# CARY PLESSMAN, AUSA, CIVIL DIVISION -

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

UAKI FLESSIVIAIN Assistant United States Attorney 4 Chief, Civil Fraud Section California Bar Number 101233 5 Room 7516, Federal Building 300 North Los Angeles Street 6 Los Angeles, California 90012 Telephone: (213) 894-2474 7 Facsimile: (213) 894-2380 Attorneys for Plaintiff θ 5 UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT 9 CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA 1 % 1 SOUTHERN DIVISION 12 UNITED STATES OF AMERICA, 13 CIVIL ACTION Plaintiff, 14 15 BODY WISE INTERNATIONAL, INC., and SACV 05-43 DOC (ANX) JESSE A. STOFF, M.D., 16 Defendants. 17

# CONSENT DECREE AS TO BODY WISE INTERNATIONAL, INC.

WHEREAS, Plaintiff, the United States of America, has commenced this action by filing the Complaint herein; Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., has waived service of the Summons and Complaint; the parties have been represented by the attorneys whose names appear hereafter; and the parties have agreed to settlement of this action upon the following terms and conditions, without adjudication of any issue of fact or law and without Defendant admitting liability for any of the matters alleged in the Complaint;

THEREFORE, on the joint motion of Plaintiff and Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., it is hereby ORDERED, ADJUDGED, and DECREED as follows:

- 1. This Court has jurisdiction of the subject matter and of the parties.
- 2. The Complaint states a claim upon which relief may be granted against Defendant under Sections 5(a), 5(l), 12, 13(b) and 16(a) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 45(a), 45(l), 52, 53(b) and 56(a).
- 3. The following definitions shall apply to this Consent Decree:
  - A. "Commission's Order" shall mean the Federal Trade Commission Order issued in Commission Docket No. C-3716, *Body Wise International, Inc.* (September 25, 1995), a copy of which is attached hereto as Appendix A and made a part of this Consent Decree.
  - B. "Competent and reliable scientific evidence" shall mean tests, analyses, research, studies, or other evidence based on the expertise of professionals in the relevant area, that has been conducted and evaluated in an objective manner by persons qualified to do so, using procedures generally accepted in the profession to yield accurate and reliable results.

#### I. MONETARY PAYMENT

**IT IS ORDERED** that Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., its successors or assigns, shall pay to Plaintiff a civil penalty, pursuant to Section 5(l) of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. § 45(l), in the amount of two million dollars (\$2,000,000.00)

A. Within ten (10) days of Defendant's execution of this Order, Defendant shall pay the entire payment required by this Part into an interest-bearing escrow account to be established and held by an escrow agent approved by the undersigned Commission attorneys. Within ten (10) days after the date of entry of this Order, the escrow agent shall transfer the entire amount in the escrow account (including accrued interest) to Plaintiff in full and final satisfaction of the judgment. The payment to Plaintiff under this Section shall be made by electronic fund transfer in accordance with instructions provided by Plaintiff. By signing this Order, Defendant relinquishes all dominion, control and title to the monies transferred to Plaintiff (including

accrued interest), and agrees that all legal and equitable title to said monies is vested in Plaintiff, for appropriate disposition. In the event the Commission does not approve this Order or the Court does not enter this Order, all monies in the escrow account shall be returned to Defendant (including accrued interest).

B. In the event of any default in payment, which default continues for ten days beyond the due date of payment, the entire unpaid penalty, together with interest, as computed pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1961 from the date of default to the date of payment, shall immediately become due and payable.

#### **INJUNCTION**

### II. PROHIBITION AGAINST VIOLATIONS OF THE COMMISSION'S ORDER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Body Wise International, Inc, its successors, assigns, agents, representatives, employees and all other persons or entities within the scope of Fed R. Civ. P. 65, and all persons in active concert or participation with it who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, are hereby permanently enjoined from ever violating, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, any provision of the Commission's Order. In the event that the Commission's Order is hereafter modified, Defendant's compliance with such Order as so modified shall not be deemed a violation of this injunction.

# III. PROHIBITIONS AGAINST ADVERTISING UNLESS SUBSTANTIATED

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., its successors, assigns, agents, representatives, employees and all other persons or entities within the scope of Fed R. Civ. P. 65, and all persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any product or service for the immune system or weight control, or any health-related service or therapy, dietary supplement, food, drug, or device, as

"food," "drug" and "device" are defined in Sections 12 and 15 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 52 and 55, in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in the Federal Trade Commission Act, shall not represent or assist others in representing, in any manner, directly or by implication, including through the use of consumer or expert endorsements, that any such product, service or therapy:

