American Journal of Public Health

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Neighborhoods and Obesity in Later Life

First Author: Irina B. Grafova

Citation: American Journal of Public Health 2008; 98: 2042-2050

Summary: Grafova and colleagues found, by way of a large and nationally representative survey,

that excess weight in older adults is related to "economic, social, and built aspects of the neighbourhoods in which they live." More specifically, Grafova and colleagues found that "high street connectivity" reduces the likelihood of women being overweight, and that "neighborhood immigrant concentration" increased the likelihood of men being

overweight. The authors note that, since interventions to reduce excess weight in later life remains an important public health priority, their findings have important policy implications: "Our study suggests that areas with few households of high socioeconomic

status, high immigrant concentration, low street connectivity, and high residential stability

and older adults living in these areas should be targeted for interventions."

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Ethnic Disparities in Access to Care in Post-Apartheid South Africa

First Author: Zeida R. Kon

Citation: American Journal of Public Health 2008; 98: 2272-2277

Summary: Kon and colleagues investigated the ethical disparities in access to health care that

potentially exists among Blacks, Whites, Asians and persons of mixed race. The authors found that despite the fact that apartheid ended 14 years ago, White and Asian persons

are undeservedly advantaged when it comes to accessing health care.

Annals of Internal Medicine

Reviewer: E Largent

Title: Healing Skills for Medical Practice

First Author: Churchill, LR

Citation: Annals of Internal Medicine 2008; 149: 720-724

Summary: The authors taped interviews with 50 "healers" and analyzed them for common themes in

healing relationships. Eight skills emerged: do the little things; take time; be open and listen; find something to like, to love; remove barriers; let the patient explain; share authority; and be committed. They assert that "these skills are not just interaction

strategies but are essential elements of medical ethics."

Reviewer: Ari

Title: Death and Taxes
First Author: Mendenhall GS

Citation: Annals of Internal Medicine 2008; 300: 822-824

Summary: The Economic Growth and Tax Relief Reconciliation Act of 2001 (EGTRRA) has led to a

decline in the top marginal rate of the estate tax from 49% in 2003 to 45% in 2009, with a scheduled year-long repeal in 2010 before returning ro 55% in 2011. This provides an incentive to die in 2010, leaving one's inheritance tax-free, which may create conflicts of

interest in late 2009 and late 2010.

Reviewer: Ari

Title: Narrative Review: Do State Laws Make It Easier to Say "I'm Sorry?"

First Author: McDonnell WM

Citation: Annals of Internal Medicine 2008; 149: 811-815

Summary: Errors must be identified before they can be corrected, yet recognition and disclosure of

medical errors remains a problem. The "admission by party opponent" exception to the hearsay rule means that past statements, such as "I'm sorry about your father's situation" or "things might have turned out better had I..." can be used against physicians in trial. Out of the 50 states and D.C., there are 36 apology laws since 2000 that at least partially overturn the exception to hearsay for physicians. Some protect against only sympathy statements, while others also protect against admissions of fault. However, the impact of apology laws on disclosure remains unclear. An interesting question raised by the article: should a physician disclose a medical error that has no effect on treatment or

outcome?

Reviewer: Ari

Title: What Do You Do When Your Loved One is III? The Line Between Physician and Family

Member

First Author: Fromme EK

Citation: Annals of Internal Medicine 2008; 149: 825-829

Summary: Interesting perspective on the relatively common practice of playing physician to family

members and the tensions between personal and professional roles (as well as issues of

legality, especially with regard to prescriptions). They use five cases as examples.

Bioethics

Reviewer: O'Neil

Title: Ethical Models Underpinning Responses to Threats to Public Health: A Comparison of

Approaches to Communicable Disease Control in Europe

First Author: Gainotti, Sabina et al.

Citation: Bioethics 2008; 22: 466-476

Summary: The authors distinguish four European legislative approaches to public health:

authoritarian, moderate, preventive, and laissez faire, with respect to the following set of questions: Involuntary testing? Involuntary isolation? Quarantine? Restriction of employment? Involuntary treatment? Poland is authoritative; Denmark, Sweden are

moderate; Ireland, Italy, UK are preventive; and Spain is laissez faire.

Reviewer: O'Neil

Title: Infectious Diseases, Security and Ethics: The Case of HIV/AIDS

First Author: Selgelid, Michael J.

Citation: Bioethics 2008; 22: 457-465

Summary: Declaring a disease a security threat will, on the one hand, raise attention and attract

resources, but on the other, increase the temptation to infringe civil liberties. The authors suggest that only diseases that are fast-spreading or inspire extreme dread should be

"securitized"--HIV/AIDS should not.

Reviewer: O'Neil

Title: Taking Due Care: Moral Obligations in Dual Use Research

First Author: Kuhlau, Frida et al.

Citation: Bioethics 2008; 22: 477-487

Summary: Products of biological research--both biological materials and knowledge--hold the

potential for harmful misuse. The authors think that biologists have a general obligation to take precautions against these harmful misuses, and cite several more specific obligations, e.g. duty to prevent bioterrorism, duty to consider negative implications of research, duty not to publish sensitive information, duty to limit access to dangerous

material, duty to report activities of concern.

British Medical Journal

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: Global Research for Health should tackle needs and inform policy

First Author: mckee m

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1249-1250

Summary: An international Symposium on Global Health Research was held last week in Bamako,

Mali.

The status of global health research 4 years after Mexico's conference was reviewed. Increased attention to evidence based policies and greater investment in health system and policies researchfollowed Mexico's reccomandations, but still much need to be done. A "Call to action" on global health research request government's commitment to at least 2% of MOHs budgets to it, developing infrastructure like ethical review boards, clinical

trial registries and open access to data. Development agency committed for 5%.

Monitoring mechanisms to follow the implementation of the commitments should be

instituted, overcoming discussions on who should lead it.

Suggestions on changing research founding were expressed, favouring the coexistence

of long and short term investments and more balanced research portfolios.

