# UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:	)	
	)	Investigation No.:
ARTISTS' CANVAS FROM CHINA	)	731-TA-1091
	)	(Preliminary)

## REVISED AND CORRECTED COPY

Pages: 1 through 231

Place: Washington, D.C.

Date: April 22, 2005

## HERITAGE REPORTING CORPORATION

Official Reporters 1220 L Street, N.W., Suite 600 Washington, D.C. 20005 (202) 628-4888 THE UNITED STATES INTERNATIONAL TRADE COMMISSION

In the Matter of:

)
Investigation No.:
ARTISTS' CANVAS FROM CHINA ) 731-TA-1091
(Preliminary)

Friday, April 22, 2005

Room 101 U. S. International Trade Commission 500 E St., SW Washington, D.C.

The conference commenced, pursuant to Notice, at 9:30 a.m., at the United States International Trade Commission, ROBERT CARPENTER, Director of Investigations, Presiding.

#### **APPEARANCES:**

#### On behalf of the International Trade Commission:

ROBERT CARPENTER, Director of Investigations DIANE MAZUR, Supervisory Investigator MEGAN SPELLACY, Investigator MARK REES, Attorney/Advisor NANCY BRYAN, Economist JUSTIN JEE, Auditor KIM FREUND, Industry Analyst

# <u>I N D E X</u>

	PAGE
OPENING STATEMENT OF GEORGE THOMPSON, ESQUIRE NEVILLE PETERSON, LLP, WASHINGTON, D.C.	5
OPENING STATEMENT OF PHILIP GALLAS, ESQUIRE SONNENSCHEIN NATH & ROSENTHAL, LLP, WASHINGTON, D.C.	8
TESTIMONY OF PETER DELIN, VICE PRESIDENT-MARKETING TARA MATERIALS, INC.	11
TESTIMONY OF PAUL STRAQUADINE, VICE PRESIDENT-SALES, TARA MATERIALS, INC.	18
TESTIMONY OF I. MICHAEL BENATOR, PRESIDENT AND CEO, TARA MATERIALS, INC.	31
TESTIMONY OF BILL CICHERSKI, PRESIDENT, AZEL ART SUPPLY, INC.	39
TESTIMONY OF RON FREEMAN, VICE PRESIDENT-MANUFACTURING, TARA MATERIALS, INC.	55
TESTIMONY OF FRANK STAPLETON, PRESIDENT, MACPHERSON'S	; 112
TESTIMONY OF ALAN MAREK, DIRECTOR OF IMPORTING, MICHAELS STORES, INC.	126
TESTIMONY OF HARVEY KANTER, PRESIDENT, AARON BROTHERS	131
TESTIMONY OF ERIC URNES, GENERAL MANAGER, COLART AMERICAS, INC.	133
TESTIMONY OF DANIEL KLETT, PRINCIPAL, CAPITAL TRADE, INC.	137
TESTIMONY OF JOHN DOWERS, PRESIDENT AND CHIEF EXECUTIVE OFFICER, UTRECHT ART SUPPLIES	141

## I N D E X

		PAGE
	OF GEORGE THOMPSON, ESQUIRE LLP, WASHINGTON, D.C.	215
CLOSING STATEMENT (SONNENSCHEIN NATH & WASHINGTON, D.C.	OF PHILIP GALLAS, ESQUIRE & ROSENTHAL, LLP,	223

1	<u>PROCEEDINGS</u>
2	(9:30 a.m.)
3	MR. CARPENTER: Good morning and welcome to
4	the United States International Trade Commission's
5	conference in connection with the preliminary phase of
6	antidumping investigation No. 731-TA-1091 concerning
7	imports of artists' canvas from China. My name is
8	Robert Carpenter, I am the Commission's Director of
9	Investigations and I will preside at this conference.
10	Among those present from the Commission staff are from
11	my far right:
12	Diane Mazur, the supervisory investigator;
13	Megan Spellacy, the investigator; on my left Mark
14	Rees, the attorney advisor; Nancy Bryan, the
15	economist; Justin Jee, the auditor; and Kim Freund,
16	the industry analyst.
17	I understand that parties are aware of the
18	time allocations. I would remind speakers not to
19	refer in your remarks to business proprietary
20	information and to speak directly into the
21	microphones. We also ask that you state your name and
22	affiliation for the record before beginning your
23	presentation.
24	Are there any questions? If not, welcome
25	Mr. Thompson. Please proceed with your opening

- 1 statement.
- MR. THOMPSON: Good morning Mr. Carpenter,
- other members of the staff. My name is George
- 4 Thompson with the law firm of Neville Peterson,
- 5 appearing on behalf of Petitioner Tara Materials,
- 6 Incorporated.
- 7 As in any preliminary antidumping
- 8 investigation, this case requires the Commission to
- 9 apply the statutory requirements concerning domestic
- 10 like product, domestic industry, and whether there is
- 11 a reasonable indication of material injury or threat
- thereof from the subject imports to the domestic
- industry.
- 14 The petition covers artists' canvas in its
- 15 various forms -- stretched canvas, pads, panels, floor
- 16 coverings, print canvas, and rolls. Whatever its
- form, all artist' canvas constitutes a single domestic
- 18 like product under the Commission's traditional five-
- 19 factor analysis. The domestic industry is composed of
- 20 all domestic producers of the like product.
- 21 As the Commission knows, Tara also has a
- 22 facility in Mexico in which it converts canvas in
- 23 rolls into stretched canvas products. This conversion
- 24 process is extensive enough to constitute Mexican
- 25 production so that the facility should be excluded

1 from the definition of the domestic	industry.
---------------------------------------	-----------

2 Having defined the domestic industry, the

3 Commission must determine whether there is a

4 reasonable indication that the subject imports are

5 causing or threatening to cause material injury to the

6 industry. Here again the statute identifies the

7 factors for the Commission to consider and they all

8 point in favor of an affirmative determination.

To begin with, the statute requires the

Commission to evaluate the volume of imports,

specifically whether the volume or any increase is

significant. The available data demonstrates that

import volume increased nearly 12 times from 2002 to

14 2004, and nearly six times from 2003 to 2004. Data

for January 2005 show that the trend continued.

This massive increase in volume was
accompanied by a significant increase in the subject

import share of the domestic market.

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

costs.

Next the statute requires consideration of the subject imports' price effects. The imports have consistently and significantly undersold the domestic like product. They have forced Tara to reduce its prices and have prevented Tara from instituting price increases need to cover its own rising raw material

1	The combination of massive import volume
2	over a short time and significant underselling has
3	been devastating for Tara. Tara's sales, shipments
4	and market share in stretch canvas, pads and panels,
5	previously the highest margin part of the artists'
6	canvas industry, have fallen substantially. Tara has
7	moved a large portion of its U.S. production to Mexico
8	to lower its cost as a direct consequence of the
9	lower-priced merchandise imported from China. There
10	has been a simultaneously harmful impact on Tara's
11	profitability.
12	The omens are that the domestic industry is
13	threatened with ever-worsening injury in the future.
14	The Chinese industry is large and export driven.
15	Imports from China have shown a significant rate of
16	increase and there is every reason to believe that the
17	increase will only worsen in the near future.
18	Import prices have already had both a
19	depressing and a suppressing effect on domestic
20	prices, and given that price is by far the most
21	important factor in purchasing decisions the low
22	prices are certain to increase demand for further
23	imports. In short, there is more than adequate
24	evidence in this investigation to warrant the entry of
25	an affirmative determination, and we ask the

- 1 Commission to do so.
- 2 Thank you.
- MR. CARPENTER: Thank you, Mr. Thompson.
- 4 Mr. Gallas?
- 5 MR. GALLAS: Good morning Mr. Carpenter and
- 6 staff. It's a pleasure to be here this morning.
- 7 I'm Phil Gallas, a partner with Sonnenschein
- 8 Nath & Rosenthal. I am here today representing ten of
- 9 the largest importers and retailers in the United
- 10 States and three Chinese producers.
- 11 Many of their representative are here today
- during the busiest time of the year for this industry.
- 13 In fact the Petitioners purposely timed the filing of
- 14 this petition to coincide with NAMTA, the most
- 15 important annual arts materials trade show, knowing
- that most importers and retailers would have to send
- their executives to NAMTA, leaving them little time to
- 18 complete the questionnaires and prepare for this
- 19 morning's conference.
- You will hear today two diametrically
- 21 opposed views of the market for artists' canvas in the
- 22 United States. From the Petitioner, Tara Materials,
- 23 who is by far the most dominant producer of artists!
- 24 canvas in this country, you will hear that all
- 25 artists' canvas are commercially interchangeable, used

1	for the same purposes and applications, and that the
2	only determining factor in customer purchases is
3	price. Tara will attempt to portray all of its
4	financial woes as stemming from increased subject
5	imports from China.
6	The record evidence demonstrates, however,
7	quite the opposite. The purchasers of artists'
8	canvas, the people in this room who buy this product,
9	evaluate it and market it to meet their customers'
10	needs will contradict Tara's claims. Our witnesses
11	will testify that the availability of artists' canvas
12	from China with improved quality, innovative
13	marketing, and maintained price points has increased
14	overall U.S. demand for artists' canvas.
15	You will also hear how Tara's dominant
16	market position has left their longstanding customers
17	feeling taken for granted over the last several years,
18	and that their concerns and goals have been virtually
19	ignored by Tara. Frustrated with pervasive quality
20	and service problems, you will hear how former Tara
21	customers have had no choice but to take their
22	business elsewhere after Tara failed to address their
23	repeated concerns.
24	Other long-time major purchases were simply

fired by Tara on short notice. At that point these

25

1	purchasers were forced to look to other sources of
2	supply including other domestic and Chinese producers.
3	You will also learn that Tara has been
4	importing artists' canvas from Mexico since well
5	before 2002, thereby displacing U.S. production for
6	which they now blame Chinese imports.
7	On our panel today we have several importers
8	and retailers providing testimony. Many more wanted
9	to appear here today but could not due to time
10	limitations allotted for testimony.
11	All of their accounts confirm that the
12	market for artists' canvas is highly differentiated
13	and there are market niches and price points that must
14	be met by purchasers that are dictated by their
15	downstream retail customers. Imports from China
16	occupy a niche in this highly differentiated market
17	and oftentimes sell side by side with U.Sproduced
18	canvas.
19	The statements of these importers and
20	retailers, my witnesses, provide the most credible
21	evidence of the state of this market and the nature of
22	the competition. Accordingly, their testimony and
23	written responses will show that there is no

reasonable indication of injury or threat of material

injury to the domestic artists' canvas industry.

24

25

- 1 Thank you very much.
- MR. CARPENTER: Thank you, Mr. Gallas.
- 3 Would the petitioning panel please come
- 4 forward at this time?
- 5 MR. THOMPSON: Good morning. Before I
- introduce the panel, I'd like to make a brief comment
- 7 on the timing of the petition. We heard a statement
- 8 before that it was due to the current dependency of
- 9 the NAMTA show. That's completely inaccurate. The
- 10 timing of the petition was dictated because of several
- 11 health issues I had this spring, which delayed the
- 12 filing of it by at least a month.
- So, if there is any thought that the timing
- 14 was deliberate to coincide with the trade show, that
- is absolutely inaccurate. Now I would like to turn
- 16 the presentation over to the witnesses from Tara and
- 17 the first is Pete Delin who is the Vice President of
- 18 marketing for Tara. Pete?
- 19 MR. CARPENTER: Could you turn on your
- 20 microphone?
- MR. DELIN: Thank you. My name is Pete
- 22 Delin. I have been Vice President of marketing for
- 23 Tara Materials for over eight years. I had previous
- 24 experience in the Arts supply industry from 1975 to
- 25 1988. Prior to Tara, I have successfully competed

- 1 against several powerful and successful consumer
- 2 brands such as Gillette, Papermate, and Bic, but never
- 3 before have I witnessed a competitor emerge quite so
- 4 quickly and with such a significant price advantage as
- is the case with Chinese manufacturers of Artists'
- 6 Canvas.
- 7 We are not opposed to competition at Tara.
- 8 We recognize that markets change and we must change
- 9 with them. And in response to the emerging threat, we
- 10 have implemented significant cost cutting initiatives,
- 11 automated processes, moved some manufacturing to
- 12 Mexico, and attempted to source cheaper components on
- 13 the world market.
- But in the course of studying this issue and
- 15 evaluating ways to reduce cost of Artists' Canvas
- 16 production, we came upon a realization. It is not
- 17 possible to produce Artists Canvas profitably or even
- 18 close to profitability at the prices that Chinese
- 19 companies are currently offering in the U.S. market
- 20 place.
- 21 We believe that these products are being
- offered at below market prices in a effort to
- 23 penetrate the U.S. market and to drive Tara and other
- 24 domestic manufacturers out of business. Based upon
- this belief, we have filed this petition before the

- 1 ITC and Commerce to investigate the underlying facts
- and if proven accurate, provide relief.
- 3 This hearing as we understand it is the
- 4 first to establish that injury has occurred. Such a
- 5 case is easy to establish. In the petition submitted
- 6 to Commerce, Tara presented an exhibit which shows
- 7 major volume losses to Chinese canvas. In almost
- 8 every case, often documented in writing from the
- 9 customer, we were told that we lost the business due
- 10 to price.
- In some cases we even agreed to lower our
- 12 prices. Sometimes the cost are below our cost and we
- 13 still lost the business often by significant margins.
- 14 Some of this loss volume was across our full customer
- 15 base, and it's hard to track, but most of it was
- 16 significant losses, with major customers, where we had
- the business and then we didn't have the business, and
- 18 lost it to Chinese made Canvas.
- 19 These losses range from hundreds of
- 20 thousands of dollars to millions of dollars and some
- volume losses were over \$2 million. The erosion
- 22 happened very very quickly and their are no signs that
- it will stop and may even be accelerating.
- 24 Recently, for example, the combination of
- two additional losses amounted to over \$1 million. In

- 1 both cases, the reason was clearly stated, once again,
- 2 as price. One was documented in writing.
- 3 During recent customer trips, we made a stop
- 4 to a retail art supply store of one of our largest
- 5 customers. Except for our new innovated patented
- 6 Frederick's watercolor canvas, there wasn't a
- 7 Frederick's canvas to be found. As a matter of fact,
- 8 their wasn't an American made canvas that we could
- 9 recall in that store other than the Frederick's
- 10 watercolor canvas.
- 11 All of the Frederick's products and U.S.
- 12 competition had been removed from the store and the
- 13 remaining inventory was product made in China. We
- 14 asked the owner of this large and prestigious art
- 15 materials company, doesn't Frederick's, still the
- 16 leading brand, carry enough weight with your customers
- to warrant some shelf presence in your store.
- 18 He admitted that Frederick's still had brand
- 19 power, but he also noted that if prices of forty
- 20 percent of retail lower than Frederick's, their was
- increasing demand for the cheaper Chinese products.
- 22 Plus, he could sell for less and make a better margin
- 23 percent on the Chinese canvas. Conclusion, even a
- true power brand will lose some of its appeal, if the
- 25 price gets low enough.

1	In addition to vigorous efforts to reduce
2	our cost, Tara has also focused on new product
3	offerings as well as enhancing existing product lines.
4	Through hard work and innovation, we have been able to
5	replace portions of the business loss to our Chinese
6	competition. Even with this new business, however,
7	downward pricing pressure has prevented us from
8	getting price increases for existing products to
9	compensate for substantial cost and raw materials.
10	And, in fact, as noted, we have had to lower
11	some of our prices to prevent further erosion. The
12	net affect of these factors, the loss of business and
13	the downward pricing pressure has had devastating
14	effect on our company and our bottom line.
15	China has also experienced inflation we're
16	told. Even greater than in the U.S., but we have yet
17	to see it reflected in prices. In our recent travels,
18	at the NAMTA show a week ago, it was gratifying to
19	hear customer after customer congratulate Tara on our
20	bold move. They read the papers like I do. They
21	listen to CNN's Lou Dobbs and they see articles nearly
22	every single day, referring to lost of American jobs
23	and manufacturing expertise to China.
24	The day before I left, there was this
25	article in the Atlanta Journal Constitution, the

- 1 headline reads, "make China play fair", and that could
- 2 be our theme today. Asian power currency manipulation
- 3 contributes to America's unhealthy addiction to
- 4 foreign goods. The prices are attractive in part
- 5 because China rigs its currencies to gain an advantage
- 6 against global competitors, making its goods
- 7 artificially cheaper by as much as forty percent.
- 8 U.S. Senator, Charles Schumer said when an
- 9 additional and artificial fifteen to forty percent
- 10 price advantage for Chinese goods is created because
- of China's currency shenanigans, it is simply
- impossible for American companies to compete.
- 13 Our customers also said that they know that
- 14 Frederick's and other domestic producers provide a
- 15 wide range of products, services, innovations, support
- 16 and new products not provided by China and that these
- 17 capabilities could not be easily replicated if the
- 18 U.S. industry does not have the money to invest in
- 19 more innovation or is forced to downsize, or doesn't
- 20 survive.
- 21 Many of our customers express to us that
- they don't believe that cheap imported canvas has been
- 23 good for the industry. And many commented that
- 24 although units may be up substantially, their overall
- 25 dollars and profits are not. If this sentiment exist,

- 1 why might you ask is their such a strong coalition of
- 2 industry leaders standing in opposition to this
- 3 petition.
- 4 The art materials market place, like many
- 5 retail markets, is a very very competitive place. The
- 6 availability of product at these prices allows very
- 7 little room to stand on principle. Lower costs
- 8 translate to lower prices and higher margins, yielding
- 9 competitive advantage or increased profitability
- 10 respectively. Regardless of the cause of the lower
- 11 costs or their long-term sustainability, this
- 12 opportunity is hard to resist.
- 13 If one player takes advantage, they all must
- or risk getting beat in the marketplace. Three years
- ago there was hardly a Chinese canvas in the
- 16 marketplace. Today there are stacks of them in just
- 17 about every retail store in America in that many of
- 18 the coalition have embraced the Chinese-produced
- 19 canvas and incorporated this product into their
- 20 business model. The hoped-for outcome of this
- 21 petition will represent a disruption and an
- 22 inconvenience to their business and we sincerely
- 23 regret that, but longer-term considerations must also
- 24 be considered.
- 25 What would be the impact if Tara and other

- 1 U.S.-manufacturers exit the market and our overseas
- 2 competitors raise prices in the now-captive market?
- What are the alternatives in the event of a supply
- 4 shock caused by geopolitical events, disruptions in
- 5 overseas transport or SARS-like health epidemics? And
- 6 what would happen to the steady flow of new products
- 7 to the marketplace?
- 8 Many of the coalition are existing or
- 9 previous customers and it is not our intention to hurt
- 10 their business. On the contrary, we have always acted
- 11 to support them. Likewise, we do not believe that
- 12 their actions in opposing this petition are attempts
- to damage Tara materials. We are both simply pursuing
- 14 our respective business interests and in this instance
- 15 they do not appear to coincide.
- 16 The critical issue is whether or not the
- 17 pricing that is being offered by the Chinese
- 18 manufacturers is below fair market value. We believe
- 19 it is. Injury to Tara and to the domestic industry is
- 20 apparent. Therefore, we request that the Commission
- issue an affirmative preliminary determination in this
- 22 investigation.
- Thank you.
- 24 MR. STRAQUADINE: Good morning. My name is
- 25 Paul Straquadine. I am the Vice President of Sales

- for Tara Materials. I've been employed in that
- 2 position for approximately four years. My art
- 3 materials background prior to that included eight
- 4 years with a large retailer on the West Coast where I
- 5 served as a sales clerk, as a store manager, and as a
- 6 buyer. I paint recreationally, my wife paints
- 7 professionally.
- 8 My goal is to share some information with
- 9 you about the scope of the petition and like product
- 10 as they pertain to the initiative, but before I begin
- 11 I'd like to say hello to my customers, several of my
- largest accounts, some former large accounts that are
- here with us today. People that we've done business
- 14 with for years who are now, as a show of force, are
- 15 gathered to oppose our petition. We've been
- threatened. We've been blatantly told that we will
- 17 lose business as a result of this from coalition
- 18 members.
- 19 I'd also like to take a quick moment and let
- 20 you know a couple of things that I'd rather not be
- 21 doing. The first is, I'd rather not be preparing,
- 22 writing and implementing antidumping petitions. I'd
- 23 much rather not do that. As a salesman I know that
- 24 the more I talk about competition the less time I have
- to talk about my own products, features, benefits, and

- 1 services. So this is not a pleasant thing for us.
- The second thing that I'd rather not be
- doing is creating animosity or making my customers
- 4 mad. It's just not good business practice, however,
- 5 we feel we're at a point where we have no choice.
- 6 We've obviously forced our largest customers to seek
- 7 counsel, come to Washington, and oppose us.
- 8 We've been put in a position where we're
- 9 facing billion dollar corporations who seem more
- interested in today's profit margins than in the long-
- 11 term viability of the domestic manufacturers or Tara
- 12 Materials, and quite frankly, we're playing Russian
- 13 roulette with our largest customers.
- 14 But there is a critical reason that these
- 15 customers and those not present today and former
- 16 customers, that they're here. These are staunch
- 17 competitors, and as Pete said, in the retail world,
- 18 Lowe's and Home Depot don't talk to each other very
- 19 often. So quite often these competitors are not on
- 20 friendly terms.
- 21 At the recent NAMTA, National Art Materials
- 22 Trade Association which took place last week, three
- 23 out of four customers who visited our booth discussed
- 24 a price war between two coalition members. A price
- war that is driving all the retailers into forced

- lower profitability, and yet those two internet
- 2 catalog distributors are on the coalition side by
- 3 side. I find that rather ironic.
- 4 They'll all report that they're selling more
- 5 canvas at better profit levels and they can report
- 6 that to their shareholders.
- 7 How do they sell more? How do they make
- 8 more profit? It's simple. The canvas is cheap. They
- 9 can afford to promote it at sharper prices as a result
- of this, and they can afford to promote it much more
- 11 often.
- 12 When you can buy a product from China for
- 13 less than half of what it costs a leading manufacturer
- to produce it, something is wrong. There is currently
- 15 no end in sight.
- 16 Sure, we've read about Chinese inflation of
- over 20 percent. We've heard about increased
- 18 transportation or container costs of over 75 percent.
- 19 Worldwide price increases on chemicals and wood
- 20 products. But what's happening in the Chinese
- 21 artists' canvas industry? The prices have either
- 22 remained constant or actually gotten lower over the
- last year to two years.
- I have a contact with a U.S. company that
- 25 imports Chinese furniture for the art materials

- 1 industry. That contact reports that in January of
- this year they were forced to pass along a price
- increase to the trade due to higher costs in China.
- 4 And quite ironically, they're passing a second price
- 5 increase on in June of this year, it's been reported.
- 6 That's two price increases in a six month
- 7 period in an industry where maybe one a year is normal
- 8 or acceptable. So prices are changing in China, just
- 9 not on Chinese artists' canvas.
- 10 We're not interested in hurting anyone.
- 11 We're not interested in hurting any of our large
- 12 customers, any of our former customers. We don't want
- 13 to hurt Chinese people or Chinese manufacturers.
- We're only asking for a level playing field, an
- 15 opportunity to compete, win or lose, on that level
- 16 playing field without unfair trade practices. I
- 17 repeat, we're not trying to hurt anyone and we do
- 18 apologize to our customers and former customers who
- 19 will be inconvenienced by this, but it is survival for
- our industry and for our company.
- The scope of artists' canvas is a
- 22 definitively unique product. At its core it
- 23 represents untapped creative potential. It represents
- a foundation for artists to express themselves upon.
- 25 Regardless of its format, it is the absolute building

1 blocks to graphic expression.

Physically, artists' canvas has a rather 2 narrow definition and application spectrum. 3 4 essence is a woven fabric primed or coated or gessoed is the term we use in the industry, to accept paints 5 and/or inks. The uniqueness of artists' canvas is 6 seen that it has virtually no other use other than as 7 a foundation for art. Artists' canvas is not used to 8 9 make camping tents, outdoor awnings, tote bags, or 10 boat sales. It is painted or printed on exclusively. While originally artists' canvas was mostly 11 woven linens, today it can range from fabrics of 12 cotton to polyesters to muslins to joots. 13 The unique modification to these fabrics lies in the artists' 14 coating, most common called gesso, and once the gesso 15 is applied to that fabric, it will now find its final 16 17 home in some capacity as artists' canvas. Products that are applied to the surface of 18 19 the artists' canvas range quite widely. They can be oil paint, acrylic paint, alkid paints, tempera 20 paints, pen and ink, water color, casein paints, inks 21 or pigments that are used in graphic reproduction, or 22

The common thread to each of these different

it can be a foundation for decoupage and other wall

23

24

25

decor.

- disciplines is the substrate, the artists' canvas in
- various styles, formats, width and textures.
- 3 Artists' canvas can take a myriad of
- 4 physical applications. The most common, what we see
- 5 mostly here is stretched canvas. Stretched canvas is
- 6 a gessoed fabric that is then stretched and adhered to
- 7 a stretcher bar, a wooden stretcher bar. It is either
- 8 stapled or affixed to the back of the stretcher strip
- 9 and it can come in a multitude, again, of sizes and
- shapes. It can come in a multitude of textures as
- 11 well as depth of stretcher bar.
- 12 Canvas panels are the same artists' canvas
- or a grade of artists' canvas that is adhered to a
- 14 chip board or a cardboard core. They're often used
- 15 for student-grade, student projects, things of that
- 16 sort.
- 17 One of our innovative products is an
- 18 archival board which is a hard board or archival panel
- 19 that a more professional grade of canvas is affixed
- 20 to.
- 21 Moving on, canvas pads are the next area
- 22 which are loose sheets of canvas that are cut and
- 23 bound together similar to a notebook pad. While
- 24 imitation is the most sincere form of flattery, and
- we've been led to believe that Chinese factories can

- 1 be innovative, I show you this sort of innovation.
- This is a Frederick's product that we've made for over
- 3 20 years. It has our history and legend since 1868,
- 4 and this is a Chinese version of that same pad -- same
- 5 graphics, same color, even the word "real" is
- 6 highlighted as a direct knock-off. So this represents
- 7 the innovation.
- 8 Canvas rolls are also a category in the
- 9 artists' canvas arena, and they are a very wide
- 10 variety of textures, styles, widths, and lengths. And
- 11 they can later be stretched by artists onto stretcher
- bars or they can be affixed to walls as a mural or
- they can be affixed to a board like a canvas panel or
- 14 an archival board.
- 15 Finally, the last category is print canvas.
- 16 That is canvas that is intended for art reproduction
- or giclees. It's critical to recognize that in order
- 18 to manufacture print canvas the exact same fabric,
- 19 gesso and manufacturing process is employed. Artists
- 20 or publishers who choose to reproduce their art on
- 21 print canvas do so to create the most authentic
- 22 facsimile of their product. While some print canvas
- 23 receives an ink jet receptive coating in order to go
- through either your desktop or a wide format printer,
- 25 that top coat files squarely upon traditionally

- 1 manufactured artists' canvas. This is an example of a
- 2 consumer product of print canvas that you could put
- 3 through your standard Epson or HP printer to print
- 4 your artwork or photograph onto artists' canvas.
- 5 Like product. In the grand scope of product
- 6 or product manufacturing, artists' canvas is actually
- 7 very focused. In reviewing the Commission statutes on
- 8 like product, the evaluation of the six factors is an
- 9 easy conclusion.
- 10 First, being physical characteristics. All
- 11 artists' canvas have the same physical properties in
- one way or another. Woven fabrics, coated or gessoed.
- 13 Whether it's stretched, adhered to panels, bound and
- tabbed, converted to small rolls or sold in bulk
- 15 primed rolls to companies who then convert it to
- 16 stretch canvas or otherwise, it's the absolute
- 17 building block to graphic expression.
- 18 Point two, interchangeability. Artists'
- 19 canvas to a very large degree is interchangeable, that
- 20 being for graphic expression. My wife currently has a
- 21 show hanging in a gallery in Snowville, Georgia. She
- 22 has pieces hanging in multiple sizes of stretched
- 23 canvas, in multiple sizes of canvas panels, and
- 24 multiple sizes of archival panels. They hand side by
- side -- some framed, some unframed -- yet it is her

- 1 expression of graphic art and I'm very hopeful that a
- 2 lot of it sells this weekend.
- Point three, channels of distribution.
- 4 Artists' canvas is sold through a multitude of
- 5 channels. Specialty art stores or stores focused
- 6 primarily on fine art. They're most commonly
- 7 independents or mom and pop stores or small chains
- 8 such as D.C.'s own Plaza Artist Material or such as
- 9 Azel Art, a ten-store chain from the great state of
- 10 Texas.
- 11 The next category is mail order or internet
- 12 supply. These are catalog or on-line suppliers who
- sell directly to artists, teachers or even printers.
- 14 Category three, arts and craft stores,
- 15 primarily chains selling a much broader mix of craft
- 16 and art materials. This includes today's big box
- 17 stores such as Michael's Arts and Crafts, Hobby Lobby,
- 18 Jo-Ann Fabrics, or A.C. Moore.
- 19 Distributors are wholesalers who do service
- the mom and pop shops quite frequently. Wholesalers
- 21 typically carry a broad range of products and a broad
- 22 range of manufacturers, and sell that variety to these
- 23 independent stores who then resell to artists.
- Then there's OEM or converters' accounts.
- These are manufacturers who convert primed artist

- canvas into rolls, canvas, stretched canvas, or pads.
- 2 The next category that the Commission
- outlines is customer and producer perception of
- 4 product. The term artists' canvas is again, a very
- 5 specific descriptor for fabric prepared with an
- 6 artists' coating intended for painting or printing.
- 7 It is recognized by the trade and the public as a
- 8 foundation for art. While not everyone may understand
- 9 the variety, the styles, the textures, or the specific
- 10 application, they will recognize its ultimate end use
- 11 -- as a foundation for graphic expression.
- 12 Common manufacturing facilities, production
- processes and production employees. The manufacturing
- of artists' canvas takes place in the same basic
- 15 facility. We currently coat our canvas on one of
- three machine coating lines. We also have a hand-
- 17 priming operation, an old world facility where hand-
- 18 primed canvas is produced, although that being a very
- 19 small part of the overall business.
- The machine-primed canvas is rolled, slit or
- 21 cut for end use and the next manufacturing process
- 22 would be to either sell it in a roll, sell it in a
- 23 bulk roll, sell it in a small roll, or to stretch it,
- 24 put it onto a panel, a wood board, or any of the
- things that I've described earlier.

1	Within 100 yards of our coating machines,
2	and quite often with the same employees, our panel
3	department, our wood department, our roll-up
4	departments all exist. Regardless of the final put-
5	up, all machine-primed artist canvas is primed in the
6	same building using the same equipment in the same
7	basic fashion.
8	Today we'll probably be accused of some
9	things, of being aloof or a monopoly, accused of
LO	making poor quality goods or providing poor service.
L1	I honestly believe this to be window dressing of
L2	excuses that only thinly veil the truth of the matter
L3	In every case that we've lost business to Chinese
L4	canvas it's been based on one reason, and one reason
L5	alone, and that's price. Not just a little bit.
L6	We're talking 40, 50, 60 or 70 percent price
L7	difference. With each loss of business Tara quoted
L8	lower prices in hopes of saving the business. Offers
L9	of substantially lower prices, up to 20 percent at
20	times, that in every case were described as not
21	enough, not good enough. The difference was too
22	dramatic.
23	Several of the accounts have literally
24	apologized in their exit of our product and going to
25	China, saying we're sorry, but the price is just too

1 dramatic.