- A. prevents, mitigates, treats, cures or improves the symptoms of any disease or health-related condition including but not limited to: Allergies; AIDS; Asthma; Cancer; Candida; Canker Sores; Chronic Fatigue Syndrome; Cold; Colon Disease; Crohn's Disease; Epstein Barr; Fibromylagia; Flu; Heart Disease; Hepatitis B; Hepatitis C; HIV; Hyperactive Thyroid; Infection; Irritable Bowel Syndrome; Lupus; Mononucleosis; Poison Ivy; Rheumatoid Arthritis; Shingles; Sinusitis; Toenail Fungus; and Ulcerative Colitis;
- B. triggers or activates the immune system to prevent or treat diseases or health- related conditions;
- C. increases the activity and/or the production of natural killer (NK) or other immune blood cells to prevent or treat diseases or health-related conditions;
- D. gives the immune system specific, coded information on how to respond to prevent or treat diseases or health-related conditions;
- E. improves immune system function to prevent or treat diseases or healthrelated conditions; or
- F. provides, can provide, or helps provide any other health benefit; unless, at the time of making such representation, Defendant possesses and relies upon competent and reliable scientific evidence that substantiates the representation.

# IV. PROHIBITIONS AGAINST MISREPRESENTATIONS AS TO THE EXISTENCE OR RESULTS OF TESTS, STUDIES OR RESEARCH

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., its successors, assigns, agents, representatives, employees and all other persons or entities within the scope of Fed. R. Civ. P. 65, and all persons in active concert or participation

wit
 dire
 wit
 dis
 hea
 "dr
 Ac
 Fee
 in a

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

with it who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any product or service for the immune system or weight control, or any health-related service or therapy, dietary supplement, food, drug, or device, as "food," "drug" and "device" are defined in Sections 12 and 15 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 52 and 55, in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in the Federal Trade Commission Act, shall not misrepresent or assist others in misrepresenting, in any manner, expressly or by implication, the existence, contents, validity, results, conclusions, or interpretations of any test, study or research.

# V. REQUIRED DISCLOSURE: ENDORSEMENTS

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., its successors, assigns, agents, representatives, employees and all other persons or entities within the scope of Fed. R. Civ. P. 65, and all persons in active concert or participation with it who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division, or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any product or service for the immune system or weight control, or any health-related service or therapy, dietary supplement, food, drug, or device, as "food," "drug" and "device" are defined in Sections 12 and 15 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 52 and 55, in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in the Federal Trade Commission Act, shall disclose clearly and prominently a material connection, where one exists, between any person providing an endorsement for any such product, as "endorsement" is defined in 16 C.F.R. § 255.0(b), and Defendant or any other individual or entity manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promoting, offering for sale, selling or distributing such product, service or therapy. For the purposes of this order, "material connection" shall mean any relationship that might materially affect the weight or credibility of the endorsement and would not be reasonably expected by consumers.

#### VI. DISTRIBUTION OF ORDER

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Order, Defendant Body Wise International, Inc. shall:

- A. Deliver a copy of this Consent Decree to:
  - (1) All principals, officers, directors, managers, employees, agents and representatives having responsibilities with respect to the subject matter of this Consent Decree; and
  - (2) Any person who agrees to provide or provides an expert endorsement or testimonial, as "expert," "testimonial" and "endorsement" are defined in the Commission's Guides Concerning the Use of Endorsements and Testimonials in Advertising, 16 C.F.R. § 255.0(a), (b) and (d), of any of Defendant's products or services, or any ingredient in or component of any of Defendant's products or services.
- B. Deliver by first class mail a summary of this Consent Decree, attached hereto as Appendix "B," to any person who agrees to sell Body Wise Products, or who receives any compensation in connection with the sale of Body Wise products, whether such person is characterized as a consultant, distributor, associate, or otherwise.

Defendant Body Wise International, Inc. shall deliver this Consent Decree or Appendix "B" to those persons to whom it is currently required to provide this Consent Decree or Appendix "B" within thirty (30) days after entry of this Consent Decree, and to any other person at the time the person agrees to assume or assumes such position or responsibilities or agrees to provide or provides an expert endorsement or testimonial. At the time of delivery of the Consent Decree, Defendant Body Wise shall secure from each person a signed and dated statement acknowledging receipt of the Consent Decree.

