## B. Georges Bank Haddock by R.W. Brown

### 1.0 Background

The Georges Bank haddock stock was last assessed by the United States in 1999 and reviewed by the Northern Demersal Committee of the Northeast Fisheries Science Center's Stock Assessment Workshop (NDWG 2000). The current stock assessment was reviewed at the $3^{\text {rd }}$ Transboundary Resource Assessment Committee in April 2000 (TRAC 2000. Brown 2000). In addition, a Canadian assessment through 1999 was completed in the April 2000 for the 5Zj\&m portion of the stock. The 1999 U.S. assessment estimated fully recruited fishing mortality (ages $4-7$ ) in 1999 to be 0.15 ( $13 \%$ exploitation rate), which was above the fishing mortality rate ( $\mathrm{F}_{\text {target }}$ $=0.00$ ) specified by the Sustainable Fisheries Act (SFA) harvest control rule (Brown 2000). Fishing mortality was estimated to have remained between 0.1 and 0.2 between 1995 and 1998. Spawning stock biomass (SSB) was estimated to have increased from 10,900 mt in 1993 to $38,100 \mathrm{mt}$ in 1998. The age structure of the population was continuing to expand and the age $4+$ biomass was estimated to be at its highest level since the early 1980s. Preliminary estimates of the 1998 year class indicated an estimated year class size of 61.9 million fish at age 1 , the largest year class since 1978. However, there was considerable uncertainty about the size of this year class due to highly variable catches in research vessel surveys available at the time of this assessment.

### 2.0 2000 Assessment

## 1999 Fishery

U.S. trip limit regulations for haddock continued to be liberalized, and 1999 regulations were significantly in more liberal in comparison to the 1998 calendar year. The trip limit from January 1 to April 30, 1999 was 3,000 pounds/day up to a maximum of 30,000 pounds/trip, 2,000 pounds/day up to a maximum of 20,000 pounds/trip from May 1 to November 4, 1999, and 5,000 pounds/trip up to a maximum of 50,000 pounds/trip from November 5 to December 31, 1999. As a result of both increased haddock abundance and liberalization of trip limit regulations, U.S. commercial landings of Georges Bank haddock in 1999 were 2,775 mt, a $51 \%$ increase from 1998 and an $887 \%$ increase over 1996 landings (Table B1, Figure B1). U.S. landings included 2,420 mt of landings from western Georges Bank (statistical areas 521, 522, 525,526 ) and 355 mt of landings from eastern Georges Bank (statistical areas $561 \& 562$ ). U.S. catch continues to be displaced inshore as a result of Days at Sea regulations and area closures.
U.S. landings at age on western Georges Bank and south were estimated separately by market category using U.S. port sampling data. Sampling was sufficient to characterize western Georges Bank landings, but poor temporal distribution of samples made it necessary to use different temporal pooling for each of the two market categories. For the large haddock, samples were applied separately for quarters 1 and 2 and pooled for quarters 3 and 4. For scrod haddock, samples were pooled for quarters 1 and 2 , and estimated separately for quarters 3 and 4 .
U.S. port samples were insufficient to characterize U.S. landings from eastern Georges Bank, but landings from this area comprise a relatively small portion of the U.S. and total landings in the assessment. Of the 2,775 mt of U.S. haddock landings from Georges Bank, 355 mt ( $12.8 \%$ of U.S. landings and $5.5 \%$ of total landings) occurred in eastern Georges Bank. U.S. landings from eastern Georges Bank were partitioned using U.S. length samples by market category from western Georges Bank and Canadian survey ages (quarter 1) and Canadian commercial ages (quarters $2,3 \& 4$ ). Length samples and landings were pooled identically to the analysis for western Georges Bank.

Discard estimates have been added to the catch at age during the assessment when resource conditions and management actions have resulted in the generation of levels of regulatory discard significantly higher than chronic background levels. In 1974, 1977, 1978, and 1980, discarding increased sharply as three large year classes $(1972,1975,1978)$ recruited to the fishery (Overholtz et al. 1983). The catch at age in each of these years was augmented by estimates of associated discard. More recently, the catch at age was also augmented with estimates of discards from 1994 to 1998 to account for discard mortality generated in response to trip limit regulations in the U.S. fishery. Low discard rates reported in the Sea Sample and Vessel Trip Report databases are consistent with liberalized haddock trip limits that were in effect during 1999. These discarding rates are less than the rates reported in the U.S. fishery during the 1994 to 1998 period, and appear to be representative of background discarding rates reported in the Sea Sampling database from 1989 to 1993. Based on these observations and the dearth of information available to characterize the size and age distribution of U.S. discards, estimates of U.S. discards were not included in the 1999 catch at age.

Canadian catch from the Georges Bank haddock stock consisted of 3,680 mt of landings (Table B1), approximately $94 \%$ of the allocated 1999 quota of $3,900 \mathrm{mt}$ and $57 \%$ of the total haddock landings from the Georges Bank stock. Comparison of observer samples with port samples did not reveal any persistent patterns which would indicate that discarding or high grading was occurring. The size and age composition of the 1999 Canadian fishery was characterized by port and at sea samples from all principal gears and all seasons.

The combined catch at age was dominated by age 3 (1996 year class) haddock, although there were significant contributions by ages 4-6 (1995, 1994, and 1993 year classes). Although 25\% of landings by weight from the stock were accounted for by the 1996 year class, age 5 and older fish still comprised $58 \%$ of total landings by weight.