As a monopoly, yes, we're a large player in 2 a very small industry overall, but that's for a 3 4 reason. We've worked very hard at gaining our reputation, of maintaining our history, and becoming 5 the leading manufacturer of artists' canvas. we've done that successfully in the face of fair 7 competition, both domestically and internationally. 8 9 By playing by the rules, we've succeeded. What about quality and service? Our fill 10 rates average 90 percent or better on orders shipped 11 in five to seven days on our Frederick's branded 12 products. Our defect ratio on a primarily natural 13 14 product, in other words wood is a natural component, fabric, the cottons, that is the predominant fabric is 15 a natural fiber, and they are prone to temperature and 16 17 humidity differences. But within those standards we believe our defect ratio or our quality issues are 18 19 well within industry standards. If these things 20 weren't true, if we made just bad quality canvas every day, there were options every day for other countries 21 to import product from or other suppliers such as Duro 22 Arts, Signature, Masterpiece or Sunbelt domestically. 23 24 Most Americans like myself always assume 25 that the lower prices for Chinese manufactured product

- 1 were based on lower labor rates. In the scope of
- 2 stretched artists' canvas this is a very small
- 3 percentage of the total cost. Even considering a ten-
- 4 fold difference in labor rates, this would not make up
- 5 for the dramatic difference in pricing.
- 6 My mother has always told me that if
- 7 something sounds too good to be true it probably is.
- 8 Consider that raw materials -- the canvas, the wood,
- 9 the chemicals and the packaging costs for a stretched
- 10 artists' canvas, just the raw materials alone -- is
- 11 selling in China for substantially less than what it
- 12 costs to manufacture it for here. This doesn't even
- take into account labor, it doesn't take into account
- overhead, or a fair profit. The cost that it is
- 15 selling for in China is more than just the raw
- 16 material cost here in the U.S.. I believe that's a
- 17 clear indicator.
- 18 The consequences of this behavior is that
- 19 the domestic industry producing artists' canvas has
- 20 been materially injured by the Chinese imports and is
- 21 threatened with such injury in the future.
- 22 I appreciate your time, your attention, and
- I hope this gets cleared up quickly for all of us.
- 24 MR. BENATOR: Good morning. Thank you for
- 25 your time and attention in hearing our petition for

- injury to the United States artists' canvas industry
- due to dumping and unfair prices by the People's
- 3 Republic of China.
- 4 My name is Michael Benator and I am CEO and
- 5 25 percent owner of Tara Materials.
- 6 First I'd like to tell you a little bit
- 7 about Tara Materials. Tara was started in 1966 by
- 8 John Benator, my uncle, and Wally Klarman. In 1970
- 9 Tara purchased Frederick's Artist Canvas Company,
- 10 moving it from New York City to Atlanta. Frederick's
- 11 started in 1868 as the first artists' canvas producer
- in the United States.
- 13 The primary strength of Tara is our
- 14 Frederick's brand that we have continued to support an
- 15 expand, so in our opinion we are trying to protect an
- industry, an American artists' canvas industry that is
- 17 over 137 years old.
- 18 We have a dairy of E. H. Friedrich, who we
- 19 call Grandpa, where he would travel for six weeks by
- train to major U.S. cities along the east coast,
- 21 meeting with famous American artists and wealthy
- 22 families, taking artists' canvas roll orders. He
- 23 would then return to New York, produce the artists!
- 24 canvas orders for an equal six week period. After
- 25 finishing the production he would load up all the

- 1 rolls, get back on a train, deliver them to the
- 2 artists and to the businessmen, and then take new
- orders. This is the schedule he repeated for many
- 4 years.
- In 1974 Tara moved to Lawrenceville,
- 6 Georgia, a suburb north of Atlanta as we needed more
- 7 space and because of tight labor in Atlanta. I joined
- 8 Tara Materials in 1984 when Wally Klarman wanted to
- 9 retire.
- In September 1990, 15 years ago, Tara
- 11 acquired Hy-Jo Manufacturing, now known as Tara
- 12 Picture Frames. Tara Picture Frames has one of the
- oldest maguiladora manufacturing facilities in
- 14 Tijuana, Mexico. We purchased Tara Picture Frames to
- 15 improve our distribution of artists' canvas on the
- 16 west coast and expand our product line, adding a
- 17 complementary, ready-made wooden picture frame program
- 18 that could be carried by the same distribution channel
- 19 that sells our Frederick's artist canvas line,
- 20 increasing our distribution volume and lowering our
- 21 costs.
- 22 About nine years later, in 1999, Tara
- 23 purchased Precision Molding located in Northern
- 24 California due to our need for additional woodworking
- capacity to meet the growing needs of pre-stretched

- 1 artists' canvas products.
- 2 Tara has never had a layoff due to declining
- 3 business until April of 2003 due to the loss of
- 4 business from low-priced imports from the People's
- 5 Republic of China. One of Tara's proud statements in
- 6 our history was that we were a stable and growing
- 7 manufacturer who never had to downsize and lay off our
- 8 valued associates up until two years ago.
- 9 Even after acquiring Tara Picture Frames and
- 10 growing our stretched canvas operation both in Mexico
- and Georgia, we did not have to lay off any Tara
- 12 Materials associates until over 12 years after our
- acquisition of a Mexican manufacturing plant.
- 14 Since 1990 we have expanded our Mexican
- 15 factory from about 250 associates to a high of 360 in
- 16 2001, mostly manufacturing ready-made wooden picture
- frames and today we are about 260 associates in
- 18 Mexico.
- 19 Up until 2003, we did not replace any of
- your U.S. stretch canvas production with our Mexican
- 21 factory.
- 22 Since 1990 we have expanded our Tara
- 23 Materials U.S. factory from about 275 associates to a
- 24 high of 450 in 2002, but have had to downsize to about
- 25 300 associates today.

1	Unfortunately, beginning in 2002 we started
2	losing significant volume of the artists' canvas
3	business, primarily to the low-priced manufacturing
4	companies in China. When additional stretched canvas
5	business was lost in 2003, we made the very difficult
6	decision to shut down our entire precision molding
7	facility in March of 2004, laying off all 39 valued
8	associates.
9	In our efforts to lower costs and try to
10	compete with the low-priced Chinese competition we
11	made the difficult decision to lay off workers in the
12	U.S. and move some of our stretch and woodworking
13	operations to the Mexican factory, but this was only
14	after 12 years of growing operations in both the
15	United States and Mexico.
16	Today you may hear that we've moved our
17	stretch operation to Mexico in order to lower our
18	costs and increase our profits. If this were the
19	case, we would have made that move 15 years ago, in
20	1990.
21	Our shift in production level to Mexico came
22	only as a result of ultra-low competitive pricing from
23	China. Pricing which has forced downward pricing
24	levels and an inability for us to raise prices
25	commensurate with raw material cost increases.

1	In Mexico we now send our proprietary
2	Frederick's artists' canvas in bulk rolls that are
3	coated in our Georgia factory and Mexico then cuts,
4	inspects, and stretches our canvas onto wooden
5	stretcher bars that are either supplied from our U.S.
6	factor, or Mexico now mills, molds and tendens these
7	stretcher bar ends from bulk raw lumber board. The
8	stretch canvas that we manufacture in Mexico today
9	employs the identical process that other U.S.
10	producers who purchase the bulk artists' canvas from
11	other artists' canvas coaters, and then manufacture
12	this into stretched artists' canvas products.
13	If the imports of unfairly low-priced
14	artists' canvas from China continues to escalate as
15	we've seen in 2003 and 2004, we will have no choice
16	but to downsize further.
17	Frederick's artists' canvas and Tara
18	Materials are both proud to be a family, privately
19	owned manufacturer in the United States of America who
20	offers fair wages, family supportive group health
21	benefits and truly cares in treating our associates
22	right. We are very proud that in Tara's 39 year
23	history, of our 300 associates that are with us today,
24	54 or 18 percent have worked at Tara over 20 years,
25	and 180 60 percent of our associates have worked at

1 Tara over five years.

25

We take great pride in maintaining our market leading position for artists' canvas. 3 4 the main reasons is that we continue to innovate and aggressively invest our profits back into the country, 5 automating manufacturing processes wherever possible. This not only has increased our capacity to meet the 7 needs of the growing artists' canvas in the past, but 8 9 also has reduced our labor cost content, making us 10 more competitive. We are confident that the specific data and 11 information that we have submitted in our petition 12 will clearly demonstrate that the People's Republic of 13 14 China are aggressively dumping artists' canvas into the United States at unfair prices. That the artists' 15 canvas industry is not able to fairly compete due to 16 17 non-market support of the Chinese yuan, along with their being able to purchase chinese-controlled raw 18 19 materials, in particular lumber, canvas and chemicals, at non-market prices. 20 Our documentation will show that the unfair 21 pricing of artists' canvas into the United States has 22 23 limited our ability to raise prices the past three 24 years, in spite of significant raw material cost

Heritage Reporting Corporation (202) 628-4888

increases, lost sales, reduced gross margins and

- 1 profitability, and it has caused us to downsize our
- 2 production facilities and capacities, further reducing
- 3 our margins and reducing our profits.
- 4 Furthermore, the U.S. import data clearly
- 5 demonstrates that the import volume of artists' canvas
- from the People's Republic of China has increased over
- 7 six times from 2003 to 2004, and almost 12 times the
- 8 volume in the past two short years, from 2002 to 2004.
- 9 And based on the initial import data for 2005, it is
- 10 continuing to escalate.
- 11 Also our financial data clearly demonstrates
- 12 that Tara has been injured by the impact of aggressive
- 13 Chinese imports. As it has driven us to lose market
- share of artists' canvas products that once earned our
- 15 best profit margins to now being one of our worst
- 16 profit margins.
- 17 Even though we are a small niche industry,
- 18 we believe there is valid evidence that our industry
- 19 has clearly suffered injury in a very short time
- 20 period with a real threat of permanent and future
- 21 damage to our industry. We do not believe it will be
- in the best interest of the U.S. art materials
- 23 industry, to all of our experienced and hard-working
- 24 associates and our families to see all manufacturing
- of artists' canvas move offshore.

1	Thank you again for your time and interest.
2	MR. THOMPSON: Thank you, Michael. Now I'd
3	like to ask Bill Cicherski of Azel Art Supply to make
4	a few comments.
5	MR. CICHERSKI: Good morning ladies and
6	gentlemen. My name is Bill Cicherski and I am the
7	President and CEO of Azel Art Supply located in
8	Dallas, Texas. We have ten retail locations
9	throughout the state of Texas. Nine of those are
10	freestanding art materials stores and one location is
11	a college or university bookstore in Lubbock, Texas
12	serving the students of Texas Tech. It also sells a
13	lot of art and architectural type supplies to the
14	students of Texas Tech.
15	Azel Art Supply was founded 54 years ago.
16	We will be celebrating our 55th year on January 1,
17	2006. Our company was started by two brothers, the
18	Azel brothers, and in 1973 I purchased the company
19	from the Azel brothers.
20	In 1987 we made all of our employees who
21	were eligible, shareholders in the company through an
22	ESOP, employee stock ownership plan. That's
23	demonstrated to me, at least, a lot of stability in
24	our employment force. Our store managers and
25	management have an average employment tenure with Azel

- 1 Art Supply of 23.5 years.
- We sell artists' canvas as well as other art
- 3 materials, and I'm quite familiar with Tara's products
- 4 and have carried their products for decades. It's
- 5 high quality. I'm also familiar with the Chinese
- 6 product and I consider it inferior to Tara's
- offerings. It's not as complete as Tara's offerings
- 8 may be.
- 9 The Chinese canvas certainly is priced below
- 10 Tara, as we have heard -- both from a retailer's
- 11 prices as well as the resale prices. Although Azel at
- 12 this time has not purchased Chinese canvas, I have
- been presented with opportunities to do so and I'd
- like to discuss with you reasons why I chose not to.
- 15 We primarily purchase inventory directly
- from manufacturers or importers, in some cases through
- 17 distributors, but rare. We subscribe to a motto that
- 18 we live by in providing to our customers and that
- 19 motto is "Making the best better." I don't feel that
- 20 buying the Chinese produced canvas adds to that motto.
- 21 It doesn't make the best better.
- 22 I find the principal issues relating to the
- 23 quality of the product fall in several areas.
- 24 Certainly you've heard me mention, but I also talk
- about the logistics of delivery -- not just the

- delivery from Tara, some 900 miles away from us, but
- from China some 9,000 miles away from us. In dealing
- 3 with some of the people represented here today who are
- 4 manufacturers or distributors, they too know how
- 5 difficult it is to keep that chain of supply full all
- of the time. Issues that can prevent them from
- 7 fulfilling those requirements are usually the 90-day
- 8 delay in lead time from order to receipt of order, to
- 9 the shipments, to problems with dock strikes, as well
- 10 as other issues involving international issues.
- I also feel that the canvas product itself
- is inferior, both in coating as well as in the quality
- itself. What samples we have seen that have been
- 14 provided to us doesn't make the best better in my
- 15 opinion.
- The stretcher bars, for example, are usually
- 17 very soft or lightweight, thus causing staples to
- 18 corrode or pull out very easily. Packaging also that
- 19 is made in China and shipped to domestic resources and
- 20 brought then into our stores usually provides a lot
- 21 more for damage. Not that damage doesn't occur with
- 22 shipments from Tara, but it's modest.
- 23 It was mentioned about the maguiladora
- 24 plants in Mexico as being maybe a source in reducing
- costs, but I believe one of the smallest elements of

1	the cost of making stretched canvas or any other
2	canvas product is labor. I'm going to remind you that
3	the products through a maquiladora agreement between
4	the countries of Mexico and the United States involves
5	the delivery of products from the United States to the
6	maquiladora plant and the plant then adds either
7	conversion or labor to that particular product, then
8	brought back into the United States and sold and
9	distributed out of the distribution points of those
10	manufacturers.
11	I am somewhat familiar with the maquiladora
12	plant because I started one in 1968 with a former
13	employer in what is Mexico. I started that plant from
14	scratch, I saw what the issues were and I know what
15	the issues are today. I'm quite familiar with the
16	circumstances of the maquiladora plant. I also feel
17	that I know some of the issues that involve Tara here
18	and the reasons why they went to the maquiladora
19	concept.
20	In discussing the issue of deliveries, as I

In discussing the issue of deliveries, as I mentioned earlier, I find one of the hesitant points that I am dealing with whenever I deal with imported goods is timeliness of delivery. We can live with long delivery periods, but we can't live with sporadic delivery periods. If the delivery period is a three

1	week period or a three day period, we can plan for
2	that. But we don't know what delivery periods might
3	be and how they might be hurt involving a product such
4	as this product that we're talking about this morning.
5	Recently I had an order delivered by Tara, a
6	large size order for us, out of 102 SKUs ordered, 102
7	were delivered. That isn't always the case. Two
8	years ago they did have delivery problems but they
9	addressed those delivery issues in a short period of
LO	time. I don't find that type of delivery with most of
L1	the manufacturers that we do business with today.
L2	That concludes my remarks this morning.
L3	Thank you very much, and I just simply want to remind
L4	you that in our area of business we have 66 direct
L5	competitors in the Dallas/Fort Worth area. Many of
L6	those competitors are represented today. We were
L7	there before they arrived, we intend to be here quite
L8	some time. And even though this particular product
L9	line is being challenged by imported products, we
20	still feel that we can do and accomplish what we want
21	to present to our customers and that's a good value at
22	a fair price and the value and the price must first
23	have the best of quality.
24	Thank you, ladies and gentlemen.

MR. THOMPSON: Thank you, Mr. Carpenter.

25

1 That concludes our prepared remarks. W	Vе	1	Ċ
--	----	---	---

- like to keep the remaining time for rebuttal, and of
- 3 course we would welcome the staff's questions.
- 4 MR. CARPENTER: Thank you, Mr. Thompson, and
- 5 than you gentlemen for your presentation. We
- 6 appreciate that.
- 7 One point of clarification. Unlike hearings
- in final phase investigations, you can't reserve your
- 9 time for rebuttal. However, there is an automatic
- 10 ten-minutes that each side gets for rebuttal at ten
- end of the testimony, so you will have ten minutes
- 12 anyway.
- 13 MR. THOMPSON: You're taking all my fun away
- 14 here.
- 15 MR. CARPENTER: Okay, we'll begin the staff
- 16 questions with Megan Spellacy.
- 17 MS. SPELLACY: Good morning. I have a few
- 18 questions, especially for the industry representatives
- 19 who are here this morning.
- 20 Under the auspices of conditions of
- 21 competition, can you discuss in a little bit greater
- detail the types of artists' canvas that are available
- and whether, and specifically responding to comments
- that were made by the Respondents in their opening
- 25 statement, whether or not imports from China occupy a

- 1 niche market and whether or not the U.S. market does
- 2 recognize these artists' products to be highly
- 3 differentiated.
- 4 MR. STRAQUADINE: If I understand your
- 5 question correctly, artists' canvas covers a very wide
- 6 selection of what we can call put-ups. Within the
- 7 core base of artists' canvas, the woven fabric, there
- 8 are many different weaves, textures, weights of the
- 9 core fabric, and oftentimes different gessoing styles
- 10 which will end up in a different result.
- 11 Our best-selling product is called
- 12 Frederick's red label canvas. It by far outshines the
- 13 rest of our product line and it is considered by most
- 14 people the industry standard as a seven ounce, pre-
- 15 primed weighted cotton. We measure the weight of the
- 16 fabric before priming it and that's seven ounce per
- 17 square yard. We then gesso that with two coats of
- 18 acrylic gesso to finish that, and then stretch it over
- 19 a standard stretcher bar. That being the industry
- 20 standard and the greatest selling product. That of
- 21 course was the first product to be either attacked or
- 22 brought on and copied on-shore. As is the case with
- 23 frequent competition, the cherrypicking process is
- 24 always the beginning an the breadth of the line only
- comes as consumer demand or customer demand dictates.

1	Our pre-primed Belgian linen, our pre-primed
2	blended fabrics such as cotton polyester blend that
3	may receive a three coat process for an ultra-smooth
4	portrait grade canvas is another selection. We call
5	that our blue label. That gives you a much smoother
6	canvas without as much texture for the detail that
7	portrait artists like.
8	While we offer the widest variety, we
9	believe, in different fabrics, in multiple styles of
10	put-ups we have seen a migration of the cherrypicking
11	process of attack on the biggest branded items. First
12	the Frederick's red label, then the Frederick's
13	gallery wrap type product, and they have continued to
14	copy into pads and panels as we've demonstrated.
15	Does that answer your question?
16	MS. SPELLACY: Yes, partially.
17	Can you also expand on then the difference
18	between, and this is as I understand from your web
19	site, you have a patent or a patent pending on your
20	watercolor canvas.
21	MR. STRAQUADINE: Correct.
22	MS. SPELLACY: I know you brought in some
23	samples today. Can you describe the imports that are
24	coming in You mentioned they went for the big
25	common labels first. Can you just expand on that, the

- 1 type of imports that you're seeing and the type of
- 2 products?
- 3 MR. STRAQUADINE: Sure. Today it is
- 4 strictly on traditionally coated artists' canvas as
- 5 the substrate. We've had no challenge or penetration
- 6 against our watercolor canvas.
- 7 Watercolor canvas works completely contrary
- 8 to traditionally primed canvas. Traditionally primed
- 9 canvas wants to allow adhesion of the ink, the paint,
- 10 or the medium that's applied to it without any strike-
- 11 through penetration or medium getting to the fabric
- 12 and causing deterioration of the cotton, the linen or
- the polyester that's underneath that gesso. So you
- want a blocked canvas, one that does not allow
- 15 penetration.
- 16 Frederick's patented watercolor canvas works
- 17 quite opposite to that in that it allows the water in
- 18 the water color to penetrate, similar to a watercolor
- 19 paper and for the water to migrate through and for the
- 20 pigment to be trapped in an absorbent coating.
- We are confident in our patent, both
- 22 application and formulation of this because it today
- 23 is our most technically produced product. It is much
- 24 much harder to reproduce this product than anything
- 25 else. We're convinced that it will come and we've

- 1 sought patent protection as a result, but it in some
- 2 instances revolutionizes watercolor to painters.
- 3 They've always traditionally painted on paper. In
- 4 order to hang their art they've had to frame it, put a
- 5 custom mat and a piece of glass in front of it. By
- 6 having watercolor canvas we've provided a medium where
- 7 they can paint, seal with a clear sealer, and hang
- 8 their art with no glass, oftentimes with no frame at
- 9 all. The art experience now is much more personal.
- 10 Standing and looking at a piece of watercolor, while
- it is beautiful art, you're separated by a piece of
- 12 glass, either non-glare or glaring glass, and your
- depth of vision is impeded by that. Watercolor canvas
- 14 allows you to be a direct experience and much closer
- 15 to the artwork and you can see and experience the
- texture of the canvas that's underneath.
- 17 MR. BENATOR: I'd like to just add on that.
- 18 The definition of niche would probably be
- 19 something I'd want a little further explanation,
- 20 because I would consider a niche being the entire
- 21 artists' canvas product line. Our niche is taking a
- 22 woven fabric that's got dimension to it and texture,
- and then putting a flexible acrylic titanium priming
- on top of it. So the red label, our flagship product,
- is one of the most well known, but I would even

- 1 consider watercolor as part of that entire niche of
- our product line. The only reason China has not
- introduced that is because of our patent pending.
- 4 MS. SPELLACY: Thank you.
- 5 Can I also ask you one question about the
- 6 printing canvas or the canvas that is used with
- 7 digital printers. To the best of your knowledge, are
- 8 you the only domestic producer of this product? If
- 9 not, who are the other producers?
- 10 MR. BENATOR: What was the product?
- 11 MS. SPELLACY: I've seen it referred to in
- 12 your petition as printing canvas. In other words the
- 13 canvas that's used for a digital printer.
- 14 MR. BENATOR: Print canvas, we are the
- 15 primary producers of the fabric with the artists'
- 16 coating on it. There are other producers that will
- 17 put an inkjet receptive top coat on it. There are
- 18 other coaters in the United States that do compete
- 19 with a pre-jet or a litho print canvas. Those names
- 20 are Holliston Mills, Seaboard Textile and Snyder
- 21 Textile. Those are the primary ones. There are quite
- 22 a few inkjet coaters, paper coater companies that have
- 23 proprietary inkjet formulas. They take our canvas and
- then put a final inkjet-receptive top coat on.
- MS. SPELLACY: Thank you.

1	And feeding off this a bit, can you comment
2	on the structure of the industry? Are there domestic
3	producers who produce the bulk rolled canvas who
4	specialize in coating? Or is coating of artists'
5	canvas primarily or exclusively, to your knowledge,
6	done by firms such as yourself who we already have
7	listed as domestic producers?
8	MR. BENATOR: To my knowledge, we are the
9	primary producer in the United States. There are
10	several competitors globally that are importing into
11	the United States.
12	MS. SPELLACY: So you know of no large
13	domestic producer that specializes in putting a gesso
14	coating on canvas?
15	MR. BENATOR: Not that I'm aware of.
16	MR. STRAQUADINE: Other than the ones he
17	mentioned previously Holliston, Seaboard Textiles,
18	Snyder Textiles. They do that.
19	MS. SPELLACY: Thank you.
20	Another question. In the petition it was
21	stated that distributors and retailers generally carry
22	a full line of artists' canvas regardless of size or
23	format in which the canvas is presented. I'd like to
24	ask you to expand on that and comment on how the
25	domestic market would characterize a full line of

1 products.

MR. STRAOUADINE: A full line of products is 2 typified by a medium text seven ounce cotton duck such 3 4 as Frederick's red label. A full line also offers a few different styles such as Frederick's green label 5 Belgian linen or Frederick's blue label, ultrasmooth 6 It would also offer a gallery style, 7 portrait canvas. which is a thicker stretcher bar that is affixed on 8 9 the back which allows a frame-free hanging of the art. So there are multiple styles of stretched canvas, but 10 also part of that full offering would include canvas 11 panels, canvas pads, probably archival panels, and 12 some offering of canvas rolls, either unprimed or most 13 14 commonly primed roles of artists' canvas. six yard rolls in several different widths, and 15 sometimes several different finishes that artists 16 17 would buy and stretch themselves. MR. CICHERSKI: As a retailer I'd also like 18 19 to comment in that particular area. I shudder to 20 think that if a Tara didn't exist, of having to go to 21 many suppliers to buy the things that I buy exclusively from Tara. Mainly because it makes things 22 23 much easier from our point of view of controlling inventory and buying from one resource as opposed to 24 25 two or more or multiple resources. That's one

- additional reason why we shied away from importing
- 2 Chinese canvas at this time, because it represents
- only one small portion of the business that we do with
- 4 Tara.
- 5 We look upon them as a complete resource of
- 6 canvas products.
- 7 MS. SPELLACY: Thank you.
- 8 I'd like to ask a few questions now about
- 9 your operations in Mexico. Just to clarify from your
- 10 comments earlier, I understand that you began your
- operations in Mexico in 1990. Can you confirm that or
- 12 clarify if needed, and talk a little bit more about
- the fact that, or clarify for me, rather, that you do
- own the facilities and if you can talk a little bit
- 15 more about your involvement in the maquiladora program
- 16 and talk about how you classify -- And this last
- 17 question if you prefer to respond in your post-
- 18 conference brief that's fine. But if you can clarify
- 19 how you classify your imports and exports to Mexico.
- MR. BENATOR: We did start, or Tara did
- 21 acquire Hydro Manufacturing in September of 1990 and
- 22 Hy-Jo has a wholly-owned subsidiary called Decoracion
- 23 Colonial located in Tijuana, Mexico. It is a Mexican
- 24 corporation.
- The product, when we first acquired it and

- 1 the intent -- It was about 95 percent manufacturing
- wooden ready-made picture frames. The picture frame
- 3 market is primarily linked molding, you buy in 10 foot
- 4 lengths normally and then the frame shops cut and
- 5 assemble the frames to the custom sizes of the
- 6 artwork.
- 7 With Decoracion Colonial we made standard
- 8 sizes, just like standard sizes of stretch canvas and
- 9 canvas panels. So we would finish it, join it, have
- it all assembled, saving the labor of the galleries,
- and offer it at about one-third the price of a custom
- frame where it had to go into the shop, the designers
- would pick out, and here the consumer could pick the
- 14 ready-made, and an artist who we assume would go into
- 15 a retail store, buy a canvas and also buy a frame and
- say this will work great for this artwork.
- One of our specialties in Mexico was we did
- 18 a lot of compo work where we could do corners. In a
- 19 ready-made frame you can do corner, and especially in
- the wedding portraiture market there are some pretty
- 21 elaborate corner decorations that with linked molding
- 22 you can't do. So that was one of the niches.
- 23 In 1990 Decoracion Colonial was doing 95
- 24 percent picture frames and five percent stretched
- 25 canvas. The reason we found out about them was they

- were selling an economy stretch canvas in bulk, a full
- 2 truckload, to a distributors in Florida -- closer to
- 3 us and much further away to their location. We were
- 4 saying how were they competing. So we inquired, and
- 5 they were assembling and producing the product in
- 6 Mexico and selling it in truckload quantities.
- 7 We met them at a trade show and found out --
- 8 We needed a west coast operation, and found out that
- 9 the owner was in his 70s and had four daughters and
- 10 was looking for some type of exit plan so that worked
- 11 out great for us.
- 12 From 1990 until probably 2002, we did
- increase the stretch canvas production because we
- 14 added a spline, a back stretched, and instead of
- 15 stapling it on the back there's a groove, and it's a
- 16 vinyl spline that adheres it to the back, and that is
- done, affixed similar to a silk screen door, I mean to
- 18 a screen door, and that probably, if anything, we were
- 19 probably 75 percent frames and 25 percent -- Ron,
- 20 would you agree, somewhere around there? Seventy-five
- 21 percent frames and 25 percent stretch, and only
- 22 recently would we say -- Because the frame business
- 23 has also been attacked significantly by China and even
- 24 our ready-mades with the assembled prices, the linked
- 25 molding has gone down and selection there is so much

- 1 less expensive that that competitive advantage that we
- 2 had for the ready-made has deteriorated.
- Now I'd say we're about 70 percent stretch
- 4 canvas and 30 percent frames today in our Mexican
- 5 factory.
- 6 MR. FREEMAN: I would like to go back and
- 7 address a little bit about this niche market.
- 8 One of the things, the offering, if you were
- 9 to look at any of these Chinese brochures or whatever
- 10 offering, basically they have the same offerings we do
- 11 now. About the only difference might be print canvas
- as specified as that, but the offerings -- panels,
- 13 stretch canvas by size, by type, by substrate,
- 14 everything about it is pretty much equal as far as the
- 15 offering, so there is a full offering if you want to
- 16 define it as a niche market. So I just wanted to
- 17 clarify that.
- 18 MR. BENATOR: Did we answer all of your
- 19 questions?
- MS. SPELLACY: Yes, except for two.
- 21 Can you discuss your involvement in the
- 22 maquiladora program a little bit more, and also can
- 23 you discuss how you classify your imports and exports
- to your subsidiary in Mexico. And again, if you
- prefer to do these in the post--conference brief,

- 1 that's fine.
- 2 MR. THOMPSON: Certainly the classification
- 3 we would put as business proprietary.
- 4 MR. BENATOR: I believe maquiladoras were
- 5 started with the cooperation of the United States and
- 6 Mexico in 1970, earlier than that?
- 7 MR. CICHERSKI: I started one in '68. One
- 8 of the early ones.
- 9 MR. BENATOR: What it is is the
- 10 manufacturing operation in Mexico is owned primarily
- 11 by Mexican nationals with a U.S. parent who provides a
- 12 lot of the materials and all of the equipment and
- sends it in bond to Mexico, and then we send products
- 14 there. The majority of it, sometimes it's sold into
- 15 Mexico, but in our case 99 percent plus was brought
- back into the United States, sold in the U.S..
- We provided canvas, lumber, staples,
- 18 cartons, film, and shipped it into Mexico in bond and
- 19 then it's returned back. And it's considered an
- 20 export back into the United States.
- MS. SPELLACY: Thank you.
- 22 One last question. From the testimony, do
- you agree that total U.S. consumption of artists'
- 24 canvas has increased in the last five years?
- MR. DELIN: Our feel is that yes, the market

- probably has increased in size. We began to feel some acceleration even before the Chinese entered the market and we felt like we were growing. Part of that was new products in other areas, going in more to the craft industry. We also saw a fairly significant increase in business after 9/11. It appeared, it was
- a bit of a surprise to us, but it appeared that people
  were tending to stay home more with family and there
  was a nice spurt of business.

In terms of how the Chinese product has

impacted the market, we don't have actual statistical

data in our industry to track that. I think we feel

pretty sure that the units have gone up. We don't

know that the total dollars have gone up any more than

the industry was already growing or as a result of an

economy that was coming back.

