

Appendix B: Area of Critical Environmental Concern (ACEC) and Research Natural Area (RNA) Comparison Tables

Table B-1. Kigluaik ACEC and Mount Osborn RNA–Alternative Comparison Table ...	B-3
Table B-2. Western Arctic Caribou Herd Calving and Insect Relief Habitat ACEC– Alternative Comparison Table.....	B-6
Table B-3. McCarthy’s Marsh ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table	B-9
Table B-4. Kuzitrin River ACEC—Alternative Comparison Table	B-11
Table B-5. Nulato Hills ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table	B-13
Table B-6. Shaktoolik, Ungalik, and Inglutalik Watershed ACECs–Alternative Comparison Table.....	B-15

Table B-1. Kigluaik ACEC and Mount Osborn RNA--Alternative Comparison Table

Management Actions	Alternatives				D: Preferred Long-term Management
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	
Decision	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate Kigluaik Mountains as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (382,000 acres)*	No RNA designation.	If sizable contiguous blocks of land remain in BLM ownership after conveyance, designate Mount Osborn as an RNA (Map 2-21) (84,000 acres)*
Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lb GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through activity plan.	Limited designation. Manage OHV use consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses (limits OHVs to vehicles under 1,500 lbs curb weight and staying on existing trails when possible).	Limited designation. Develop an OHV management plan which may implement limitations such as designated trails or seasonal closures.
Recreation Management	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis	Same as Alternative A	May limit # SRPs or #VUD and may require permits for transporters if conflicts occur.	Do not limit # SRPs or #VUD; do not require transporters to obtain permits.	May implement limits on #SRPs or VUD, or implement additional permitting requirements through activity plan.

Management Actions	Alternatives				D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management		
Fluid Mineral Leasing	Mostly closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native-selections. Open	Revoke withdrawals and open to leasing subject to Standard Stipulations and ROPs. Open subject to ROPs.	Closed	Closed by segregations for State- and Native-selections.	Same as Alternative B	
Solid Mineral Exploration	Open	Open subject to ROPs.	Closed	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B	
Locatable Minerals	Mostly closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native-selections. Open	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to ROPs. Open subject to ROPs	Closed. Retain (d)(1) withdrawal until such time as a new withdrawal from mineral entry and location is completed for the area.	Closed by segregations for State- and Native-selections.	Same as Alternative C	
Mineral Material Sales	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Closed	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B	
FLPMA and R&PP Leases	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO.	Same as Alternative A	Not allowed	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative C	
Rights-of-way	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	ROW avoidance area; limit communication site ROW to existing sites.	Consider on a case-by-case basis; limit communication site ROW to existing sites.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management	
Disposal Actions	Segregated due to selections or withdrawn under various PLOs; not currently identified as available for disposal.	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift.	Same as Alternative B	Segregated due to selections.	Retain	

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Long-term Management
Grazing	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Closed	Open-reindeer grazing only
VRM	No VRM designations	Mount Osborn VRM class II; remainder is VRM class III	Mostly VRM class II; small area VRM class III	Same as Alternative B

*Under Alternative C, the entire Kigluaik Mountain Range would be considered for ACEC designation. Under Alternative D, only the Mount Osborn area would be considered for designation as an RNA. Final acreage is dependant upon results of conveyance.

Table B-2. Western Arctic Caribou Herd Calving and Insect Relief Habitat ACEC--Alternative Comparison Table

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management
Decision	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate calving and critical insect relief habitat for the Western Arctic Caribou Herd as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (2,893,000 acres*)	D: Preferred Long-term Management Following adjudication of all selected lands, adjust ACEC boundaries to incorporate additional unencumbered BLM lands, into the ACEC (Map 2-21) (2,893,000 acres*)
Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lb GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through activity plan.	Limited designation: cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lb GVWR yearlong. Additional OHV limits may be developed through activity plans based upon resource values and management objectives. Limitations may include designated trails, seasonal restrictions or closures, or GVWR limits.
Recreation Management	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRP applications on case-by-case basis	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A

Management Actions	Alternatives				D: Preferred Interim Management	D: Preferred Long-term Management
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management		
Fluid Mineral Leasing	Closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native- selections.	Revoke withdrawals and open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs. Oil and gas leasing stipulations #6 and #7 would not apply.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to minor constraints such as seasonal restrictions; 300' NSO setback on Kivalina River; Develop habitat management plan before leasing.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
Solid Mineral Exploration	Open	Open subject to ROPs.	Closed	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
Locatable Minerals	Closed due to (d)(1) withdrawals and segregation for State and Native- selections.	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to ROPs.	Closed. Withdraw from mineral entry and location.	Same as Alternative B, plus a mining plan of operations would be required within ACEC.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
Mineral Material Sales	Open	Open subject to ROPS	Open subject to ROPs. Sale of mineral riverbed, ocean beach/lagoon, and lakeshore will not be permitted.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
FLPMA and R&PP Leases	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO.	Same as Alternative A	Not allowed	On selected lands, same as Alternative A; on unencumbered BLM lands same as Alternative C	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B