## Fishery Independent Information

Abundance (stratified mean number/tow) and biomass (stratified mean weight/tow) survey indices in the U.S. Spring survey in 1999 and 2000 remained above levels observed from 19861995 (Table B2; Figure B2). The 1999 U.S. Spring survey catch of age 1 haddock (1998 year class) was the highest level observed since 1979 (1978 year class), but the index in the 2000 U.S. Spring survey for this year class was reduced substantially. The abundance and biomass survey indices in the U.S. Autumn survey in 1999 were the highest observed since 1979 (Table B2;

Figure B2). The 1998 U.S. Autumn survey catch of age 0 haddock (1998 year class) was the highest level observed since 1985 (1985 year class), but the index for this year class at age 1 declined sharply in the 1999 survey. Aggregate abundance survey indices in the Canadian Spring survey in 2000 were the highest levels observed since the initiation of the survey in 1986, and three-fold higher than the 1999 index (Figure B2). The majority of this abundance was comprised of large catches of age 1 and 2 haddock (1999 and 1998 year classes, respectively). Each of these indices was 3 fold higher than the next index at age in the Canadian survey time series. A single large tow in the 2000 Canadian survey had a significant effect on the aggregate index value.

## Input Data and Analysis

The present assessment represents a one-year update to the previous U.S. assessment (NDWG 2000). The VPA formulation used for the current assessment was identical to the one used in the 1999 U.S. assessment, except for the addition of the terminal year of catch at age (1999) and research survey data (U.S. Spring 1999, U.S. Autumn 1999, Canadian Spring 2000). Very minor revisions were made to 1997 catch at age to incorporate revisions to the estimate of 1997 Canadian catch at age.

Precision of the 2000 stock sizes and 1999 fishing mortality and SSB estimates was derived from 1000 bootstrap simulations of the 1999 VPA formulation. A retrospective analysis of terminal year estimates of stock size, fully recruited fishing mortality and SSB was carried out to 1995.

### 3.0 Assessment Results

The current assessment continues to consistently estimate the strength of incoming year classes, indicating that the 1992 ( 15.3 million at age 1), 1993 ( 12.4 million), and 1996 ( 19.5 million) were stronger than other year classes since 1988 (Table B3; Figure B3). Based on the consistent strength of age $0+$ and 1 survey indices, the 1998 and 1999 year classes are estimated to be 48.8 and 35.2 million fish at age 1, respectively. If these estimates are reliable, the 1998 and 1999 year classes would be the third and fourth largest year class since 1964, although smaller than the 1975 (103.3 million at age 1) and 1978 ( 84.0 million) year classes (Table B3). There is considerable uncertainty about the relative size of these two year classes due to highly variable results from research vessel surveys conducted to date. The size of these year classes will remain uncertain until additional fishery dependent and independent information is collected and analyzed. The age distribution of the stock continues to show evidence of broadening.

SSB has continued to increase steadily since 1994 and was estimated to be $48,500 \mathrm{mt}$. Although SSB is threefold higher than was estimated in 1993, it remains less than $50 \%$ of the $\mathrm{B}_{\text {MSY }}$ level of $105,000 \mathrm{mt}$ established by harvest control rules. Fully recruited fishing mortality (ages 4-7) in 1999 is estimated to be 0.16 , a slight increase from the fishing mortality estimated for 1998 (Table B3; Figure B4).

## VPA Diagnostics

The sums of squares and mean squared residuals from the VPA were within the range of accepted VPAs from the last four U.S. assessments of Georges Bank haddock. The coefficients of variation on estimated age 1-8 stock sizes (range 0.25-0.61) were slightly nearly identical to those observed in recent U.S. assessments. Other VPA diagnostics including the range of CV's on survey $q$ estimates, the number of large standardized residuals and the maximum partial variance estimates are consistent with previous U.S. haddock assessments. There were no outstanding residual patterns detected during an analysis of standardized residuals. Residual patterns for the 1998 and 1999 year classes exhibit a general trend reflecting consistently higher Canadian survey indices which are contrasted by consistently lower U.S. Autumn survey indices.

Accounting for precision in the current assessment, there is a $80 \%$ probability that fully recruited F in 1999 was between 0.14 and 0.18 , and that SSB in 1999 was between 43,800 and $54,500 \mathrm{mt}$. There was a $14.9 \%$ change that SSB in 1999 exceeded the limit threshold ( $53,000 \mathrm{mt}$ ) and a zero percent chance that SSB in 1999 had exceeded the target biomass threshold $(68,000 \mathrm{mt})$.

Retrospective patterns for fishing mortality were similar to those observed in the 1999 assessment of this stock, indicating that terminal year estimates of fishing mortality and SSB are relatively well estimated in the terminal year of the assessment. The alternating pattern of slightly overestimated and slightly underestimated terminal year estimates indicates that there is not a retrospective pattern in the terminal year estimates of these parameters.

Terminal year estimates of age 1 recruitment were more variable with a significant tendency to overestimate age 1 recruitment in some years (1995 year class in 1996, 1998 year class in 1999). The retrospective analysis of age 1 stock sizes reinforces the need for additional survey information on incoming recruitment before firm estimates of year class strength can be made.

## Harvest Control Rule

The SFA harvest control rule for Georges Bank haddock is based on MSY-based reference point proxies (Figure B5). When SSB is greater than $105,000 \mathrm{mt}$, the overfishing limit is $\mathrm{F}_{0.1}$ (currently estimated to be 0.26 ), and the target F is $75 \%$ of the $\mathrm{F}_{\text {MSY }}$ proxy ( 0.20 ). The limit F decreases linearly from 0.26 at $105,000 \mathrm{mt}$ of SSB to zero at $53,000 \mathrm{mt} \mathrm{SSB}$, and the target F decreases linearly from 0.20 at $105,000 \mathrm{mt}$ of SSB to zero at $68,000 \mathrm{mt}$ of SSB.

### 4.0 Consistency of 1999 Projection Forecast with 2000 Assessment Results

Projections conducted during the 1999 assessment (NDWG 2000) were based on the 1999 assessment results, assumed that $\mathrm{F}_{1999}=\mathrm{F}_{1998}=0.15$, and estimated that SSB would rise to 44,700 mt in 1999. The 2000 assessment estimated $\mathrm{F}_{1999}=0.16$ and SSB at 48,500 mt (Table B3). The fishing mortality assumption made during the 1999 assessment was reasonable ( 0.15 vs. realized F of 0.16) and the resulting SSB projection for $1999(48,500 \mathrm{mt})$ is within the $80 \%$ confidence
interval (40,000-49,800 mt) of the 1999 assessment projection. The 2000 assessment resulted in improved SSB estimates for 1997-1999, based on relatively stronger contributions from the 1994 and 1996 year classes.