MR. STRAQUADINE: In my sales efforts or sales travels and conversations with large and small customers, I do hear a definite tone that the industry has grown, that more artists' canvas is being sold than ever before -- not only of our brand, but especially of this very low-priced product that's being sold and promoted much more aggressively, 40 percent off every day, 50 percent off every day, are the signs that hang above the Chinese canvas. An

1	inflated retail price or MSRP that is actually higher
2	than the brand, or often higher than the brand, and
3	yet it's discounted and sold as though it is on sale
4	every day at 40 or 50 percent off. That impression
5	has helped drive the sales of the artists' canvas.
6	The irony of that is that many of the
7	coalition members have reported that their sales of
8	ancillary products such as brushes, paints and mediums
9	that would naturally go hand in hand with this huge
10	up-swing in canvas sales, have not been commensurate
11	by any degree. While some companies can report
12	success of their paint sales, the overall industry
13	growth of paint and brushes are flat or in the single
14	digit growth numbers as opposed to this huge upswing
15	in artists' material or artists' canvas.
16	My question then is, if artists' canvas is
17	so good for the entire industry, why are the ancillary
18	products not coming right along with that? Why are
19	they not selling at a 40 percent increase of a 50
20	percent increase like the increase in sales of overall
21	artists' canvas?
22	MR. DELIN: Another factor. I had mentioned
23	new products have had an impact on growth. Our
24	watercolor canvas has increased significantly. It was

the number one art product of the year in Craft Trends

25

- 1 magazine, and it has had excellent sales. Also U.S.
- 2 producers have tried to find new markets, just like
- any company would, and we're working towards building
- 4 the brand as well as new concepts and ideas into the
- 5 craft market to get more of the craft-type business
- and the scrapbook -- I don't know if you're familiar
- 7 with the scrapbook market, but it's sort of on the
- 8 craft side of business. In our marketing programs and
- 9 strategy we've attempted to try to take more of our
- 10 products, existing products, with different label
- 11 strategies into those markets.
- MS. SPELLACY: Okay, thank you.
- MR. CARPENTER: Mr. Rees?
- 14 MR. REES: Good morning. My name is Mark
- Rees and I'm with the Office of General Counsel.
- 16 Than you for your testimony this morning.
- 17 It's very helpful.
- 18 Mr. Freeman, I don't believe you were
- 19 identified formally. If you could do so now, that
- would be helpful.
- MR. FREEMAN: Yes, I am the Vice President
- of the Manufacturing for Tara Materials.
- MR. REES: Thank you.
- I do have a few questions. Some are of a
- 25 more technical variety but we've heard some technical

- discussion from the industry witnesses so I'll do my
- 2 best to actually put all my questions to the industry
- 3 witnesses, although Mr. Thompson you're welcome to
- 4 jump in at any time, of course.
- 5 Before I get to some of those questions I do
- 6 have a question that just arises out of the testimony
- 7 we've heard from you, and I'm going to botch the
- 8 pronunciation, bur Mr. Cicherski.
- 9 MR. CICHERSKI: I don't know if the
- 10 misspelling throws you off that much or not.
- 11 Evidently when someone hit the computer she or he hit
- two H's, there's only one H. The name is Cicherski.
- 13 MR. REES: Thank you, Mr. Cicherski.
- 14 MR. THOMPSON: Mr. Rees, I have to confess
- that I am the "he" who hit the wrong key.
- [Laughter].
- MR. REES: We've all done that.
- 18 Mr. Cicherski, I know we're going to hear a
- 19 whole bunch about this, or I suspect. I don't know.
- 20 I guess. From some of the folks behind you once
- 21 you're all seated. And so I'd ask you at this point
- 22 to enlighten us a bit on this side of the table.
- 23 You mentioned there were some delivery
- 24 problems two years ago with the domestic industry.
- You mentioned it and you said they were all addressed

- and fully resolved, and you've obviously testified at
- length, importantly, about your perceptions as a
- 3 retailer an as a purchaser of these materials, as to
- 4 the nature of the products in the marketplace and the
- 5 quality of the domestic product. But could you
- 6 explain a little bit more, what did you mean by
- 7 delivery problems? What precisely were you referring
- 8 to or what are you familiar with in the industry that
- 9 took place? And also fill in, even the dates are
- 10 helpful to get some idea of background. If you know.
- 11 MR. CICHERSKI: I may have to enlist some of
- the help of the Tara people, but I think they realize
- 13 the period that I'm talking about probably was in
- 14 early 2003.
- 15 They were running into some production
- 16 issues and some of it I think, I've concluded today at
- 17 least, may have been related to some of the transfer
- 18 of manufacturing to their maguiladora plant in
- 19 Tijuana, but I'm not sure of that. That's my
- 20 viewpoint.
- 21 It was a limited period of time, but it was
- of importance to us because we hadn't planned on it,
- and in dealing with Tara over the years we had never
- 24 encountered an issue like this. So we didn't know if
- there was something economically happening,

- 1 financially happening, union problems, we didn't know.
- 2 And in fact it wasn't until we talked to Paul and Pete
- 3 here about this matter in our office, we finally
- 4 realized that they were addressing the issues, which
- 5 they did do, and subsequently, since that 2003 period
- our deliveries from Tara have been over what we would
- 7 expect from any norman manufacturer of art materials.
- As I said earlier in my presentation,
- 9 sometimes three day deliveries don't necessarily mean
- that much to you if it's a consistent three day
- 11 delivery. Just as a three week delivery is not
- important as long as it's a consistent three week
- period, and we can build our requirements on what that
- 14 time period might be.
- 15 We find that Tara generally lives and
- 16 subscribes to about a 12 to 16 day period in the turn-
- 17 around of an order. That is from the time we submit
- 18 the order to Tara until the time that it arrives on
- 19 our dock.
- 20 Granted, we're not that far away from Tara,
- 21 as maybe some other places in the United States, but
- 22 it's still about a 900-mile drive. We don't consider
- 23 delivery an issue at Tara today, nor would we consider
- 24 the fill rate of an order an issue, and the fill rate
- is more important to us sometimes than the delivery

- 1 because if the fill rate isn't there, that just means
- 2 we might not have merchandise to sell to our
- 3 customers' demands when they come in, and that can
- 4 hurt you more than anything because if a customer
- 5 associates you with that reputation of not being a
- full-stocking dealer, they may not come back. And as
- 7 I indicated earlier, with the kind of competition that
- we have in our community, we have to have our
- 9 merchandise shelves full for our consumers.
- 10 MR. REES: Okay. So as I understand it,
- 11 there was a temporary period in 2003, and as I
- 12 understand, you're testifying to certain delays
- associated with delivery. Is that right?
- 14 MR. CICHERSKI: It was a combination of
- 15 delays and, I think, probably some back orders that
- 16 they had, too.
- MR. REES: Now, having said that, that's
- 18 helpful, thank you, and if the industry witnesses have
- 19 anything to add to enlighten us on that, that would be
- 20 helpful.
- 21 MR. STRAQUADINE: Like any manufacturing
- 22 facility, we are very cognizant of our fill rate. In
- other words, if you order 100 pieces of canvas from
- 24 me, and I only deliver 93 of them, that would be a 93-
- 25 percent fill rate based upon the quantity of pieces

- when we speak of percentages, and we're very cognizant
- that empty shelves mean lost sales for the retailers,
- for the wholesalers, or for any of our customers.
- 4 We're sensitive to that.
- In 2003, we experienced an anomaly, one that
- 6 is common in this specific industry, or in the art
- 7 materials industry, and that's when some of our
- 8 largest coalition members, without the normal notice,
- 9 hit us with very, very large orders, above-and-beyond
- orders, quite often private-label orders that are
- 11 manufactured specifically in their house brand, and
- that caused a delay and a back order of product and
- depleted our shelves of both our branded and our
- 14 house-brand products, private-label products. That's
- 15 happened in 2003. We went through a brief period in
- 16 2002 where a similar thing happened.
- In every case, it's our goal to communicate
- 18 with the customer, let them know what the delays are
- 19 and when they will be getting their product, and
- 20 specific to any product issues or quality issues, in
- 21 every case, if a quality problem is related, we try
- 22 not to ignore it. We try not to turn our heads away.
- 23 I've gone through some of the warehouses that are
- 24 represented in the coalition, searching the shelves
- for a bad product that my label is on and taking it

- out, at my cost and my time, to get it off their
- 2 shelves and get it replaced.
- 3 So we are cognizant of that. It's a natural
- 4 product. Things will happen. The wood is a tree that
- 5 grows; it's not metal that's manufactured. The cotton
- 6 grows and is woven, and it is susceptible to
- 7 atmospheric changes. That being said, we believe we
- 8 manufacture a very, very good-quality product, and
- 9 when we do have problems, we try to immediately
- 10 rectify it and replace it at no charge, and to try to
- 11 eliminate the inconvenience to the customer.
- 12 MR. BENATOR: I would like to add that we
- can explain some of these shortages specifically, but
- 14 they do involve some proprietary customer volumes and
- so forth, and we would be happy to respond separately.
- I also would like to say that we have done
- 17 quite a bit of work on improving our forecasting
- 18 method. That's something very difficult in our niche
- 19 artists' canvas industry where we've got a lot of
- 20 sizes, a lot of depths of material, and so one blip of
- 21 certain sizes will cause a temporary shortage. And
- 22 what we have done, two major things that we have done,
- one is we've established, through quite a bit of work
- and correspondence with key customers, a minimum
- 25 stocking volume in two warehouses.

1	So we are building towards minimum levels,
2	both in our San Diego warehouse and in our
3	Lawrenceville, Georgia, warehouse. In addition to
4	that, our San Diego warehouse, we increased from a
5	20,000-square-foot facility that was only one story to
6	a 60,000-foot, 28-foot-high. We can stack pallets
7	four high in this warehouse in San Diego, so we've got
8	a lot more minimum stock level capacity to ship more
9	timely today.
LO	MR. REES: Thank you for the testimony, and,
L1	of course, please take the opportunity to comment
L2	further if you wish, or especially if you have
L3	confidential information on any of those points, in
L4	your post-conference brief. And also, planning ahead,
L5	please do respond in your post-conference brief or
L6	offer a rebuttal to any of the litany of allegations
L7	we might hear concerning any nonprice factors having
L8	influenced the competition that we see. That would be
L9	helpful for post-conference brief purposes. Unless
20	you have anything to add to that, I'll get to my next
21	question.
22	Is direct importing, that is, importing by
23	retailers directly, first of all, does that exist in
24	this market? Yes. Okay. The witnesses are telling
25	me yes. Is that a newer phenomenon in this market?

- 1 MR. BENATOR: Absolutely not. A lot of the
- fine art industry came from Europe, so there has been
- 3 importing of a lot of art materials from many
- 4 different countries.
- 5 MR. REES: Okay. I realize my question is
- 6 not very clear, so, please, if you want --
- 7 MR. STRAQUADINE: Specific to canvas, there
- 8 has been import of artists' canvas into this industry
- 9 for many, many years. We compete very effectively,
- and we compete very fairly, with countries such as
- 11 India, such as Italy, such as France. When artists'
- 12 canvas comes from any of those countries, and it has
- for years, it is fair competition. It's only with the
- 14 advent of the People's Republic of China and specific
- 15 pricing defined in the petition that the differences
- 16 have taken place.
- 17 MR. THOMPSON: Mr. Rees, if I could just ask
- 18 for a clarification of your question, you're asking
- 19 about direct imports by retailers as opposed to
- 20 imports by, say, a distributor.
- MR. REES: Obviously, the question wasn't
- 22 phrased well. This is exactly what I'm getting to.
- 23 You're putting your finger right on it, Mr. Thompson.
- 24 I'm trying to understand the channels of distribution
- in this into market not only as they are today but as

- they have evolved over time, if they have evolved.
- 2 And when I was referring to "direct importing," what I
- meant by that is it appears that, as you've testified,
- 4 there clearly has always be a presence in the
- 5 marketplace of imports of artists' canvas, and there
- is today, of nonsubject imports, that is, imports of
- 7 canvas from countries other than China.
- 8 But has there been, in the distribution in
- 9 the United States, has there been any change? Has
- there been a shift from product that is purchased by
- 11 retailers where retailers are now importing themselves
- directly from abroad as opposed to purchasing imports
- 13 from an importer or other distributor? Is that
- 14 phenomenon, which we see in other consumer products
- from time to time, and increasingly so before the
- 16 Commission, is that taking place here?
- 17 MR. CICHERSKI: As a retailer, I would like
- 18 to address that issue simply from our perspective. We
- 19 could probably put an order together for a container
- 20 of canvas products brought over from China very
- 21 easily. The problem is not the initial order; it's
- the subsequent order. Because we don't sell
- 23 everything at the same value in the same quantity at
- the same time, we're going to sell out of some size or
- some product quicker that other products.

1	So the issue then becomes, how do I bring my
2	subsequent order in? That may take a long period of
3	time in order to build up sufficient value of cube
4	size to fill the container. That then limits me of
5	having out-of-stock merchandise a lot longer than I
6	would expect and, therefore, turning my customer away
7	from desired and moving products.
8	Now, how that issue might work in terms of
9	me now going to another importer, that probably would
LO	impact my direct cost based on what my initial order
L1	was and what my subsequent order will be through an
L2	importer, which will increase my cost.
L3	So from the perspective of a small retailer,
L4	I would probably shy away from any direct importing of
L5	this particular product line.
L6	MR. BENATOR: Yes. I think Bill would
L7	prefer to do that through an importer or distributor
L8	who then warehouses it and sells it or distributes it
L9	to the retail.
20	But since 2001, the first large chain, large
21	retailer, that brought in Chinese artist canvas was
22	JoAnn's, a mass merchant, and the art materials
23	industry is similar to a lot of other retail
24	industries in the United States. You can look at
25	hardware, you can look at books, you can look at

- office supply, and the growth of the mass merchants.
- 2 They are truly expanding and have the largest buying
- 3 power, and they now have the ability to buy direct
- from overseas, and, yes, that's changed since 2001,
- with JoAnn's, and then with several of the large
- 6 retailers who buy direct from China today, and it's
- 7 just started since 2001.
- 8 MR. REES: Mr. Thompson, I would ask that if
- 9 we have the data, the pricing data, reflecting some of
- this direct importing, if you would take the
- opportunity, in your post-conference brief, to comment
- on the utility of that data in terms of making
- 13 comparisons with, say, between direct importing prices
- and, for example, domestic producers' sale prices, an
- issue with which you're familiar.
- 16 MR. THOMPSON: Yes, indeed. My initial
- 17 reaction is they really are not comparable, but we'll
- 18 certainly take a look at the data and see what would
- 19 be included in any prices that are reported.
- 20 MR. REES: Okay. Is this a growing part of
- 21 the market in terms of the, as you see it, Mr.
- 22 Benator, in terms of the subject imports, that's
- directly imported product, or is it just one small
- 24 part of the subject imports?
- MR. BENATOR: It's a growing part. The

- 1 private labeling and the private branding of large
- 2 retailers and offering that product at similar
- 3 specifications but at much lower prices.
- 4 MR. REES: Thank you.
- 5 Mr. Straquadine, is it? We have a very
- 6 interesting group of names here.
- 7 MR. STRAQUADINE: It just looks that.
- 8 MR. REES: The scope also referred to floor
- 9 cloths and placemats. I don't see any examples of
- 10 those here. How do they fit into this scheme of this
- 11 petition?
- 12 MR. STRAOUADINE: Floor cloths and placemats
- are an extension of artists' canvas. It's a heavy-
- 14 weight artists' canvas that is gessoed on the top
- 15 side, which will be painted decoratively, and then
- 16 used like a throw rug or a floor covering, like old-
- fashioned linoleum used to be painted. The difference
- 18 between it and standard artists' canvas is we apply a
- 19 coat of gesso on the back side as well so that it
- 20 doesn't want to curl. But basically, it is a large,
- loose piece of artists' canvas that is painted
- 22 decoratively.
- 23 Placemats are part of the off-fall, or part
- of what's left over when we make these rolls, and
- it's, again, a floor cloth, but it's cut into a

- 1 placemat size and offered for painters to paint their
- own placemats. It's a perfect gift for a grandma to
- 3 have her grandkids each do their personalized
- 4 placemat, and when they come visit, they have their
- 5 own placemat.
- 6 So they are an extension of artists' canvas.
- 7 We've mentioned them because we felt that it is part
- 8 of the scope, the overall scope, but, in name alone,
- 9 floor cloth and placemat -- I understand your question
- 10 -- certainly sounds odd, but, in effect, it is another
- 11 application of artists' canvas.
- MR. REES: Do you have any idea what
- percentage of subject imports are made up of these
- 14 particular items?
- 15 MR. STRAQUADINE: No, I don't, and if you
- 16 would like, we can respond later with some research on
- 17 that.
- 18 MR. REES: That would be helpful. Thanks.
- 19 But following on that same point, then, and
- 20 since you're the one who testified to the like product
- 21 and six factors, questions that I might ordinarily
- 22 direct right to the lawyer, but you have some familiar
- 23 with, at least, the factual underpinnings that go into
- an analysis of those factors; is it your company's
- position that those are all part of one like product,

- that this is just one product that we're dealing with
- 2 in terms of a like product?
- 3 MR. STRAQUADINE: Correct. I would say that
- 4 they are an extension or a part and parcel of artists'
- 5 canvas. If I were to lump them into an area, I would
- lump them into the rolled canvas because that's where
- 7 the majority of the product, floor cloth, is sold in
- 8 rolls through retailers.
- 9 MR. REES: Okay. If you could include in
- 10 your post-conference brief a discussion under the
- 11 traditional criteria of why the Commission ought to
- include those in a single-like-product definition.
- 13 MR. BENATOR: Mr. Rees, I would like to add
- 14 that the canvas pad that we demonstrated here, that
- 15 Paul has here; that is a lighter weight. That is a
- seven ounce with a double-acrylic priming for
- 17 painting. The placemats, both oval shaped and
- 18 rectangular, are a similar product. It's just the 12
- 19 ounce with a double-acrylic priming on the top and
- 20 single on the back.
- 21 And this is a market that Tara and
- 22 Frederick's have been innovative in marketing and
- 23 promoting to the artist to extend their versatility
- and different types of products that they can sell to
- the marketplace, the roll canvas, Frederick's has over

- 1 40 different styles of artists' canvas, and a few of
- them are 12-ounce, acrylic-primed. That's the same
- 3 product on our floor cloth. Several of the artists
- 4 out there and decorative painters out there will buy
- our 12 ounce, cut it to shape, and gesso the back of
- it or sew it or glue it to the back to make lay flat.
- 7 So there is a lot of crossover, and that's why it's
- 8 considered all part of the same scope, the artists'
- 9 canvas scope.
- 10 MR. DELIN: To try to simplify it possibly,
- in terms of the commonality, all of them are coated,
- 12 woven materials. We refer to all of this as "artists'
- canvas," but they are all coated, woven materials.
- 14 All of our coated canvas is manufactured on the same
- 15 machinery. The difference is how they are mounted, I
- think, more than anything else. A canvas mounted on
- 17 stretcher strips is a "stretched canvas." The same
- 18 canvas mounted on a chipboard is, we call, a "panel."
- 19 If it's on archival hardboard, it's still the same
- 20 canvas, but it's on a hardboard. If it's in a pad,
- it's still the same canvas made on the same machines
- in a pad form. So that's the point of commonality.
- 23 It's still the same product; it's just delivered in a
- 24 different format or package.
- MR. REES: Is the scope intended to cover

- any items that do not incorporate artists' canvas?
- 2 MR. STRAQUADINE: No. The scope is intended
- 3 to cover fabrics coated with gesso, defined as
- 4 "artists' canvas."
- 5 MR. REES: And that would include in
- 6 whatever form they might be made, whether it's the
- 7 prestretched or these various other forms that you've
- 8 described. So it wouldn't encompass frames or kits.
- 9 Do I understand that correctly?
- 10 MR. STRAOUADINE: Correct.
- MR. REES: That's how it was intended.
- 12 MR. THOMPSON: Mr. Rees, frames, stretcher
- bars, for example, are outside the scope. However,
- 14 the scope, as I understand it will be defined in the
- 15 Commerce initiation notice, would encompass kits. I
- don't think I have the language with me now, but it
- 17 would be a kit with a primed artists' canvas. So it's
- 18 an in-scope item that happens to be imported with
- other artists' materials, say, stretcher bars or
- 20 brushes or paints, what have you. Those would be
- 21 considered in-scope merchandise.
- 22 MR. REES: Okay. What is a "kit"?
- 23 MR. THOMPSON: A kit is what, in the past,
- has been a retail item that would have fabric, the
- 25 artists' canvas. So it's going to have the coated

- 1 fabric cut.
- 2 MR. DELIN: It could be any number of
- formats, depending on the purpose of that kit, but it
- 4 might have an artists' canvas in it or a panel, or it
- 5 might have a sheet of canvas, and it might have
- 6 watercolor paints, or it might have acrylic paints or
- 7 brushes or any combination of those, depending on the
- 8 specific strategy and the target.
- 9 MR. THOMPSON: If you like, we can provide
- 10 additional information. You'll certainly want to see
- 11 the scope language as finally settled upon by Commerce
- and our rationale for including those within the
- 13 scope.
- 14 MR. REES: Thank you. That would be helpful
- if you could address that in the post-conference
- 16 brief.
- MR. THOMPSON: I would be happy to, yes.
- 18 MR. REES: Now, in terms of the prestretched
- 19 artists' canvas, do I understand it correctly that --
- 20 well, let me put in just an open-ended question. Does
- 21 Tara prestretch any artists' canvas presently in the
- 22 United States?
- MR. BENATOR: Yes.
- 24 MR. REES: So you talked about the Mexican
- 25 production. I wasn't certain. I heard a number of

- 1 percentages about the shifting and developing Mexican
- 2 production. I didn't know whether that meant --
- 3 MR. FREEMAN: It has shifted quite a bit in
- 4 the last few years, just trying to compete at cost and
- 5 those kinds of things. But, yes, we still produce a
- 6 prestrectched canvas. Twenty-five percent of it is
- 7 produced in Georgia.
- 8 MR. REES: Okay. Are there other domestic
- 9 producers that make a prestretched canvas?
- MR. BENATOR: Yes.
- 11 MR. REES: In terms of their production
- 12 process, the prestretching is done in house, or do
- they have converters who perform that work?
- 14 MR. BENATOR: There is both, but the ones
- that are producers in the United States; they will buy
- the bulk canvas and then will fabricate the wood,
- 17 assemble it, stretch it, inspect it and stretch it, in
- their facilities in the United States.
- MR. REES: Okay.
- 20 MR. BENATOR: From Duro Art, who has joined
- 21 the petition, to Masterpiece Artists' Canvas, who is
- here, to Sunbelt to Signature.
- 23 MR. REES: To refine it further, are there
- 24 any converters in the United States that the only part
- of their involvement in the production of artists'

- canvas is in this stretch piece of it?
- 2 MR. BENATOR: Stretch alone?
- 3 MR. REES: Yes.
- 4 MR. BENATOR: I think Sunbelt is just doing
- 5 stretch alone.
- 6 MR. REES: Okay. Well, then, Mr. Thompson,
- 7 in your post-conference brief, if you could address
- 8 whether entities that are only performing converting
- 9 operations, such as stretching, or if there are other
- 10 aspects of converting operations, if you think they
- 11 meet the criteria such that they ought to be included
- in the definition of the domestic industry that the
- 13 Commission adopts for purposes of the preliminary
- 14 phase of this investigation.
- 15 MR. THOMPSON: I certainly will. One point
- 16 to consider, though, is there's different converting
- operations, from what I understand, that may involve
- 18 different elements of work.
- 19 So a converter -- I don't know that that's a
- 20 catch-all term. The people from Tara and correct me
- if I'm wrong, but conversion might encompass a number
- of different meanings within that term.
- MR. REES: Okay.
- MR. THOMPSON: We'll try to define that.
- MR. REES: With the limited time we have, I

- won't explore all of the nuances of each, but I just
- 2 put it open endedly, any aspect of the manufacturing
- 3 process that you describe in the petition that is
- 4 something that Tara actually outsources or sends to
- another entity or to a converter, whether it's
- 6 stretching or some other feature -- I don't know
- 7 whether some part of it, gessoing is converted, I
- 8 don't know, but any aspect of that, if you could just
- 9 include a discussion of that as you describe the
- 10 production process. It's basically a refinement of
- 11 the description of the production process that exists
- in the petition. Can you explain who is doing what,
- when, and if there are these converters out there,
- 14 whether the Petitioner thinks that they ought to be
- 15 considered part of the domestic industry for purposes
- of this investigation?
- 17 MR. THOMPSON: Certainly.
- 18 MR. REES: I'm going to stop there. Thank
- 19 you.
- MR. CARPENTER: Ms. Bryan?
- 21 MS. BRYAN: Thank you. I'm Nancy Bryan from
- the Office of Economics. Thank you for all of your
- 23 questions thus far. They are very helpful.
- 24 My first question is regarding any
- substitute products of artists' canvas, such as paper,

- 1 possibly wood, and if you could describe their quality
- 2 differences and relative prices.
- 3 MR. STRAQUADINE: Substitute products are
- 4 very limited. There is nothing like the real thing
- 5 when it comes to an artist's painting. There are
- papers, and there are paperboards that are used, and
- 7 some are gaining popularity, which are either gessoed
- 8 boards or papers intended to imitate canvas. They are
- 9 a very small part of the industry, and they are
- 10 certainly not part of the scope that we've focused
- 11 upon.
- 12 MS. BRYAN: Sure, sure. Okay. And their
- 13 prices -- can you describe their relative prices, in
- 14 your understanding, to artists' canvas?
- 15 MR. STRAQUADINE: Relatively speaking, and
- this is rough, I would say that they are rather
- 17 comparable. It's ironic, to me, to see a canvas pad
- 18 on a shelf at a \$7 retail and see a canvas set, which
- is a paper that is textured to look like canvas,
- 20 selling for \$6.95. So very similar. Ten sheets
- versus 10 sheets, but the paper does sell. I do see
- 22 it moving off the shelf.
- MR. BENATOR: Ms. Bryan, excuse me. I want
- to add that the fine-art papers are a big segment of
- 25 the art materials market, but as far as competing

- against the textured canvas, it's a small percent.
- 2 But there's a lot of print-making papers, sketching
- 3 papers, drawing papers, construction papers that
- 4 comprise quite a bit of volume.
- 5 MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 6 Also, could you further discuss the raw
- 7 materials that you use -- in my understanding, it's
- 8 mostly the raw canvas and the lumber -- can you
- 9 explain what percentage of your total production costs
- 10 are accounted for by each raw material?
- MR. BENATOR: That's proprietary. We would
- 12 be happy to provide that later.
- MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 14 MR. THOMPSON: And I take it, you would want
- 15 us to address the other materials involved.
- 16 MS. BRYAN: Yes, any other raw materials
- 17 that you use.
- 18 MR. THOMPSON: Certainly.
- MS. BRYAN: Thank you.
- 20 And also, and this is just a general
- 21 question about the industry, in your understanding,
- are the processing steps -- the coating, the
- 23 stretching, the cutting -- are those pretty much the
- 24 same across the industry, or do certain producers have
- a certain specialized way they do it?

1	MR. STRAQUADINE: If you ask the producers,
2	they will all say it's specialized. So, of course,
3	ours is proprietary. But the basic manufacturing
4	process, the concept of taking lumber, cutting it,
5	molding it, joining it, and the concept of taking
6	fabric, priming it, and then stretching it, is very,
7	very similar. While some people may use machines or
8	machine assists to help in the stretching process, and
9	other people do it strictly by hand, there are nuances
10	and differences there, but the ultimate concept of
11	this manufacturing process, I believe, is generally
12	very similar.
13	MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
14	Also, if you could explain the quality
15	differences and the price differences of artists'
16	canvas made of cotton, linen, and polyester.
17	MR. STRAQUADINE: This, again, would be a
18	wonderful debate not only amongst manufacturers but
19	amongst individual artists.
20	Linen was the traditional substrate. Linen
21	comes from the flax plant, which gives you a very
22	
<b>4                                    </b>	sturdy yarn similar to the linen in textiles or sheets
23	sturdy yarn similar to the linen in textiles or sheets or tablecloths. However, artist-grade linen, of which

Belgium, is treated with a similar acrylic or an oil-

25

- 1 priming process, and it is more of the Cadillac brand.
- 2 Linens are typically seen in the higher-end oil
- 3 paintings and favored by artists selling their work
- 4 for usually a higher price.
- 5 Cotton is probably the Ford or Chevy textile
- 6 that's used most commonly. It's readily available.
- 7 It's grown and woven in multiple countries, including
- 8 the U.S., though much smaller today than ever before.
- 9 And the polyester is a synthetic product, as
- 10 a petroleum derivative, and it is used as a very
- 11 stable yarn that tends not to have a lot of elasticity
- to it. From a purist's or an archival artist's point
- 13 of view, it goes very contrary to a traditionalist's
- 14 point of view. A purist who says they want their
- 15 artwork to last three to 500 years would today
- 16 probably use a synthetic fabric, an acrylic gesso, and
- an acrylic paint, all plastic and not very subject to
- 18 a great deal degradation, while the purist, the
- 19 traditionalist, would say he would use a linen fabric,
- an oil gesso or an oil ground, and then an oil paint
- on top of it, often followed by a varnish to increase
- 22 the longevity.
- 23 MS. BRYAN: And what are the relative prices
- 24 between those three materials?
- MR. STRAQUADINE: We can supply a price list

- 1 that shows the difference between the ultra-smooth
- polyester blend, the linen, and the cotton.
- 3 Typically, the cottons are priced more economically.
- 4 By far, the most economical would be taking a cotton
- 5 that's been bleached -- we don't use any bleached
- 6 cotton in our process. When I spill bleach on my
- 7 bluejeans, eventually a hole will be formed there, and
- 8 we believe that the same thing will take place in
- 9 artists' canvas. Although we've seen bleached cotton
- 10 brought in from the People's Republic of China, it's a
- 11 contrary product to what we believe.
- 12 MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 13 Also, this is a question about how their
- 14 canvases are typically packaged, especially the canvas
- 15 panels. Are those usually sold in packs of three or
- 16 individually?
- 17 MR. STRAQUADINE: Canvas panels have
- 18 traditionally been sold in packs of three or packs of
- 19 12, a classroom pack. Many retailers, Bill probably
- 20 being one of them, will buy the packs of 12 and yet
- 21 sell them individually, take them out of their
- 22 packaging and sell them individually.
- 23 Today, with the advantageous pricing from
- 24 China, we have seen individually packed canvas panels
- coming on shore, so it's already shrink wrapped

- 1 individually versus threes.
- MS. BRYAN: Okay. Also, I had a question
- 3 about the delivery issues that you may experience when
- 4 delivering to the West Coast. Do you notice any
- 5 difficulties or differences in shipping to the East
- 6 Coast versus West Coast?
- 7 MR. FREEMAN: If I may, one of the reasons
- 8 for purchasing a much larger warehouse on the West
- 9 Coast is to take care of that seven days that it
- 10 typically takes to ship across the country, and as
- 11 Michael said earlier about trying to develop max and
- mins in keeping those levels. Currently, right now,
- are West Coast has a better shipping, on-time
- 14 percentage than we do on the East Coast, but we do try
- to keep all of those minimums there.
- 16 I would like to go back. Earlier, there was
- 17 a question asked. You know, we can demonstrate our
- on-time delivery. Over the last two years, every
- 19 month has continued to improve.
- 20 MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 21 Also, Mr. Straquadine, I think you mentioned
- 22 earlier your main customer bases -- specialty art
- 23 stores, Internet suppliers, arts and crafts stores,
- 24 wholesalers, converters -- do you have a sense of what
- share they each account for of your total customer

1	base and which one is the largest, for example?
2	MR. STRAQUADINE: I think that for
3	competitive reasons, we should respond to that either
4	very ambiguously or later. But the largest part of
5	the business is the big-box, arts and crafts retailer
6	everyone on the coalition would represent, or the
7	majority of the coalition would represent, that
8	followed by the fine-art chains and/or wholesalers.
9	The wholesale business in the U.S. is a business
10	that's been a bit volatile, similar to other
11	industries: paint, hardware, food and drug. Lots of
12	larger retailers are buying direct from factories more
13	and using less fill in.
14	As described by opposing counsel earlier, we
15	were accused of firing a longtime distributor a year
16	and a half ago. Short of antidumping, that was, by
17	far, the company's largest decision and toughest
18	decision, to end a relationship with someone that we

far, the company's largest decision and toughest
decision, to end a relationship with someone that we
had done business with for many years. It was done
specifically due to the importation of Chinese canvas,
what we believed was free riding, leading people to
believe that the canvas was made in Lawrenceville,
Georgia, by Tara Materials and then converted in China
and brought back into the States. We have a couple of
evidences of that.