Management Actions	Alternatives				D: Preferred Long-term Management
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred Interim Management	
Rights-of-Way	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A; plus designate the Red Dog-Kuchiak Mine ROW Corridor.	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A. Plus develop measures to minimize impacts to caribou movements from ROW	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
Disposal Actions	Segregated or withdrawn under (d)(1); not identified as available for disposal.	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift.	Same as Alternative B	Segregated due to selections	Retain
Grazing	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Closed	Same as Alternative C	Same as Alternative C
VRM	No VRM designations	VRM Class IV	Mixture of VRM class II and class III	Mostly VRM class IV; VRM class II and III near Kivalina River.	Same as Alternative D-Interim Management
Wildlife Management	Consider impacts to wildlife habitat on project specific basis and develop appropriate mitigation measures	Same as Alternative A	Develop habitat management plan to mitigate impacts to caribou habitat from resource uses.	Same as Alternative C	Same as Alternative C

* Final acreage is dependent upon results of conveyance and will be considerably less than indicated in this table.

Table B-3. McCarthy’s Marsh ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table

Management Actions	Alternatives			D: Preferred
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	
Decision	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate McCarthy’s Marsh as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (131,000 acres*)	No ACEC designation
Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State’s Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lb GVWR yearlong.
Recreation Management	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage for dispersed recreational use; limit # VUD associated with SRPs; require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Same as Alternative B
Fluid Mineral Leasing	Currently closed under a combination of (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native- selections.	Revoke withdrawals and open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs. 300’ NSO setback on Fish River.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to minor constraints such as seasonal restrictions; 300’ NSO setback on Fish River and Boston Creek.
Solid Mineral Exploration	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Closed	Open subject to ROPs except 300’ setback on Fish River and Boston Creek which is closed.
Locatable Minerals	Currently closed under a combination of (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native- selections.	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to ROPs.	Closed	Withdraw 300’ setback on Boston Creek from entry under mining laws; remainder open subject to ROPs.

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
Mineral Material Sales	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Closed	Same as Alternative B
FLPMA and R&PP Leases	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative A
Rights-of-Way	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A
Disposal Actions	Segregated or withdrawn; not identified as available for disposal	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
Grazing	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	closed	closed
Fire	Manage per approved fire management plan	Develop fire management objectives through activity plan to protect lichen habitat.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
VRM	No VRM designation	VRM class IV	VRM class II	VRM class III and IV

*Final acreage may be less depending on results of conveyance.

Table B-4. Kuzitrin River ACEC—Alternative Comparison Table

Management Actions	Alternatives			D: Preferred
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	
Decision	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate Kuzitrin River as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (141,000 acres*)	No ACEC designation
Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lbs GVWR yearlong.
Recreation Management	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Limit # VUD associated with SRPs and require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Same as Alternative B
Fluid Mineral Leasing	Currently closed under a combination of (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native selections.	Revoke withdrawals and open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs; 300' NSO setback on Kuzitrin River.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to minor constraints such as seasonal restrictions; 300' NSO setback on the Kuzitrin River.
Solid Mineral Exploration	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Closed	Open subject to ROPs except for 300' setback on Kuzitrin River which is closed.

Management Actions	Alternatives			C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation		
Locatable Minerals	Currently closed under a combination of d(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native- selections. Open	Revoke (d)(1) withdrawals and open to mineral entry and location subject to ROPs.	Closed	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
Mineral Material Sales	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
FLPMA and R&PP Leases	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A
Rights-of-Way	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Same as Alternative A
Disposal Actions	Segregated or withdrawn; not identified as available for disposal	Segregated due to selections; retain after selections lift	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
Grazing	Open. Consider on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	closed	closed	closed
VRM	No VRM designation	VRM class IV	VRM class II	VRM class II	VRM class III

*Final acreage may be less depending on results of conveyance.