### 5.0 Sources of Uncertainty

a) Sampling of U.S. landings and discards was insufficient to accurately characterize the size and age distribution of the catch. There is a critical need for increased biological sampling for Georges Bank haddock.
b) There is considerable uncertainty regarding the size of the 1998 and 1999 year classes. Survey indices for these year classes are highly variable and there is conflicting information about the relative size of these year classes from U.S. and Canadian surveys.

### 6.0 Conclusions

The Georges Bank haddock stock remains in an overexploited condition based on the current low level of biomass in relation to management rebuilding thresholds and pre-collapse stock levels. The assessment indicates that fishing mortality has been reduced from pre-1994 levels, and $\mathrm{F}_{1999}(0.16$ or $13 \%$ exploitation) indicates that fishing mortality has remained stable and at relatively low levels since 1994. The age structure of the population is continuing to expand and the age $4+$ biomass is at its highest levels since 1982. Recruitment continues to improve and the 1998 and 1999 year classes are currently estimated to be the largest observed since 1978. There is considerable uncertainty about the absolute size of these year classes due to the influence of large tows that have a significant influence on available survey indices. Spawning stock biomass (SSB) in 1998 was estimated to be 48,500 mt, a 3-fold increase over levels estimated in 1993 but less than $50 \%$ of the $\mathrm{B}_{\mathrm{MSY}}$ of $105,000 \mathrm{mt}$ established by U.S. harvest control rules.

Observed increases in SSB of Georges Bank haddock have resulted from conservation of a series of relatively weak year classes. This was a necessary first step in the stock rebuilding process. Spawning stock has been rebuilt and age structure has been restored to the point where recruitment appears to be improving significantly. If incoming recruitment from the 1998 and 1999 year classes is conserved, growth and maturation of these year classes will result in significant increases in SSB. Based on historical stock recruitment relationships for this stock, as SSB increases, the probability of additional strong recruitment events will be significantly enhanced. Maintenance of low fishing mortality rates to promote continuous rebuilding of SSB is essential to achieving biomass rebuilding targets for this stock. Given the potential growth trajectories for this stock, maintenance of current low fishing mortality rates should still allow for significant increases in available landings to both the U.S. and Canadian fisheries over the next several years.

### 7.0 References

Brown, R.W. 2000. U.S. Stock Assessment of 5Z George Bank Haddock, 1931-1999. Northeast Fisheries Science Center Reference Document 00-XX. [In Review]

NDWG (Northern Demersal Working Group, Northeast Regional Stock Assessment Workshop). 2000. Assessment of 11 northeast groundfishstocks through 1999. Report of the SAW Northern Demersal Working Group. A Report to the NEFMC Multi-Species Monitoring Committee. NMFS, NEFSC Reference Document 00-5.

Overholtz, W. J., S. H. Clark, and D. Y. White. 1983. A review of the status of the Georges Bank and Gulf of Maine haddock stocks for 1983. Woods Hole Laboratory Reference Document No. 83-23.

TRAC (Transboundary Resource Assessment Committee) 2000. TRAC Advisory Report on Stock Status. A Report of the Third Meeting of the Transboundary Resources Assessment Committee (TRAC), Woods Hole, Massachusetts, April 26-28, 2000. NMFS, NEFSC Reference Document 00-08.

Table B1. Commercial landings (mt) of haddock from Georges Bank and south (NAFO Division 5Z and Subarea 6), 1960-1999. ${ }^{1}$

| Year | U.S. | Canada | USSR | Spain | Other | Total |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1960 | 40800 | 77 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 40877 |
| 1961 | 46384 | 266 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 46650 |
| 1962 | 49409 | 3461 | 1134 | 0 | 0 | 54004 |
| 1963 | 44150 | 8379 | 2317 | 0 | 0 | 54846 |
| 1964 | 46512 | 11625 | 5483 | 2 | 464 | 64086 |
| 1965 | 52823 | 14889 | 81882 | 10 | 758 | 150362 |
| 1966 | 52918 | 18292 | 48409 | 1111 | 544 | 121274 |
| 1967 | 34728 | 13040 | 2316 | 1355 | 30 | 51469 |
| 1968 | 25469 | 9323 | 1397 | 3014 | 1720 | 40923 |
| 1969 | 16456 | 3990 | 65 | 1201 | 540 | 22252 |
| 1970 | 8415 | 1978 | 103 | 782 | 22 | 11300 |
| 1971 | 7306 | 1630 | 374 | 1310 | 242 | 10862 |
| 1972 | 3869 | 609 | 137 | 1098 | 20 | 5733 |
| 1973 | 2777 | 1563 | 602 | 386 | 3 | 5331 |
| 1974 | 2396 | 462 | 109 | 764 | 559 | 4290 |
| 1975 | 3989 | 1358 | 8 | 61 | 4 | 5420 |
| 1976 | 2904 | 1361 | 4 | 46 | 9 | 4324 |
| 1977 | 7934 | 2909 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 10843 |
| 1978 | 12160 | 10179 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 22339 |
| 1979 | 14279 | 5182 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 19461 |
| 1980 | 17470 | 10017 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 27487 |
| 1981 | 19176 | 5658 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 24834 |
| 1982 | 12625 | 4872 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 17497 |
| 1983 | 8682 | 3208 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 11890 |
| 1984 | 8807 | 1463 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 10270 |
| 1985 | 4273 | 3484 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 7757 |
| 1986 | 3339 | 3415 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6754 |
| 1987 | 2156 | 4703 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6859 |
| 1988 | 2492 | $4046{ }^{2}$ | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6538 |
| 1989 | 1430 | 3059 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4489 |
| 1990 | 2001 | 3340 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 5341 |
| 1991 | 1395 | 5446 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6841 |
| 1992 | 2005 | 4061 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6066 |
| 1993 | 687 | 3727 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 4414 |
| 1994 | $218{ }^{3}$ | 2411 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2629 |
| 1995 | $218{ }^{3}$ | 2064 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 2282 |
| 1996 | $313^{3}$ | 3643 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3956 |
| 1997 | $888^{3}$ | 2622 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 3510 |
| 1998 | $1841{ }^{3}$ | 3371 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 5212 |
| 1999 | $2775^{3}$ | 3680 | 0 | 0 | 0 | 6455 |