1	Not being invited to be part of their
2	marketing program, sales meetings, things of that
3	source, being treated more as a competitor, having our
4	brand available but being undersold by the Chinese
5	product is the reason we went there.
6	It was, by far, our toughest decision. We
7	regret that we had to make that decision, but we
8	believe that, today, my information or my knowledge
9	would say is the largest importer of Chinese canvas,
10	that was a good decision on our part to end that
11	relationship and choose to exercise our resources in
12	arenas where we felt there was further support taking
13	place.
14	MS. BRYAN: Thank you.
15	This may be a little harder to answer, but I
16	suspect that there's a few large groups of final
17	customers: amateur artists, student artists,
18	recreational, professional, possibly firms that
19	manufacture reproductions. Again, do you know which
20	of those groups is your largest customer base?
21	MR. STRAQUADINE: We love them all equally,
22	but we believe the volume is still higher in the craft
23	market, on the amateur or part-time artist, and that
24	the serious fine artist, professionally working, is a
25	smaller segment, yet, in our eyes, as equally

- important, in essence, because it's part of the
- 2 integrity of the industry. Often, they are the last
- 3 to shop price and price alone. But we can probably
- 4 take our best stab at defining what the overall market
- is in terms of amateur crafters, part-timers, serious
- 6 amateurs, and professionals.
- 7 MR. STRAQUADINE: Okay. Thank you.
- 8 MR. BENATOR: And I think some of the other
- 9 retailers would have different -- there would be a
- 10 wide range of responses. There is no valid industry
- 11 study of that.
- MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you. That's all I
- 13 have.
- MR. CARPENTER: Mr. Jee?
- 15 MR. JEE: Good morning. My name is Justin
- 16 Jee. I'm an auditor and a financial analyst in the
- 17 Office of Investigations. I have just one comment and
- 18 a request.
- 19 I'm concerned with timely responses by
- 20 domestic producers, and the response was due on April
- 21 15th. As of today, a week later, we have received so
- 22 far four producers' responses out of a possible 11.
- 23 Furthermore, I have issued three deficiency letters,
- as well as several phone calls, to the Petitioner. I
- still have not received complete and usable financial

- data and some other data. So I would appreciate your
- 2 cooperation on my request. Thank you.
- 3 MR. CARPENTER: Thank you. Ms. Freund?
- 4 MS. FREUND: Hi. I'm Kim Freund from the
- 5 Office of Industries, and I just have a couple of
- 6 quick questions, mostly about the raw materials you're
- 7 using in the canvas.
- First of all, I just want to clarify, to be
- 9 an artists' canvas, it has to be coated. Is that
- 10 correct? I seem to remember reading that you
- 11 sometimes sell raw canvas to artists who do their own
- 12 coating.
- 13 MR. BENATOR: Some artists prefer to buy it
- 14 uncoated or raw and then put their own formula or
- 15 their own preferred texture onto the canvas. Because
- of the raw market being so voluminous and that
- industry selling to sailboats, to awnings, to
- industrial products, book covers, and so forth, we
- 19 preferred to leave that out of the scope.
- MS. FREUND: Okay.
- MR. BENATOR: A very small percentage of the
- 22 artists' canvas market.
- 23 MS. FREUND: Okay. Thank you. That helps.
- 24 And that was a follow-up question, actually,
- what uses are there for that canvas, so basically you

- 1 just covered it there, I quess.
- 2 Also, where do you actually purchase your
- 3 canvas from? It is domestically produced or imported?
- 4 MR. BENATOR: When Tara first started in
- 5 1966, it was primarily in the United States, in the
- 6 Southeast. Thus, the name Tara from Gone with the
- 7 Wind. Both the cotton, all of the chipboard to make
- 8 our panels -- none of the lumber supplies -- the
- 9 lumber was from the Northwest because the yellow pine
- 10 had too much sap was not conducive for an artist's
- 11 canvas to be stretched over, but also the paper for
- 12 all of the labels -- so we were a Southeast, pretty
- 13 much materials supporter.
- But through the years, our canvas, the
- 15 synthetics, the polyesters, the majority of that is
- purchased from the United States; otherwise, it's
- moved all around the globe, from South America to
- 18 India to Hong Kong. We've never gotten it from the
- 19 People's Republic of China, but all over.
- 20 MS. FREUND: Okay. And the artists' canvas
- 21 that are competing from China; what kind of raw
- 22 materials are they? Are they using cotton or
- 23 polyester?
- MR. BENATOR: Primarily, 100-percent cotton
- 25 bleached or unbleached, primarily. That's the biggest

- 1 volume, but there are other products that they use.
- 2 MS. FREUND: Okay. And would you be able to
- 3 give some estimate of how much your production is in
- 4 that later?
- 5 MR. BENATOR: Yes, we would later.
- 6 MS. FREUND: Okay. Thanks.
- 7 Regarding the coatings, you mentioned
- 8 earlier, I think that some of them were petroleum
- 9 based, have you seen a lot of price fluctuation in the
- 10 costs of your coating?
- 11 MR. BENATOR: If I can respond, we've had
- 12 three price increases in the last 12 months, and as
- far as the amounts, I would prefer to keep that
- 14 confidential, but we had two, one earlier last year
- and one at the end of '04, and we have now been
- 16 advised that there is another one coming shortly.
- MS. FREUND: Okay. And, I guess, the last
- 18 question -- I think you mentioned earlier, but just a
- 19 little clarification, on the coatings used for inkjet
- 20 versus, say, oil painting or some other type, -- I
- 21 want to make sure I understand this correctly -- did
- 22 you say that the product coming in from China is not
- 23 appropriate for use in inkjet printers or for printing
- 24 purposes?
- MR. BENATOR: That is a product that's just

- 1 started to come into the United States with the ink-
- 2 receptive coating.
- 3 MS. FREUND: Okay.
- 4 MR. BENATOR: There's quite a few other
- 5 global producers of that inkjet-receptive coating.
- 6 MS. FREUND: Okay.
- 7 MR. BENATOR: China is just starting to get
- 8 actively into that account.
- 9 MS. FREUND: Okay. Thank you. That's all I
- 10 have.
- 11 MR. CARPENTER: Before I go to Ms. Mazur, if
- 12 I could just ask one follow-up question related to the
- 13 question of the uncoated canvas, which is clearly
- 14 outside the scope.
- 15 Mr. Thompson, is it your position that that
- would also be outside your proposed like product?
- MR. THOMPSON: Oh, yes. The uncoated canvas
- 18 is outside the scope of the like product definition.
- MR. CARPENTER: Thank you.
- 20 Ms. Mazur?
- MS. MAZUR: Thank you. Thank you very much
- 22 to the industry witnesses for taking the time to come
- 23 today to Washington and to prepare your testimony and
- 24 present it to us. It was very, very helpful.
- 25 A couple of questions. Mr. Straquadine, in

- 1 talking about the anomalous situation in 2003 that
- 2 resulted in back orders, et cetera, you indicated that
- 3 the coalition members basically placed a series of
- 4 large orders. Was there anything in particular that
- 5 was happening in the marketplace that was driving
- 6 those orders?
- 7 MR. STRAQUADINE: I would say store
- 8 promotions, advertising, store growth, chains going
- 9 from 700 stores to 800 stores perhaps or other growth
- 10 within the market seemed to accelerate that and
- 11 provide this anomaly of larger orders.
- MS. MAZUR: So it was just a confluence of
- events. All of these things happened at roughly the
- 14 same time.
- 15 MR. STRAQUADINE: Yes. Primarily, all of
- those things happening at the same time. Sometimes
- inventories at year end appear, and I really don't
- 18 feel I can speak to that, but sometimes some
- 19 retailers, and in my retailing background, at year
- 20 end, inventories will be run down for year-end audits,
- and after the first of the year or the first of the
- 22 fiscal, large orders will be placed to restock shelves
- for some badly needed product, those things can time,
- 24 along with some growth issues and promotion issues, to
- 25 bring in a flood of large orders that, in this case,

- 1 resulted in our fill rates dropping into, I believe,
- the 80 percent on our branded products.
- 3 MR. FREEMAN: If I might add just a little
- 4 bit to that, just from a manufacturing standpoint, one
- of the things that we try to do very diligently is to
- 6 get as much information by forecasts from the market,
- 7 and we try to develop a capacity plan to meet that
- 8 capacity, and if you were to extrapolate through 12
- 9 months, if the world was perfect, everything would be
- 10 balanced, and that's the reason for the inventory
- 11 pieces that we try to drive up.
- When you develop a plan, let's say, just use
- a number, \$4 million, and then in that month you
- receive sales or orders of \$6 million, it certainly
- 15 stretches the fabric. You have kind of cyclic
- deliveries sometimes when you do those kinds of
- things. And I must say, we appreciate very much these
- 18 larger orders. We work very diligently. We try to
- 19 add shifts. We try to do all kinds of different
- things to try to meet this requirement, but sometimes
- it's pretty difficult because we try to plan this on a
- 22 yearly basis, how many people do we need doing this,
- 23 this, this. It's hard to carry, especially in this
- day and time, extra people to respond to this very
- 25 quickly and that kind of thing. So I just wanted to

- 1 add that.
- MS. MAZUR: Thank you. That is very
- 3 helpful.
- 4 MR. DELIN: I could add to that, if I may.
- 5 MS. MAZUR: Please.
- 6 MR. DELIN: There are a lot of different
- 7 reasons, over time, where there is demand that changes
- 8 rather radically, for whatever reason. Like, 9/11 was
- 9 an example that just nobody foresaw. We thought it
- 10 would go down; instead, it came up.
- 11 Our retailers make adjustments as well.
- 12 They realize that they don't have enough in stock, and
- they are losing sales on the shelves at retail, and
- 14 they suddenly make a strategic decision to load up,
- and then suddenly we get, from perhaps our largest
- 16 customer, two or two and a half or three times the
- normal order, and that kind of a thing does have an
- 18 impact on us.
- 19 As Ron pointed out, we've attempted to work
- 20 with them to get forecasts from them to help us, and
- they just haven't helped at all.
- 22 So all you can do is try to prepare as much
- as you can, carry reasonable levels of safety stock in
- 24 anticipation of needs. We go into heavy overtime to
- 25 fill orders on time, if necessary, but there is a

- 1 combination of many different events that can impact
- 2 demand at any given time.
- MS. MAZUR: Thank you.
- 4 MR. DELIN: One of the points, I think, if
- 5 I'm beginning to grasp some of the dynamics of this,
- our case is based on price, and I believe that the
- 7 coalition really can't deal with the issue of price,
- 8 so they are going to try to find other reasons for why
- 9 they are going to China. But we have clear evidence,
- 10 as I stated, even in writing from customers, as well
- 11 as witness commentary from customers, as well as exit
- 12 reports that are documented, that in almost every case
- it has been as a result of price.
- 14 MS. MAZUR: I wonder if Tara could respond
- in the post-conference brief and provide us with order
- 16 book sales, quarterly order book sales, for the entire
- period of investigation, January 2002 to 2004, in the
- 18 post-conference brief. That would be very helpful.
- 19 MR. BENATOR: We would be happy to provide
- 20 that.
- MS. MAZUR: Thank you very much.
- 22 One other issue with respect to one of the
- issues that Mr. Gallas, on behalf of Respondents,
- 24 raised this morning was the firing of the distributor.
- 25 Mr. Straquadine, you mentioned that earlier and

- 1 provided some detail. If you could, in the post-
- 2 conference brief, give us details as to what happened
- or what transpired in that episode, and if we could
- 4 talk volumes as well, dates and volumes, that would be
- 5 helpful. Thank you.
- And then one last issue with respect to the
- 7 domestic industry. Mr. Benator and Mr. Straquadine,
- 8 you mentioned the three coaters, three additional
- 9 coaters, who might be out there in the industry. Do
- 10 they perform tolling operations for other producers of
- 11 artists' canvas that you know of?
- 12 MR. BENATOR: Not that I know of. That is
- only a small percentage of their business. They do a
- 14 lot of other coatings -- textile, vinyl, all different
- 15 types of signage, industrial coatings.
- 16 MS. MAZUR: To what extent does tolling go
- on in the artists' canvas industry; that is, the
- 18 canvas producer is contracting out to a toll producer
- 19 for coating operations?
- MR. BENATOR: Primarily, in the United
- 21 States, it relates to the print canvas side, to the
- 22 inkjet, and to some of the other specialty artists!
- canvas.
- 24 MS. MAZUR: Mr. Thompson, if you could
- 25 explore this issue in the post-conference brief with

1	respect to tolling being performed by these three
2	coaters that have been mentioned, if you could also
3	identify their locations as well, we would appreciate
4	that.
5	Those are all of the questions I have, and,
6	again, Thank you very, very much for your testimony.
7	MR. CARPENTER: I have a few questions, too.
8	The Respondents, in their opening statement,
9	made what may be considered a causation argument, that
10	your Mexican imports are displacing your domestic
11	production. Of course, you made the argument that
12	you've increasingly shifted production to Mexico
13	because of competition from the low-priced imports
14	from China, and they may elaborate on that argument
15	this afternoon. But what could you tell me? Is there
16	anything you could tell me at this point that would
17	refute their argument that if they were to argue, for
18	example, that this was self-inflicted injury, that you
19	were shifting your production to Mexico, and that's
20	hurt your U.S. operations? Do you have any
21	information you can provide on that at this point?
22	MR. BENATOR: The only thing I can say right
23	now; I would like to think about it and provide a
24	better answer, but the only thing I can say right now
25	is the displacement of stretch production from the

- 1 United States to Mexico was, because our margins kept
- getting squeezed, a kind of reactionary measure to
- lower our costs as much as possible, and we feel we
- 4 would not have had to do that without this unfair,
- 5 low-priced Chinese product, and that regardless of
- 6 Mexican labor at, say, one-fourth of U.S. labor cost
- 7 and Chinese at one-tenth of U.S. labor cost, we still
- 8 can't be competitive against China. That's not the
- 9 factor.
- 10 MR. CARPENTER: To some extent, this strikes
- 11 me as possibly a timing issue. If there is anything
- 12 you can provide in your post-conference briefs that
- would support the argument that you are increasing
- 14 your shifting to Mexico in response to increasing
- 15 volumes and lower prices from China, that this was,
- 16 like you said, a reactionary move, I think that would
- 17 be helpful.
- 18 You also made the argument, and I didn't
- 19 catch all of the factors, but basically innovative
- 20 marketing by the Chinese and certain other factors has
- increased demand for this product in the U.S., and I
- 22 believe that this panel has indicated that you feel
- 23 that demand for this product has increased somewhat in
- 24 recent years. Do you see any merit to their argument
- that the Chinese, through marketing or other reasons,

- 1 have succeeded in expanding the market, to the benefit
- of all of the players?
- MR. STRAQUADINE: I would say, independent
- 4 of price, no. Taking price into consideration and
- 5 being able to sell canvas panels individually rather
- 6 than in packs of three; that could be considered an
- 7 innovation. The innovation of offering perhaps a
- 8 larger size or a different size than what we currently
- 9 manufacture within a particular range of artists'
- 10 canvas may be the next question of innovation or the
- only other thing I could propose as innovation. But I
- would say 98, maybe 99 percent of the products offered
- 13 are direct imitations, not innovations, to our product
- line or other U.S.-manufactured product.
- 15 Another U.S. domestic supplier, Masterpiece
- 16 Artists' Canvas, has, for years, manufactured a three-
- inch deep, very, very deep, artists' canvas on a deep
- 18 stretcher bar. It's a nice piece of goods. It's a
- 19 market that we've never competed with them on. I've
- 20 always admired their quality in that, yet, today, it's
- 21 being imported as a direct displacement of the
- 22 Masterpiece product in, ironically, a three-inch
- 23 depth. So that, again, would be evidence of
- 24 imitation, not innovation.
- MR. BENATOR: I would like to add that the

- 1 low-priced Chinese product, especially in the economy
- 2 stretched, has displaced canvas panel product because
- 3 the stretched canvas is less expensive. Artists who
- 4 normally were buying panel, which was considered a
- 5 nonarchival, inexpensive substrate, now can paint on a
- 6 prestretched, and that has probably grown the
- 7 stretched canvas portion of the artists' canvas
- 8 industry.
- 9 In addition, because of these low prices
- 10 that are coming into the United States, retailers have
- 11 more aggressively promoted artists' canvas and taking
- 12 up much more floor space in their stores. It's valid
- 13 logic that it carries more paints and brushes to come
- out of the store, so they get more total sales per
- 15 customer. But if you look at it, it's volume of
- 16 artists' canvas, not necessarily dollars of sales
- 17 volume.
- 18 MR. CARPENTER: One question about the kits
- 19 that are coming in from China. Could you describe to
- 20 me, to the extent that you have seen these in the
- 21 market, what these are? For example, do they have
- 22 essentially two pieces, the treated canvas and then
- 23 the completed frame, or is the frame sometimes also
- 24 unassembled?
- MR. STRAQUADINE: To date, kits have

1	primarily	been	either	а	stretched	canvas	with	some
---	-----------	------	--------	---	-----------	--------	------	------

- 2 paints and brushes nested inside the opening or a box
- 3 containing a canvas panel or a sheet of canvas that
- 4 then contained artists' paints and artists' brushes.
- 5 We have not seen a kit that involved four stretcher
- 6 strips and a piece of canvas for someone to stretch
- 7 themselves.
- 8 Our goal in including kits in the scope is
- 9 to try and avoid any end runs that could precipitate
- if a canvas duty was put in place on artists' canvas
- 11 that, by calling it a kit and putting one brush in
- 12 with it, that somehow or other that would avoid any
- duty just because a 29-cent brush is nested in the
- 14 back of the canvas, thus making it a kit. We have not
- 15 seen that, but we could see that as an opposition,
- should a dumping duty be put in place.
- 17 MR. CARPENTER: Do you describe to me,
- 18 again, what steps are now being performed in Mexico?
- 19 MR. BENATOR: The Mexican factory, as I
- 20 said, has 260 employees there. They are doing quite a
- 21 bit of woodworking on the stretcher bars. We take the
- 22 raw boards, we rip them, we defect out the knots, we
- then cut it to different sizes based upon demand, we
- then mold it, applying the shape to the stretcher bar,
- and then we put the tongue-and-groove end work, which

- 1 we call "tennoning the ends," so that when we put the
- inside frame of an artists' canvas together, you can
- adjust it or peg it out if it starts to loosen.
- 4 MR. CARPENTER: Is all of the woodworking
- 5 and the construction of the frames being done in
- 6 Mexico?
- 7 MR. BENATOR: Not all of it. We still have
- 8 a large woodworking facility in Lawrenceville,
- 9 Georgia. We were providing it up until recently
- 10 because when we closed down the Precision factory in
- 11 April of '04, we had quite a bit of woodworking
- 12 equipment there. We moved the majority of it Mexico,
- but we were still doing volume and sending them a lot
- of finished stretcher strips throughout 2004.
- 15 We still, today, send blanks where we take
- 16 the bulk lumber and rip it and defect it and send it
- 17 to Mexico. We provide the bulk rolls. We were
- 18 providing it cut and on sheets. They now have a
- 19 cutter and a sheeter. They are sheeting and cutting
- the canvas to size to stretch onto these assembled
- 21 stretcher bars.
- 22 They are also, at this point, -- is there
- 23 anything else I'm missing?
- MR. FREEMAN: Well, right now, 65 percent of
- the woodworking is still done in Georgia, and 35

- 1 percent down there. Also, about 30 to 35 percent of
- the work they do now is still picture frames, but they
- 3 are applying the canvas to these strips, and we do
- 4 send, almost on a weekly basis, we send, at least, one
- or two trailer loads of wood product and also canvas
- 6 to them.
- 7 MR. CARPENTER: Is the woodworking the most
- 8 labor-intensive part of the entire production process
- 9 and cutting and that sort of activity?
- 10 MR. FREEMAN: It is if you consider cutting.
- 11 Coating is the most labor intensive.
- MR. CARPENTER: Coating is the most --
- 13 MR. FREEMAN: Coating is the most costly
- 14 process.
- 15 MR. CARPENTER: Okay. Would coating be the
- 16 more capital-intensive process?
- 17 MR. FREEMAN: It's more capital intensive.
- 18 I shouldn't say "labor intensive," but it's more
- 19 capital intensive, yes, and then all of the equipment
- 20 you have to have to apply paint and make paint and
- 21 those kinds of things.
- MR. CARPENTER: Okay. Thank you.
- 23 Mr. Cicherski, if I understood your
- 24 testimony correctly, in describing the Chinese
- 25 product, I believe that you had indicated that it was

- inferior in quality, that there were some delivery
- 2 problems or maybe not so much problems, but there was
- 3 typically, I guess, about a 90-day order delay or 90
- 4 days from the time of order to shipment as opposed to
- 5 about 12 to 16 days for Tara and that the deliveries
- 6 were somewhat sporadic.
- 7 I think you also mentioned that the coating
- 8 was inferior, the stretch parts were inferior, and the
- 9 packaging was inferior. Is this based on product that
- 10 you've actually imported yourself from China?
- 11 MR. CICHERSKI: No. As I said earlier, I do
- 12 not import any Chinese canvas. I am referring to
- samples that have been provided me by some of the
- 14 people who are present here today who are selling the
- 15 Chinese canvas who would like for us to buy from them.
- MR. CARPENTER: I see.
- 17 MR. CICHERSKI: And my rejection is based
- 18 simply on what they, I had hoped, would provide me
- 19 their best, and if that is their best, it doesn't fit
- 20 my criteria of making the best better.
- So, as a consequence, I've rejected it for
- two reasons, and one I didn't mention earlier. The
- first reason is what I did say, and that is just the
- 24 quality of the product as well. But what we find is
- that our growth in normal sales of Tara canvas has

1	gone up, and the reason it's gone up is those buyers
2	of imported Chinese canvas from our competitors are
3	coming to us to buy the better grade of canvas for
4	their particular use because they can depend upon it,
5	and it works better for them. So those are basically
6	the two reasons that I would reject it.
7	You mentioned something about the delivery.
8	The delivery that I had reference to is if I had
9	chosen to import canvas, my concern would be not in
10	developing my initial order, which would be handled on
11	an anticipated basis, and, I suspect I don't know
12	this for truth, but I suspect that it's about a 90-day
13	turnaround time to get an order, from the time that
14	you send it in to the time that you receive it at your
15	dock door and cleared by customs.
16	My problem is the subsequent reorders, and
17	what I had referenced there is some products outsell
18	other products that I might have brought in in that
19	initial order, and how am I going to replace those
20	that sell first if I have to wait to buy through the
21	manufacturer in China and work up an order for a
22	container?

At the moment, I don't have any track record of any major distributor in the United States of the Chinese canvas that would satisfy my requirements. So

- 1 my primary problem would be in the length and term of
- 2 subsequent deliveries to my first order, not
- 3 necessarily the first order.
- 4 MR. CARPENTER: Is it fair to say that you
- 5 tend to stock higher-end products, high-quality
- 6 products, that that's your customer base?
- 7 MR. CICHERSKI: Our primary product line,
- 8 and not just including canvas, is name-brand products
- 9 that people know and recognize. Many of our customers
- 10 are students, and that's what teachers prescribe,
- 11 name-brand products, not just the generic product.
- 12 So we have to be in a position of not only
- 13 providing to them what the teachers prescribe, but
- then, in terms of commercial art users, as well as
- 15 fine-art users, they all usually subscribe to a
- 16 certain brand of product that works better for them
- than other products. Sometimes that means we may
- 18 duplicate products, comparable products but yet from
- 19 different manufacturers, just to satisfy the
- 20 customer's requirements.
- Each of our customers; they are the ones who
- determine what we are going to buy, and if we have a
- 23 customer or customers that come in making a demand for
- 24 a particular product, we'll have to listen to that,
- and we'll wind up buying the product for them if we

- don't currently stock it. At the moment, and that's
- as of yesterday, we don't have people coming into our
- 3 store making demands for a cheap Chinese product in
- 4 canvas. It just doesn't exist.
- 5 MR. CARPENTER: Do you have a sense as to
- 6 who is buying the Chinese product? Is it a different
- 7 type of client base?
- 8 MR. CICHERSKI: My view is that it's the
- 9 mass merchandiser who is getting the bulk of the
- 10 business because that's where it's being offered and
- 11 advertised. No, I don't have a detailed sense of
- where all of this is coming from; it's just from what
- 13 I've seen.
- I might add, the importation of Chinese
- 15 canvas is somewhat interesting to me in a lot of ways
- 16 because I think there's a lot of issues to be involved
- 17 here. One of my major suppliers has introduced a
- 18 Chinese canvas early last year. They have yet to
- 19 deliver. I question why. I don't know what their
- 20 problems are, but if I had made that adjustment in my
- 21 thinking of bringing that product in in the middle of
- 22 2004, I wouldn't have it on my shelf yet.
- MR. DELIN: I would like to add to that,
- there have been major service disruptions in Chinese
- canvas. For example, we had one major, big-box store

- that we lost their business, and we were trying to get
- in, and I made regular visits, almost every two weeks
- 3 to every month, for over a year, just constantly
- 4 monitoring their out-of-stock position because we were
- 5 using it in our strategy to try to get back in, and I
- 6 kept repeating that because I was a bit dumbfounded by
- 7 the amount of out of stock and their unwillingness to
- 8 switch over. It was huge out of stocks, over 50
- 9 percent of the shelf being empty in this case.
- 10 Now, I don't know what the reasons were
- 11 behind it, but that's just one example, and Paul could
- 12 probably address that more because he spends more time
- in the field than I do, but there have been huge out
- of stocks.
- 15 MR. CARPENTER: Mr. Straguadine?
- MR. STRAQUADINE: I would add that, yes,
- there's been out of stocks. A large, house-brand
- 18 account of fine-art stores that made a conversion from
- 19 our brand to a Chinese brand based on price did, in
- 20 fact, experience the same thing, that their stores
- 21 were out of the product that they were importing from
- 22 China. They had their alternative U.S. brand on the
- 23 shelf, and it looked good, nice quality, I believe, at
- 24 a higher price than what they purchased it from us
- for, but it was there. But the majority, or a large

- 1 part, of their program that was dependent on China was
- very much delayed, and they went several months
- 3 without product as a result of that.
- In the case of who buys the Chinese canvas,
- 5 Bill is more the exception than the rule. Many art
- 6 material dealers feel they have been forced to buy it
- 7 as a result of distributors who are offering a very
- 8 low-priced item. Once your biggest competitor, the
- 9 other art store in town, is offering something for 40
- or 50 percent lower prices than you, the only way to
- 11 keep from being embarrassed is to join him rather than
- 12 fight him and just lose money.
- So when the pricing difference is that big,
- many retailers, and many of the ones that came by in
- 15 support of us at the NAMTA show last week and told us
- this was a good thing, many of them told us, we're
- only carrying the product, and we only left part, or
- 18 even sometimes all, of your brand as a result of the
- 19 competition changing and the low, low prices of 40, 50
- 20 percent every day off retail being offered in the
- 21 market.
- 22 MR. CARPENTER: All right. Thank you very
- 23 much for your responses. That was very helpful.
- Are there any other questions from staff?
- 25 Ms. Mazur?

- 1 MS. MAZUR: I'm sorry. I have one
- 2 additional question.
- 3 Mr. Freeman, when you were discussing the
- 4 operations down in Mexico, you indicated that you also
- 5 send these stretcher strips down to the Maquiladora in
- 6 Mexico. Is that correct?
- 7 MR. FREEMAN: We actually send the blank.
- 8 We don't send the stretcher strip. We send it down,
- 9 it's molded there, and it's tennoned, or a 45-degree
- 10 angle is put on it there.
- 11 MS. MAZUR: All right. So that's why you
- 12 consider the stretched canvas returning from the
- 13 Mexican Maquiladora as Mexican product.
- 14 MR. FREEMAN: Yes. It's an import back into
- 15 the --
- 16 MS. MAZUR: But the country of origin is
- 17 considered Mexico because you're sending down the
- 18 coated canvas and the wood blanks.
- 19 MR. FREEMAN: Yes. As a salesman, for many
- 20 years now, I've asked, why does our label have to say
- "made in Mexico"? It's much more palatable to say
- 22 "assembled in Mexico." It would be sales tool for me.
- 23 I've been told time and time again by our Maguiladora
- 24 operation that in order to get goods in and out of
- 25 Mexico, this is considered by the Mexican government a

- 1 manufacturing process, so we've never been able to put
- 2 "assembled in Mexico," and it's always had to say
- 3 "made in Mexico."
- 4 MS. MAZUR: That's very helpful. Thank you
- 5 very much.
- 6 MR. CARPENTER: All right. Thank you again.
- 7 At this point, we'll take a brief break,
- 8 about a 10-minute break, and we'll resume at about
- 9 twelve-twelve, by the clock in the back. Thank you.
- 10 (Whereupon, at 12:03 p.m., a brief recess
- 11 was taken.)
- 12 MR. CARPENTER: Mr. Gallas, feel free to get
- 13 started whenever you're ready.
- MR. GALLAS: Thank you, Mr. Carpenter. We
- 15 have a lot to say, so I'm just going to turn it over
- 16 to our first witness, Frank Stapleton of MacPherson's.
- 17 Thank you.
- 18 MR. STAPLETON: Hello. My name is Frank
- 19 Stapleton, and I have worked in the art-supply
- 20 business for 33 years. The company I head,
- 21 MacPherson's, began in the 1930's as a small, regional
- 22 wholesaler in northern California, and we've gradually
- grown to become the only nationwide wholesale
- 24 distributor and especially of name-brand art
- 25 materials.