Geographical vacuum of research capacities appears to be a challenge in terms of scaling up possibilities: government of those areas have been requested of improving

basic institutions there, tackiling corruptions and governance failures.

Reviewer: lepora, chiaar

Title: Should there be a ceiling on what percentage of GDP countries spend on health? Yes

and No debate

First Author: Bosanquet, Nick

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1382-1383

Summary: Most countries (aside US) spend around 3000\$ per person on health, equal to around 8-

9% of their total GDP.

YES

Decisions on health expenditure should be made on "value", and increased efficiency should be privileged as strategy to meet both public satisfaction and cost containment.

NO

Health care cost should not be bind to GDP. Fair agreements, share costs, rational limitations of expenditure might be better ways of ensuring appropriate health coverage

in a possible way.

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: Research funding goes metric

First Author: Watts, Geoff

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1380-1381

Summary: UK research funding has been allocated in the past through an assessment process

called RAE.

This system will be used this month for the last time, after several controversies of its flawed decision making and its outcomes.

The review process for example, can be done using around 3% of the funding available for research, and increased specialization makes it difficult for panel experts to properly cover all the proposed issues.

Research Excellence Framework (REF), will than replace the old RAE system, based on statistical indicators and "metrics".

Mixed reactions were encountered in the academic community, where peer review was still considered the best option possible despite it sapparent inefficiency and higher costs.

Metrics haven't been defined yet, but they moght include a department's nongovernamental income, bibliometrics quality and impact of its publications, number of post-graduates or a combination of all of the above.

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: How should health be defined? Join a global conversation at blogs.bmj.com/bmj

First Author: Jadad, Alejandro R

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1363-1364

Summary: WHO, created in 1948 to attain "by all people of the highest possible level of health",

defined "health" as a "state of complete physical, mental and social well-being and not

merely the absence of diseases or infirmity".

Deception migth arise in admitting that those goals might have been to ambitious, and

that maybe the same definition of "health" should be revised.
BMJ started a blog on the subject, requesting public partecipation

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: alcohol consumption and alcohol counselling among US medical students: cohort study

First Author: Frank, Erica

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1-10

Summary: Each year, excessive alcohol consumption kills around 80.000 people in the US. Clinical

alcohol screening and counselling shown to be the best cost-effective measure to reduce

excessive consumption and related harms.

Defining "excessive drinking" as one of the following conditions:

- at least 1 episode in the past month of consumption of more than 5 drinks

- more than 2 drinks/day for men, or more than 1 drink/day for women

Around 29% of medical student drunk excessively in the past month of a self-reported

interview done in 16 representative medical school in the US.

The report showed as well that young medical student would be more prone to involve in alcohol counselling than students at their last year.

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: Washington state legalises physician assisted suicide

First Author: Dyer, Clare

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1133-1133

Summary: Initiative 1000 will constitute the second framework of legalisation of assisted suicide.

after Oregon's Death with Dignity Act.

Physicians will be able to prescribe lethal doses for mentally competent patients with less

than 6 months of life expectancy, residing in the state from 15 days or longer.

Around 341 patients used Oregon's act since it's application, 11 years ago. 18 among

them were depressed at that time.

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: Discrepancies in sample size calculations and data analyses reported in randomised

trials: comparison of publications with protocols

First Author: Chan, An Wen

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1-8

Summary: Retrospective cohort study compared statistical data of research protocols and their

respective publications in 70 randomised controlled trials recently published in main

medical journals.

Only 11 out of 62 studies provide consistent information between protocols and

publications.

Sample size calculation, protocols deviation and methods for those cases, missing data, primary outcome analysis, subgroup and adjusted analysis were the major discrepancies

found.

"The reliability of trial reports cannot be assessed without having access to the full

protocol".

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: Doctor's Health: Healthy doctors - healthy practice

First Author: Brewster, Joan M

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1121-1122

Summary: although good health cannot be used as the main indicators to define a good doctor,

studies show a correlation between doctor's health and their professional outcomes. Multicentric studies should be done in order to have results less linked with contextual

situations.

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: International Regulation on Alchool

First Author: room, robin

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1248-1249

Summary: The recent issuing on WHO's report on Social Determinants of Health, suggest using the

2005 framework for tobacco control for alchool.

Increase in alchool availability seems correlated to greater health inequality, as a result of

release of tax policy and trading monopolies.

Strong medical evidencies support the necessity of regulating internationally alchool selling and trading, in order to avoid cross-border trafficking and have a general

persuasive effect on governments and society.

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Drug use in children: cohort study in three European countries.

First Author: Sturkenboom

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1338-1341

Summary: Sturkenboom and colleagues provide an overview of "primary care prescription patterns"

in paediatric populations in the UK, Italy and the Netherlands. The authors note that their data could be used to improve the prioritisation of research into both the long term safety of paediatric drugs and efficacy and effectiveness in paediatric medicine. Sturkenboom and colleagues more specifically recommend that the most commonly used paediatric

drugs—almost all of which are used off-label—be considered research priorities

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Scientist is denied renewal of licence to carry out research on primates

First Author: Ned Stafford

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1316-1316

Summary: A German neuroscientist, investigating how simple cognitive processes are generated by

the interaction of neurons, has been denied the right to continue his research with primates. Dr Kreiter—the neuroscientist in question—plans to fight the ruling claiming that the German constitution guarantees a scientist's right to conduct ethical research. Ingelore Rosenkötter, the SPD party member who is (partially) responsible for denied Kreiter's request for continuation, claims that his research is "ethically unjustified" because "it focuse[s] on long term scientific questions and not on medical treatments." Rosenkötter, it turns out, is influenced by Jörg Luy—the director of the Institute of Animal Protection and Behaviour at the Free University of Berlin—who claims that "if similar"

experiments were done on prisoners of war it would be called torture."

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Is health care getting safer?