${ }^{1}$ All landings 1960-1979 are from Clark et al. (1982); U.S. landings 1980-1981 are from Overholtz et al. (1983); U.S. landings 1982-1993 are from NMFS, NEFC Detailed Weighout Files and Canvas data; Canadian landings 1980-1998 from Gavaris and Van Eeckhaute (1999); Canadian landings 1999 from S. Gavaris (Personal Communication).
${ }^{2} 1895$ tons were excluded because of suspected misreporting (Gavaris and Van Eeckhaute 1995).
${ }^{3}$ U.S. landings from 1994-1999 are prorated using Vessel Trip Report data and are considered provisional.

Table B2. Mean number and mean weight ( kg ) per tow of haddock caught in the U.S. spring and autumn bottom trawl surveys from 1963-1999.

| Year | Spring Survey |  | Autumn Survey |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
|  | Number/Tow | Weight (kg)/tow | Number/tow | Weight (kg)/tow |
| 1963 |  |  | 145.01 | 79.77 |
| 1964 |  |  | 193.24 | 96.75 |
| 1965 |  |  | 101.69 | 72.78 |
| 1966 |  |  | 33.26 | 29.87 |
| 1967 | Spring survey | ted in 1968 | 17.70 | 25.47 |
| 1968 | 13.84 | 20.55 | 7.51 | 15.40 |
| 1969 | 7.33 | 16.93 | 3.38 | 8.44 |
| 1970 | 6.00 | 17.12 | 7.70 | 13.50 |
| 1971 | 2.79 | 5.00 | 4.20 | 5.59 |
| 1972 | 6.38 | 7.37 | 11.35 | 8.47 |
| 1973 | 37.62 | 15.37 | 14.89 | 9.78 |
| 1974 | 19.01 | 17.70 | 4.05 | 3.99 |
| 1975 | 6.24 | 8.21 | 30.95 | 15.10 |
| 1976 | 83.19 | 15.72 | 71.07 | 35.76 |
| 1977 | 36.86 | 26.58 | 23.25 | 27.52 |
| 1978 | 19.41 | 31.27 | 25.29 | 18.06 |
| 1979 | 45.50 | 19.77 | 52.24 | 31.98 |
| 1980 | 60.06 | 53.92 | 30.54 | 21.98 |
| 1981 | 31.21 | 38.02 | 13.45 | 14.01 |
| 1982 | 8.60 | 13.11 | 4.96 | 7.34 |
| 1983 | 5.60 | 13.21 | 7.99 | 5.75 |
| 1984 | 6.24 | 7.45 | 5.38 | 4.48 |
| 1985 | 8.85 | 11.14 | 14.19 | 3.86 |
| 1986 | 5.85 | 5.86 | 6.81 | 5.10 |
| 1987 | 4.95 | 5.60 | 3.62 | 2.56 |
| 1988 | 3.38 | 3.43 | 5.35 | 5.57 |
| 1989 | 5.35 | 4.70 | 4.34 | 4.70 |
| 1990 | 7.68 | 7.57 | 2.92 | 2.62 |
| 1991 | 3.97 | 4.38 | 2.92 | 0.94 |
| 1992 | 1.18 | 1.41 | 6.06 | 3.17 |
| 1993 | 2.79 | 2.48 | 8.09 | 4.33 |
| 1994 | 4.99 | 3.63 | 3.58 | 2.93 |
| 1995 | 5.61 | 5.72 | 17.11 | 10.66 |
| 1996 | 23.40 | 25.73 | 4.47 | 4.11 |
| 1997 | 12.95 | 18.50 | 6.16 | 6.51 |
| 1998 | 7.28 | 6.12 | 11.07 | 5.75 |
| 1999 | 16.66 | 7.74 | 33.09 | 23.13 |