1	We sell only to retail stores, including
2	thousands of mom-and-pops, and, like most in the
3	business, our challenges seem to be becoming more
4	difficult every year. However, I would like to say,
5	contrary to what was stated by Tara, the distributor
6	sector that we represent is growing. We are growing,
7	and so are our competitors.
8	What I hope to do here is to explain a bit
9	of the context of this sorry situation from a point of
LO	view very different from the owners of Tara.
L1	Success in the market requires basic skills,
L2	such as a close connection to the forces that drive
L3	trends, strong relationships up and down the supply
L4	chain, a dedication and success to your customers,
L5	with lost of ingenuity.
L6	MacPherson's has positioned itself in a very
L7	different way from Tara in the U.S. canvas market. We
L8	have carved out a company mission that focuses
L9	everything we do towards helping our retailer
20	customers achieve success. In short, growing both our
21	customers' business and the greater industry is our
22	top priority.
23	This vision guides us to build strong
24	relationships with our suppliers and customers because
25	we believe that, through teamwork and cooperation, we

- 1 magnify the result. I'll explain later how Tara's
- vision and actions differ significantly from ours.
- I think it's important to get a basic
- 4 overview of the canvas market, focusing on one
- 5 significant and wonderful trend that has shaped our
- 6 industry over the past 10 years.
- 7 First, the product. As you've heard,
- 8 stretched canvas is a unique product category in the
- 9 art-craft business. It is the surface that painters
- and the artistically undiscovered use to express their
- 11 creativity with paints, brushes, and other supplies.
- 12 In the early days of my career, canvas was considered
- just one of many necessary categories within a typical
- 14 store. There was very little product or merchandising
- 15 leadership in canvas sales until the early 1990's when
- 16 a California-based, home-decor retail chain, Standards
- 17 Brands Paint, created an art-supply specialty division
- 18 called The Arts Store.
- 19 Up until this time, the game in canvas was
- at the producer level, and the big dog in canvas
- 21 manufacturing was Tara Materials and it's Frederick's
- 22 brand. The Benator family took control of Tara in the
- 23 mid-1980's, as you have heard, and their focus on
- 24 sales volume, production efficiencies, and
- 25 profitability allowed them to systematically

1	neutralize	competitors,	and	by	the	year	2000,	they

- 2 dominated the U.S. market.
- In a touchy-feely business full of casual
- 4 dressing and creative types, these were always the
- 5 guys wearing a suit and tie. Tara's strategy made for
- 6 impressive financial results, but its dominance also
- 7 resulted in a failure to connect with customers and
- 8 forge relationships or to perceive changes in the
- 9 market and, as a major consequence, put its control at
- 10 risk.
- 11 Traditionally, most stores merchandise
- canvas in custom-built, cubbyhole-styled cabinets,
- much like library books, designed to contain the
- 14 products in the smallest-possible space. I would like
- to call your attention to MacPherson's No. 1 picture.
- 16 This shows the traditional way that canvas was
- 17 merchandised.
- 18 I would also like to call your attention to
- 19 the second picture, which is not labeled, which is a
- 20 photograph taken of one of Asel Art's locations in
- 21 Dallas, Texas, yesterday. I think what it
- demonstrates is that this is not a very appealing way
- 23 to merchandise.
- 24 At the newly established art store, the two
- 25 managers decided to try something revolutionary in the

- early 1990's. They displayed stretched canvas on
- 2 shelves with the surface side facing out, and I'll
- 3 call your attention to faced-out merchandise in
- 4 MacPherson's No. 2. This is an example of what the
- 5 new merchandising looks like and what the customers
- 6 would face if they walked into a store like the Art's
- 7 Stores at the time.
- 8 And following the principles of long-
- 9 established retail merchandizing, they began to sell a
- 10 range of products and quality offerings, meeting the
- 11 needs of hobbyists as well as the professional artist.
- 12 Picture No. 3, Mac No. 3, is just kind of a
- 13 continuation of that same concept, retailers doing it
- in their own unique ways.
- 15 Although this merchandizing approach took
- infinitely more space, the results were dramatic,
- 17 "draw-matic." For some reason, creative people are
- inspired when they see rows of white surfaces
- 19 beckoning them to express their inspirations. This
- 20 initial idea turned into a full-blown program with
- 21 stunning results. Generally, canvas sales rarely
- 22 exceed 5 percent of a store's art supply sales. The
- 23 magic that these guys created resulted in their canvas
- 24 sales topping 15 percent of the entire store sales,
- while generating additional sales of materials and

1	implements	needed	to	cover	the	canvas.	And	that's	no	ot

- 2 always paint and brushes. There's lots of things that
- 3 can go on canvas.
- 4 How is this possible? The trick to this
- 5 program is that it gets consumers to buy canvas on
- 6 impulse, in addition to what they came to the store
- 7 originally to buy.
- 8 As with the growing sophistication of the
- 9 wine industry in the 1960's, this focus on the
- 10 painting surfaces category in the mid-1990's spawned a
- 11 new generation of discerning canvas consumers
- demanding much more to choose from in canvas styles
- and qualities. And I would like to point out all of
- 14 the array of stuff. We bought this, literally, all in
- the D.C. area yesterday, just to show you. Each
- 16 product that I'm showing here represents, and I would
- 17 be happy in the question-and-answer period to go over
- 18 any specifics that you might want to hear about, but
- 19 they are all very different, and they are perceived
- very differently, and they are bought by very
- 21 different customers.
- 22 Leading the charge of new product innovation
- was the San Francisco canvas manufacturer,
- 24 Masterpiece, who is here. Examples of these new,
- 25 specialty niches for painting surfaces are air brush,

1	portrait, archival, museum, digital printing, home
2	decor, and more. Manufacturing companies on the
3	lookout for these new segments suddenly had many more
4	selling options. The result of all of this activity
5	is an explosion in the sales of all painting surfaces.
6	So what was our experience with Tara in
7	relation to the market trends? For over 25 years, we
8	were a loyal customer. We paid our bills on time,
9	constantly promoted their products, jumped on new
10	items, and gave them large orders, and I hope you will
11	ask me later on about some of the allegations that
12	they made about the reason for their firing us.
13	Our decision to import canvas from China was
14	never meant to displace Tara or Masterpiece canvas.
15	The amazing program that the Art's Stores created had
15 16	The amazing program that the Art's Stores created had the potential for turning around years of sales
16	the potential for turning around years of sales
16 17	the potential for turning around years of sales declines in art material retail stores, and we never
16 17 18	the potential for turning around years of sales declines in art material retail stores, and we never gave up on trying to find a way to benefit our
16 17 18 19	the potential for turning around years of sales declines in art material retail stores, and we never gave up on trying to find a way to benefit our customers.
16 17 18 19 20	the potential for turning around years of sales declines in art material retail stores, and we never gave up on trying to find a way to benefit our customers.  We had tried for years to enlist Tara's
16 17 18 19 20 21	the potential for turning around years of sales declines in art material retail stores, and we never gave up on trying to find a way to benefit our customers.  We had tried for years to enlist Tara's cooperation. In the year 2000, a full 10 years after

build on the power of a complete and varied selection

25

- of painting surface products. We felt that much of
- the high-end and specialty ranges should still be
- 3 sourced in the U.S.
- 4 From the outset, we were very open about the
- 5 rationale and intentions for this program with our two
- domestic suppliers, Tara and Masterpiece. We saw our
- 7 small product offering as a fresh way for our
- 8 customers to grow their business while, at the same
- 9 time, promoting the value and quality of U.S.-made
- 10 brands. We continually coached our sales force in the
- 11 nuances of this vision, and in no instance did we ever
- 12 encourage customers to reduce, eliminate, or replace
- 13 Tara or Masterpiece with our China-made, Art
- 14 Alternatives canvas.
- 15 Our view expressed continually to our
- 16 customers was the more style, varieties, shapes,
- 17 sizes, everything, and brands that you display, the
- 18 more you will sell. Our customers bought into the
- 19 concept big time. As proof, we often sold Tara,
- 20 Masterpiece, and Art Alternatives in the same
- 21 shipment.
- 22 We made a concerted effort to partner with
- Tara to increase our customer sales volume of art
- 24 canvas. In 1990, at the Hobby Industry Convention, I
- approached the senior management team of Tara for the

1	first	time	to	share	the	story	of	Art'	s	Stores'	canvas
---	-------	------	----	-------	-----	-------	----	------	---	---------	--------

- 2 program and to try to develop ways that we could co-
- develop this plan for others to benefit from. We were
- 4 unsuccessful in persuading Tara management that this
- 5 new marketing approach represented a dramatic
- 6 opportunity, and I can see why today, listening to
- 7 their approach, which is entirely, we make the
- 8 product, we make an excellent product, and people buy
- 9 it.
- 10 Nevertheless, when we found an alternative
- and began selling our own line in 2001, we continued
- our support of Tara. Astonishingly, and despite
- repeated supportive letters to MacPherson's, Tara
- lashed out at the end of 2003 by firing us on only 24
- 15 hours' notice. Tara claims in the petition that its
- 16 termination was the result of declining sales.
- 17 Ironically, the largest part of the decrease was due
- 18 to Tara's increased sales directly to customers who
- 19 had previously bought Tara from us.
- 20 Prior to our cancellation by Tara, our
- 21 product selection in Art Alternatives had been very
- 22 narrow and targeted to be compatible with the
- 23 multisourced, multibrand strategy that we had laid out
- from the beginning, which required sourcing from U.S.
- 25 manufacturers. In the first half of 2004, our sales

- of imported canvas increased dramatically after Tara
- dropped us, primarily because importing was the only
- 3 viable way for us to replace the lost sales due to
- 4 their control of the market.
- 5 Before our cancellation, we had needed only
- 6 a sampling of sizes and styles from our foreign source
- 7 to supplement our U.S.-produced offerings. It is also
- 8 our belief that, starting in 2002, virtually all of
- 9 the stretched canvas product that Tara shipped to our
- 10 warehouse in Reno, Nevada, was made in Mexico. The
- invoicing to us made no distinction between U.S. made
- 12 and Mexican produced.
- Can some of the sales decline they have
- 14 reported in the U.S. be attributed to their own shift
- in Mexican production? When Tara fired us in 2003,
- our canvas purchases from them were nearly a million
- and a half dollars. We still wonder how dropping us
- 18 could help Tara's declining sales performance. What
- 19 was their strategy for making up the lost sales? Many
- in our industry have concluded that this was a more
- 21 emotionally motivated reaction than a rational, well
- thought out business decision.
- 23 Many of our loyal customers, some who were
- 24 buying Tara canvas from us, others who were buying
- direct from Tara, were so outraged by Tara's action

1	that they were very willing to examine any option that
2	replaced or diminished Tara's place in their stores.
3	After Tara dropped us, we significantly
4	increased our selection and purchases from U.S.
5	producer Masterpiece Artist Canvas. One of the few
6	remaining regional producers of canvas, Masterpiece is
7	located in San Francisco, in perhaps the most
8	expensive labor and commercial real estate market in
9	the United States.
10	The fact that we replaced Tara's significant
11	role in canvas marketing with similarly high priced
12	products from the U.S. producer Masterpiece
13	underscores two key points.
14	First, if the canvas is the commodity that
15	Tara claims, why is one U.S. producer doing poorly
16	while another is doing well, even as imports from
17	China are increasing?
18	The explanation for these two wildly
19	different results is found within Tara's approach to

Second, as I discussed previously, lower quality ranges are as important as premium quality and specialization to satisfy the very needs of the consumer. Products must be offered at many different quality and price levels.

the market, not imports from China or any other place.

1	As much as Tara would like to pin the blame
2	for its problems on unfair practices by Chinese
3	suppliers, it inflicted these wounds on itself by
4	unilaterally refusing to sell me and failing to see
5	and capitalize on the opportunities in the market.
6	When you own a large share of the market, as
7	Tara does, there is a huge temptation to put all your
8	energy in defending that position rather than building
9	the market. Unfortunately for Tara, the art market
LO	has rebelled at Tara's market dominance and
L1	stagnation.
L2	Over the last ten years, this product
L3	category has been redefined. From the first signs of
L4	an upward trend until now, Tara's response has been
L5	reactionary rather than adaptive or nurturing.
L6	I would like to make one additional
L7	observation about the retail art supply world which
L8	differs a little bit from Mr. Cicherski.
L9	Even the smallest stores carry thousands of
20	different products made by hundreds of manufacturers.
21	Each of these suppliers has minimums for both
22	individual products and for the total order. Ordering
23	directly from suppliers like Tara generally offers a
24	store better pricing, but also requires significantly
25	more storage space and inventory investment.

1	To meet these minimums, stores who buy
2	direct will let their stocks run down before ordering
3	Because distributors like MacPherson's offer a full
4	basket of art supplies from a nearby warehouse, our
5	customers can purchase fewer canvases more frequently
6	and still receive free freight.
7	Free freight is a huge factor for the small
8	retailers due to the high cost of shipping such a
9	bulky product as canvas. This averages 10 percent or
10	more of the delivery cost. In addition, our ability
11	to warehouse canvas as needed with free freight is an
12	enabling factor for smaller retailers to carry a
13	larger array of canvases.
14	The combination of Tara's inflexible
15	policies and cutting us off has isolated them from an
16	important customer base. This is in contrast to our
17	quick response, just-in-time system that keeps the
18	small independently owned store customers satisfied
19	with better in stocks while strengthening their
20	critical cash flow.
21	This convenience benefits all our suppliers
22	and is the core of the service we provide. When Tara
23	fired us, it hurt its own ability to sell by limiting
24	the options of many of the mom and pops who rely on
25	this service. This is one reason why any of our

1	customers	that	bough	t Tara	canvas	through	us	reacted
2	so negativ	vely v	when we	e were	fired 1	by Tara.		

3 I'd like to read an excerpt from the letter 4 sent to Tara in January 2004, right after we were fired by a customer in Kansas that concretely 5 illustrates this point. It reads, "I was told that 6 your objection with MacPherson's has been that you 7 feel that they have been essentially competition to 8 9 you by selling their less expensive canvas. 10 carry their cheaper canvas next to your canvas, but it hasn't seemed to interfere with sales of Frederick's 11 The students and professional artists who 12 canvas. want to work on inferior canvas choose the 13 14 MacPherson's brand of canvas rather than going to my competition to buy it. And those who recognize 15 quality purchase your products from us. If anything 16 17 else, our Frederick's canvas sales have increased with the infusion of MacPherson's brand because some people 18 19 actually buy both. With all of this in mind, I am 20 sitting here wondering what to do. Do I really want to pay the huge freight bills from Frederick's 21 relating to my canvas consumption? Do I want to try 22 23 and use the other distributors who can't efficiently 24 deliver product to me in a timely manner? Or is it time to start looking for a different brand of canvas 25

- to replace my Frederick's brand? I am honestly
- 2 perplexed. I must say I am also perplexed at your
- decision concerning MacPherson's because as a business
- 4 decision it seems to have only created animosity and
- 5 problems for retailers like myself who have probably
- 6 purchased your products for years but need fast and
- 7 inexpensive means to deliver it to me such as
- 8 MacPherson's has provided. With that in mind, I ask
- 9 respectfully that you reconsider your decision
- 10 concerning using MacPherson's as a distributor for
- 11 your product. Sincerely, Penny A. Colors, the Kansas
- 12 State Student Union Bookstore."
- 13 And I would just like to make one final
- 14 quote that I took earlier today and that is "Poor
- 15 Chinese canvas ultimately leads to greater sales in
- 16 Tara." Bill Cicherski, Azel Art.
- 17 Thank you.
- 18 MR. MAREK: Good afternoon, Mr. Carpenter
- 19 and commission staff. My name is Alan Marek and I am
- the director of importing for Michael's, which
- 21 includes canvas as well as other arts and crafts
- 22 materials.
- 23 Michael's is a unique arts and crafts
- retailer, serving over 800 communities throughout the
- United States, employing in excess of 38,000

- 1 Americans. As a retailer for arts and crafts from the
- 2 hobbyist to professional artist, our line of products
- 3 include a wide range of artist canvas. It is my
- 4 understanding that we are the single largest purchaser
- of artist canvas from Tara and this continues to be
- 6 the case, even after our purchases of canvas from
- 7 China.
- 8 My testimony will cover three issues:
- 9 first. my role in procuring artist canvas from China
- and the reason for buying; second, how artist canvas
- 11 made in China fits into our retail sales strategy in
- 12 relation to our purchases and the sales of Tara made
- 13 canvas; and, third, the role of price in the market,
- both for our purchases and sales at retail.
- 15 My chief responsibility for Michael's is to
- 16 identify production capability for arts and crafts
- 17 materials that are consistent with our retail
- 18 philosophy. This involves attending trade fairs to
- 19 first identify such products and manufacturers. When
- 20 I identify a potential product for Michael's, I then
- visit the factory. We are a large enough buyer to
- 22 allow us to buy directly from the manufacturer and
- this gives us more control over the quality, the
- 24 product and the packaging.
- 25 My first encounter with Chinese canvas was

- 1 at the Canton fair in late 2002. I saw canvas from at
- 2 least five suppliers. Several of these suppliers were
- 3 showing Phoenix-produced canvas in their booths, so
- 4 Phoenix appeared to be a major and reputable
- 5 manufacturer. I then arranged a visit to their
- factory in China because I need to ensure that our
- 7 source of supply has the capacity to meet Michael's
- 8 requirements regarding quality and volume.
- 9 To ensure quality, we first send sample
- 10 products to an independent testing lab to evaluate the
- 11 product against specifications and protocols we have
- 12 provided to the lab.
- Buying direct from the factory gives us more
- 14 control over the product itself. We can provide our
- 15 specifications to the manufacturer, changes to the
- 16 product can be made if necessary, and we drive the
- 17 packaging, aesthetics and marketing.
- 18 How the product is presented on the shelves
- 19 to our customers has a direct impact on retail sales,
- 20 so control at the manufacturing stage is important to
- 21 us. Ultimately, we contract direct production that
- 22 provides us with more flexibility and control than we
- 23 otherwise would have were we to purchase exclusively
- 24 from Tara. This allows us to differentiate products
- 25 to our customers.

1	Once we were satisfied that Phoenix could
2	meet our requirements, we decided to import from
3	China. Our purchases from China were for three SKUs:
4	two different 16 by 20, a single and double pack, and
5	an 18 by 24 side stapled canvas. These canvases are
6	at our opening price points and we consider them to be
7	a driver for sales of other art products.
8	In fact, contrary to what you've heard from
9	Tara, this is exactly what occurred. We have found
LO	that our sales for these canvases has grown
L1	significantly when we offered and promoted them at
L2	attractive price points and this volume growth would
L3	likely not have been attained at higher price points.
L4	If as Tara claims price is the only factor
L5	driving a purchase decision, either ours or our
L6	consumers', we would sell only the lowest priced
L7	canvas available to us, whatever the source. Yet this
L8	is not the case.
L9	Michael's continues to sell Tara's red label
20	and creative edge canvas in its retail outlets, as
21	well as our canvas imported from China.
22	Some customers buy only Tara canvas, some
23	buy only our imports, and some customers buy both. In
24	addition, neither is it the case that customers that
25	buy only the lower priced canvas necessarily did so

- instead of a Tara red label or creative edge canvas.
- While this may have occurred, Michael's has
- 3 experienced significant sales growth by offering and
- 4 promoting our imported China canvas at the lower price
- 5 point.
- Thus, it is probable that much of the
- 7 increase in our sales of imported canvas are sales
- 8 that would not otherwise have been made at higher
- 9 price points. In other words, much of our import
- 10 volume did not displace Tara's red label or creative
- 11 edge sales, but in fact were incremental sales.
- 12 Indeed, 75 percent of our total sales of canvas in
- 13 2004 were sourced from Tara.
- 14 Tara may claim that their business with
- 15 Michael's has decreased, but during 2004, Michael's
- implemented an automatic replenishment inventory
- 17 management system which reduced purchases and
- 18 inventories. The reality is that out the door retail
- 19 sales of Tara's Frederick's brand canvas has grown in
- 20 excess of 15 percent during 2004.
- It is my understanding that Michael's will
- 22 continue to be a major purchaser of domestic canvas
- 23 even as we continue importation of artist canvas from
- 24 China.
- 25 Thank you.

1	MR. KANTER: Good afternoon, Mr. Carpenter
2	and commission staff. My name is Harvey Kanter and
3	I am the president of Aaron Brothers. Aaron Brothers
4	is a frame and art retail store with 165 stores in 11
5	states, including Maryland and Virginia. However, our
6	major markets are in California and along the West
7	Coast.
8	Aaron Brothers now primarily sells canvas on
9	its own private label, rather than a manufacturer's
LO	label. Originally, we did purchase our core canvas
L1	program from Tara, but decided to move this program to
L2	China-produced canvas. In this regard, I will make
L3	two key points. First, because canvas generates sales
L4	of other art supply products, as Alan mentioned, in
L5	our retail stores we want to continue to purchase
L6	canvas that meets our high quality standards and at a
L7	price point that would allow us to conduct a
L8	promotional program for canvas to generate volume
L9	growth at retail and at a positive margin. Please
20	note it is not just about price.
21	I would ask you to look at picture 1 and
22	picture 2. These are both pictures from our store
23	with respect to the impact we made of creating an
24	inspirational impact with the customer. In both
25	cases, it is not about price. We actually only

Т	promote the core canvas program twice per year.
2	It is important for the commission to
3	understand that to implement our strategy Aaron
4	Brothers first approached Tara. Tara struggled to
5	provide consistent quality and delivery and, further,
6	to provide us with the price-value combination that
7	would allow us to produce and execute our strategy.
8	This inflexibility forced us to look at
9	alternative sourcing. Tara may characterize this
LO	inconsistent quality due to effects of their
L1	production and to a reduction in price, but from my
L2	perspective Tara refused to recognize the sales volume
L3	growth opportunity created through the promotional
L4	strategy which we were pursuing at retail. In fact,
L5	our assessment has been correct. Aaron Brothers'
L6	sales of canvas at retail has significantly increased.
L7	Unlike Azel's experience, our sourcing
L8	review showed China can make high quality product and
L9	deliver it on time. As a result, we produced and
20	introduced our private label program which is at a
21	higher quality level and allows us to maintain our
22	margins, affording us the ability to promote which has
23	driven significant growth in retail sales.
24	My second point, I believe that most of the
25	canvas we purchased from Tara was actually produced in

- 1 Tara's Mexican production plant.
- 2 As I mentioned, Aaron Brothers' major market
- 3 is in California and shipping from Mexico to
- 4 California reduced costs for Tara. To my
- 5 recollection, Tara had moved some of its production to
- 6 Mexico some time in 2002. Tara says in its petition
- 7 that it was forced to move because of impact of
- 8 competition from China, but this makes no sense. As
- 9 imports from China were not significant in the U.S.
- 10 until much later, in 2004. Rather, it is my belief
- 11 that Tara's motivation was to lower costs, both
- 12 manufacturing and freight, which make great sense
- 13 based on our significant sales growth which is a
- 14 result of our promotional strategy and has
- 15 successfully enabled us to compete in the market and
- 16 grow our business significantly.
- 17 Thank you very much.
- 18 MR. URNES: Good afternoon, Mr. Carpenter
- 19 and commission staff. My name is Eric Urnes. I am
- the general manager of ColArt Americas. ColArt's
- 21 experience differs somewhat from what you've heard
- 22 from the other witnesses today. First, we are a
- 23 European-headquartered company with our primary
- 24 product being artist paint, not canvas. We are the
- 25 world leader in artist paint and can trace our

- 1 heritage back more than 208 years.
- 2 Second, our experience with Chinese canvas
- in the U.S. market has been relatively limited until
- 4 recently. Nonetheless, I believe I can offer some
- 5 useful perspective based on our position in the
- 6 market.
- 7 Our experience in Europe is useful because
- 8 it's real world proof that the demand for canvas by
- 9 consumers at the retail level is highly responsive to
- increased promotion and selection.
- 11 Sales have increased dramatically to
- 12 consumers who would normally not be buyers of canvas.
- 13 Examples of these new consumers are moms of school-age
- children, Cub Scout leaders, young professionals
- 15 decorating their starter apartments, as you may have
- 16 seen on "Trading Spaces" on the television here in the
- 17 U.S.
- 18 Our experience in Europe over the past few
- 19 years demonstrates to us that making some canvas more
- 20 broadly available at lower price points generates an
- 21 explosion in demand for canvas at these price points.
- 22 As an example, if we look at our canvas business in
- 23 Germany, it more than doubled last year. And in
- 24 response to some of the comments made by Petitioner,
- we also see that the demand for paint has also grown

1	significantly, both in the U.S., but even more so in
2	Europe where the canvas explosion is probably a year
3	or two ahead.
4	Our experience has also shown that the sales
5	of these low price point canvases generally have not
6	resulted in declining sales for high quality or
7	branded canvas sold at higher price points. In many
8	European markets, we have seen stable demand for
9	European manufactured and more highly priced canvas.
10	ColArt has a joint venture manufacturing
11	partner in China which produces artist canvas to
12	ColArt specifications which was recently launched in
13	the U.S. market under our Windsor Newton brand,
14	recognized as a premium quality canvas.
15	Our experience in Europe led us to the
16	conclusion that we could enter the U.S. markets with a
17	recognized brand sold at good price points could
18	generate additional demand. We were looking to grow
19	the market. Our strategy was based primarily on
20	market growth, not taking sales away from other canvas
21	suppliers. We wanted to leverage Windsor Newton's
22	extensive experience in making high quality artist
23	supplies and launch a higher end product in this fast

growing category.

24

25

Because we also sell paints and other artist

Heritage Reporting Corporation
(202) 628-4888

1	supplies,	we	have	seen	that	higher	canvas	sales
---	-----------	----	------	------	------	--------	--------	-------

- whether it's our canvas or other people's canvas,
- drives the sales of paint and art-related accessories.

4 The artist materials industry has been quite

5 a challenging business due to very limited growth over

6 the past few years. The explosion of canvas sales has

7 been one of the most exciting developments for our

8 industry in the past ten years.

The fact that more people paint on canvas than ever before has generated a much needed boost for the overall artist materials industry. In the past, we have worked with Tara, but it was always difficult as they were inflexible. If you look at our factory opening in China, it actually happened a long time after we stopped cooperating with Tara. When we launched our Windsor Newton canvas range earlier this year, we did not approach Tara because we wanted to have much better control over the production process, the product specifications, formulations, quality control and logistics.

Our impression is that Tara's historically dominant position in the market has led them to prefer the status quo with regard to working with retailers or other non-competing manufacturers in many ways.

25 Thank you.

1	MR. KLETT: Good afternoon, Mr. Carpenter,
2	commission staff. My name is Daniel Klett. I'm an
3	economist with Capital Trade, Inc., testifying on
4	behalf of certain respondents in this investigation.
5	The previous witnesses described the U.S.
6	artist canvas market and competitive dynamics with
7	respect to Tara. I will briefly address four points.
8	First, Tara has asserted that its decision
9	to move part of its canvas manufacturing process to
LO	Mexico was due to competition from canvas imports from
L1	China. However, official U.S. import data show that
L2	imports from China were at very low levels prior to
L3	2004.
L4	As you can see from Chart 1, which is a bar
L5	graph from 2000 to 2004 representing imports from
L6	Mexico, imports from Mexico have been significant
L7	since at least the year 2000, when they were valued at
L8	over \$2 million. Imports from Mexico then grew
L9	significantly, nearly tripling in value by 2003.
20	Thus, any shift by Tara to Mexico occurred well before
21	Chinese canvas became a factor in the market. Given
22	the lag between when business decisions are made and
23	when they are fully implemented, Tara's decision to
24	relocate some of its canvas manufacturing to Mexico
25	had to have occurred well before imports from China

were a factor in the U.S. market.

Tara's own statements confirm this. In a

fall 2004 article in Art Affairs magazine, Michael

Benator of Tara stated that the consolidation of its

production and distribution facilities, including an

expansion of its Mexican operations was "a process

started two years ago" or 2002.

I also found it perplexing that on the one hand Tara indicated it switched to Mexico because of increased competition from China in 2003, but also indicated that it had a surge in orders from coalition members in 2003, in canvas orders from our coalition members. Given the discrepancy between the import data, this statement and Mr. Benator's testimony this morning that imports from China was the only reason for shifting to Mexico, the commission staff should ask Tara for more detail regarding the shift to Mexico including contemporaneous internal documents relating to this business decision and particularly their most recent expansion in the 2002-2003 period.

Second, you've heard testimony about how the availability of artist canvas from China at an attractive price point combined with innovative marketing has increased overall demand for artist canvas and has grown the market. Mr. Urnes testified

- 1 to his experience with demand growth in the European
- 2 market. Using official Chinese trade statistics,
- 3 Chart 2, which is a bar chart from 2000 to 2004, shows
- 4 that China's exports of artist canvas from Chinese
- 5 trade statistics.
- 6 Export growth to Europe in particular has
- 7 been dramatic since 2000, exceeding the growth in
- 8 China's exports to the United States. So while
- 9 Chinese producers may be export oriented, Petitioner's
- 10 allegation that export growth will be directed to the
- 11 United States is misplaced.
- In addition, the data confirm our position
- that a significant component of any import growth from
- 14 China into the United States reflects a growth in
- 15 demand for China canvas, not a displacement of U.S.
- 16 production.
- 17 Third, I want to address how the commission
- 18 should review any financial data that Tara may provide
- 19 given publicly available information relating to Tara.
- 20 Tara's website shows that it produces non-subject
- 21 merchandise, including stretcher strips and unprimed
- 22 canvas that are sold rather than incorporated in the
- 23 subject product. Tara's U.S. sales also include
- 24 products that are at least partially produced in
- 25 Mexico, as their witnesses testified. For these

1	reasons, any financial information reported by Tara
2	may have required some allocations to the financial
3	data as kept by the company in the normal course of
4	business.
5	In addition, Tara testified of shifts to
6	Mexico in 2003. This would involve some costs and
7	it's unclear whether these costs would have been
8	expensed or capitalized and what the effects on their
9	domestic financial operations would have been.
10	The commission staff should follow up on
11	question 3-2 of the producer questionnaire and request
12	that Tara provide copies of its internal financial
13	statements as kept in the regular course of business
14	and from a comment made by Mr. Jee earlier today, it
15	appears that they have already made that request.
16	Finally, please refer to the last chart of
17	the package which are two pie charts and the intention
18	of this chart is to summarize what our witnesses
19	testified to just now.
20	Tara would have you believe that artist
21	canvas is a commodity with price the overriding factor
22	driving purchase decisions and that overall market
23	growth is limited. However, you have heard that the
24	canvas market is more complex with many more non-price

factors that differentiates canvas. These include

24

25

1	quality,	differences	in product	range,	the	adoption	of
2	innovativ	ve marketing	techniques	, respoi	nsive	eness to	

3 customers and the effect on small retail purchases of

4 differences in free freight policies and other

5 factors.

10

6 Regarding product differentiation, I'd just

7 like to note that Petitioner indicated this morning

8 that they've expanded the scope to include kits.

9 Although there are kits that are being imported, it's

my understanding from talking with our witnesses that

there are no kits now being produced in the United

12 States so at least with respect to those types of

products, there is little competition. It's also my

14 understanding that print canvas, which is produced by

15 Tara as well as other producers, is not imported at

least in any significant quantity from China.