#### VII. RECORD KEEPING

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that for a period of six (6) years from the date of entry of this Consent Decree, Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., and its agents, employees, officers, corporations, subsidiaries, successors and assigns, and those persons in active concert or participation with them who receive actual notice of this Consent Decree by personal service or otherwise, directly or through any corporation, subsidiary, division or other device, in connection with the manufacturing, labeling, advertising, promotion, offering for sale, sale or distribution of any product or service for the immune system or weight control, or any health-related service or therapy, dietary supplement, food, drug, or device, as "food," "drug" and "device" are defined in Sections 12 and 15 of the Federal Trade Commission Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 52 and 55, in or affecting commerce, as "commerce" is defined in the Federal Trade Commission Act, are hereby restrained and enjoined from failing to create and retain the following records:

- A. Accounting records that reflect the cost of goods or services sold, revenues generated, and the disbursement of such revenues;
- B. Personnel records accurately reflecting: the name, address, and telephone number of each person employed in any capacity by such business, including as an independent contractor or consultant, distributor, associate, or otherwise; that person's job title or position; the date upon which the person commenced work; the date and reason for the person's termination, if applicable; a copy of such person's acknowledgment of receipt of this Consent Decree; and proof of mailing or forwarding Appendix "B" to each consultant, distributor, associate, or otherwise, and any mail containing Appendix "B" returned as undeliverable with no forwarding address, obtained by Defendant Body Wise International, Inc. pursuant to Part VI.;
- C. Customer files containing the names, addresses, phone numbers, dollar amounts paid, quantity of items or services purchased, and description of

- the items or services purchased, to the extent such information is obtained in the ordinary course of business;
- D. Complaints and refund requests (whether received directly or through any third party) and any responses to those complaints or requests;
- E. Copies of all training materials, advertisements or other marketing materials;
- F. All projections, visual aids and materials provided to Defendant's consultants, distributors, associates or otherwise, or to the general public, in all presentations or discussions of any such product or service;
- G. All materials that were relied upon to substantiate any representation made in the sales scripts, training materials, advertisements or other marketing materials, or in the promotions or discussions referred to in Paragraphs E and F of this Part;
- H. All tests, reports, studies, surveys, demonstrations, or other evidence in their possession or control that contradict, qualify, or call into question any representation made in the sales scripts, training materials, advertisements or other marketing materials, or in the promotions or discussions referred to in Paragraphs E and F of this Part.

If Defendant makes any audio or video recordings, verbatim transcripts, or any other records of any presentation respecting any such product or service to Defendant's consultants, distributors, associates or otherwise, or to the general public, Defendant shall retain such records for the period required by this Part.

#### VIII. COMPLIANCE REPORTING BY DEFENDANT

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, in order that compliance with the provisions of this Consent Decree may be monitored:

- A. For a period of three (3) years from the date of entry of this Consent Decree,
  - (1) Defendant shall notify the Commission of the following:

- (a) Any changes in Defendant's business, mailing address and telephone number, within ten (10) days of the date of such changes;
- (b) Any changes in Defendant's corporate status within ten (10) days of the date of such change;
- (c) Any change in Defendant's name or use of any assumed or fictitious names; and
- (2) Defendant shall notify the Commission of any changes in corporate structure that may affect compliance obligations arising under this Consent Decree, including but not limited to a dissolution, assignment, sale, merger, or other action that would result in the emergence of a successor corporation; the creation or dissolution of a subsidiary, parent, or affiliate that engages in any acts or practices subject to this Consent Decree; or the filing of a bankruptcy petition, at least thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, *provided*, *however*, that with respect to any proposed change in the corporation about which Defendant learns less than thirty (30) days prior to the date such action is to take place, Defendant shall notify the Commission as soon as practicable after obtaining such knowledge.
- B. One hundred eighty (180) days after the date of entry of this Consent

  Decree, Defendant shall provide a written report to the Commission, sworn
  to under penalty of perjury, setting forth in detail the manner and form in
  which it has complied and is complying with this Consent Decree. This
  report shall also include, but not be limited to, a copy of each
  acknowledgment of receipt of this Consent Decree, and an affidavit setting
  forth the names and addresses of the persons to whom defendant has mailed
  Appendix "B," including copies of proofs of mailing or forwarding mail,

and names of persons whose mail was returned as undeliverable with no forwarding address, obtained by Defendant Body Wise International, Inc. pursuant to Part VI.

C. For purposes of this Consent Decree, Defendant shall, unless otherwise directed by the Commission's authorized representatives, mail all written notifications to the Commission to:

Associate Director for Enforcement Bureau of Consumer Protection Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW Washington, DC, 20580 Re: *United States v. Body Wise International, Inc.*, Civil Action No. \_\_\_\_\_

#### IX. COMPLIANCE MONITORING

**IT IS FURTHER ORDERED** that, for the purpose of monitoring and investigating compliance with any provision of this Consent Decree,

A. Within ten (10) days of receipt of written notice from a representative of the Commission, Defendant shall submit additional written reports, sworn to under penalty of perjury; produce documents for inspection and copying; appear for deposition; and/or provide entry during normal business hours to any business location in Defendant's possession or direct or indirect control to inspect, the business operation;

*Provided*, *however*, that Defendant, after attempting to resolve a dispute without court action and for good cause shown, may file a motion with this Court seeking an order including one or more of the protections set forth in Fed. R. Civ. P. 26(c).