Table B3. Beginning year stock size (000s) of Georges Bank haddock estimated from VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1963 | 1964 | 1965 | 1966 | 1967 | 1968 | 1969 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 190706 | 471885 | 33154 | 4137 | 12954 | 422 | 988 |
| 2 | 32266 | 153504 | 377207 | 18457 | 3284 | 9565 | 338 |
| 3 | 32743 | 22756 | 111260 | 194986 | 8920 | 2536 | 5122 |
| 4 | 45821 | 20096 | 14510 | 50830 | 68425 | 4687 | 1435 |
| 5 | 29031 | 27424 | 12131 | 7034 | 24273 | 37321 | 2099 |
| 6 | 9186 | 16351 | 14561 | 5959 | 3254 | 10519 | 17419 |
| 7 | 5595 | 5526 | 8144 | 5868 | 2535 | 1570 | 5446 |
| 8 | 2795 | 3309 | 2640 | 3255 | 2694 | 1177 | 682 |
| 9 | 4217 | 4251 | 3258 | 2201 | 2031 | 2163 | 1712 |
| 1+ | 352360 | 725101 | 576867 | 292727 | 128369 | 69961 | 35241 |
|  | 1970 | 1971 | 1972 | 1973 | 1974 | 1975 | 1976 |
| 1 | 4661 | 369 | 8517 | 19418 | 10547 | 7661 | 103305 |
| 2 | 807 | 3774 | 301 | 6832 | 13582 | 8594 | 6098 |
| 3 | 267 | 518 | 1846 | 245 | 3716 | 7211 | 6100 |
| 4 | 2657 | 204 | 222 | 1104 | 198 | 2448 | 4217 |
| 5 | 770 | 1660 | 131 | 109 | 555 | 160 | 1665 |
| 6 | 1127 | 462 | 1097 | 78 | 41 | 391 | 127 |
| 7 | 8874 | 729 | 156 | 790 | 37 | 32 | 282 |
| 8 | 3035 | 5177 | 339 | 57 | 577 | 28 | 22 |
| 9 | 1875 | 3245 | 6311 | 1679 | 2702 | 622 | 623 |
| 1+ | 24071 | 16137 | 18919 | 30311 | 31954 | 27146 | 122441 |
|  | 1977 | 1978 | 1979 | 1980 | 1981 | 1982 | 1983 |
| 1 | 13810 | 6073 | 83984 | 10137 | 7225 | 2480 | 3108 |
| 2 | 84449 | 11306 | 4971 | 68760 | 8292 | 5915 | 2029 |
| 3 | 4565 | 51420 | 8568 | 4046 | 28246 | 5212 | 3788 |
| 4 | 4497 | 3568 | 29074 | 5453 | 2999 | 13174 | 2789 |
| 5 | 2657 | 3066 | 2645 | 17317 | 3582 | 1703 | 7408 |
| 6 | 1168 | 1709 | 1997 | 1691 | 8700 | 2085 | 1041 |
| 7 | 104 | 633 | 931 | 1264 | 847 | 4796 | 1192 |
| 8 | 210 | 82 | 392 | 478 | 541 | 394 | 2914 |
| 9 | 594 | 390 | 187 | 251 | 319 | 406 | 275 |
| 1+ | 112054 | 78246 | 132750 | 109396 | 60751 | 36164 | 24545 |
|  | 1984 | 1985 | 1986 | 1987 | 1988 | 1989 | 1990 |
| 1 | 17265 | 1761 | 14746 | 2103 | 16757 | 1087 | 2644 |
| 2 | 2544 | 14136 | 1442 | 12068 | 1722 | 13716 | 890 |
| 3 | 1468 | 1999 | 9396 | 1131 | 8075 | 1363 | 10087 |
| 4 | 2366 | 933 | 1139 | 5150 | 810 | 4454 | 1038 |
| 5 | 1659 | 1279 | 588 | 731 | 2757 | 542 | 2853 |
| 6 | 4039 | 999 | 630 | 350 | 488 | 1415 | 314 |
| 7 | 606 | 1966 | 612 | 360 | 220 | 265 | 835 |
| 8 | 808 | 284 | 1134 | 365 | 214 | 130 | 175 |
| 9 | 1628 | 550 | 254 | 461 | 351 | 208 | 166 |
| $1+$ | 32384 | 23908 | 29941 | 22719 | 31393 | 23180 | 19002 |

Table B3 (Cont). Beginning year stock size (000s) of Georges Bank haddock estimated from VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1991 | 1992 | 1993 | 1994 | 1995 | 1996 | 1997 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 2377 | 9306 | 15272 | 12448 | 10425 | 9908 | 19530 |
| 2 | 2163 | 1940 | 7613 | 12497 | 10190 | 8527 | 8107 |
| 3 | 719 | 1365 | 1365 | 5970 | 9989 | 8262 | 6933 |
| 4 | 6951 | 506 | 828 | 801 | 4155 | 7638 | 6249 |
| 5 | 694 | 3746 | 295 | 408 | 502 | 2988 | 5398 |
| 6 | 1551 | 476 | 1686 | 147 | 274 | 357 | 2027 |
| 7 | 168 | 899 | 289 | 784 | 58 | 196 | 230 |
| 8 | 523 | 72 | 443 | 202 | 505 | 40 | 141 |
| 9 | 243 | 247 | 210 | 198 | 160 | 58 | 356 |
| 1+ | 15388 | 18558 | 28001 | 33456 | 36258 | 37974 | 48971 |
|  | 1998 | 1999 | 2000 |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 11294 | 48760 | 35243 |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 15963 | 9245 | 39921 |  |  |  |  |
| 3 | 6477 | 12890 | 7534 |  |  |  |  |
| 4 | 5415 | 4927 | 9592 |  |  |  |  |
| 5 | 4413 | 3980 | 3507 |  |  |  |  |
| 6 | 3906 | 2987 | 2808 |  |  |  |  |
| 7 | 1460 | 2722 | 1984 |  |  |  |  |
| 8 | 171 | 1061 | 1926 |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | 331 | 303 | 951 |  |  |  |  |
| 1+ | 49430 | 86877 | 103466 |  |  |  |  |

Table B3 (Cont). Spawning stock biomass (mt) of Georges Bank haddock estimated from the VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1963 | 1964 | 1965 | 1966 | 1967 | 1968 | 1969 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 |
| 2 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 1675 | 61 |
| 3 | 24233 | 15655 | 65996 | 91773 | 4934 | 1433 | 3119 |
| 4 | 56101 | 23010 | 14892 | 48128 | 60273 | 4294 | 1636 |
| 5 | 38629 | 36355 | 15691 | 8788 | 26351 | 41983 | 2731 |
| 6 | 16464 | 25247 | 20964 | 8946 | 5063 | 15410 | 26018 |
| 7 | 10877 | 10439 | 13799 | 10289 | 4575 | 2780 | 10823 |
| 8 | 6533 | 7059 | 5446 | 6850 | 5610 | 2397 | 1526 |
| 9 | 11435 | 10811 | 8271 | 5784 | 5324 | 5124 | 5278 |
| 1+ | 164273 | 128575 | 145060 | 180559 | 112131 | 75096 | 51190 |
|  | 1970 | 1971 | 1972 | 1973 | 1974 | 1975 | 1976 |