17 The chart also demonstrates that our

18 witnesses see the opportunity for and indeed have

19 experienced a growing market for canvas through their

20 ability to procure Chinese-produced canvas for a niche

in the market that they have grown through innovative

22 marketing and at attractive pricing points.

23 Thank you.

24 MR. DOWERS: Good afternoon, Mr. Carpenter

and committee. My name is John Dowers. I'm the

1	president and CEO of Utrecht Art Supplies. We
2	currently operate 35 stores across the entire United
3	States, serving primarily student and professional
4	fine artists. One of our stores, in fact, is located
5	at 13th and I Street here in Washington, D.C. We
6	purchase from over 200 different vendors or suppliers.
7	Utrecht is located in Cranberry, New Jersey
8	and was founded in 1949 as a premier supplier of the
9	world's finest artist linen and canvas. We are not a
LO	direct importer of stretched canvas, but rather a
L1	purchaser of this product as a retailer through
L2	various vendors. Until the summer of 2004, Utrecht
L3	purchased it private label merchandise from Tara.
L4	The relationship between our company and
L5	Tara dates back to Utrecht's original owners and
L6	founders, the Golamerian family. Over these many
L7	years, Utrecht remained a loyal customer of Tara,
L8	which had become our prime vendor of stretched canvas.
L9	During the past 20 years, we had purchased their
20	canvas under Utrecht's private label and under Tara's
21	own brand. It is not an industry secret that Tara had
22	established itself as a dominant supplier of canvas in
23	the United States.
24	However, in recent years, Utrecht had become
25	increasingly troubled by Tarals declining quality with

- 1 respect to their product line and service.
- 2 Consequently, as the quality of other domestic and
- 3 imported products improved, we decided to move our
- 4 private label stretched canvas, stretched linens and
- 5 stretcher bar business to what we believe to be better
- 6 vendors.
- 7 I believe it would be helpful for me to
- 8 explain the shift of how it came about since in light
- 9 of our longstanding relationship with Tara it involved
- 10 considerable deliberation on our part.
- Between September 2003 and May 2004, we
- received an unusually high number of documented
- 13 customer complaints regarding Tara's product.
- 14 Specifically, the complaints noted poorly constructed
- 15 canvas panels, partially primed rolls of canvas as
- well as mislabeled goods that were sent in the
- original sealed factory cartons to the Utrecht
- 18 warehouse. We actually got some Windsor Newton
- 19 products in our boxes, which obviously creates a bit
- of a problem through our distribution channel.
- 21 We also received a call from an experience
- 22 artist who complained that their finished oil painting
- 23 was experiencing adhesions problem on the Tara canvas.
- 24 Utrecht maintained pictures of many of these
- 25 problems and we also documented test results showing

- 1 leeching of oil paint through the prestretched heavy
- duty canvas, stretcher bar warping and discoloration,
- 3 prime linen products showing loss of tension and a
- 4 rippling effect, as well as stretcher bar cross and
- 5 diamond braces, those are the pieces in the back that
- 6 help hold the larger sizes together, falling outside
- 7 their secure wrap.
- 8 I would also like to add that Azel's
- 9 president is lucky he didn't see the same quality
- 10 problems that we had seen and ours totaled in the tens
- of thousands of dollars.
- In September 2003, at the onset of a host of
- problems, Joe Flatley, our category manager and buyer
- 14 at the time, negotiated an agreement with Paul
- 15 Straquadine of Tara whereby Tara would extend a
- 16 .5 percent annual damage allowance to Utrecht.
- 17 This allowance was intended to address all the quality
- 18 inconveniences, both on Utrecht's private label
- 19 program and the branded goods it was purchasing from
- 20 Tara.
- Beginning in October 2003, we began
- 22 documenting the inconsistencies in quality, especially
- 23 those concerning our private label merchandise
- 24 supplied to us from Tara.
- Then, on October 8, 2003, Joe received an

1	e-mail from Paul that Tara had inexplicably changed
2	its mind and would not honor the agreement for this
3	damage allowance. Instead of offering the previously
4	granted allowance, a unilateral decision was made by
5	Tara to appoint a senior quality control director in
6	its warehouse with the hopes that he could eliminate
7	the unacceptable merchandise reaching our customers.
8	Despite this new appointment, Tara quality problems
9	continued.
LO	Then in November of 2003, Mike Stone was
L1	appointed category manager for Utrecht and replaced
L2	Joe Flatley. Tara, like all our vendors, was notified
L3	of his appointment by myself in a letter to the trade
L4	and yet Tara did not contact Mike for an extended and
L5	noticeable period of time, something rather unusual in
L6	my experience, usually they try to go see the new
L7	buyer and sell everything they possibly haven't been
L8	able to get in under the prior regime. This neglect
L9	only underscored the impression that Tara was
20	increasingly indifferent to Utrecht's business
21	concerns.
22	In December 2003, after continued

frustration triggered by Tara's non-responsiveness to

the quality problems and our belief that the Utrecht

brand was not getting the attention that it deserved,

23

24

25

- we requested a meeting with Tara's president, Michael
- 2 Benator, and gave them a detailed agenda of issues and
- 3 concerns and a work plan for helping to grow our
- 4 respective businesses.
- In January 2004, we met with Mr. Benator and
- 6 Mr. Straquadine at our facilities in New Jersey. Not
- 7 withstanding the issues raised by the way of a written
- 8 agenda, as I mentioned earlier, that we wished for
- 9 Tara to address in order to improve their
- 10 deteriorating business relationship with us, Michael
- and Paul barely skimmed the surface in addressing our
- 12 concerns.
- Specifically, we asked who was going to be
- 14 named our sales representative, at that point, it was
- 15 unclear, and how quality control was going to be
- improved. We also made suggestions for a coding
- 17 system to ensure that product could be better tracked,
- 18 specifically, detailed large quantities of damaged and
- 19 poor quality Tara merchandise that was clogging up the
- 20 inventory flow and disrupting our replenishment
- 21 system.
- 22 In addition, we showed Michael and Paul
- 23 examples of the defective product in our warehouse.
- 24 We went and took a walk out of the meeting room and we
- showed them mislabeled cartons, mislabeled canvas,

1	unauthorized substitutions on products, pinholes in						
2	the canvas, poor gesso application, and damaged						
3	merchandise. We also communicated our displeasure to						
4	Tara's saddling Utrecht with lower quality materials.						
5	Despite all the problems that we raised at						
6	this meeting, Tara made no improvements to address our						
7	concerns. What's more, in the meeting, Michael and						
8	Paul informed us that the base year for calculation						
9	our 2004 volume incentive, which is sort of the carrot						
10	that traditionally vendors use to help have you						
11	increase your volume, for Utrecht would be 2002 rather						
12	than 2003, the prior year. The normal industry						
13	practice is to base the current year incentive to the						
14	prior year as the base.						
15	Given the circumstances for our meeting,						
16	this sudden announcement was baffling and counter to a						
17	true partnership. Since our 2002 purchases from Tara						
18	were higher than our 2003 purchases, obviously tied to						
19	some of the quality issues I described, this meant						
20	that our bonus target for Tara's products was being						
21	set higher than we expected. Combined with the						
22	already existing quality problems, this unanticipated						
23	target left us even more exasperated with Tara than						
24	when we started the meeting.						
25	Each of these instances in isolation might						

1	be considered normal tensions between a buyer and a						
2	seller. However, I've been involved as a purchaser in						
3	a lot of other sectors and the cumulative effect of						
4	these factors led me to believe that Tara took Utrecht						
5	for granted as a customer. We had a serious cause to						
6	believe that the quality problems we were incurring						
7	would continue into the future. Quite simply, there						
8	was no indication to the contrary from Tara.						
9	Furthermore, Tara is not willing to						
10	entertain more innovative ways to assist us in growing						
11	our canvas market at retail, ignoring what we felt was						
12	a significant part of the written agenda provided to						
13	Tara well in advance of our meeting.						
14	After careful evaluation of the quality,						
15	reputation, service, pricing, product value, marketing						
16	programs and other factors I have described, Utrecht						
17	decided to shift its business from Tara materials.						

Utrecht's final decision was to divide purchases of our private label brand between a U.S.-based producer, Signature, which manufactures in Kansas City, and MacPherson's, the largest art materials distributor in the U.S. which imports

at an industry show in Denver, I notified Michael

Benator of our decision.

On May 26, 2004, in a face-to-face meeting

- 1 Utrecht's canvas from China and some of the product is
- 2 displayed behind us here.
- We also chose a U.S. company, Jack
- 4 Richardson out of Kimberly, Wisconsin for domestically
- 5 made stretcher bars.
- Additionally, we decided to purchase
- 7 stretched linen domestically from Signature. This
- 8 product had also previously been supplied to us by
- 9 Tara.
- 10 Over recent years, Utrecht worked very hard
- 11 to nurture its relationship with Tara, but Tara failed
- 12 to reciprocate. The Utrecht brand has always stood
- for value as the cornerstone of our business. The
- 14 declining quality and service provided by Tara did not
- 15 match their high prices and Utrecht had no choice but
- 16 to look for other suppliers who could deliver the
- 17 quality, service and value that we require.
- 18 In making this necessary business decision,
- 19 we secured sourcing from both domestic and foreign
- 20 manufacturers.
- 21 Having relied on its nearly dominant hold of
- the domestic canvas market for so long, it's my belief
- 23 that Tara began taking its customers for granted,
- 24 which led others, like Utrecht, to source elsewhere.
- 25 It is evident that in its filing and antidumping

- 1 petition Tara is attempting to make up for its poor
- 2 management decisions including failure to address
- 3 quality and service concerns with their longstanding
- 4 customers like ourselves, costing them sales and
- 5 future business. In short, this dumping case is
- 6 Tara's transparent attempt to force prior customers to
- 7 return to its product under the same arrogant regime.
- 8 Thanks for the opportunity to express our
- 9 views.
- 10 MR. GALLAS: That concludes our direct
- 11 testimony.
- MR. CARPENTER: Okay. Thank you, gentlemen,
- for your testimony. We appreciate your coming here.
- 14 We'll begin again with Megan Spellacy.
- 15 MS. SPELLACY: Good afternoon. Megan
- 16 Spellacy, Office of Investigators. I wanted to start
- off by first asking you to elaborate on the statement
- 18 you made in your opening statement regarding the niche
- 19 markets that you see in the artist canvas industry and
- 20 respond to what the Petitioners presented to us
- 21 earlier this morning.
- 22 MR. KLETT: I'll take the first cut at that.
- 23 I think our point generally is that there was an
- 24 opportunity to expand growth for sales of artist
- 25 canvas. And, as Mr. Stapleton indicated, this was a

- 1 combination both that resulted from -- or the
- 2 opportunity presented itself by virtue of offering
- 3 canvas using an innovative marketing technique at a
- 4 more attractive price point that would generate
- 5 growth. So generally that's, I think, our position
- 6 with respect to the niche market.
- 7 I think Mr. Stapleton can probably elaborate
- 8 on that point.
- 9 MS. SPELLACY: Yes. And if I may, if you
- 10 could elaborate -- and also keeping in mind the
- 11 conditions of competition, if you feel that the
- imports are targeting a certain section or if you
- 13 believe there is specialization within the artist
- 14 canvas market that imports are focusing. The
- 15 Petitioners indicated that they did not that to be the
- 16 case, that they did not believe that there are
- varieties of specialization within the artist canvas.
- 18 If you could comment on that as well, I would
- 19 appreciate it.
- MR. STAPLETON: Yes. I think what Tara's is
- 21 alleging, really, is that canvas is all one thing and
- from that simple view, it sort of makes sense, but
- 23 even way before the import canvas stuff started to
- 24 happen in this country there were a lot of specific
- 25 niches that were in place already, portrait canvas,

1	for instance, the smooth portrait canvas, was already					
2	in place. The linen canvas was sort of a predecessor					
3	of the more modern cotton canvas. There are different					
4	usages for the canvas that sort of spawned those in					
5	the first place. Our contention is that this					
6	marketing approach, that essentially took a product					
7	that the consumer in the past would have to wake up in					
8	the morning, decide that they had an inspiration that					
9	they wanted to express, knowing that they were going					
10	to drive down to the art supply store or the arts and					
11	crafts store that week some time to buy it, they knew					
12	exactly where to go in the store, really didn't need					
13	to have the product be displayed in any way that sort					
14	of grabbed them. And that was the way it was always					
15	done in the past.					
16	And so it was always kept this really narrow					
17	sort of product selection and the illustration that					
18	I had in MacPherson's number 1 photo shows this, that					
19	it was sort of the retailers thought that the more					
20	compact they could build that display the more they					
21	were going to be successful. And, by the way, you					
22	could put it interview he back of the store or even in					

What these guys in California discovered,

Heritage Reporting Corporation

Heritage Reporting Corporation (202) 628-4888

a back room, it didn't matter, the consumer knew what

they were going to be getting.

23

24

25

- and I think what we're seeing variations, if you go to
- the stores here within walking distance of the office
- 3 here, you'll see just what I'm talking about, that
- 4 they've made it prominent. You walk into Utrecht and
- 5 you see a wall of canvas in that store.
- 6 Well, people who walk into the store looking
- 7 for something else suddenly are seeing this
- 8 inspiration. That inspiration led to all kinds of
- 9 other things. We've got birch board being created
- 10 because it simulates what the old masters used to
- 11 paint on. You're seeing masonite being coated with
- 12 gesso. You're seeing increases in sales in paper
- canvas now. You're seeing an explosion in what's
- 14 going on and it isn't really just the paints and the
- 15 brushes. The "Trading Spaces" thing that Eric talked
- 16 about I think is really significant because that's
- 17 become a huge area. You can take little squares of
- 18 stretched canvas that previously were not really
- 19 offered in that size that were created by these
- 20 collaborations that were spawned by all this increase
- in business and those little squares can be made into
- 22 a big giant cube and all you have to do is paint them
- 23 with craft paint or house paint. And that's something
- 24 somebody who is not an artist, somebody who could walk
- into an art supply store and normally feel intimidated

- 1 would not feel intimidated. It led to a lot of other
- 2 things.
- When you sort of expose people to a much
- 4 bigger thing, they start asking for other things. Air
- 5 brush canvased. The shapes. We're going to be
- 6 introducing next year triangles. As you can see,
- 7 there's ovals there, but rounds and all kinds of crazy
- 8 shapes. This has created, I think, this process of
- 9 people wanting more. Giving them more, they want
- 10 more. And that's pretty much -- I hope that answers
- 11 the question.
- MR. KLETT: Ms. Spellacy, I'd just like to
- make one very short point. I think it needs to be
- 14 understood that when we talk about niche, we're not
- 15 talking merely about the physical properties of the
- 16 product, we're talking about the marketing techniques
- 17 as well.
- 18 MR. URNES: I would agree and I thought
- 19 I would just relay an example from certain markets in
- 20 Europe where we're talking about creating a new
- 21 category where they're actually rolling out canvas
- 22 together with the same type of branded paint into Home
- 23 Depot like shopping environments, so we're really
- 24 talking about accessing a completely new consumer base
- and you see all of this particularly in Germany much

- earlier than you do in the U.S. The source or the
- 2 supplier of reasonably priced canvas from the Far East
- 3 has enabled this explosion in market development. It
- 4 was interesting to listen to the VP of sales from Tara
- 5 in a sense trying to talk about this one gray blob of
- 6 market with no distinction and then he starts
- 7 referring to the canvas as the Rolls Royce and the
- 8 Bentley or the segmentations, so clearly in the minds
- 9 of Tara as well there is segmentation.
- 10 MS. SPELLACY: Okay. And I'm sure we'll
- 11 have more questions on domestic like product, but I'll
- leave that for some of my colleagues.
- 13 Let's see. I'd like to ask you if I can
- 14 follow up on some of the comments that several of you
- 15 made earlier.
- Mr. Marek, you mentioned that in 2004 your
- 17 store experienced 15 percent growth in Tara's product.
- 18 I'm assuming that that is by unit and I was
- 19 wondering -- and you may not have this information
- available today, which is fine, you can comment on
- 21 this later, if you can give a correlation for the
- 22 increase that they had in value of the product as well
- 23 so we can get an idea of not only how the units are
- increasing, but the value and how the product mix may
- 25 be affecting that.

- 1 MR. MAREK: Certainly. The 15 percent
- I referred to was in dollars, it was dollar volume,
- and I can certainly get that information for you and
- 4 supply it in our post-conference brief.
- 5 MS. SPELLACY: Okay. So I was incorrect.
- 6 You were referring to dollar value.
- 7 MR. MAREK: That is correct.
- 8 MS. SPELLACY: Okay. Thank you.
- 9 And also, Mr. Kanter, whether you can do it
- 10 now or in the post-conference brief, if you could
- 11 supply me detailed information on the difficulty you
- had with sourcing and quality with Tara that you
- 13 referenced in your testimony.
- 14 MR. KANTER: Yes. I can certainly. Two of
- 15 the points that John made relative to gesso and
- 16 actually the paint bleeding through and the holes were
- two of the key things, but we can follow up in more
- 18 detail.
- MS. SPELLACY: Okay. Thank you.
- MR. KANTER: And also relative to Allan's
- 21 comment on unit and dollar volume, I think it's worth
- 22 noting that we are obviously part of the same
- 23 corporation, Aaron Brothers' specific dollar volume
- 24 accelerated at a greater level than its unit volume,
- so I think that's an important point to note relative

- 1 to that.
- MS. SPELLACY: Also, I know that you've
- 3 mentioned this before and it seems that the Petitioner
- 4 agrees and if you have anything to expand on this,
- 5 again, in your post-conference brief, there seems to
- 6 be a consensus that the U.S. consumption of artist
- 7 canvas has increased in the last five years, if anyone
- 8 has anything different, otherwise, I'm going to take
- 9 that as an operating consensus.
- 10 And then, finally, just two more questions.
- I want to just give you an opportunity now and my
- 12 colleagues may have more specific questions, if there
- was anything about the samples that you brought in
- today that you wanted to highlight for us now?
- 15 MR. STAPLETON: Sure. [Off Mike.]
- 16 MR. CARPENTER: Could you try to bring your
- samples and bring it over to the microphone? I'm not
- 18 sure if the microphone will stretch that far.
- 19 MR. STAPLETON: Just as an example, this
- 20 canvas here represents sort of the old style, staples
- on the edge, pine wood, wood frame. This one happens
- 22 to be a canvas that is designed for portrait. It's
- 23 ultra smooth. But that's an example of the old style.
- 24 This one happens to be Tara.
- This one happens to be the deep edge style

- offered in a limited number of sizes. If it was
- 2 available, it was marketed to the fine art customers.
- 3 It is in this format, the Asian format, it's marketed
- 4 more to the home improvement type of customer, put
- 5 this on a wall, paint it with a very simple kind of
- 6 formula.
- 7 Noting, too, that the edge does not have any
- 8 staples on it, which opens up another option for
- 9 consumers, particularly the ones who did not intend to
- 10 buy canvas when they walked into the store. The ones
- 11 who came into the store wanting to have canvas
- 12 typically envision having a frame around it. These
- 13 canvases don't require that, so you can paint the
- 14 edge, you can leave it plain, put it in a frame,
- 15 you've got all kinds of options that you can do with
- 16 that.
- 17 This is another example of a different depth
- 18 of molding. It just creates more of a dimension, less
- of a dimension than this. In this case, the side is
- 20 paintable.
- I'd just like to point out, too, there are
- three methods by which canvas is attached to the
- 23 frame. The one I showed you first of all was the one
- 24 with the staples on the edge. That one is the old
- 25 style. Again, it's not quite as flexible in terms of

- 1 how you would finally put it up on the wall.
- The remaining two, and I don't know whether
- 3 we have -- you see that they're both paintable edge,
- 4 but this one is stapled on the back as opposed to the
- 5 spline system was described by the Tara people.
- 6 Again, this kind of look is really targeted
- 7 to the non-serious artist. It's designed to look
- 8 great and look sharp for all kinds of purposes, but
- 9 it's not really -- the process is really different.
- In the case of this particular canvas, this
- illustrates that this style doesn't look quite as
- 12 good, but this is this in a strange sort of way, this
- is a super premium canvas. This is Utrecht's super
- 14 premium. It has a hardwood frame. It has seven and a
- 15 half ounce duck canvas on it, triple primed, ultra
- smooth for the discriminating artist.
- 17 And I've listened to the sales pitches in
- 18 the stores about the differences between these two.
- 19 Serious artists will like this. Even though it
- doesn't look as good, serious artists are going to
- 21 like this. All right. Ultimately, you can pull the
- 22 staples out, whereas this one would be very, very
- 23 difficult to do. So it sort of opens things up.
- 24 MR. KANTER: I think it's of worth to note
- 25 that the Utrecht product that Frank was just referring

- 1 to and the difference between Utrecht's business and
- 2 Aaron Brothers, Utrecht is actually highly dedicated
- 3 to the professional artist and hence the product they
- 4 carry is very broad and includes that, whereas Aaron
- 5 Brothers is more oriented towards the hobbyist and
- 6 enthusiast, and it just continues to document, if you
- 7 will, the broad based applications and end uses is
- 8 quite large in scope.
- 9 MR. STAPLETON: This is a twist, actually,
- 10 I haven't seen. It appears that Tara is gradually
- 11 changing from side staples to back attached in one way
- or the other. This happens to be linen canvas, which
- is the old traditional style canvas that you see, the
- 14 brown material there. This one is framed for acrylic.
- 15 I wanted to call your attention to that
- 16 because that is another sort of unique category for
- 17 the very serious fine art painter. Somebody with a
- 18 lot of money.
- 19 And then I just wanted to point out
- 20 something because we talked about quality. One of the
- 21 things, quality was never really an issue for us when
- 22 we were buying from Tara because we were flowing a lot
- of product through and we had a great -- well, we
- thought we had a great relationship, so it wasn't a
- 25 big issue for us.

- 1 I'll pass this around, you should take a
- look at this. This is an example of a stretching
- 3 problem.
- 4 Now, Masterpiece in San Francisco is the
- 5 domestic supplier described. They've never had a
- 6 problem with stretching. This is a floppy canvas on
- 7 the inside. A consumer would not want to buy that.
- 8 That would have to go back because, as you can see,
- 9 it's caving in in the center. So I thought I'd show
- 10 you that just as an example.
- 11 There are different shapes that are coming
- out now, as I sort of talked about, and they are just
- one more twist. Those shapes, I can't imagine --
- 14 well, there are serious artists that would buy them,
- 15 make a construction out of them, but they really are
- 16 for somebody else.
- MS. SPELLACY: Okay. Thank you.
- 18 This is a question, I'm not sure how
- 19 relevant this actually is to your industry, but
- 20 I asked it earlier. Can you also maybe just point out
- 21 some of these different types of canvases that you
- 22 have here? I know you mentioned earlier that they all
- are kind of in one size for comparative purposes.
- When you talk about a store carrying a full
- line of products, what does that entail? I don't know

- if you recall what the Petitioner mentioned today.
- 2 Does that sound about right?
- Obviously, I think, Mr. Kanter, you just
- 4 mentioned that some stores are going to have slightly
- 5 different product lines given their consumers, but if
- 6 you could expand that.
- 7 MR. STAPLETON: In the photo of Azel Art,
- 8 you would see really two different styles. Now,
- 9 I don't know whether that represents the whole thing,
- 10 but they gave most of the space to two styles. One
- 11 was red label, which is the traditional depth, this is
- 12 a red label right here. And the other appears to be
- on the bottom shelf, the blue label, which is the
- 14 smooth canvas.
- 15 The old style store would definitely think
- that that was a complete selection. The new thinking,
- 17 the merchandising concept that was created by these
- 18 quys at the art stores, entirely different. What we
- 19 tell our customers, when we're marketing this program,
- 20 really, I heard this said by Tara and I really,
- 21 really, really want to dispute that because at no time
- 22 did we ever say to any of our customers that this
- 23 product that we're selling from Asia is the same or
- 24 has the label of Tara or any other American made
- 25 product.

1	It wouldn't make any sense for us to carry
2	all three of these manufactures from the U.S. if we
3	were trying to confuse somebody. There wasn't any
4	instance of that whatsoever.
5	I got diverted here. What was the question
6	again?
7	MS. SPELLACY: I'm sorry. I was just asking
8	about the definition of a full product line.
9	MR. STAPLETON: Oh, a full product line?
10	MS. SPELLACY: Yes.
11	MR. STAPLETON: Okay. So what happens is we
12	talked a retailer into this big, massive change which
13	is go from this cubbyhole thing which is tight space,
14	in the back, doesn't take up anything, it's a huge
15	decision for a retailer to say I am suddenly going to
16	expand the space to reflect the possibility that the
17	sales could move from 5 percent to 15 percent.
18	Because in theory if it had less than 5 percent
19	before, but you ought to be able to give the product
20	15 percent of the floor space. So you can't get them
21	to do that right away.
22	So what you say is take this small section
23	and MacPherson's picture number 2 illustrates kind of
24	the first step, which is carry a faced out selection

of stuff, but be ready to grow that into the next step

25

- 1 because what's going to happen to your consumers is
- you're going to start showing this stuff, people that
- 3 you would never imagine would buy it are going to
- 4 start buying it and they're going to want more. So
- 5 then you start expanding.
- That was the thought behind it.
- 7 So at that point, and I heard this last week
- 8 in a store, they wanted linen canvas, they had
- 9 expanded the store selection from the little cubbyhole
- 10 to the bigger selection and now they're starting to
- 11 get people asking for linen canvas. You never would
- 12 have had that in the past because the artist would
- have had it in their mind, that store is never going
- to have it because he doesn't have a very big
- 15 selection.
- 16 So it goes from there. We've added sizes
- and styles, the ovals, the rounds. It just is a
- 18 progression. The latest thing that I'm hearing about
- 19 and Paul was talking about it, too, is people wanting
- to paint on the old world style painting on wood
- 21 panels and that's becoming a category. That never
- 22 would have happened in the past.
- New York City is the only place, it's the
- 24 largest art supply market in the world, and that's the
- only place you would have found this stuff in the

- 1 past. Maybe in Paris or London. But you're seeing it
- in Portland, Oregon now and that has just -- this
- 3 whole concept has just led to -- and that's all people
- 4 talk about, is painting surfaces now, because they
- 5 really see it as something to drive their business.
- 6 So I hope that answers the question. You
- 7 can't just -- to be a complete store, you would have
- 8 everything. And many stores have the space to put out
- 9 pretty close to everything.
- 10 MS. SPELLACY: Okay. So if I'm
- 11 understanding you correctly, it sounds like there's
- 12 probably a very short list of what would be considered
- a full product line, but the possibility of adding to
- 14 that and expanding the marketing opportunities are --
- 15 MR. STAPLETON: And that's a moving target
- 16 because the full product line now really is different
- 17 from what it was last year. You could look at that
- 18 photo from Azel Art and say that's a full product
- 19 line, but really these discerning customers are coming
- in now, they wouldn't say it was, they would say, no,
- 21 no, you don't have rounds now? You don't have the
- 22 three-inch thick? I need that. I need the
- 23 super-sized stuff. We're selling a canvas that is 15
- inches by 60 inches. That's five feet tall. It's a
- crazy size, but we're selling a huge amount of it

- 1 because people can make a screen out of it, put hinges
- 2 on it and make screens out of it. So that sort of
- 3 thing you would have said in the past you're a
- 4 complete store if you don't have that, but now,
- 5 I don't know.
- 6 MR. DOWERS: I could maybe give some
- 7 specifics. Just, again, it would be specific to
- 8 Utrecht, but we carry about a hundred SKUs, canvas
- 9 SKUs, now. In the past, we carried about 50, so we've
- 10 more than doubled our assortment. Again, we saw a
- 11 trend clearly within the industry. Saw a lot of
- movement, lot of change. Said, wow, this is an
- interesting dynamic going on here, we need to be a
- 14 part of it and again challenged Tara, were not happy
- 15 with the results and some of the other issues that
- 16 I described earlier. Then they about doubled the
- 17 number of SKUs that we carried. We've seen a 35
- 18 percent increase in dollars over the last 26 weeks,
- 19 about a 25 percent increase in unit, a 35 percent
- increase in dollars, and a very significant increase
- in margin. And a lot of it has to do with that
- 22 impulse factor and offering lots of different shapes,
- 23 sizes, depths, and better communicating what the
- 24 different canvases are about because it can be a
- little bit daunting. So, we'll give you a rough idea

- of what a fine art store may carry that we certainly
- 2 carry.
- MS. SPELLACY: Okay. Thank you very much.
- 4 That's very helpful.
- Just one last question. I wanted to remind
- 6 you that we haven't yet received the foreign producer
- 7 questionnaire from Ningbo Two Birds. I don't know if
- 8 that's on it's way, but we would appreciate getting
- 9 that if at all possible.
- 10 Thank you.
- MR. CARPENTER: Mr. Rees?
- MR. REES: Thank you, and thank you,
- witnesses, for your testimony and coming all this way.
- I can't remember. You didn't actually come
- 15 from Europe though. Where are you based?
- MR. URNES: In New Jersey.
- 17 MR. REES: You're in New Jersey. Good. It
- 18 wasn't terribly far. Welcome.
- MR. URNES: Thank you.
- 20 MR. REES: Mr. Klett, you made the point,
- 21 and I'm probably wildly oversimplifying it, but
- 22 something to the effect that we see the increase in
- 23 imports from Mexico before you see a significant
- 24 presence of Chinese imports from the data and that
- therefore the shift to increased imports from Mexico

- 1 would seem to be something other than Chinese imports
- 2 driving that.
- 3 MR. KLETT: I think that's what I said. I
- 4 don't think that's an oversimplification.
- 5 MR. REES: Okay. No. I meant I'm
- 6 oversimplifying your argument. I don't mean your
- 7 argument is oversimplified. I'll leave that to the
- 8 other side.
- 9 Let me ask you this. How do you respond to
- 10 the Petitioners' point that well, why hadn't they gone
- 11 to Mexico 10 or 15 years ago when they bought the
- 12 Mexican plant? In other words, your focus, and
- 13 perhaps appropriately -- the parties will debate it --
- 14 is on let's say 2001 to 2004. What about 1990 to
- 15 2001?
- 16 If there weren't an increase then might
- there be any merit to their point that costs are not
- or that it's Chinese imports that explain --
- 19 MR. KLETT: Mr. Rees, I don't know why they
- 20 didn't.
- I mean, in fact I think they indicated that
- 22 they did make some shifts to Mexico as far back as
- 23 1990 when they discussed the history of their
- 24 participation or marketing or manufacturing in Mexico
- 25 earlier today. I think factually their point that

- they didn't make that shift earlier is just not
- 2 correct. I think they did.
- Number two, even if they hadn't made the
- 4 shift back through 1990, I can't say why they didn't
- or wouldn't have made the shift back then. All I can
- 6 say is that they are attributing the shift to China,
- 7 and it's pretty clear to me from looking at the data,
- 8 and I don't have the Chinese imports on the charts,
- 9 but if you look at the official import statistics
- 10 China was really not much of a factor in the market
- 11 prior to 2004.
- 12 If China was the reason, I would have
- 13 expected to have seen the decision to shift to Mexico
- in 2004 not prior to 2004, and the fact that they
- shifted in a big way apparently in 2002 or 2003, well
- 16 before China was even present in the market, I can't
- see the linkage between that decision and imports from
- 18 China regardless of what they did or didn't do back in
- 19 1990.
- 20 MR. REES: Thanks. Actually in terms of
- 21 your Chart 2 -- I think it was your chart. Maybe it
- was someone else's.
- MR. KLETT: That's my chart.
- 24 MR. REES: Right. Chart 2. Is it your
- opinion that the blue there, which indicates Chinese

- 1 exports of artists' canvas to the United States, that
- 2 the blue there reflected from 2001 to 2004, that the
- 3 volume reflected in this data that you've encapsulated
- 4 on this chart is significant?
- 5 MR. KLETT: In what years?
- 6 MR. REES: I'm sorry. Not the growth.
- 7 Well, all right. Let's start there. Growth and
- 8 volume between 2001 and 2004.
- 9 MR. KLETT: Between 2001 and 2004 the growth
- 10 is significant, but my point is that with respect to
- 11 Tara's decision to move to Mexico that decision
- 12 appears to have been made in terms of moving canvas or
- assembly to Mexico in a big way sometime in 2002, and
- in 2002 imports from China were it looks to be about
- 15 \$1 million, a very small part of the market.
- 16 So my point is that at the time the decision
- was made to move assembly to Mexico in a big way,
- 18 imports from China were not a big factor in the
- 19 market. Now, it's true that since that time imports
- 20 from China have increased, but my point is that at the
- 21 time the decision was made I do not see even from this
- data that China was a big factor in the U.S. market
- 23 for artists' canvas.
- MR. REES: Would you say based on this data
- 25 that the imports from China in 2004 were a big factor

- in the U.S. market, to use your words? I prefer the
- word significant.
- 3 MR. KLETT: Based on this data, and I don't
- 4 have all the information to look at the market to know
- 5 what the market share of this is because we don't have
- 6 I think full and complete information with respect to
- 7 what U.S. production is, for example, that this is
- 8 significant.
- 9 I think the key point and I think one of the
- 10 key points we were trying to make today with respect
- 11 to the growth in 2003 to 2004 was that I don't think
- 12 you can assume that if there was a market share
- increase consequent to this increase in volume from
- 14 China that that displaced U.S. production. I think a
- 15 large component of that increase was a creation in
- 16 market demand, not displacement of U.S. production.
- 17 MR. REES: Thank you.
- 18 We've heard a lot of testimony about the
- 19 significance of or the role that merchandising has
- 20 played in this market and in the growth of the market.
- I ask myself and I look at these pretty
- 22 photographs. I'm not an expert on merchandising, but
- 23 they convey your point. I ask myself is there any
- 24 reason that the product indicated in Aaron Brothers
- 25 Exhibits 1 and 2 or in MacPherson's 2 and 3 could not

1	be	U.	S.	product?
	$\mathcal{L}$	$\circ$	$\circ$	product.