First Author: Charles Vincent

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1205-1207

Summary: Vincent and colleagues note that, while considerable efforts have been made to improve

patient safety in the UK, it is difficult to ascertain whether patients are actually any safer as result of the efforts that have been made. The problem stems from the lack of reliable information on safety and the fact that obtaining this information is not high on any agenda. Vincent and colleagues make some general recommendations: (i) we need to

move away from an "unsystematic voluntary reporting towards systematic

measurement"; (ii) we need to compile safety indices which could be done by making minor adjustments to existing information systems (iii) and, finally, "careful attention to

epidemiology and monitoring" is required.

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Taskforce rejects system of presumed consent for organ donation in UK

First Author: Zosia Kmietowicz

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1189-1189

Summary: The Organ Donation Taskforce has rejected a proposed system of presumed consent for

organ donation in the UK. They offer two reasons for this rejection: (i) it is not clear that presumed consent will increase the number of organ donations; and (ii) a system of presumed consent risks breaking trust that is essential to the patient-doctor relationship.

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Prescribing "placebo treatments": results of national survey of US internists and

rheumatologists

First Author: Jon Tilbert

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1097-1100

Summary: Tilbert and colleagues surveyed internists and rheumatologists to ascertain their attitude

towards prescribing placebo treatments—placebo treatments are treatments "whose benefits derive from positive patient expectations and not from the physiological mechanism of the treatment itself." Tilbert and colleagues report that respondents both commonly prescribe placebo treatments and view this practice as ethically permissible despite the fact that these placebo treatments are rarely described as such in conversations with patients. Tilbert and colleagues conclude that "[w]hether, or under

what circumstances, recommending or prescribing placebo treatments is appropriate

remains a topic for ethical and policy debates."

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Patients in England are given green light to buy drugs privately alongside NHS care

First Author: Zosia Kmietowicz

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1071-1071

Summary: On the condition that "top-up" treatments are not administered in an NHS setting, English

patients are now permitted both to purchase "top-up" treatments and to continue to

receive NHS care.

Reviewer: Danielle Bromwich

Title: Patient fails in attempt to get law on aiding suicide abroad clarified

First Author: Clare Dyer

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1075-1075

Summary: The director of public prosecutions for England and Wales has refused to issue guidance

clarifying whether the husband of a woman with MS would face prosecution if he helped

her travel to Switzerland for an assisted suicide.

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: Euthanasia and depression: no surprise / Depression in terminal illness

First Author: Koch, Tom

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1127-1127

Summary: Prevalence of depression and anxiety in patients' requesting assisted suicide was

confirmed in a study from Oregon, after several dutch evidencies.

Dr. Jack Kevorkian, a necroscopy doctor, is cited to show how no clear organic

dysfunction could be found in the majority of assisted suicide cases.

Koch claim depression treatment should be considered before assumin assisted suicide

as default option.

Evans answer reminds that depression is not a psychotic disorder, therefore it does not

jeopardize autonomy in taking a reasonnable decisions.

Reviewer: lepora, chiara

Title: It's time to change how Europe regulates research

First Author: Godlee Fiona

Citation: British Medical Journal 2008; 337: 1361-1362

Summary: Attempt to conduct research in UK seemed to be thretened by excessive burocratic

regulations.

Sir lain Chalmers, one of the Cochrane founders, claims that ethics committee and other

regulators failed patients in acquiescing to unneseccary research.

EU clinical trial directive appear to have increased the problem from it approval in 2004.

Hastings Center Report

Reviewer: Kingma

Title: Pregnancy and Clinical Research

First Author: Lyerly A et al

Citation: Hastings Center Report 2008; 38: 53-53

Summary: Lyerly, Little and Faden argue against the standard practice of excluding pregnant

women from research; since pregnant women are not immune to illnesses, many women have to take drugs during pregnancy. If we don't research these drugs on pregnant women, we have no data on safety or efficacy on the basis of which we can prescribe

them.

Reviewer: Kingma

Title: Rethinking the Ethics of Vital Organ Donations

First Author: Miller FG et al

Citation: Hastings Center Report 2008; 38: 38-46

Summary: Miller and Truog argue that there is a current discrepancy between the dead donor rule -

the requirement that a person is dead before organs can be extracted – and current organ harvesting practices where organs are extracted from people who are brain dead (i.e. not dead, according to the authors) and from people whose life support has been turned of so recently that their cardiopulmonary cessation may still be reversible, which,

according to the authors, also means that they are not dead.

Rather than fiddling with definitions of death, the authors propose that that in cases of turning off life support, we both accept that this act is causally responsible for the death of the patient and that causing the patients death is legitimate given the patients right to refuse treatment. Given that it is legitimate to 'kill' patients in these circumstances, the authors propose that it does not matter whether the patient is killed by the turning off of life support, or by the removal of organs. Hence we should have no problem removing organs from these patients, regardless of whether we consider them to be 'dead' or 'alive'.

Health Affairs

Reviewer: Wolitz

Title: Expanded Use of Imaging Technology and the Challenge of Measuring Value

First Author: Laurence C. Baker et al

Citation: Health Affairs 2008; 27: 1467-1478

Summary: This article discusses challenges in determining the value of increased availability and

use of CT and MRI scanning. There are two major challenges: 1) moving from costeffectiveness studies that focus on specific clinical situations to "population-level" analyses and 2) more fully understanding the range of benefits associated with imaging that might not show up in cost benefit analyses like patient physical and emotional

comfort.

Reviewer: Wolitz

Title: Expanded Use of Imaging Technology and the Challenge of Measuring Value

First Author: Laurence C. Baker et al

Citation: Health Affairs 2008; 27: 1467-1478

Summary: This article discusses challenges in determining the value of increased availability and

use of CT and MRI scanning. There are two major challenges: 1) moving from costeffectiveness studies that focus on specific clinical situations to "population-level" analyses and 2) more fully understanding the range of benefits associated with imaging that might not show up in cost benefit analyses like patient physical and emotional

comfort.