| 1 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 2 | 164 | 756 | 67 | 1594 | 3142 | 2253 | 1510 |
| 3 | 185 | 411 | 1652 | 273 | 4216 | 7623 | 6069 |
| 4 | 3442 | 266 | 304 | 1789 | 359 | 4459 | 6767 |
| 5 | 1303 | 3215 | 236 | 189 | 1248 | 342 | 3694 |
| 6 | 2067 | 873 | 2671 | 183 | 116 | 1039 | 316 |
| 7 | 17573 | 1590 | 354 | 2308 | 126 | 113 | 863 |
| 8 | 7609 | 12676 | 962 | 170 | 1956 | 105 | 87 |
| 9 | 6177 | 10450 | 20679 | 5770 | 10659 | 2455 | 2771 |
| 1+ | 38520 | 30237 | 26924 | 12276 | 21822 | 18389 | 22076 |
|  | 1977 | 1978 | 1979 | 1980 | 1981 | 1982 | 1983 |
| 1 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 | 00 |
| 2 | 17995 | 2458 | 1134 | 12825 | 1686 | 1074 | 293 |
| 3 | 4151 | 45760 | 6800 | 3345 | 20420 | 4055 | 3145 |
| 4 | 7098 | 5675 | 44468 | 7305 | 3874 | 17421 | 3991 |
| 5 | 5546 | 6779 | 5353 | 30529 | 6242 | 3137 | 12974 |
| 6 | 2927 | 4333 | 5274 | 3784 | 18209 | 4569 | 2279 |
| 7 | 351 | 1847 | 2737 | 3438 | 2262 | 12571 | 3240 |
| 8 | 725 | 286 | 1233 | 1494 | 1781 | 1315 | 8354 |
| 9 | 2664 | 1797 | 799 | 827 | 1224 | 1445 | 1019 |
| 1+ | 41458 | 68935 | 67797 | 63547 | 55698 | 45586 | 35294 |
|  | 1984 | 1985 | 1986 | 1987 | 1988 | 1989 | 1990 |
| 1 | 376 | 79 | 1114 | 137 | 1105 | 97 | 117 |
| 2 | 436 | 4746 | 491 | 4335 | 685 | 5044 | 339 |
| 3 | 1429 | 1787 | 8534 | 1097 | 6681 | 1395 | 9917 |
| 4 | 3212 | 1317 | 1593 | 7119 | 1112 | 6049 | 1507 |
| 5 | 2933 | 2274 | 1163 | 1340 | 4738 | 911 | 4770 |
| 6 | 8196 | 2162 | 1446 | 808 | 983 | 2853 | 638 |
| 7 | 1405 | 4897 | 1526 | 923 | 540 | 672 | 1994 |
| 8 | 2283 | 820 | 3256 | 1054 | 597 | 377 | 476 |
| 9 | 5141 | 1817 | 848 | 1710 | 1197 | 708 | 603 |
| $1+$ | 25411 | 19900 | 19971 | 18523 | 17638 | 18106 | 20361 |

Table B3 (Cont). Spawning stock biomass (mt) of Georges Bank haddock estimated from the VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1991 | 1992 | 1993 | 1994 | 1995 | 1996 | 1997 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 92 | 323 | 521 | 252 | 53 | 58 | 96 |
| 2 | 947 | 822 | 1704 | 3010 | 2160 | 1888 | 1759 |
| 3 | 698 | 1589 | 1209 | 5366 | 11204 | 8713 | 8350 |
| 4 | 9669 | 666 | 1230 | 1309 | 6979 | 11583 | 9641 |
| 5 | 1244 | 6115 | 480 | 882 | 1092 | 5885 | 10037 |
| 6 | 3201 | 985 | 3336 | 281 | 686 | 812 | 4543 |
| 7 | 367 | 2109 | 683 | 1940 | 158 | 560 | 601 |
| 8 | 1319 | 185 | 1132 | 570 | 1392 | 124 | 440 |
| 9 | 907 | 878 | 706 | 800 | 586 | 198 | 1196 |
| 1+ | 18445 | 13674 | 11001 | 14409 | 24311 | 29823 | 36663 |
|  | 1998 | 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 75 | 569 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 3457 | 2240 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 | 7181 | 14483 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 | 8875 | 7744 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 | 8013 | 7212 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 | 8241 | 6006 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7 | 3713 | 6366 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 8 | 535 | 2885 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | 1178 | 1018 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1+ | 41270 | 48522 |  |  |  |  |  |