- 2 MR. STAPLETON: From our standpoint --
- 3 MR. REES: Yes.
- 4 MR. STAPLETON: From the standpoint of our
- 5 getting into the canvas program, the introduction that
- 6 we had was a very, very narrow range in a sort of a
- 7 value category so we felt following, and it was
- 8 described I think by Paul Straquadine.
- 9 We felt that following the model that The
- 10 Art Store had created the retail prices were, you
- 11 know, in relationship to themselves, not necessarily
- 12 other products in the market, but that it was a
- 13 significant factor in inducing somebody who did not
- intend to come into the store to buy canvas to get
- 15 them to do it.
- 16 There were several factors, and one of those
- was merchandising. The other one was I'm not going to
- 18 say price because I'd quess discount against retail
- 19 equals price, but the more significant thing in that
- 20 was getting, and to take Barnes & Noble, 25 percent
- off of the bestsellers was a significant kind of
- 22 motivator.
- Our belief was that we were aiming at a
- 24 customer who was not going to buy canvas coming into
- 25 the store, and this is the way you kind of kneaded

- 1 them to do that. When it was all said and done, the
- 2 next price was very, very close to the price that most
- 3 retailers -- I don't know Asel's scanning policy, but
- 4 would be very close or equal to what that was.
- 5 You know, we originally approached this
- 6 thing from the standpoint of going to Tara and saying
- qee, let's work together on this thing. This is a
- 8 miracle what these guys have done at The Art Stores.
- 9 They created their own product with their own label
- 10 with a kind of a pricing structure that you could do,
- 11 you know, if you had your own label on it. There was
- 12 no interest in that.
- We're a distributor. We were never going to
- 14 get into manufacturing the products for ourselves. We
- 15 really needed to find a way to do this. It wasn't a
- burning priority because you can see it took 10 years
- before we actually moved from the idea to actually
- 18 getting something done, but we ruled out the U.S.
- 19 operations because of a number of factors, but the
- 20 main one was there was a lack of receptivity.
- 21 When the canvas from China came on board
- 22 basically that became a really sensible solution for
- 23 us because the flexibility of at least our experience
- 24 with the Asian suppliers is they're not rigid. They
- just say what would you like it to be? How would you

- 1 like it to be? We'll try something different. You
- 2 didn't like that? We'll do something new.
- If you looked at the sort of iterations we
- 4 went through from initial introduction to where we are
- 5 today, it was night and day almost so there really was
- a much more narrow approach that we had that led us to
- 7 want to deal with the American suppliers, but
- 8 basically failed. The Chinese suppliers were just
- 9 open arms.
- 10 We didn't explore a lot. Like I said, our
- 11 main business is really selling brand name art
- 12 supplies just-in-time to retailers that we serve
- 13 throughout the United States.
- 14 MR. REES: Okay. That's helpful. It still
- 15 leaves this question of you talked about the price
- 16 structure. They couldn't fit it into the price
- 17 structure.
- 18 Price is a magic word that you don't want to
- 19 use here or whatever, but I'm just wondering. Is the
- 20 problem that they were not capable of manufacturing
- 21 the product and other reasons, or I keep hearing, you
- 22 know, within the value structure or the cost scheme.
- 23 It's that part that I never don't hear that. That
- 24 always seems to play a role.
- I'm wondering. Is there anything, you know,

- 1 but for the price structure, the value, whatever term
- 2 people are most comfortable with? But for that, is
- 3 this stuff that the domestic industry can make and can
- 4 supply?
- 5 MR. STAPLETON: The experience that we had
- 6 was that Tara is the game; that they were not
- 7 interested, that they did not want to participate in
- 8 this thing.
- 9 I mean, our original idea that I expressed
- 10 to them in 1990 was we don't want to take on the
- 11 responsibility of this big, huge line so we really
- 12 need to have somebody sort of co-partner this thing
- with us. Would you be willing to do that?
- I described kind of what I described to you,
- and what they said was that doesn't really fit in our
- 16 plans. I mean, they were willing to undertake a
- 17 private label program for somebody like Utrecht or
- 18 Standard Brands Paint at the time or Aaron Brothers
- 19 because their volume was so significant that, you
- 20 know, they could sort of plot it out, but they weren't
- 21 really interested in saying okay, we don't know what
- it's going to be. We don't know where it's going to
- 23 go, but we're willing to give it a try with you.
- 24 They weren't willing to do that, so they
- 25 didn't really provide us any opportunity. The answer

- I guess is yes, they could do it if they wanted to.
- 2 They didn't want to.
- MR. REES: Okay. Let me follow up on
- 4 another point. You were mentioning quality. We've
- 5 heard discussion. Obviously we heard from a retailer
- 6 this morning who spoke glowingly of the quality of the
- 7 U.S. product and in fact was suggesting it's superior
- 8 to that of the product from China.
- 9 I think, Mr. Dowers and Mr. Kanter, we've
- 10 heard some testimony to the opposite effect. From
- 11 you, Mr. Stapleton, it's been more a message that the
- 12 quality wasn't really driving your decision making.
- 13 MR. STAPLETON: For the category that we
- 14 were aiming for, which was this -- you know, I have to
- 15 say that I don't think many -- I have conversations
- 16 like this all the time with retailers, and you can see
- 17 from listening to Mr. Cicherski. He still is back,
- 18 you know, in the time when you did it in a different
- 19 way. That's a pretty prevalent idea.
- 20 A lot of what I'm doing is proselytizing for
- 21 a concept, and that concept is really not understood.
- The idea that I had originally was a small value line
- 23 that is presented big that drives everything else.
- think the momentum that's happened, you know, by our
- 25 doing that -- you know, I won't take credit for the

- original idea. The original idea came from these guys
- in California, but that concept has really kind of
- 3 exploded, and everybody is doing some form of that.
- 4 MR. REES: Okay, but the message I'm getting
- from you is that the quality was not a driving force.
- 6 MR. KANTER: In that little, narrow thing
- 7 that we started with --
- 8 MR. REES: Right.
- 9 MR. KANTER: -- that was the driver of our
- 10 program.
- 11 MR. REES: Okay. Let me just put it the
- other way, and this is bluntly. Are you saying that
- the Chinese product is a better quality than the U.S.
- 14 product? Maybe it's an over simple question.
- 15 MR. KANTER: The reality is --
- 16 MR. REES: What's the reality? That's what
- 17 we're looking for.
- 18 MR. KANTER: We source the quality level
- 19 that we want, and the question becomes is the Chinese
- 20 market capable of producing that quality. The answer
- 21 to that question is yes.
- We have moved the majority of our program to
- 23 the factory that Alan referred to, and the quality has
- 24 been -- there's been a nonexistent issue with quality
- in terms of we inspect a certain package. To Alan's

- 1 point, we MTL test it regularly, and it meets our
- 2 specifications to the conversation they mentioned
- 3 prior to you, which was fill rate, delivery, almost
- 4 perfect.
- 5 The reality is that's a huge undertaking for
- a 165 store chain to roll the program overseas, and
- 7 this resource has been phenomenal. I'd say there is
- 8 no quality issue whatsoever. In fact, we improved the
- 9 spec. Frank showed you a couple examples in our
- 10 market for our target consumers. Some of the specific
- 11 specs we made to the art canvas itself, but that also
- 12 requires a certain level of expertise that that
- manufacturing is more than producing what our spec
- 14 requires.
- There is no quality issue whatsoever in our
- 16 overseas production that is currently in place, and
- 17 the interesting side on that is also because we have
- 18 two companies that both jointly had done business with
- 19 Tara -- one still does the majority with and one does
- 20 without -- we can compare and contrast a lot of what
- is happening and have the ability to move if we needed
- to, but we're not moving back because it's working
- very well.
- 24 MR. REES: That's helpful hearing your
- 25 experience with the Chinese product. I think you've

- 1 made the point then that the quality is a non-issue.
- 2 In other words, it's top quality. You're selling top
- 3 quality product --
- 4 MR. KANTER: It is top quality.
- 5 MR. REES: -- meeting all of the
- 6 specifications.
- 7 I guess my question is compared to the
- 8 American supply, that's one point. I hear it loud and
- 9 clear. Well made. Are you saying that American
- 10 quality is inferior?
- 11 MR. KANTER: No. It is a question of the
- 12 specific manufacturer. Masterpiece is in the room,
- 13 which I don't have personal experience with, but some
- of my colleagues do and have recognized that that
- 15 manufacturer is producing a higher level of output.
- 16 We do have specific experience with the Tara
- 17 product. My colleagues back at the office have a
- 18 great deal of track record, if you will, and we have
- 19 had experience with both inconsistent delivery and
- 20 specific quality issues, which already were being
- addressed but were not being addressed at the level
- 22 required.
- 23 While I wouldn't say it's a choice not to
- produce the quality required, it wasn't happening.
- Obviously John can talk to direct experience he had

- 1 most recently.
- MR. DOWERS: As far as quality goes, the
- 3 Chinese goods to Tara goods, yes. Just looking at our
- 4 returns that would pretty much state, you know.
- 5 It's in our best interest when it's got our
- 6 name on it to have the best quality product in our
- 7 stores, and we had tens of thousands of dollars of
- 8 RTVs with Tara that's documented. We have not had
- 9 that with Chinese goods.
- 10 As it relates to American made goods, you
- 11 know, we chose to source those domestically in a
- broader range in terms of some of the products that
- 13 Frank pointed out here. We've been very, very happy
- 14 with those, and it's shown up in our dollar sales and
- 15 our returns.
- 16 In our case, I'll let our numbers do the
- 17 speaking.
- 18 MR. REES: Thank you.
- 19 Mr. Marek, there was some discussion this
- 20 morning about this dynamic of direct importing and
- 21 whether and how that's influenced the marketplace in
- the last several years.
- 23 Mr. Stapleton came out and said gee, I don't
- see that from my perspective in my business that the
- growth, and he was speaking from his own perspective,

- but the growth in a business based on distribution has
- done exceedingly well in these last several years.
- 3 I'm wondering from your perspective. Has
- 4 there been some development where there's increasing
- 5 amounts of imports being imported directly? That is,
- 6 importing by companies such as your own where you
- 7 imported directly rather than go through an importer
- 8 or other distributor.
- 9 MR. MAREK: I can only speak for Aaron
- 10 Brothers and Michael's, and in the case of Michael's
- 11 75 percent of our product mix today is domestic, and
- 12 approximately 25 percent is not. In the case of Aaron
- Brothers, as Harvey testified, the majority, if not
- 14 all, of that product has been moved overseas for the
- 15 reasons that he brought up.
- I know that in competition like Jo-Ann's,
- which is another arts and crafts company, and A.C.
- 18 Moore, which is a second arts and crafts company, that
- 19 they have imported product in their store, but I am
- 20 not knowledgeable as to whether they're direct
- importing it from a factory or if they're buying it
- 22 from the importer.
- 23 MR. KANTER: Might I add something to add?
- 24 My experience both prior to Aaron Brothers, as well as
- 25 at Aaron Brothers, is both in what I would define as a

- branded retail environment.
- 2 Aaron Brothers is a company that we are
- 3 trying to actually enhance the brand retail aspect of
- 4 our business, and to do that requires several things.
- 5 Several key components are exclusivity of product.
- 6 It's all about the product you sell, so it could be
- 7 very well priced, but if the product isn't the right
- 8 product it doesn't matter.
- 9 So when you combine having to have the right
- 10 product and then exclusivity it requires very often
- 11 you to go to places which will produce the product you
- 12 spec. That is countered very often to a branded U.S.
- 13 retailer or, for that matter, an overseas retailer
- 14 because they're producing our product in almost a
- 15 contract environment.
- 16 Our direct import business has grown, Aaron
- 17 Brothers specifically. We expect it will continue to
- 18 grow as we continue to actually develop private label
- 19 exclusive product. With that obviously comes greater
- 20 pressure on when you develop something on your own you
- 21 unfortunately don't have the ability to talk with
- 22 anybody -- it's not selling; help me -- which is in
- 23 some respects a normal retail practice and so there is
- 24 a required margin because you then have to liquidate
- 25 the product all on your own.

1	The end result means you develop it on your
2	own, source it on your own, bring it on your own and
3	deal with it on your own if you're in trouble, which
4	ultimately requires more direct importing whether it
5	be direct from the Asian market or, for that matter,
6	even Europe or other communities.
7	We are specifically and with purpose
8	exploring other sourcing alternatives both in the
9	states, but also overseas.
10	MR. REES: Thank you.
11	Mr. Marek, it would be helpful, and it might
12	be most appropriate in any postconference brief, but
13	it would be helpful to have your perspective on the
14	utility, if we get the data, on making any comparisons
15	between product that you import directly versus the
16	selling price of the domestic producer.
17	Actually, you might not be in a position
18	even to have access to the data so I leave it to Mr.
19	Gallas to sort out, but I think, Mr. Gallas, you
20	understand. It would be helpful to explore if we have
21	the data that includes direct purchase prices, as
22	opposed to an importer's purchase prices and
23	importer's sales to a retailer.
24	What utility or what use, if any, should the
25	Commission make of the data regarding the purchase

- 1 price of a direct importer, if that doesn't come
- 2 completely out of left field?
- MR. GALLAS: We will certainly supply that
- 4 in our brief.
- 5 MR. REES: As I mentioned this morning, it's
- a phenomenon that I think the Commission has seen
- 7 increasingly in recent years and so any wisdom that
- 8 you can lend on that and can glean from your client in
- 9 terms of why a particular price, you might think it
- 10 makes a good comparison or does not make a good
- 11 comparison. That's welcome.
- MR. GALLAS: We'll be happy to supply it.
- MR. REES: Thanks. The last of my questions
- 14 really are these more technical variety that are
- 15 perhaps directed more to the lawyer than the others,
- 16 although he might need your input as he writes his
- 17 brief.
- 18 We would be interested in knowing how the
- 19 Respondents define the domestic like product. We
- 20 haven't heard.
- MR. GALLAS: I think we're of the same
- 22 accord as the Petitioners in their definition. The
- 23 only other point is Dan's earlier reference to we're
- 24 not sure about U.S. production of the kits.
- MR. STAPLETON: I think there's another

- 1 question that we had about something that Tara said
- 2 about bleached canvas.
- 3 Bleached canvas is imported as a value line
- 4 here, and they've basically said that they won't sell
- it so I'm not really sure whether that should be
- 6 included.
- 7 MR. REES: Okay. But as I understand it
- 8 now, your position at least here is the Respondents
- 9 aren't advancing a debate for preliminary purposes, in
- 10 any event, regarding the definition of the like
- 11 product proffered by the domestic industry, although
- there might be some refinement of that in your brief?
- Do I understand that correctly?
- 14 MR. GALLAS: That is correct. At this point
- for the preliminary that is correct.
- 16 MR. REES: Of course, it will be helpful to
- 17 see that in your brief. I'd appreciate that, even if
- it's just saying you're not going to dispute it.
- 19 Similarly on the issue of domestic industry,
- 20 how the industry ought to be defined, and if it's
- 21 simply that you agree for purposes of the preliminary
- on the Petitioners' definition that's fine as well,
- 23 but if you would please note that.
- 24 Lastly, and I forgot to ask this of the
- 25 Petitioners as well, but it's a purely legal issue.

- 1 If there's evidence that any member of the domestic
- 2 industry is a related party within the related parties
- 3 provision of the statute, imports, engaged in import
- 4 of subject imports during the period examined or the
- 5 other criteria that would satisfy the definition, I
- 6 would appreciate it if both sides could comment in
- 7 their brief on whether they think the related parties
- 8 definition is met.
- And, if so, whether they are advocating that
- 10 a particular member of the industry be excluded from
- 11 the domestic industry for purposes of the Commission's
- decision making in its preliminary phase of the
- 13 investigation.
- 14 MR. GALLAS: When we get the several missing
- 15 producers' questionnaires we'll be better able to
- 16 address that. Thank you.
- MR. REES: And that's why I put it that way.
- 18 Thank you.
- 19 That's all I have. Thanks.
- MR. CARPENTER: Ms. Bryan?
- MS. BRYAN: Thank you.
- I quess my first question would be for Mr.
- 23 Dowers. If I heard you correctly, it sounds like you
- 24 still source some American made canvas, just not Tara,
- and I guess my main question is why do you still

1	decide to source from those American sources? Is it
2	just brand recognition, or is there a quality issue?
3	MR. DOWERS: It's about half, so it's
4	significant. We use Signature out of Kansas City.
5	We really try to look at things sort of
6	across a range or a tier as you want to present them.
7	We saw that the domestic supplier was extremely
8	flexible as it related to some of the really creative.
9	We tried to stick with the 16x20 size here,
10	you know, to see the same thing or different things
11	across the same size, but there is a multitude of
12	different sizes that are fabulous that are very
13	inspiring, and that was one of the primary reasons.
14	There is also shorter lead time. There's no
15	doubt about that. There's a slightly higher comfort
16	level as it relates to using a domestic supplier. You
17	know, you can go down to Kansas City and see the
18	operations.
19	We also felt too that part of the thinking
20	was perhaps an underlying belief that using and being
21	wholly dependent on a single source supplier that was
22	dominant in the marketplace was a little bit
23	dangerous. You know, you're relying on them solely to
24	manage a category for you, and we like getting
25	different points of view. We do that in brush. We

- 1 have a couple different brush suppliers. One is
- 2 German. One is Japanese.
- 3 There's a couple reasons for it I think
- 4 underlying that decision, but it's worked very well
- 5 for us.
- 6 MS. BRYAN: Okay. Besides the quality
- 7 problems you had with Tara, the shipping, the service,
- 8 things you just mentioned, are those comparable or
- 9 were they comparable between Tara and Signature,
- 10 between the domestic producers themselves?
- 11 MR. DOWERS: In terms of the issues we've
- 12 had, no. You wouldn't stay with a supplier long if
- 13 you had those issues. It creates too much of a
- 14 disruption and distraction to your business.
- 15 Ultimately my position as the president is
- 16 to write the direction for which our company goes. I
- try to let people do their jobs, and this one had
- 18 reached a point where I had to get on the phone and
- 19 ask Michael to come up and see us and say we've got to
- 20 find some solution here. We have problems. I don't
- 21 do that often. I don't have to fortunately, but it
- 22 had reached that sort of a stress point.
- No, we don't have anywhere near the same
- 24 problems. It's difficult to conduct business when you
- do have those issues.

- 1 MS. BRYAN: Thank you. I guess this is for
- 2 Mr. Dowers and both Mr. Kanter.
- 3 Before you started seeing the quality
- 4 deteriorating or the problems you were having with
- 5 Tara, before that did you used to consider Tara a more
- 6 high end product relative to other choices?
- 7 MR. DOWERS: Yes. I couldn't quote on the
- 8 long-term perspective that you're probably asking for
- 9 and would like to get from me. I wouldn't be
- 10 qualified to probably do that.
- I don't know, Harvey, if you would.
- 12 MR. KANTER: Unfortunately, John and I are
- both in the same boat. We've been with our
- organizations about two plus years and it's prior to
- 15 us, but I would say there's an inkling of that in
- there, but more details may be appropriate for our
- 17 brief.
- 18 MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 19 Also, is there a consensus among the
- retailers who has the better, the wider product range?
- Is it Tara or the Chinese producers? Is there a
- 22 consensus among all of you about that?
- MR. DOWERS: I don't know if I've ever made
- 24 a comparison. I think the one slight difference is
- again given, and I have not been to Tara's facilities,

- but a number of our associates -- my Utrecht
- 2 associates have.
- You know, they're more of an automated
- 4 process, much more of a more technically efficient
- 5 process, less labor oriented, whereas, you know, one
- of the advantages of the Chinese plants is that there
- 7 is an enormous amount of flexibility in terms of
- 8 create me this product with this spec, and it's like
- 9 making your own ice cream sundae. You can pretty much
- 10 tell them what you want on it, and they'll try to make
- 11 it for you.
- 12 Given their less sophisticated level of
- 13 production, unlike most situations in the United
- 14 States, they are more high tech. You do tend to have
- 15 greater flexibility, so it's almost an infinite range
- 16 I quess. It's hard to compare it on paper up front,
- 17 but that would be my impression.
- MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 19 I don't know if this question would be for
- 20 Mr. Klett or for posthearing briefs later. In Chart 2
- 21 we see the Chinese exports to Europe really
- 22 skyrocketing here through 2003 and 2004 especially.
- 23 Do we know how is the European market more attractive
- to the Chinese than the U.S. apparently?
- MR. KLETT: I think Mr. Urnes can testify to

- that because he has actually been in the European
- 2 market and I think maybe can discuss the different
- 3 trends between the U.S. and Europe.
- 4 MS. BRYAN: Okay.
- 5 MR. URNES: That's a tricky question. If I
- knew the answer, you know, we could plan our marketing
- 7 strategies years ago, but let me give it a go.
- 8 I think one of the things that characterizes
- 9 Europe in terms of bringing in the new customer and
- 10 especially crafts for Germany, Holland and the like is
- 11 that they are actually early in the curve so we tend
- to see phenomenas in the intercontinental Europe
- countries happening before in Europe and then coming
- to the U.S., so I think that's one of the things
- 15 that's driving the phenomenal growth in Europe is that
- this whole new category of consumer have come in.
- 17 That's one area.
- 18 I think the other from a ColArt perspective,
- 19 before we want to launch in the U.S. with our canvas
- 20 we waited partly because the demand in new was so huge
- so we were told to go to the back of the queue, you
- 22 know, for production reasons, but we also wanted to
- 23 make sure that the quality was right, that we got the
- 24 elements that we felt, you know, so we can offer a
- 25 product that would suit the U.S. market.

1	So there might have been tactics from
2	manufacturers like ourselves, just purely strategical,
3	technical reasons, but I think the main drive in
4	Europe has really been the change in the public
5	consumer who buys canvas.
6	That's my take. You know, I'm happy to
7	speak in more detail with my European colleagues if
8	you think that would be useful.
9	MS. BRYAN: That was helpful. I think that
10	will be sufficient. Thank you.
11	MR. KANTER: Might I just add just a piece?
12	Aaron Brothers is owned by Michael's Corp., who also
13	owns a company called Recollections. Recollections is
14	a scrapbook company, and to Eric's point the
15	Netherlands is one of the leading countries relative
16	to scrapbooking.
17	The increased use of canvas has been
18	broadened now to the point where scrapbooking has what
19	they call altered art. Altered art means specifically
20	basically scrapbooking applied to canvas and hung on
21	the wall as wall art.
22	To his point, whether it be that or my past
23	life where we shot to Europe specifically for trends a
24	year in advance, I think that directionally is a very

accurate reflection on why it potentially could have

25

- 1 accelerated there fast.
- MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 3 My next question has to do with any
- 4 seasonality you might all see in demand for artists'
- 5 canvas. I suspect that around school time there is
- 6 higher demand. If you could address that, please?
- 7 MR. GALLAS: I think we'll have them address
- 8 it, but the timing of this petition is the beginning.
- 9 You will see a surge of imports following the filing
- of the petition due to seasonality because they are
- 11 ramping up for back-to-school.
- 12 Go ahead.
- MR. STAPLETON: I was going to say that I
- 14 was drooling over the concept of a 90-day lead time
- from China. We tell customers it's 180 days now.
- 16 What's happening right now is we are
- 17 building the inventories for back-to-school. The most
- 18 significant period in the canvas selling season for us
- 19 mirrors the back-to-school selling season, which
- depends on the country or the school or whatever.
- It generally begins at the first of August.
- 22 Retailers are buying in at the end of June to that
- 23 time period, and then it carries through all the way
- 24 until about the 15th of October, maybe a little bit
- beyond that. That really is the seasonality of it.