Reviewer: Wolitz

Title: Assessing The Comparative Effectiveness of A Diagnostic Technology: CT Colonography

First Author: Pearson, S., et al

Citation: Health Affairs 2008; 27: 1503-1514

Summary: There are important gaps in evidence regarding the clinical effectiveness of new imaging

tests and treatments as compared to the best existing alternatives. Evaluating the comparative effectiveness of medical imaging faces numerous distinct challenges. Using the example of CT Colonography, the authors conclude that "manufacturers and clinical researchers should work together to improve the evidence available for comparative effectiveness assessments", that evidence reviewers need to place emphasis on the value of "longitudinal engagement and dialogue with an advisory group consisting of a broad mix" of relevant parties, and that decision makers need to become more actively engaged as well as work with reviewers to become comfortable with applying decision-analytic modeling to "questions of comparative effectiveness".

Reviewer: Wolitz

Title: The Evidence Dilemma in Genomic Medicine

First Author: Khoury, Muin J. et al

Citation: Health Affairs 2008; 27: 1600-1611

Summary: There is an ongoing dilemma in genomic medicine to balance the need for scientific

innovation with the appropriate level of evidence thresholds for new technologies to be introduced into practice. To date, however, genomic medicine has been reluctant to subscribe to evidence based medicine. This could be attributed to a variety of reasons including that this area of medicine is usually focused on rare diseases and that "clinical utility" is variably defined in this context. Setting a low threshold for evidence runs the risk of having ineffective and even harmful tests make their way into the market place. Having a high evidence threshold on the other hand could create disincentives for developing genomic technology. Authors conclude that it is imperative to work out the

appropriate evidence thresholds for different applications soon.

JAMA

Reviewer: Ari

Title: Male Circumcision as an HIV Prevention Strategy in Sub-Saharan Africa: Sociolegal

Barriers

First Author: Gostin LO

Citation: JAMA 2008; 300: 2539-2541

Summary: This commentary discusses social, logistical, and legal barriers to effective scale-up of

male circumcision as an HIV prevention strategy in Sub-Saharan Africa. Although the authors point out some of the wide range of issues, including some evidence that men feel safer once circumcised and increase their number of sexual partners, they conclude that the prevention strategy should be scaled "to achieve coverage levels adequate for

population effect" and the tone is certainly paternalistic.

Reviewer: Ari

Title: Clinical Equivalence of Generic and Brand-Name Drugs Used

in Cardiovascular Disease: A Systematic Review and Meta-analysis

First Author: Kesselheim, AS

Citation: JAMA 2008; 300: 2514-2526

Summary: In spite of ZERO evidence of brand name superiority in cardiovascular medications

(including beta-blockers, calcium channel blockers, diuretics, alpha-blockers, angiotensin converting enzyme inhibitors, and statins), there is a persistence of editorial comments

with negative views of generic substitution (53% of editorials on the subject).

Reviewer: Wolitz

Title: Disparities in Liver Transplantation Before and After Introduction of the MELD Score

First Author: Moylan, Cynthia A., et al.

Citation: JAMA 2008; 300: 2371-2378

Summary: In 2002, the allocation system for liver transplantation became based on the Model for

End-Stage Liver Disease Score (MELD). Prior to this new model, blacks were disproportionately likely to die or get too sick for a transplant while on the waiting list. Authors set out to study the links between race, sex, and transplantation post MELD. They conclude that race is no longer associated with getting a transplant or dying on the waitlist, but that gender is still a source of disparity. Women are 30% more likely to die on the wait list or become too sick for a liver transplant. Causes for this might be related to MELD's use of creatinine values or the size of donor organs not matching. Authors

don't really know.

Reviewer: E Largent

Title: Human Oocyte Research: The Ethics of Donation and Donor Protection

First Author: Levens, E

Citation: JAMA 2008; 300: 2174-2176

Summary: The authors use the 7 principles of ethical research (loosely) to examine the ethics of

oocyte research. Although undue inducement is a particular concern, and it is unclear if the benefits – including those to society – outweigh the risks, the authors conclude that oocyte research can be conducted in an ethical fashion. The article specifically

examines egg donation and does not look at the ethics of donating fertilized embryos for

scientific use.

Reviewer: E Largent

Title: Translating New Medical Therapies Into Societal Benefit

First Author: Booth CM

Citation: JAMA 2008; 300: 2177-2179

Summary: The authors contend that well-designed population-based outcome studies should be

conducted in follow-up of all major randomized controlled trials. They point out that it is unclear who might be responsible for conducting and funding such studies and recognize that randomized controlled trials will remain the gold standard. Even so, they feel (and provide examples in which) population-based outcome studies "have the ability to provide

unique insight into the societal benefits of treatments in the real world."

Journal of Clinical Ethics

Reviewer: Annette

Title: Harmful rights-doing? The perceived problem of liberal paradigms and pubic health

First Author: Coggon J

Citation: Journal of Clinical Ethics 2008; 34: 798-801

Summary: [JOURNAL OF MEDICAL ETHICS] The author argues that the Nuffield Council's most

recent report on public health ethics – presented during Grand Rounds at NIH – does not develop a principled account for the ethics of public health interventions, but 'waters down' a Millian framework in a more or less arbitrary fashion. The author suggests that Joseph Raz' liberalism would provide a better and more principled basis for the Council's

substantive than its own stewardship model.

Reviewer: Annette

Title: Patient complaints in Finland 2000-2004: a retrospective register study

First Author: Jyisnabeb K

Citation: Journal of Clinical Ethics 2008; 34: 788-792

Summary: [JOURNAL OF MEDICAL ETHICS] Paper presenting the structure of the Finnish

nationwide patient complaints register and how it was used over a period of four years. Nice discussion about the need to deal with patient complaints locally (where treatment has been provided), rather than centrally. Of potential interest to those working in quality

assurance and improvement in the delivery of health care.

Reviewer: Annette

Title: Is informed consent effective in trauma patients?