Table B3 (Cont). Estimated mean biomass (mt) for the Georges Bank haddock estimated from VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1963 | 1964 | 1965 | 1966 | 1967 | 1968 | 1969 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 97717 | 211391 | 14554 | 2142 | 7375 | 223 | 465 |
| 2 | 23694 | 108938 | 190543 | 9574 | 2026 | 5762 | 235 |
| 3 | 30570 | 20524 | 79454 | 107563 | 6249 | 2031 | 4131 |
| 4 | 52683 | 22565 | 13938 | 45273 | 60547 | 4252 | 1805 |
| 5 | 37107 | 33322 | 14500 | 8336 | 23357 | 41005 | 2735 |
| 6 | 15484 | 23667 | 19034 | 8292 | 4737 | 16183 | 25212 |
| 7 | 10228 | 9378 | 12048 | 9296 | 4088 | 2471 | 10392 |
| 8 | 6577 | 6509 | 4809 | 6534 | 5219 | 2165 | 1497 |
| 9 | 10122 | 9407 | 6938 | 4896 | 4586 | 4345 | 4563 |
| 1+ | 284182 | 445700 | 355818 | 201907 | 118183 | 78438 | 51035 |
|  | 1970 | 1971 | 1972 | 1973 | 1974 | 1975 | 1976 |
| 1 | 2983 | 224 | 4739 | 9796 | 6867 | 4247 | 46780 |
| 2 | 828 | 2777 | 280 | 5270 | 10666 | 7130 | 5242 |
| 3 | 286 | 458 | 2511 | 348 | 5529 | 9097 | 7308 |
| 4 | 4091 | 287 | 324 | 1700 | 414 | 4489 | 6720 |
| 5 | 1320 | 3249 | 248 | 167 | 1324 | 315 | 3728 |
| 6 | 2183 | 791 | 2731 | 181 | 136 | 980 | 356 |
| 7 | 17699 | 1487 | 300 | 2318 | 132 | 107 | 901 |
| 8 | 7654 | 12198 | 942 | 169 | 1948 | 96 | 85 |
| 9 | 5489 | 9174 | 18665 | 5098 | 9910 | 2252 | 2513 |
| 1+ | 42532 | 30643 | 30740 | 25047 | 36925 | 28713 | 73634 |
|  | 1977 | 1978 | 1979 | 1980 | 1981 | 1982 | 1983 |
| 1 | 6634 | 2917 | 40343 | 5051 | 2554 | 494 | 930 |
| 2 | 71235 | 9281 | 4493 | 42806 | 5771 | 4630 | 1768 |
| 3 | 5826 | 58786 | 8824 | 4231 | 24504 | 5619 | 4140 |
| 4 | 8107 | 6291 | 45834 | 7702 | 4192 | 18830 | 3982 |
| 5 | 5864 | 6958 | 5353 | 27164 | 6363 | 3188 | 12276 |
| 6 | 2803 | 4087 | 5034 | 3442 | 17830 | 4408 | 2131 |
| 7 | 384 | 1695 | 2568 | 3068 | 2195 | 12237 | 3210 |
| 8 | 683 | 242 | 1162 | 1257 | 1652 | 1198 | 7491 |
| 9 | 2411 | 1633 | 711 | 717 | 1071 | 1275 | 898 |
| 1+ | 103947 | 91891 | 114321 | 95439 | 66131 | 51880 | 36824 |
|  | 1984 | 1985 | 1986 | 1987 | 1988 | 1989 | 1990 |
| 1 | 5164 | 527 | 6013 | 820 | 6378 | 522 | 1533 |
| 2 | 2080 | 11489 | 1203 | 8249 | 1505 | 10509 | 778 |
| 3 | 1558 | 2125 | 9604 | 1375 | 8155 | 1765 | 12464 |
| 4 | 3234 | 1480 | 1683 | 7660 | 1120 | 6434 | 1519 |
| 5 | 2864 | 2256 | 1174 | 1353 | 4145 | 923 | 4522 |
| 6 | 7688 | 2149 | 1365 | 736 | 894 | 2826 | 596 |
| 7 | 1259 | 4627 | 1415 | 847 | 509 | 702 | 1871 |
| 8 | 2021 | 810 | 3087 | 1042 | 561 | 370 | 404 |
| 9 | 4444 | 1600 | 756 | 1498 | 1045 | 635 | 533 |
| 1+ | 30312 | 27062 | 26301 | 23578 | 24312 | 24687 | 24221 |

Table B3 (Cont). Estimated mean biomass (mt) for the Georges Bank haddock estimated from VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1991 | 1992 | 1993 | 1994 | 1995 | 1996 | 1997 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 1250 | 4536 | 9120 | 5043 | 4052 | 4094 | 7358 |
| 2 | 2082 | 1922 | 7901 | 12238 | 8889 | 8457 | 7247 |
| 3 | 795 | 1761 | 1828 | 8228 | 13045 | 10792 | 10387 |
| 4 | 9420 | 692 | 1288 | 1413 | 7168 | 11861 | 9980 |
| 5 | 1262 | 5640 | 451 | 885 | 1080 | 5758 | 10202 |
| 6 | 3161 | 944 | 3095 | 262 | 656 | 734 | 4402 |
| 7 | 323 | 1912 | 644 | 1841 | 159 | 572 | 618 |
| 8 | 1203 | 171 | 994 | 611 | 1329 | 118 | 404 |
| 9 | 794 | 747 | 605 | 718 | 542 | 182 | 1105 |
| 1+ | 20290 | 18326 | 25925 | 31237 | 36919 | 42567 | 51703 |
|  | 1998 | 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 5230 | 29963 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 15579 | 9205 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 | 9061 | 17041 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 | 8632 | 7644 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 | 7746 | 7093 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 | 7905 | 5734 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7 | 3723 | 6206 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 8 | 542 | 2648 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | 1086 | 935 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1+ | 59505 | 86470 |  |  |  |  |  |