- B. In addition, the Commission is authorized to monitor compliance with this Order by all other lawful means, including but not limited to the following:
  - (1) obtaining discovery from any person, without further leave of court, using the procedures prescribed by Fed. R. Civ. P. 30, 31, 33, 34, 36, and 45;

18 19

20

21

16

17

22 23

24 25

26

27

28

(2) posing as consumers, consultants or prospective consultants, and suppliers to Defendant, its employees, or any other entity managed or controlled in whole or in part by Defendant, without the necessity of identification or prior notice;

*Provided*, however, that nothing in this Consent Decree shall limit the Commission's lawful use of compulsory process, pursuant to Sections 9 and 20 of the FTC Act, 15 U.S.C. §§ 49, 57b-1, to obtain any documentary material, tangible things, testimony, or information relevant to unfair or deceptive acts or practices in or affecting commerce (within the meaning of 15 U.S.C § 45(a)(1)).

C. Defendant shall permit representatives of the Commission to interview, any employer, consultant, independent contractor, representative, agent, or employee who has agreed to such an interview, relating in any way to any conduct subject to this Consent Decree. The person interviewed may have counsel present if he or she chooses.

#### X. COOPERATION WITH UNITED STATES AND COMMISSION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant Body Wise International, Inc., and its corporations, subsidiaries, successors and assigns, shall, in connection with this action or any subsequent action, proceeding or investigation related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of this Complaint, designate one or more officers, directors, managing agents, or other persons who consent to testify on Defendant's behalf, who shall cooperate in good faith with the United States and the Commission and produce such documents and appear at such places and times as the United States or the Commission shall reasonably request, after written notice, for interviews, conferences, pretrial discovery, review of documents, and for such other matters as may be reasonably requested by the United States or the Commission. If requested in writing by the United States or the Commission, Defendant's designee or designees hereunder shall appear and provide documents and truthful testimony in any

trial, deposition, or other proceeding related to or associated with the transactions or the occurrences that are the subject of the Complaint, without the service of a subpoena.

#### XI. TAXPAYER IDENTIFICATION NUMBER

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that Defendant is hereby required, in accordance with 31 U.S.C. § 7701, to furnish to the Federal Trade Commission its taxpayer identifying numbers (employer identification number), which shall be used for purposes of collecting and reporting on any delinquent amount arising out of Defendant's relationship with the government.

#### XII. RETENTION OF JURISDICTION

IT IS FURTHER ORDERED that this Court shall retain jurisdiction of this matter for the purposes of enabling any of the parties to this Consent Decree to apply to the Court at any time for such further orders or directives as may be necessary or appropriate for the interpretation or modification of this Consent Decree, for enforcement of compliance therewith, or for the punishment of violations thereof.

JUDGMENT IS THEREFORE ENTERED in favor of Plaintiff and against Defendant pursuant to all the terms and conditions recited above. This \_\_\_\_\_, 2005

United States District Judge

The parties, by their respective counsel, hereby consent to the terms and conditions of the Consent Decree as set forth above and consent to the entry thereof. Defendant waives any rights that may arise under the Equal Access to Justice Act, 28 U.S.C. § 2412, amended by Pub. L. 104-121, 110 Stat. 847, 863-64 (1996).

27

28

1	FOR THE UNITED STATES OF
2	AMERICA: PETER D. KEISLER
3	Assistant Attorney General Civil Division
4	U.S. Department of Justice
5	DEBRA W. YANG United States Attorney
6	By:
7	GARY PLESSMAN Assistant United States Attorney
8	United States Attorney's Office Room 7516, Federal Building
9	300 North Los Angeles Street Los Angeles, California 90012
10	(213) 894-2474 (voice) (213) 894-2380 (facsimile)
11	EUGENE M. THIROLF
12	Director Office of Consumer Litigation
13	By:
14	ELIZABETH STEIN Trial Attorney
15	Office of Consumer Litigation U.S. Department of Justice
16	P.O. Box 386 Washington, DC 20044
17	(202) 307-0486 (202) 514-8742
18	FOR THE FEDERAL TRADE
19	COMMISSION:
20	ELAINE D. KOLISH
21	Associate Director Division of Enforcement
22	
23	ROBERT M. FRISBY Assistant Director
24	Division of Enforcement
25	JOEL N. BREWER
26	Attorneys Division of Enforcement
27	Federal Trade Commission 600 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW
28	Washington, DC 20580

1	
2	FOR THE DEFENDANT:
3	
4	
5	BODY WISE INTERNATIONAL INC.
6	
7	STEPONOVICH & ASSOCIATES
8	701 South Parker Street, Suite 7500 Orange, California 92868-4762
9	
10	By:
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	