First Author: Bhangu A

Citation: Journal of Clinical Ethics 2008; 34: 780-782

Summary: [JOURNAL OF MEDICAL ETHICS] Empirical study on the quality of informed consent of

orthopedic trauma patients vs. orthopedic elective patients in the U.K.. Recall of complications in trauma patients was significantly lower than in elective patients.

although both groups scored poorly overall. - These data are not really news, but may be

useful for people working on emergency research.

Reviewer: Annette

Title: Empirical developments in retraction

First Author: Redman BK

Citation: Journal of Clinical Ethics 2008; 34: 807-809

Summary: [JOURNAL OF MEDICAL ETHICS] Paper reviewing papers that were listed as retracted

in PubMed between 1995-2004. 328 out of 5,041,587 papers were retracted. The post-retraction citation rate remains high, with a mean number of citations per retracted paper ranging from 6-24. The retraction rate has increased when compared to the rate

between 1966-1997, and retraction is initiated less by authors and more by editors,

sponsors, and institutional officials. Plagiarism is a new problem.

Journal of General Internal Medicine

Reviewer: Jesse Chao

Title: Physician Personality Characteristics and Inquiry About Mood Symptoms in Primary Care

First Author: Paul R. Duberstein, et al.

Citation: Journal of General Internal Medicine 2008; 23: 1854-1857

Summary: The authors explore the influence of physician personality on depression assessments.

Physician personality was assessed via items from the NEO-PI-R; physicians each saw one patient with major depression and one with adjustment disorder. Results show that physicians who are more 'dutiful' were more likely to document a diagnosis of

depression, but are no more likely to ask about suicide than their less 'dutiful' peers.

Reviewer: Jesse Chao

Title: Reach and Impact of a Mass Media Event Among Vulnerable Patients: The Terri Schiavo

Story

First Author: Rebecca L. Sudore, et al.

Citation: Journal of General Internal Medicine 2008; 23: 1854-1857

Summary: The authors ask whether health-related media stories reach diverse older adults and

influence advance care planning (ACP). Subjects were asked whether they had head of Terri Schiavo and whether subjects engaged in ACP. Results show 92% reported hearing of TS, with participants with adequate literacy, at least a high school diploma, and that were English speaking (vs. Spanish) being more likely to report hearing of TS. 61% reported clarifying their own goals of care, 66% talking to their family/friends about

ACP, and 37% wanting to complete an advance directive as a result of TS.

Reviewer: Jesse Chao

Title: Impact of an Evidence-Based Medicine Curriculum on Resident Use of Electronic

Resources: A Randomized Controlled Study

First Author: Sarang Kim, et al.

Citation: Journal of General Internal Medicine 2008; 23: 1804-1808

Summary: The authors seek to determine the effectiveness of EBM teaching in residency on

residents' behavior. Residents assigned to EBM teaching participated in a formal curriculum (12 hours total) based on published studies and guides for EBM. After intervention, a test of EBM knowledge was administered, which included clinical vignettes, first without then with access to electronic resources. Results show that EBM teaching improved EBM knowledge (100-point scale) and increased use of evidence-

based resources by residents (mean score increase 22 vs. 12, p=0.012).

Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics

Reviewer: Sachs, Ben

Title: (Uncontrolled) Donation after Cardiac Determination of Death: A Note of Caution

First Author: Doig, Christopher James

Citation: Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics 2008; 36: 760-765

Summary: The Institute of Medicine has recently begun promoting the practice of uncontrolled organ

donation after cardiac death" (uDCD). The "uncontrolled" label is used to disintguish this pracice from the practice of harvesting organs from people who suffer cardiac death following withdrawal of ventilation. The time the patient spends on ventilation, and the ability to plan exactly when ventilation will be withdrawn, gives the medical team the opportunity to plan organ harvesting and to seek consent from family members if necessary. In uDCD, the dying person suddenly goes into cardiac arrest while not on ventilation, which means that potentially transplantable organs could die of oxygen starvation while attempts are made to resuscitate the person. Furthermore, when he or she does die, the individual might have to be ventilated or perfused to keep the option of organ donation on the table.

The authors argue that uDCD should be approached with caution. They have three worries. First, that the option of uDCD could put doctors in difficult situations in which they feel pressure to avoid resuscitating individuals who, if they died, would be candidates for uDCC. Second, that uDCD would not greatly alleviate the shortage of donor organs. Third, the medical professionals and the public might not support uDCD. The authors are somewhat convincing on the first and second point, but very unconvincing on the third.

Reviewer: Sachs, Ben

Title: Private Gain and Public Pain

First Author: Siegel, Bruce

Citation: Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics 2008; 36: 644-651

Summary: This article considers the various explanations of America's skyrocketing health care

spending, and settles on the development and spread of technology as the most

powerful factor.

Reviewer: Sachs, Ben

Title: Legal Authority to Preserve Organs in Cases of Uncontrolled Cardiac Death: Preserving

Family Choice

First Author: Bonnie, Richard J.

Citation: Journal of Law, Medicine and Ethics 2008; 36: 741-751

Summary: It is commonplace for doctors to leave recently deceased patients on mechanical

ventilation to preserve the option of organ donation while the deceased's family members are found and asked for permission. This option is available for people who are declared dead according to neurological criteria. But what about people who suffer a sudden cardiac cardiac death? For them, preserving the option of organ donation requires making small incisions in the body cavity to perfuse the organs. However, some hospitals have expressed doubts as to whether they are legally authorized to do this.

The authors argue, first, "that preservation of organs while seeking family consent

is implicitly authorized by the Uniform Anatomical

Gift Act (UAGA), the model for all state organ donation statutes; second, even if courts were to conclude that these statutes do not confer the necessary authority, preserving organs under these circumstances (i.e., without explicit statutory authority) would not violate the rights of family members and would not pose any meaningful risk of liability."