Table B3 (Cont). Estimated fishing mortality (F) for the Georges Bank haddock estimated from VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1963 | 1964 | 1965 | 1966 | 1967 | 1968 | 1969 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 0.02 | 0.02 | 0.39 | 0.03 | 0.10 | 0.02 | 0.00 |
| 2 | 0.15 | 0.12 | 0.46 | 0.53 | 0.06 | 0.42 | 0.04 |
| 3 | 0.29 | 0.25 | 0.58 | 0.85 | 0.44 | 0.37 | 0.46 |
| 4 | 0.31 | 0.30 | 0.52 | 0.54 | 0.41 | 0.60 | 0.42 |
| 5 | 0.37 | 0.43 | 0.51 | 0.57 | 0.64 | 0.56 | 0.42 |
| 6 | 0.31 | 0.50 | 0.71 | 0.65 | 0.53 | 0.46 | 0.47 |
| 7 | 0.33 | 0.54 | 0.72 | 0.58 | 0.57 | 0.63 | 0.38 |
| 8 | 0.34 | 0.42 | 0.61 | 0.56 | 0.47 | 0.55 | 0.45 |
| 9 | 0.34 | 0.42 | 0.61 | 0.56 | 0.47 | 0.55 | 0.45 |
| 4-7 | 0.33 | 0.44 | 0.62 | 0.59 | 0.53 | 0.56 | 0.43 |
|  | 1970 | 1971 | 1972 | 1973 | 1974 | 1975 | 1976 |
| 1 | 0.01 | 0.00 | 0.02 | 0.16 | 0.00 | 0.03 | 0.00 |
| 2 | 0.24 | 0.52 | 0.01 | 0.41 | 0.43 | 0.14 | 0.09 |
| 3 | 0.07 | 0.65 | 0.31 | 0.01 | 0.22 | 0.34 | 0.10 |
| 4 | 0.27 | 0.24 | 0.52 | 0.49 | 0.01 | 0.19 | 0.26 |
| 5 | 0.31 | 0.21 | 0.31 | 0.77 | 0.15 | 0.03 | 0.15 |
| 6 | 0.24 | 0.89 | 0.13 | 0.55 | 0.06 | 0.13 | 0.00 |
| 7 | 0.34 | 0.57 | 0.81 | 0.11 | 0.06 | 0.15 | 0.09 |
| 8 | 0.32 | 0.38 | 0.24 | 0.35 | 0.11 | 0.17 | 0.22 |
| 9 | 0.32 | 0.38 | 0.24 | 0.35 | 0.11 | 0.17 | 0.22 |
| 4-7 | 0.29 | 0.48 | 0.44 | 0.48 | 0.07 | 0.12 | 0.13 |
|  | 1977 | 1978 | 1979 | 1980 | 1981 | 1982 | 1983 |
| 1 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 2 | 0.30 | 0.08 | 0.01 | 0.69 | 0.26 | 0.25 | 0.12 |
| 3 | 0.05 | 0.37 | 0.25 | 0.10 | 0.56 | 0.43 | 0.27 |
| 4 | 0.18 | 0.10 | 0.32 | 0.22 | 0.37 | 0.38 | 0.32 |
| 5 | 0.24 | 0.23 | 0.25 | 0.49 | 0.34 | 0.29 | 0.41 |
| 6 | 0.41 | 0.41 | 0.26 | 0.49 | 0.40 | 0.36 | 0.34 |
| 7 | 0.04 | 0.28 | 0.47 | 0.65 | 0.57 | 0.30 | 0.19 |
| 8 | 0.23 | 0.21 | 0.32 | 0.44 | 0.39 | 0.35 | 0.36 |
| 9 | 0.23 | 0.21 | 0.32 | 0.44 | 0.39 | 0.35 | 0.36 |
| 4-7 | 0.22 | 0.25 | 0.32 | 0.46 | 0.42 | 0.33 | 0.31 |
|  | 1984 | 1985 | 1986 | 1987 | 1988 | 1989 | 1990 |
| 1 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 2 | 0.04 | 0.21 | 0.04 | 0.20 | 0.03 | 0.11 | 0.01 |
| 3 | 0.25 | 0.36 | 0.40 | 0.13 | 0.39 | 0.07 | 0.17 |
| 4 | 0.41 | 0.26 | 0.24 | 0.42 | 0.20 | 0.25 | 0.20 |
| 5 | 0.31 | 0.51 | 0.32 | 0.20 | 0.47 | 0.35 | 0.41 |
| 6 | 0.52 | 0.29 | 0.36 | 0.26 | 0.41 | 0.33 | 0.42 |
| 7 | 0.56 | 0.35 | 0.32 | 0.32 | 0.32 | 0.21 | 0.27 |
| 8 | 0.45 | 0.36 | 0.30 | 0.39 | 0.40 | 0.27 | 0.34 |
| 9 | 0.45 | 0.36 | 0.30 | 0.39 | 0.40 | 0.27 | 0.34 |
| 4-7 | 0.45 | 0.35 | 0.31 | 0.30 | 0.35 | 0.28 | 0.33 |

Table B3 (Cont). Estimated fishing mortality (F) for the Georges Bank haddock estimated from VPA, 1963-1999.

|  | 1991 | 1992 | 1993 | 1994 | 1995 | 1996 | 1997 |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 1 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 | 0.00 |
| 2 | 0.26 | 0.15 | 0.04 | 0.02 | 0.01 | 0.01 | 0.02 |
| 3 | 0.15 | 0.30 | 0.33 | 0.16 | 0.07 | 0.08 | 0.05 |
| 4 | 0.42 | 0.34 | 0.51 | 0.27 | 0.13 | 0.15 | 0.15 |
| 5 | 0.18 | 0.60 | 0.49 | 0.20 | 0.14 | 0.19 | 0.12 |
| 6 | 0.35 | 0.30 | 0.57 | 0.73 | 0.14 | 0.24 | 0.13 |
| 7 | 0.65 | 0.51 | 0.16 | 0.24 | 0.17 | 0.13 | 0.10 |
| 8 | 0.39 | 0.54 | 0.50 | 0.27 | 0.13 | 0.16 | 0.14 |
| 9 | 0.39 | 0.54 | 0.50 | 0.27 | 0.13 | 0.16 | 0.14 |
| 4-7 | 0.40 | 0.44 | 0.43 | 0.36 | 0.14 | 0.18 | 0.12 |
|  | 1998 | 1999 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 1 | 0.00 | 0.00 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 2 | 0.01 | 0.00 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 3 | 0.07 | 0.10 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4 | 0.11 | 0.14 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 5 | 0.19 | 0.15 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 6 | 0.16 | 0.21 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 7 | 0.12 | 0.15 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 8 | 0.15 | 0.16 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 9 | 0.15 | 0.16 |  |  |  |  |  |
| 4-7 | 0.14 | 0.16 |  |  |  |  |  |



Figure B1. Total commercial landings (000s mt) of haddock from Georges Bank and south, 1904-1999.


Figure B2. U.S. and Canadian research vessel survey abundance (stratified and standardized mean number/tow, Top Panel) and biomass (kg per tow, Bottom Panel) indices for Georges Bank haddock from 1963-1999. U.S. survey includes strata 01130-01250 and 01290-01300; Canadian survey indices include strata $5 Z 1-5 Z 8$. Surveys have not been adjusted for catchabilities.


(n 'L-t d) SY!

Figure B4. Trends in commercial landings (mt, live weight) and fully recruited fishing mortality (mean F , ages 4-7, unweighted) for Georges Bank haddock from 1931-1999.


[^0]
[^0]:    Figure B5. SFA harvest control rule for Georges Bank haddock based on proxies of MSY-based reference points and minimum

