Frank Chlebana
June 16 2005

Godparent Report

"Search for First-Generation Scaler Leptoquarks in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV"

"Search for Second-Generation Scaler Leptoquarks in $p\bar{p}$ collisions at $\sqrt{s} = 1.96$ TeV"

Authors:

Simona Rolli	rolli@fnal.gov
Dan Ryan	dryan@fnal.gov
Hao Sun	hsun04@emerald.tufts.edu

godparents:

Frank Chlebana (Chair)	chlebana@fnal.gov
Allan Clark	Allan.Clark@cern.ch
Lucio Cerrito	lucio@fnal.gov

Analysis web page:
http://www-cdf.fnal.gov/internal/physics/lq_search/

Meeting Schedule

Committee Formed:	February 16 2004
First Meeting:	January 12 2005
First Draft posted	March 8 2005
“Search for First-Generation...”	
“Search for Second-Generation...”	
Second Draft posted	May 16 2005
“Search for First-Generation...”	
Paper Seminar	June 23 2005
“Search for First-Generation...”	

Originally considered a single PRD, but decided to have two separate PRLs

In general we thought that the original drafts were well written and that the analysis was sound

Had several followup meetings after our initial meeting, and quickly converged on a draft for the collaboration

$\rightarrow$ *Received minor comments on the analysis after the first drafts were circulated to the collaboration*

$\rightarrow$ *Several groups expressed concern that the two drafts were very similar and suggested that the results be combined or that the papers be rewritten to emphasize the differences*

After discussion with the authors and consulting with the conveners we decided keep two separate drafts and rewrite them to more clearly emphasize the differences.

We sent a reply to the groups who commented on the first drafts

```
1) The results are separate and independent
2) The analysis was performed by different authors
3) The similarity of the two papers is mainly in wording of the introduction
   and conclusions.
4) The Run I results were presented in two separate papers
```

See web page for full text and also for the replies to the first round of comments.

First round of comments were incorporated into the second draft and released to the collaboration.

"Search for First-Generation..."

Received minor comments which are now being addressed. *Replies has been posted on the web page*

$\rightarrow$ Paper seminar scheduled for June 23.

Once the first paper is submitted will focus on the second one

"Search for Second-Generation..."

There are no remaining physics issues with the analysis - *it is just a matter or rewording the draft...*

The godparents wish to congratulate the authors on the quality of the analysis and the quick convergence from the first meeting to the paper seminar