Lancet

Reviewer: Kingma

Title: Medical Research Ethics in China

First Author: Wang, R. et al

Citation: Lancet 2008; 372: 1967-1968

Summary: An article considering the situation in China with respect to medical ethics. The author

writes on a positive note that priniciplism is on its way up in China. Article is most notable for its uncritical adoption of priniciplism as the universal way forward, especially

considering the fact that the article describes research ethics.

Reviewer: G. Owen Schaefer

Title: Obama's plans for US and global health

First Author: Brisol, Nellie

Citation: Lancet 2008; 372: 1797-1798

Summary: The author expresses cautious optimism about Obama's plans for health care. While

universal insurance coverage may be delayed, smaller initiatives like SCHIP will likely be enacted quickly. The ban on stem cell research and the global gag rule (NGO's supported by federal funds cannot perform or promote abortions) could be quickly

rescinded, while some say an institute to evaluate treatment effectiveness like the U.K.'s

NICE (NICER?) could be implemented.

Reviewer: Kingma

Title: Why and how is Health a Human Right?

First Author: Sen, A.

Citation: Lancet 2008; 372: 2010-2010

Summary: In a brief essay Sen considers how health can be a human right if ensuring health is

neither required by binding legislation, nor feasible. In answer to the first question, Sen argues rights should be thought of as having a function in terms of social ethics; they are meant to guide legislation. In answer to the second question Sen points out that

guaranteeing everyone's liberty or life is also not feasible, yet we do not consider those

rights to be incoherent.

More on health and a human right in the rest of this issue.

Reviewer: G. Owen Schaefer

Title: The role of welfare state principles and generosity in social policy programmes for public

health: an international comparative study

First Author: Lundberg, Olle

Citation: Lancet 2008; 372: 1633-1640

Summary: A study on 18 OECD studies the correlation between social policies and health. In

particular, the study compared infant mortality with amount of family support, as well as pension rates with old-age excess mortality. The general effect: a 1 percent increase in dual-earner family support was correlated with a .5 percent reduction in infant mortality. There is a weaker correlation between pension rates and old-age excess mortality. Only stronger universal pension systems were correlated with lower old-age excess mortality; Stronger income-based pension systems were not correlated. The latter finding is nevertheless important because it implies ensuring all elderly have a basic level of support may be more important than enforcing savings. All findings must also be approached with caution, as there are a large variety of other factors (especially that increased social support is likely correlated with increased health support) which could confound results. Still, it appears that the Nordic models (which have the common feature of having better-funded social programs) are well-correlated with at least these

two health indicators.

Reviewer: G. Owen Schaefer

Title: Fair and ethical trade in health procurement

First Author: Bhutta, Mahmood F

Citation: Lancet 2008; 372: 1935-1937

Summary: This article (along with an editorial in the same issue) points out an interesting

intersection of labor and health care ethics. The U.K.'s NHS is taking steps to ensure health supplies it purchases are not produced unethically. While it is unclear what specific "fair trade" standards will be used, the initiative is focused on ensuring

appropriate wages and limiting exploitation and abuse.

Reviewer: G. Owen Schaefer

Title: Rethinking suicide prevention in Asian countries

First Author: Chen, Ying-Yeh

Citation: Lancet 2008; 372: 1629-1630

Summary: The Japanese government has recently announced an anti-suicide initiative, specifically

bolstering treatment for depression. The authors are, however, skeptical that psychiatric treatment will be as effective in East Asia compared to other nations. The less individualistic Confucian philosophy is argued to be incongruous with individualistic psychiatry. Rather than depression, the authors claim "acute life stresses," especially economic issues, are primarily to blame for inordinately high East Asian suicide rates. Expanding treatment for depression, then, would not be the best public policy strategy for

preventing suicide in the region.

Reviewer: G. Owen Schaefer

Title: Solutions to the R&D crisis for neglected diseases

First Author: The Lancet

Citation: Lancet 2008; 372: 1784-1784

Summary: Oxfam recently released a report, Ending the R&D crisis in public health: promoting pro-

poor innovation. The report suggests increased funding is only one part of the solution — a rethinking of R&D incentives is also necessary. Oxfam specifically advises that prize funds (schemes similar to Thomas Pogge's Health Impact Fund which give cash awards to pharmaceutical companies depending on how much a drug contributes to public health in exchange for a waiver of patent rights) and patent pools (which allow two or more companies to hold joint patents, helping get around 'patent thickets' which impede research). Finally, Oxfam recommended that more research be done abroad, which would be cheaper (and so lower drug costs), help local economies and develop medical

infrastructure abroad.

New England Journal of Medicine

Reviewer: E. Abdoler

Title: The Genetic Privacy of Presidential Candidates

First Author: Green, RC

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2192-2193

Summary: In this perspective piece, the authors discuss the possibility of genomic information about

candidates being used in future presidential elections. Recognizing the potential phenomenon as an extension of the press's current practice of seeking personal and family health information about candidates, Green and Annas warn about the limits of genomic analysis and the possible negative consequences for future presidential races. In an effort to prevent "genetic McCarthyism," the authors urge future candidates to keep their own, and their opponents', genetic information private. Further, they implore experts to engage in the public education necessary to thwart the spread of genetic

discrimination and scrutiny.

Reviewer: E. Abdoler

Title: South Dakota's Abortion Script — Threatening the Physician-Patient Relationship

First Author: Lazzarini, Zita

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2189-2192

Summary: In this article, the author describes South Dakota's "Informed Consent" law for abortion

and the concerns it raises. First, she disagrees with the Eighth Circuit Court of Appeals' recent decision that the law does not violate the First Amendment rights of physicians; she claims the scripted language physicians must use to describe the fetus as "a whole, separate, unique, living human being" is ideological rather than biological. Second, she argues that the "informed consent" script physicians must use before performing abortions is designed to intimidate and upset women; further, she notes that the "informed consent" process itself is burdensome and undermines the autonomy of women seeking abortions. Finally, the author contends that the South Dakota abortion law "threatens the physician-patient relationship" by demanding that physicians use an "informed consent" script containing misinformation about the actual, confirmed risks of

the procedure.