Table B-5. Nulato Hills ACEC–Alternative Comparison Table

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
Decision	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	Designate Nulato Hills as an ACEC (Map 2-20) (2,044,000 acres)*	Designate N. Nulato hills as ACEC (Map 2-21) (1,081,000 acres)*
Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lbs GVWR yearlong. Additional OHV limitations may be developed through ACEC plan.
Recreation Management	Manage for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on a case-by-case basis.	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage for dispersed recreational use; limit # VUD associated with SRPs; require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Same as Alternative B
Fluid Leasable Minerals	Northern part mostly closed due to (d)(1) withdrawal and segregation for State and Native- selections; Southern part mostly open except for segregation of State-selected lands.	Revoke withdrawals; open to mineral leasing subject to standard stipulations and ROPs; 300' NSO setback on Ungalik, Inglutalik, and Shaktoolik Rivers.	Closed	Open to leasing subject to minor constraints such as seasonal restrictions. Develop habitat management plan before leasing.
Solid Mineral Exploration	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Closed	Closed

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
Locatable Minerals	Mostly open to locatable mineral entry and location; portions segregated due to State-selections.	Open subject to ROPs	Closed. Withdraw from mineral entry and location.	Open subject to ROPs and mining plan
Mineral Material Sales	Open	Open subject to ROPS	Open subject to ROPs. Sale of mineral materials from riverbed, ocean beach/lagoon, and lakeshore will not be permitted.	Same as Alternative B
FLPMA and R&PP Leases	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO.	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative C
Rights-of-Way	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative C
Disposal Actions	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; Not identified as available for disposal.	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; retain after selections lift.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
Grazing	Open to grazing; applications considered on a case-by-case basis	Open	Closed	Portion within existing grazing allotments would remain open; remainder closed.
VRM	No VRM designation	VRM Class IV	VRM Class II	VRM Class IV
Wildlife Management	Buckland Valley Habitat Management Plan applies.	Same as Alternative A	Develop management plan for ACEC to mitigate impacts to caribou habitat from resource uses and address fire management in lichen habitats	Same as Alternative C

*Boundary of ACEC varies between Alternatives. Under Alternative C, this ACEC includes the Ungalik, Inglutalik, and Shaktoolik watersheds. Final acreage will vary depending on results of conveyance.

Table B-6. Shaktoolik, Ungalik, and Inglutalik Watershed ACECs—Alternative Comparison Table

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
Decision	No ACEC designation	No ACEC designation	These watersheds would be included in the Nulato Hills ACEC	Designate Shaktoolik (234,000 acres), Inglutalik (466,000 acres), and Ungalik (264,000 acres) watersheds as ACECs* (Map 2-21)
Off-highway Vehicle Use (OHV)	No designation	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with no weight limit; Summer: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR	Limited designation. Winter: cross-country use allowed with maximum 2,000 lbs GVWR; Summer: Limited to designated trails. Additional limitations such as seasonal closures may be developed through ACEC plan.	Limited designation: On selected lands, manage OHVs consistent with the State's Generally Allowable Uses; On unencumbered BLM lands cross-country use allowed with 2,000 lbs GVWR yearlong. Additional OHV limitations may be developed through ACEC plan.
Special Recreation Use Permits	Issue SRP case-by-case	Manage as semi-primitive motorized and for dispersed recreational use. Consider SRPs on case-by-case basis.	Manage for dispersed recreational use; limit # VUD associated with SRPs; require permit for transporters; No facility development.	Same as Alternative B
Fluid Leasable Minerals	Mostly open; some segregated due to State-selection	Open	Closed	Open w/minor constraints; 300' NSO setback on all three rivers
Solid Leasables	Open	Open	Closed	Open
Locatable Minerals	Mostly open; some segregated due to State-selection.	Open subject to ROPs	Closed. Withdraw from mineral entry and location.	Mostly open subject to ROPs and mining plan; 300' setback on the Ungalik River.

Management Actions	Alternatives			
	A: No Action	B: Resource Development	C: Resource Conservation	D: Preferred
Mineral Material Sales	Open	Open subject to ROPs	Open subject to ROPs. Sale of mineral materials from riverbed, ocean beach/lagoon, and lakeshore will not be permitted.	Same as Alternative B
FLPMA and R&PP Leases	Considered on case-by-case basis except where prohibited by PLO	Same as Alternative A	Do not allow	Same as Alternative C
Rights-of-Way	Considered on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A	Designate as ROW avoidance area; consider ROW on case-by-case basis.	Same as Alternative A
Disposal Actions	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; Not identified as available for disposal.	Portions are segregated due to State-selection; retain after selections lifted.	Same as Alternative B	Same as Alternative B
Grazing	Open to grazing; applications considered on a case-by-case basis	Open	Closed	Portion within existing grazing allotments would remain open; remainder closed
VRM	No VRM designations	VRM Class IV	VRM Class II	VRM Class II along Ungalik River; Class III remainder.

*Final acreage will change depending on results of conveyance.