quarterly.
- 17. BLM will have a wildlife biologist, natural resource, specialist or, other appropriate staff its El Centro and Palm Springs Offices attend all meetings of the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep recovery team or its successor organization.

- 18. BLM will maintain in effect and enforce the existing dog closure in Peninsular Bighorn Sheep habitat. BLM shall provide law enforcement in support of this dog closure and shall provide the Plaintiffs with summary information concerning the number of tickets issued and the location of the violations upon request and/or quarterly.
- 19. BLM will not locate a "dog use area" on the east side of California State Highway 74. Before locating any new "dog use area," BLM will consult with the U.S. Fish and Wildlife Service, and will seek the views of the Bighorn Institute, and the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep Recovery team concerning the location of any "dog use area." Any new "dog use area" shall not be within a mile of the Bighorn Institute.
- 20. Removal of the picnic tables and hitching posts on the top of Murray Hill will be considered among the alternatives analyzed in the Coachella Valley Multiple Species Habitat Conservation Plan amendment to the CDCA Plan.
- 21. In consideration of the actions to be taken by BLM, Plaintiffs agree that they will not seek injunctive relief through this litigation with respect to the Peninsular Bighorn Sheep so long as BLM complies with the terms of this stipulation. Nothing in this Stipulation shall be construed so as to prevent Plaintiffs from challenging any action in the CDCA affecting Peninsular Bighorn Sheep for reasons other than BLM's failure to consult on the CDCA Plan.
- 22. This Stipulation shall not be interpreted or construed as an admission by any of the parties of any claim or defense in this litigation.
- 23. Nothing in this Stipulation shall be interpreted or construed as a commitment or requirement that the BLM or any other federal agency obligate or pay funds in contravention of the Anti-Deficiency Act, 31 U.S.C. 1341, or any other applicable provision of law.
- 24. In complying with the terms of this agreement, BLM shall be subject to all applicable federal statutes and regulations, and nothing in this agreement shall be construed to require BLM to take any actions in contravention of any such applicable statutes or regulations.
- 25. This Stipulation is effective immediately upon its signature as an agreement among the signatories and is further effective as an Order of the Court upon its approval and entry as an Order by the Court. This Stipulation is to remain in effect until BLM receives a Biological Opinion from FWS on

the effects of the CDCA Plan on Peninsular Ranges Bighorn Sheep and implements any applicable terms and conditions, reasonable and prudent alternatives, and/or reasonable and prudent measures of the Opinion that require implementation.

26. For good cause, any party to this stipulation may ask any other to modify this agreement. Any such request for modification shall be in writing. If after 30 days the parties are unable to agree upon the requested modification, the parties shall present their disagreement to the Court which may modify this agreement for good cause shown.

4

5

9

10

11

12

15

16

17

18 13

21

22

23

24

25

28

Da

Dated: 2/28/01

FOR PLAINTIFFS CENTER FOR BIOLOGICAL DIVERSITY; SIERRA CLUB AND PUBLIC EMPLOYEES FOR ENVIRONMENTAL RESPONSIBILITY

TAMES J. TUPCHTON

Farthjustice Environmental Law Clinic University of Denver-Forbes House 1714 Poplar Street Denver, CO 80220

BRENDAN CUMMINGS Law Office of Brendan Cummings 2325 Carleton St., Suite B Berkeley CA 94704

REVISED STIPULATION AND PROPOSED ORDER CONCERNING PENINSULAR BIGHORN SHEEP C-00-0927-WHA

	li de la companya de
1	
2	FOR DEFENDANT BUREAU OF LAND MANAGMENT
3	JOHN C. CRUDEN
4	Acting Assistant Attorney General
5	
6	Dated: 3/1/0/
7	UEAN E. WILLIAMS, Chief LISA LYNNE RUSSELL, Trial Attorney
8 9	U.S. Department of Justice Environment & Natural Resources Division
10	Wildlife & Marine Resources Section Ben Franklin Station, P.O. Box 7369 Washington, D.C. 20044-7369
11	·
12	ROBERT S. MUELLER, III, United States Attorney JAMES A. CODA, Asst. U.S. Attorney
	Northern District of California 10th Floor, Box 36055
13	450 Golden Gate Avenue
14	San Francisco, CA 94102
15	
16	
17	Dated: 3/1/0/ Leni Sissi
18	HENRI BISSON Assistant Director
19	Renewable Resources & Planning
20	BUREAU OF LAND MANAGEMENT 1849 C St NW, Washington, DC 20240
21	
22	
23	
24	: -
25	- -
26	
27	
- 1	
28	
- 11	PRIMARY CHIPMAN AND PROPERTY OF THE PROPERTY O

PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO ORDERED.				
DATED the	_day of	, 2001		
		WILLIAM ALSUP UNITED STATES DISTRICT JUDGE		
3				
2 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 7 3 3 4 5 5 7 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7 8 7		PURSUANT TO STIPULATION, IT IS SO		