Reviewer: E. Abdoler

Title: Physicians and the First Amendment

First Author: Curfman. GD

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2484-2485

Summary: In this editorial, the authors echo and expand upon Lazzarini's arguments in an earlier

issue of the NEJM that the South Dakota "abortion script" informed consent law violates the First Amendment rights of physicians by 1) "mandating ideological speech" and 2) obliging physicians to relay "false and misleading" information to their patients. The authors urge all physicians, regardless of their abortion views, to oppose the legislation, saying, "Patients should not accept, and our profession should not allow, physicians to

become a mouthpiece of state-sponsored ideology."

Reviewer: E. Abdoler

Title: Circumcision — A Surgical Strategy for HIV Prevention in Africa

First Author: Katz, IT

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2412-2415

Summary: This article describes the current debate regarding circumcision as an HIV prevention

strategy in Africa, especially among heterosexual men. While the evidence

overwhelmingly supports the claim that circumcision reduces the rate of HIV infection in this population of men, circumcision programs face many barriers and much criticism. Barriers include an inadequate number of trained providers, cultural differences, and suspicion of Western intervention in African health. Much of the criticism surrounding circumcision programs is directed at their cost; in a context of limited resources for health

interventions, circumcision programs compete against other important health goals.

Accordingly, the authors call for strong leadership to help ensure successful

advancement of the programs.

Reviewer: LD Stunkel

Title: The Future of Primary Care

First Author: Lee, TH

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2085-2092

Summary: The primary care system is presently tasked with caring for an increasing number of

patients in less time, and primary care physicians are not compensated as well as specialists. The system is disorganized and inadequate, and fewer and fewer new

doctors choose to pursue primary care.

The Need for Reinvention by TH Lee (2085-2086)

While some of the problems of primary care may be due to the fact that primary care physicians often earn less than specialists, the author suggests that they may also be due to the unique challenges faced by primary care physicians, including long hours and low job satisfaction. He suggests that we need to address these problems in order to attract doctors to primary care.

Sustaining Relationships by K Treadway (2086-2088)

The author relates a personal story of using her role as a primary care physician to offer comfort and guidance to a patient and her family. She suggests that our challenge in redesigning primary care will be to preserve the special nature of the relationship between patient and primary care physician.

Transforming Practice by T Bodenheimer (2086-2089)

The author argues that primary care should be reorganized "into a team-based endeavor," shifting some of the burden off overworked physicians.

Reforming Physician Payment by AH Goroll (2087-2090)

The author asserts that the current system of compensation for primary care physicians, fee-for-service, is flawed, and suggests that a new system by implemented in which a "base-payment" be established, and bonuses be offered for meeting cost and quality goals.

Refocusing the System by B Starfield (2087-2091)

Empirical evidence shows that increasing access to primary care improves the overall health of populations. The author suggests structural and financial reforms to decrease patients' use of specialists. Strengthening the role of primary care physicians will improve the health of the US population.

Lessons from the U.K. by M Roland (2087-2092)

The single-payer system in the UK is effectively an incentive to improve care quality and preventative care, thus elevating the status of the primary care physician. However, the UK system sacrifices some aspects of the personal relationship between patient and doctor.

Reviewer: LD Stunkel

Title: Innovation in Primary Care — Staying One Step Ahead of Burnout

First Author: Okie, S

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2305-2309

Summary: The author discusses several strategies to avoid primary care physician burnout. For

example, some small practices are making better use of nurses and administrative support to decrease the burden on physicians. For the treatment of chronic conditions, group information sessions to supplement individual consultations can increase success. Increased use of telephone and email communication can also improve

efficiency.

Reviewer: LD Stunkel

Title: Pay Now, Benefits May Follow — The Case of Cardiac Computed Tomographic

Angiography

First Author: Redberg, RF

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2309-2311

Summary: Insurers, including Medicare, are often paying for interventions that have not yet been

proven effective. This can in some cases lead to useless expenditures that have the potential to cripple Medicare. This is in part driven by fee-for-service compensation plans. The author advocates stricter adherence to evidence-based medicine both to

save money and to avoid risk from unproven interventions.

Reviewer: LD Stunkel

Title: The Lessons of Success — Revisiting the Medicare Story

First Author: Blumenthal, D

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2384-2389

Summary: The history of Medicare and Medicaid are the best examples to study if we want to enact

health care reform during Obama's presidency. Similar to Obama, Johnson was a Democratic president elected with a Democratic majority in Congress. Even then, Johnson moved very quickly to enact health reform while his victory was still fresh and influential, which was crucial to his success. Also, Johnson worked with Congressman Mills, who actually wrote the bill, ensuring that the bill came from Congress. Finally, Johnson did not concentrate on the cost of Medicare, saying, "I'll go a hundred million or a billion on health or education. I don't argue about that any more than I argue about Lady Bird [Mrs. Johnson] buying flour. You got to have flour and coffee in your house and

education and health."

Reviewer: LD Stunkel

Title: The Insanity Offense: How America's Failure to Treat the Seriously Mentally III

Endangers Its Citizens

First Author: Veenhuis, PE

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2401-2402

Summary: This article reviews E. Fuller Torrey's book, which traces the history of social and legal

attitudes toward the mentally ill in order to show how it became acceptable to allow the seriously mentally ill to refuse treatment. He advocates a reassessment of current attitudes, an effort to identify those at risk to commit violent acts, and "the creation of a national data bank to which people could be added only by judicial order; access to this data bank would be limited to health professionals and members of law enforcement

agencies."

Reviewer: E. Abdoler

Title: Home Delivery — Bringing Primary Care to the Housebound Elderly

First Author: Okie, S

Citation: New England Journal of Medicine 2008; 359: 2409-2412

Summary: In this article, the author describes several new programs that involve general internists

and nurse practitioners in the care of homebound elderly and disabled patients. It is not clear whether the new programs, including "House Calls" in Boston and "Just for Us" at Duke, save the system money; in fact, total spending may increase under these

programs. However, evidence exists that the programs reduce hospital admission rates and hospital days. Further, different payment systems may help support these programs

and the type of care coordination they provide, attracting young physicians to family

medicine.

PLoS Medicine

Reviewer: Sachs, Ben

Title: Reporting Bias in Drug Trials Submitted to the Food and Drug Adminstration: Review of

Publication and Presentation

First Author: Rising, Kristin

Citation: PLoS Medicine 2008; 5: 1561-1570

Summary: The objective of this study was to determine

the publication rate of efficacy trials submitted to the Food and Drug Administration

(FDA) in

approved New Drug Applications (NDAs) and to compare the trial characteristics as

reported by

the FDA with those reported in publications. The authors found that trials with positive results (results favorable to the drug) were more likely to be published; that primary outcomes reported to the FDA were, when unfavorable to the drug, less likely to be published; that there were sometimes discrepancies in reporting of statistical significance between results submitted to FDA and results published, where (usually) the analysis of statistical significance in the publication was more favorable to the drug than the analysis submitted to the FDA; and that there were sometimes discrepancies in reporting of conclusions between conclusions submitted to FDA and conclusions published, where (universally) the conclusion in the publication was more favorable to the drug than the conclusion submitted to FDA.

Reviewer: Sachs, Ben

Title: The Chilling Effect: How Do Researchers React to Controversy?

First Author: Kempner, Joanna

Citation: PLoS Medicine 2008; 5: 1571-1578

Summary: In October 2003 Congress publicly called into question over 250 NIH grants investigating

sexual behavior and drug use, suggesting that such studies might be a waste of taxpayer money. All grants remained funded, but various people expressed worry that the incident might discourage scientists from undertaking research in these areas. This article uses this incident as an opportunity to examine whether and to what extent this "chilling effect" is real. Its author surveyed and interviewed the scientists whose NIH grants were called

into question.

"About half of the sample said that they now remove potentially controversial words from their

grant and a quarter reported eliminating entire topics from their research agendas. Four researchers reportedly chose to move into more secure positions entirely, either outside academia or in jobs that guaranteed salaries. About 10% of the group reported that this controversy strengthened their commitment to complete their research and disseminate it widely."

Science

Reviewer: smith

Title: Changes to NIH Grant System May Backfire

First Author: Peter Karp et al

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 1187-1188

Summary: Article poses three problems for reforms proposed for the NIH grant system. They claim

that the shortening of grant proposals is too strong, curbing the abilities of reviewers, especially for multidisciplinary work. They suggest a middle ground between the current length and the proposed shorter length. They propose that the forced requirements for PIs to serve on review panels are also too strong and suggest a weaker requirement. Finally, they suggest that the proposed requirement that investigators with over \$1 million

in funding provide reason for additional funding requests will have negative

consequences and that review panels should instead have the right to make decisions in

the matter.

Reviewer: Smith

Title: European Union Floats Tighter Animal-Research Rules

First Author: Gretchen Vogel

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 1037-1038

Summary: Article details new European regulations on animal research and recounts mixed

reactions by both scientists and animal welfare activists. The new directive sets out "3Rs": "reducing the number of animals used, refining techniques to lessen pain and

discomfort, and replacing animal studies with alternatives."

Reviewer: Smith

Title: Obama Victory Raises Hopes for New Policies, Bigger Budgets

First Author: Constance Holden et al

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 1034-1035

Summary: Authors recount policy implications that the science community hopes for coming out of

the Obama victory.

Reviewer: smith

Title: Biology, Politics, and the Emerging Science of Human Nature

First Author: Fowler, James H. and Schreiber, Darren

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 912-914

Summary: Authors point to possible interactions between genetic behavioral research and social

science research into political behavior.

Reviewer: smith

Title: Zerhouni's Parting Message: Make Room for Young Scientists

First Author: Jocelyn Kaiser

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 834-835

Summary: Article reports action taken by Elias Zerhouni in his final days as NIH Director to make

formal policy out of the push to secure more R01 Grant funding for younger scientists. It then covers the debate that has taken a significant portion of his tenure on the issue.

Reviewer: smith

Title: US Visa Delays on the Rise, Scientists Abroad Report

First Author: Richard Stone

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 1172-1173

Summary: Article details growing difficulties for researchers wishing to obtain visas for conference

participation in time to actually attend said conferences and proposes that security agencies should endorse an expert vouching system in which agencies rely on the judgment of a scientific body or a university that the application is for its proposed

purposes.

Reviewer: smith

Title: Study Shows How Degraded Surroundings Can Degrade Behavior

First Author: Constance Holden

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 1175-1175

Summary: Article details recent findings that give empirical strength to the so-called Broken Window

Theory, on which individuals antisocial behavior is effected by environmental signals that

such behavior is taking place increase the rate of it.

Reviewer: smith

Title: Malaria Drugs, the Coca-Cola Way

First Author: Martin Enserink

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 1174-1174

Summary: The article details the possibility of decreasing the price of anti-malaria medication to

poor individuals in Africa by subsidizing private intermediaries to create a supply-chain. The idea is that competition between the intermediaries should reduce prices. It reports results from a trial in Tanzania in which wholesalers were allowed to sell in two rural districts that increased take home of said expensive malarial medication from 1% to

44%. Pilots of larger scope are planned.

Reviewer: smith

Title: The Touchy Subject of "Race"

First Author: Constance Holden

Citation: Science 2008; 322: 839-839

Summary: Author gives report of meeting at NHGRI on attempting to find terminology that is

acceptable for presentation of genetic findings, which will separate them from terms that are strongly linked from the social dynamics of "race." Author reported difficulties in finding appropriate language. Most interesting part was a quote by Allen Buchanan: "A visible concerted effort to change vocabulary for moral reasons is liekly to trigger a backlash, [and hence, there is a] risk of ... stiffling freedom of expression in the name of

political correctness."