1	I just want to add one little thing to the
2	European perspective. Every year there's a trade
3	convention in Germany, the Frankfurt Spring Fair.
4	Paper World it's called. They have now a giant hall
5	that's arts and crafts, so they've kind of made a
6	specialization in that. Every year it's a real
7	opportunity to see what the trends are that are coming
8	on.
9	For two years running, the home decor based
10	canvas has had the most dynamic presentations and the
11	most dynamic introductions of new product. I forget
12	the name of the company, but there's a German company
13	now that has paint as you would traditionally, so they
14	have sort of formula painting on canvas. They have
15	the altered art on canvas.
16	They have things that you can apply to
17	canvas and then spray paint, so there's all this huge
18	explosion of stuff that really is starting to happen
19	here, yet the big bucks guys haven't yet gotten onto
20	it because it takes them a while to sort of move to
21	the trends. I just thought I'd add that.
22	MS. BRYAN: Okay. Thank you.
23	I guess my next question would be the
24	substitute product issue. I think you've mentioned
25	masonite panels, wood panels. If anybody wants to

- 1 comment on their availability and relative prices to
- 2 artists' canvas?
- 3 MR. STAPLETON: Well, I mean the relative
- 4 prices between masonite and canvas board and actually
- 5 there's a product that John sells and is sold pretty
- 6 regularly which is just a cut piece of canvas either
- 7 primed or unprimed, so you can buy that, lay that down
- 8 on a table and start painting on that. There's all of
- 9 these possibilities to do the basic thing, which is to
- 10 express yourself graphically onto a surface.
- 11 Stretch canvas, there's a little romance to
- 12 it. It looks like you're an artist. You know, you're
- 13 kind of feeling like there's something special about
- 14 that. If you really just took it down to the raw
- thing, you know, what is the cheapest possible product
- 16 that you could buy that performs well, look at
- 17 Leonardo. He painted on hardwood.
- 18 MS. BRYAN: Would you say that the interest
- 19 in these non-traditional substances like masonite and
- 20 wood panels are increasing following the trends that
- 21 you've been mentioning?
- 22 MR. STAPLETON: In a word, absolutely.
- 23 MS. BRYAN: Okay. I quess if there's any
- 24 way you could all elucidate on your use of promotional
- sales and discounts, whether that's something that

- 1 comes from the producer or it's a marketing decision
- 2 you all make and why and when that happens?
- MR. KANTER: Aaron Brothers, which has been
- 4 around since 1946, in 1972 started what they called a
- 5 one-cent frame sale, and actually canvas has been
- 6 incorporated in that for quite some time.
- 7 No different than the seasonality question
- 8 you asked, we historically -- it's kind of like
- 9 Nordstrom's semi-annual sale. It's that big a feature
- of our marketing program. That's why we only promote
- it twice a year. In July and January we have this
- 12 event. We promote twice a year.
- Beyond that, canvas categorically is not
- really promoted other than one-offs for either the set
- 15 business or the masonite category, but for the most
- 16 part that's the extent of the promotional business.
- 17 It has been driven by us, and actually one of those
- 18 two pictures is one of the presentations during the
- 19 one-cent frame sale where that large bulk stack
- 20 presentation is down because most of the year the wall
- 21 and the way Frank described that statement of all
- 22 faced out canvas up on that mantle is how we actually
- 23 drive the business.
- We stock inventory in a multitude of sizes, but
- we don't promote. We create our own promotional

1	strategy,	and	for	the	most	part,	although	in	some
---	-----------	-----	-----	-----	------	-------	----------	----	------

- 2 packaged goods categories retailers provide rebates
- or, excuse me, wholesalers provide rebates and things
- 4 of that nature, for the most part our promotional
- 5 strategy is driven by our specific business and our
- 6 marketing team.
- 7 MS. BRYAN: Okay. Anyone else on that?
- 8 MR. STAPLETON: I can very much repeat that.
- 9 It's not a back in allowance driven thing where
- there's large discounts that are offered by the
- 11 manufacturer. Decision is made for whatever reasons.
- 12 Ours, very much because of our locations
- near schools, is very much tied to the back-to-school
- 14 period that you referred to earlier, but it is
- 15 primarily retailer driver, not manufacturer driven.
- MR. URNES: I don't know how relevant it is,
- 17 but I think from my perspective as a paint
- 18 manufacturer and marketer, you know, to preserve our
- 19 brands we spend a lot of money on marketing and
- 20 setting of promotional schedules and opportunities to
- 21 work with retailers. We'll run a normal schedule for
- the whole industry where we have product innovation.
- 23 You know, I have 25 marketers just in the
- 24 U.S. working on how we build our brands and how we
- work with our customers, and then with bigger

- 1 customers we will do selective projects so I think as
- a sort of manufacturer representative, you know, our
- job in order to stay current, given that we've been
- 4 around for 280 years, we need to stay ahead of the
- 5 game in terms of marketing and understanding the needs
- of the customers.
- 7 I think there is a role for active
- 8 involvement from the manufacturers' side, which we
- 9 obviously try to stay abreast on, but I think it
- 10 sounds like it may have been missing to some extent
- 11 from Tara.
- 12 Obviously being a big company we can't be as
- 13 flexible as somebody producing paintings in their back
- 14 garden, but I think in terms of the responsibility we
- 15 feel to keep excitement in the industry, you know, we
- are doing a lot of time and resources from a
- 17 promotional marketing perspective.
- 18 MR. DOWERS: Yes. I think the only
- 19 difference between mine and Eric's is that on
- 20 nationally branded products clearly the marketing
- 21 people are driving programs.
- In the case of a contract pack brands, own
- 23 brands that we talked about, it's typically the
- 24 retailer that's making those decisions so I think that
- 25 explains some of the differences between, you know,

1	the	marketing	initiative	and	drive	on	а	national	brand

- versus an own brand, a private label brand. It's a
- 3 very different approach because yet you take ownership
- 4 to it.
- 5 MR. URNES: Which means that the retailers
- 6 with their own brands take -- you know, they have to
- 7 have the right idea to take the risk and the returns
- 8 as Harvey spoke to earlier.
- 9 MR. STAPLETON: One of the things that we
- 10 want to submit in the post brief materials is the
- 11 promotional material that our company engaged in for
- 12 the year prior to our being fired by Tara to show -- I
- think it illustrates two different ways. One is the
- largest retailers pick their promotions in the time
- periods that they want to do them.
- 16 Distributors like ourselves representing 200
- odd manufacturers really have a responsibility to take
- 18 the promotional schedules that the manufacturers have
- 19 created like ColArt and Tara and actually present
- those in our quarterly promotional books exactly as
- 21 they wanted us to present them, so in watercolor
- 22 season we'll be selling watercolor paints. In back-
- to-school we'll be selling kind of the basic market
- 24 basket, that sort of thing.
- You'll also see, and sort of counter to what

- 1 they said, that they indicated one of the reasons that
- we were fired is that we weren't promoting their
- goods. We promoted their goods in every single flyer
- 4 aggressively for years.
- In that last year before we were fired when
- 6 presumably they were making their decision we were
- 7 promoting their products on their schedule.
- 8 MS. BRYAN: Okay. That's all I have. Thank
- 9 you.
- 10 MR. CARPENTER: Mr. Jee?
- 11 MR. JEE: Justin Jee. I have no questions.
- 12 Thank you.
- MS. FREUND: Hi. I'm Kim Freund, Office of
- 14 Industries. I just have a couple questions.
- 15 I've heard a lot about all the different
- sizes and shapes of the stretch panels, and it seems
- to me that a lot of the new product differentiation
- 18 you've had has been the shapes and sizes.
- 19 I'm wondering if the product inputs at all
- 20 have changed as far as the fabric or the finishes.
- 21 Has that had any impact on your variety?
- 22 MR. KANTER: I think there's at least
- 23 several key things that have happened. Frank referred
- 24 to the construction of the product itself, but there's
- other things that have obviously been done differently

- 1 by different manufacturers or retailers -- the number
- of coatings of gesso, things of that nature -- which
- are in fact beyond just pure shape that will
- 4 differentiate the product assortment.
- Frank, you might have more to offer, but
- 6 it's not just the shape that will drive a
- 7 differentiation among retailers.
- 8 MS. FREUND: And that's been changing? I
- 9 mean, you've been changing that?
- 10 MR. KANTER: In our specific case, yes. We
- 11 changed the spec when we went to a different
- 12 manufacturing relationship.
- MS. FREUND: Okay.
- MR. STAPLETON: When you're creating your
- 15 own line you have a lot of input, as Harvey said, and
- 16 those inputs can reduce cost, add features. I think
- what's happened over a period of time, ours has
- 18 remained relatively the same, our basic input. The
- only thing that's changed for us is a proliferation of
- 20 sizes and depths.
- There are all of these other little benefits
- and features like, you know, quadruple priming or
- 23 using acrylic primer versus oil primer. I've seen
- 24 canvases that are coming out for the home decor that
- are actually precolored, you know, with a trendy color

- that can then just be put up on the wall, or you could
- 2 attach something to it, glue something to it.
- 3 There's all these little inputs that can
- 4 happen. Ours has been relatively modest. I think the
- 5 rest of the panel members here have sort of targeted
- 6 towards being refinements that would appeal to a
- discerning aspect of a customer, so a niche they'd be
- 8 looking for.
- 9 MS. FREUND: Okay.
- 10 MR. URNES: And I think if you look at what
- 11 we produce out of our joint manufacturing in China,
- the formulation of the gesso, the chemical properties
- 13 you have there have been developed by our technicians
- 14 and chemists.
- 15 You know, from a Winsor & Newton we've put a
- 16 lot of emphasis on the performance of the gesso and
- spent a lot of time and money in the R&D going behind
- 18 that qesso.
- 19 It's obviously how you talk to your
- 20 consumers about the differentiation is a marketing
- issue, but from a product innovation point of view the
- guys in the lab in the U.K. would have developed the
- formulation that we then prime the canvases with.
- 24 MS. FREUND: Okay. Great. What about
- everybody else as far as what you're importing from

- 1 China versus buying domestically in terms of the
- product differentiation?
- 3 Are you buying more SKUs from China versus
- 4 domestically? Has that changed, or are you still
- 5 getting a broader assortment from domestic producers
- and importing some of the staple items?
- 7 MR. STAPLETON: If you added the total
- 8 number of SKUs up for what we carry, I think -- you
- 9 know, our second line now is Masterpiece that we
- 10 source from San Francisco, and I'd have to check this,
- 11 but I think if you took the total number of SKUs that
- we buy from Masterpiece versus the total number of
- 13 SKUs that we offer in the art alternative line that
- 14 probably it would be maybe 30 or 40 percent more SKUs
- we're buying from Masterpiece.
- MS. FREUND: Okay.
- 17 MR. STAPLETON: They're different things.
- 18 You know, we are buying kind of the middle level
- 19 Chevy, as Paul called it, line from Masterpiece
- 20 because some customers like Bill Cicherski really want
- 21 an American made product, and we have that.
- 22 Some people really like the fact that they
- 23 can trust the quality. Some people, looking at the
- discerning aspects of it, see that the canvas by
- 25 Masterpiece is stretched so much more tightly, so it's

- 1 like a drum. We can't quite make that claim, and we
- don't. Again, where our range is is something very
- 3 sort of basic.
- 4 MS. FREUND: Okay.
- 5 MR. KANTER: The only thing I was going to
- add is that you've defined it and Frank enunciated it
- 7 a little bit that it is really categorical or
- 8 specifically driven by what the product is -- end use,
- 9 if you will -- so we specifically still buy from Tara
- the watercolor canvas, which is a product that only
- they can provide, and it's based on something they've
- 12 been able to accomplish.
- 13 You know, it goes back to that sourcing
- thing where you source with the person that's the
- 15 best, if you look at our pie chart, the best example
- of the multicomponent that you're trying to
- 17 accomplish.
- 18 In Tara's case, with respect to watercolor
- 19 that's what they have done for us, and there's a
- 20 reason to buy that from them, but it is not really
- about the SKUs, the breadth of SKUs, as much as
- 22 categorically the end use of the product and what
- 23 unique property that basically products support.
- MS. FREUND: Okay. Anyone else?
- 25 (No response.)

- 1 MS. FREUND: That's all I have. Thanks.
- 2 MR. CARPENTER: Ms. Mazur?
- 3 MS. MAZUR: Thank you very much to the
- 4 Respondent panel. This afternoon's testimony and
- 5 answers to questions has been very, very helpful, and
- 6 we always appreciate your presence here.
- 7 I just have one question in the area of non-
- 8 subject imports, non-subject being other than China or
- 9 in this case we have discussed extensively Mexico.
- 10 Are there any other sources of imports from foreign
- 11 producers that have an impact here in the U.S. market?
- MR. STAPLETON: In canvas specifically?
- MS. MAZUR: Yes.
- 14 MR. STAPLETON: India is a producer of
- 15 canvas, and it's imported to the U.S. Latvia is an
- importer.
- 17 MR. DOWERS: Canadian. There's some
- 18 Canadian.
- 19 MR. STAPLETON: Canadian.
- MR. DOWERS: Yes.
- MR. STAPLETON: Yes, Canadian is a huge
- 22 factor.
- MS. MAZUR: I mean, what kind of impact in
- terms of each of your businesses, and do you at all
- 25 import other canvas?

- 1 MR. KANTER: In our case we don't. It's
- 2 just the business with Tara and the business we
- 3 import.
- 4 MS. MAZUR: From China?
- 5 MR. KANTER: Yes.
- 6 MR. DOWERS: The same here. I know it's
- 7 available, but I can't specifically comment on the
- 8 purchase of it because we have not historically and we
- 9 don't now.
- 10 MS. MAZUR: Okay. All right. Well, thank
- 11 you. That was the only question I had.
- MR. CARPENTER: That was my question
- actually, but if I could just follow up on that a
- 14 little bit.
- 15 I got the impression just from listening to
- this discussion all day that imports from countries
- other than China, excluding Mexico, which is obviously
- 18 Tara, but that non-subject sources had a fairly small
- 19 presence in the market.
- If that's the case, what I was wondering is
- 21 if this is true why is it that until a year or two ago
- that this particular market was dominated by the
- 23 domestic industry and that there was essentially, you
- 24 know, very little import competition?
- MR. STAPLETON: I mean, I really can only

- 1 speak from our point of view. I think that there
- 2 really wasn't an idea out there that a lot of people
- 3 were driving towards that would say gee, let's have
- 4 our existing supplier expand the capability.
- As I sort of mention in my notes, it's
- 6 really a difficult position to be as dominant in a
- 7 marketplace as Tara was and is. I think from the
- 8 standpoint of how they've operated their business they
- 9 really have been driven towards things like
- 10 efficiencies in their production, which I think
- 11 ultimately pinches back their willingness or their
- interest in inputs from the outside world.
- 13 You know, why is it that all of a sudden
- 14 this stuff is happening from China in particular? I
- 15 mean, it started, in my opinion, from a frustration
- that the people here had that made them more receptive
- 17 to other possibilities.
- 18 Also, you know, originally the very original
- 19 idea that came from The Art Stores, it was sourced
- from a little, undocumented worker factory in southern
- 21 California called California Canvas and very custom
- 22 made. I don't think it was any mystery that Tara was
- 23 not interested in that business to begin with because
- 24 you really needed somebody who was willing to nurture
- 25 a concept and develop it.

1	Now, we're way beyond that now. You know,
2	this thing has a lot of momentum. It has wheels and
3	it's headed down the highway at 90 miles an hour, but
4	in those days, going back to that start, for somebody
5	like the guys at The Art Store who wanted to create
6	something on their own, flexible with differentiation
7	that hadn't been there in the past without a brand
8	name on it that they had to worry about kind of a
9	margin structure that didn't really fit into what they
LO	were trying to do, you wouldn't have had that. I
L1	know. We tried. We couldn't get that kind of
L2	interest from a Tara, so what was left really?
L3	You know, we had Masterpiece in our area,
L4	and they really were headed down another direction.
L5	They have done some private label for us at this
L6	point, but at that point I think they really were
L7	headed in an opposite direction, and we wanted them to
L8	head in that opposite direction because that direction
L9	was quality made product from the United States aiming
20	at a much more discerning market.
21	You know, why is it that China? I think
22	China just sort of represented or placed themselves,
23	at least for us, for the people here, a really great
24	opportunity to have some flexibility, but I could give
25	you a list of five retailers around the country who

- 1 chose India or chose Canada to do their sourcing.
- 2 They weren't as successful I don't think, but they
- 3 keep doing it.
- 4 MR. CARPENTER: I was wondering, Mr. Kanter,
- 5 maybe if you had any thoughts on that? You had
- 6 indicated earlier I think you sourced about 75 percent
- 7 domestic and 25 percent from China. Was that right?
- 8 MR. KANTER: (Off mike.)
- 9 MR. CARPENTER: I'm sorry.
- MR. MAREK: (Off mike.)
- 11 MR. CARPENTER: Okay. But both of you are
- domestic and China in different proportions?
- MR. KANTER: We're basically backwards. He
- is the majority is domestic, and I'm the majority
- overseas.
- MR. CARPENTER: Okay.
- 17 MR. KANTER: But we used to be both majority
- 18 domestic.
- MR. CARPENTER: Okay.
- 20 MR. KANTER: I might suggest although about
- 21 the time we made a decision to move our sourcing, and
- 22 it was about the time I joined the company, I would
- 23 relate that similar to what Frank described.
- 24 My last life, if you will, was in the home
- business category sheets, and no different than the

- 1 flexibility comment that he made relative to domestic
- 2 sourcing. We moved business to both Israel and
- 3 Portugal in sheeting specifically, mostly because of
- 4 just the manufacture there being much more flexible
- 5 with respect to their capacities to execute and their
- 6 willingness to do so.
- 7 It's kind of a similar conversation. I
- 8 don't want to project because, as I said, the decision
- 9 pretty much was made when I arrived, but the
- 10 commentary about why moving offshore, if you will. It
- 11 doesn't necessarily mean it's Asia or for that matter
- 12 India. Companies/countries have capacity to do things
- and then just a different business model, which they
- executed in these two categories I mentioned.
- 15 MR. CARPENTER: I mean, I've heard a lot of
- 16 discussion this afternoon about marketing strategies
- and business models and that Tara wasn't particularly
- 18 receptive to the direction that your companies wanted
- 19 to go in and so that's why you turned to China, but I
- 20 quess I'm more interested in for this particular
- 21 product why did you turn to China as opposed to other
- 22 possible sources of imports? Are they simply not out
- 23 there?
- MR. URNES: Being a manufacturer, I think
- one of the reasons why we went to China is we have

- 1 another factory in China not making canvas, but making
- 2 paint. You know, it could be to do with knowledge of
- 3 the players and the market and just basically feeling
- 4 comfortable in the operating environment, you
- 5 understand.
- I mean, for us in terms of setting of the
- 7 factory it was an easy decision because culturally
- 8 whether you go to India or to Norway or to England or
- 9 to the U.S. it's very, very different, but once you
- 10 understand the cultural parameters it would be my take
- 11 then it's easier to start.
- 12 You know, you can be more efficient in the
- way you procure and the way you work with people. I
- 14 mean, it's simplistic, but I think to some extent
- 15 true.
- MR. CARPENTER: Thank you.
- 17 Yes, sir?
- 18 MR. MAREK: Mr. Carpenter, when I was
- 19 traveling to international trade fairs, whether that
- 20 be in India or in Thailand or in the Philippines, Hong
- 21 Kong, China, I saw a number, as I stated in my
- 22 testimony, of canvas sources in the China fairs, but I
- 23 didn't see the product very prevalent anywhere else.
- To me, when I was first looking at it, you
- know, it's one of those things that a merchant, it

- 1 catches his eye. You start looking around and asking.
- 2 You begin to find out that the production, the
- 3 manufacturing has got stability, capacity and they do
- 4 a good product.
- 5 We looked at it. It was a high quality. We
- 6 checked it, and it in fact proved to be true. That's
- 7 why we went to China because when we brought it back
- 8 and showed it to the buyers it was something that they
- 9 got excited about, but I didn't see that in other
- 10 places.
- 11 MR. CARPENTER: I see. That's very helpful.
- 12 Thank you.
- MR. STAPLETON: This is going to sound a
- 14 little hokey, but how we got into the canvas was I got
- 15 a direct mail piece catalog from a Chinese supplier.
- 16 I had this in the back of my mind that I really wanted
- to do something in canvas, but I didn't have a way to
- 18 execute it.
- I imagine that if I'd gotten this same
- 20 brochure or catalog from India or from Canada I
- 21 probably would have gone that way too.
- MR. CARPENTER: Okay. Thank you.
- Just one housekeeping matter. The various
- charts and pictures that you provided to us we'll
- incorporate in the record as an attachment to the

- 1 transcript.
- 2 If there are no other questions from the
- 3 staff -- Megan?
- 4 MS. SPELLACY: This is very quick. I
- 5 realize you don't have any industry representatives
- 6 here from China, but as you are representing several
- 7 foreign manufacturers we would be interested in
- 8 anything you might have to say on the industry in
- 9 China or the growth or lack of growth of demand in
- 10 China for artists' canvas.
- Just feel free. Yes, sir? If you have
- 12 something to say, please.
- MR. URNES: I mean, I'm obviously a
- 14 manufacturer miles away, but we've had our first joint
- 15 venture in China makes paints. We started up in 1996.
- 16 The strategic reason for going in was that, you know,
- a billion people are going to use a lot of paint type
- 18 of approach, so I have a much better feeling on the
- 19 paint side. In terms of number of tubes, I mean, we
- 20 sell more tubes in China than we do in the whole of
- 21 continental Europe with very, very rapid growth.
- 22 I also know that our paint making joint
- 23 venture, which is in China, has bought canvas from our
- 24 canvas joint venture to sell in the Chinese market.
- The whole debate about market economy might not be

- 1 relevant now, but in my almost 10 years of experience,
- you know, my CEO said Eric, I don't think I've seen
- 3 any market that is so truly capitalistic as you see in
- 4 China in terms of producers of paint and also to the
- 5 accessories.
- It's a very, very dynamic market, but very
- 7 price sensitive given the economic development levels.
- 8 I don't know whether that's useful or not, but that's
- 9 at least my sort of miles away perspective.
- 10 MS. SPELLACY: Thank you.
- 11 MR. STAPLETON: We collected all these
- samples over here, and there was a lot of interesting
- 13 questions about qualities and varieties and whatnot.
- 14 Would you all like to have the canvas that we
- 15 collected over here to examine?
- 16 MR. CARPENTER: If you want to leave some
- samples with us, that would be fine. We would accept
- 18 them as samples, and then I'll return them to you at
- 19 the end of the case --
- MR. STAPLETON: Okay.
- MR. CARPENTER: -- if that's all right.
- 22 Once again I want to thank this panel for
- 23 coming here today, for your testimony and for your
- 24 responses to our questions. It's all very helpful.
- 25 At this point we'll take a short break again

- for about five or 10 minutes to allow each side to
- 2 prepare their closing statements. At the end of the
- 3 break we'll have the closing statements from each side
- 4 beginning with the Petitioners.
- 5 Thank you.
- 6 (Whereupon, a short recess was taken from
- 7 2:42 p.m. to 2:43 p.m.)
- 8 MR. CARPENTER: Welcome again. Please
- 9 proceed.
- 10 MR. THOMPSON: Well, because many of the
- 11 assertions from Respondents were factual in nature,
- rather than me doing a summation I would prefer to
- have some factual comments from Tara itself.
- MR. CARPENTER: That's fine.
- 15 MR. BENATOR: I'd like to first say I don't
- 16 know how you do this without a lunch break. We've
- 17 been going pretty strong here. I've had a cup of
- 18 coffee since breakfast.
- 19 We're going to start with Paul Straguadine.
- 20 MR. STRAQUADINE: Again, thank you for your
- 21 time. I thank the Respondents for their testimony and
- the issues that they brought forth. From a sales
- 23 perspective it's great to hear your customers and
- 24 great to hear what you do good and what you do bad in
- 25 the industry.

1	I don't believe in essence that we're quite
2	as bad as what was portrayed. I appreciate the
3	samples that they chose to supply you of our product,
4	and I certainly appreciate that that was I'm sure a
5	random sample and that our random samples of Chinese
6	canvas can look equally bad, if not worse. That's
7	just a window dressing issue.
8	I'd like to take a couple points, the first
9	being the concept, this wonderful concept of
LO	merchandising artists' canvas. The retailer that
L1	Frank mentioned, The Art Store, is the retailer that
L2	ironically I worked for for eight years, the parent
L3	company, Standard Brands.
L4	I worked for them for eight years as a store
L5	clerk, as a store manager and as a buyer. I was
L6	closely related to the gentleman who started The Art
L7	Store, and it is a great concept, and it is a good,
L8	strong merchandising concept.
L9	There are a few flaws, and I think they're
20	evidenced in the financials, which caused Standard
21	Brands to eventually go bankrupt and completely close
22	down, and the subsequent company that purchased The
23	Art Store has also gone bankrupt and had to sell that
24	business off to Dick Blick, so using them as a classic
5	huginess model may not in essence he the hest

1	I know in both cases that MacPherson's was
2	damaged by those bankruptcies. I never like to see
3	anyone hurt by a bankruptcy. I don't ethically care
4	for them, but using that as a model, yet having been
5	stung twice by that model, may not be the best thing.
6	I again apologize to the Commission, to our
7	current customers and former customers that there have
8	been issues in the past that have caused us to part
9	ways. I believe in these instances they've been good
10	business judgments on our part to part ways with
11	customers, whether us being fired or us ending a
12	relationship with a distributor.
13	In the case of the quality issue at Utrecht
14	which caused us to lose the business last year, we
15	were familiar with the issues. We had tried on
16	several occasions to work with them. One of the
17	pluses of Utrecht is that they have very good buyers.
18	They are very strong. They understand their position,
19	and they have been very successful at driving price
20	down and not accepting price increases.
21	In essence, all the burden being on Tara
22	Materials to reduce cost in order to maintain price
23	and not being able to pass on price increases does
24	affect the quality, and I believe that that is what
25	stung us toward the end of our relationship with them.

1	I also take responsibility that when Mike
2	Stone, his new buyer in November of 2003 took his
3	position and did not get contacted by Tara Materials
4	until late December of 2003, I take that
5	responsibility myself.
6	Our director of national accounts her
7	name is Maxine Harnish who handles that account was
8	recovering from life threatening breast cancer during
9	that period. I was trying to cover her desk and my
10	desk at the same time, and I failed to welcome Mike
11	Stone, and that certainly added quite a wedge in the
12	relationship, which helped catalyze in the quality
13	issues and the subsequent change.
14	I again apologize to Utrecht, Mike Stone and
15	to the Commission that that took place. I am pleased
16	to say that Maxine has returned to work. She's on her
17	feet and doing very, very well.
18	The final issue in my mind is that this does
19	relate back to price, that the opportunity to
20	reengineer or specify a product, as several of the
21	members mentioned the luxury they received of going to
22	China and saying these are my specs. You've got to
23	hit them.
24	This is the weight, the quality, the exact
25	specification that meets my customers', my discerning

- 1 customers' demands is a luxury when in fact you've got
- a 60 or 70 percent price difference. Yes, you can
- 3 accept a 50 percent price savings and engineer up by
- 4 doing that, and I believe that's what has taken place
- 5 in the case of several of the Respondents.
- That I believe is the core and the issue.
- 7 Had Tara Materials been able to pass price increases
- 8 on and stay commensurate with the price of raw
- 9 materials I do believe that our quality would not have
- 10 been an issue with any of these people, but I again
- 11 thoroughly believe that quality has a price and that
- 12 people, whether they're willing to pay that price or
- not, are going to be highly influenced by the
- 14 availability of ultra low-priced products.
- 15 Thank you.
- MR. BENATOR: Is this limited to 10 minutes?
- 17 Is that correct? Please pardon me if I speak fast.
- 18 What I would like to address is factual issues, not
- 19 opinions at this point.
- Mr. Klett, the economist, stated that we did
- 21 not move to Mexico or discuss it until 2004 when the
- 22 Chinese imports were aggressively entering the United
- 23 States. That is not true. We first saw it with Jo-
- 24 Ann's in 2001 and were having major discussions and
- 25 presentations in 2002 and lost significant business in

- 1 2003. We did start seriously contemplating it back in
- 2 2002.
- 3 As a long-term leading artists'
- 4 manufacturer, we try to look ahead, and we saw what
- 5 was happening. We were reacting and discussing our
- 6 plans. We didn't start implementing them until 2003,
- 7 but that's because we valued all of our operations,
- 8 all the investments we made, and wanted to keep it in
- 9 the U.S. as long as we could.
- 10 As far as breadth of the line, if you look
- 11 at the Frederick's catalog compared to the Chinese
- 12 catalog you'll see that almost all products we have
- 13 the capacity or have made. The only one that I can
- 14 think of right now is Masterpiece came up with a three
- inch triple deep, and we never chose to make that, but
- that has been knocked off, and that has been replaced
- 17 by China. He's lost business on that.
- 18 Also, Masterpiece is one of the major U.S.
- 19 manufacturers, and Mr. Stapleton stated that
- 20 Masterpiece has 30 to 40 percent more SKUs than does
- 21 his Art Alternatives Chinese brand. Let's get the
- facts. Ask what the volume and the dollar sales of
- the Masterpiece products are by MacPherson's versus
- the Art Alternatives Chinese brand. I think you'll
- see significant volume differences with the lower

- 1 priced Chinese products.
- Next is Aaron Brothers. They've stated that
- 3 they have had great success with their penny sale.
- 4 They started with frames. That penny sale is done
- 5 twice a year for two months. They promote it buy one,
- 6 get one at a penny.
- 7 Sixteen percent of the time or two months
- 8 out of the year they sell 66 percent of their volume.
- 9 The other 10 months out of the year or 84 percent of
- 10 the time they only sell 33 percent of volume, so I
- 11 pretty much state that it is a price issue, and that's
- where we're getting hurt because Chinese products are
- 13 being entered into this country at extremely unfair
- 14 prices.
- 15 As far as the MacPherson's issue and our
- 16 cutting them off, that was a difficult issue. We did
- offer them a price. They gave us three choice to
- 18 quote on this, and we did quote. We believe the
- 19 reason we did not win that business again was price.
- 20 As far as all these specific other issues,
- 21 we do not want to go into that at this point. We
- 22 would like to do that privately in rebuttal. Our
- 23 quote, and I have to look at the files, but I think it
- 24 was 1999 or 2000.
- 25 Regarding ColArt and about their many

factories and one of the reasons they went to C	China
---	-------

- was because they already had a presence there with
- 3 paint, ColArt is truly the leading brand name in the
- 4 art materials industry. We were supplying them at one
- 5 time. They also had many factories in Europe, and if
- 6 you look at the chart from Mr. Klett you'll see that
- 7 Europe has had the most or significant imports of
- 8 Chinese products.
- 9 The main reason they located in China to
- 10 canvas was to take business away from their Poland
- 11 factory or their Poland source and to get it at unfair
- 12 prices so they could compete.
- 13 MR. STRAQUADINE: Also considering the
- 14 schedule that was produced that shows the amount of
- 15 product imported into Europe, I think it's evidence if
- in fact you agree, which most of us do, that the
- 17 European market is a year to two years ahead of the
- 18 U.S. market, if you look at that steep incline in
- 19 European purchases or imports of Chinese canvas and
- then extrapolate that to the U.S. we're dead.
- 21 We're dead. We're gone and the rest of the
- industry is gone because that spike will continue,
- 23 much like it has in Europe over the next three years.
- MR. FREEMAN: I just wanted to make one
- 25 statement. There was a statement made about the

- differentiation about the finishes on the canvas in
- 2 single prime, double prime, triple prime.
- We do exactly the same thing. There is no
- 4 differentiation. I mean, it's primed. We have
- 5 single, double, triple and pretty much can make any
- 6 size anybody wanted, but it is a cost issue. If you
- 7 build small quantities, the cost escalates. I wanted
- 8 to make a statement on that.
- 9 MR. THOMPSON: Thank you very much. That
- 10 concludes our presentation.
- 11 MR. CARPENTER: Okay. Thank you for those
- 12 comments. I appreciate it.
- 13 Welcome, Mr. Gallas and Mr. Klett.
- 14 MR. GALLAS: Thank you. To start with, I
- 15 want to go back to The Art Store. My clients inform
- 16 me The Art Store went bust because they expanded too
- 17 quickly, but their canvas program per se was
- 18 successful.
- 19 Moreover, when my client in this group, Dick
- 20 Blick, purchased Art Store out of bankruptcy Dick
- 21 Blick doubled their selection of canvas because of the
- 22 success of Art Stores' program.
- 23 Tara points to China as the cause of its
- 24 problems, but Tara need look no further than itself.
- 25 You heard from our clients. Frank Stapleton said that

- 1 Tara frustrated these substantial importers/retailers.
- 2 Tara offshored its production to Mexico. You know,
- 3 there's all kinds of question of the chronology. I
- 4 think it was Michael Benator who said starting in
- 5 September 1990 -- 1990 -- they went there.
- 6 You know, whenever they went there you, Mr.
- 7 Carpenter, put your finger on the button that Tara has
- 8 a real timing issue because China was not even a blip
- 9 in the period that they're talking about. There was
- 10 not competition from China when they offshored their
- 11 production to Mexico.
- 12 Tara as the dominant player in this market
- 13 has lost its market share because of its own business
- 14 decisions. You've heard about their inflexibility
- 15 through the testimony of my clients, Aaron Brothers,
- 16 Utrecht and MacPherson's, their problems with quality,
- their slowness in correcting the problems and doing
- 18 all kinds of strange things, giving damage allowance
- 19 to Utrecht, taking it back, giving them a bizarre
- 20 volume discount based on two years before to make it
- an even higher level to reach that volume discount.
- This is not a good faith business relationship.
- 23 My clients, and you listened to Frank
- 24 Stapleton and the others, Utrecht, they all were
- 25 trying to grow the business mutually with Tara, and it

- was with great reluctance that they had to depart from
- 2 Tara, but they had no choice.
- 3 Did John Dowers of Utrecht take all his
- 4 business to China? No. He went to another domestic
- 5 producer in Kansas City, my hometown, Signature. It
- 6 was Tara's own fault that they lost that business.
- 7 Utrecht gave them a detailed agenda to correct and
- 8 address these problems, and all this time went by.
- 9 Nothing was done.
- 10 You know, they're pointing the finger at the
- 11 Chinese imports, but they fired a \$1.5 million a year
- 12 account, MacPherson's. Is that a sound business
- 13 practice? By doing so they cut themselves off, Tara,
- 14 from the hundreds of mom and pop stores that relied
- 15 upon getting their supply at MacPherson's because it
- was a very subtle point, but MacPherson's told you
- about the great cost of freight and that Tara has
- 18 minimum orders and there's a freight charge and so
- 19 forth.
- 20 So these customers, these mom and pops,
- 21 relied upon MacPherson's to be able to keep their
- 22 shelves constantly stocked. Otherwise their shelves
- 23 would go empty. Their inventory would have to be
- 24 depleted before it would be financially feasible to
- order from Tara so there was a real reason why, Tara's

- 1 inflexibility and improperly dealing with customers.
- 2 They cut themselves off, cut themselves off from their
- 3 customers and potential customers.
- 4 We talked about the inattention of quality
- 5 by Aaron Brothers and Utrecht. I won't go back
- 6 through all of that. Michael's witness, Alan Marek,
- 7 said that still 75 percent of their total 2004 retail
- 8 sales were still with Tara, and they intend to
- 9 continue to source domestically with Chinese products
- 10 side-by-side.
- 11 The market has grown, as ColArt's story in
- 12 Europe has been related. I don't remember if it was
- 13 Ms. Bryan or Ms. Spellacy, but you alluded to the fact
- 14 that, you know, where has the market grown? Well, the
- 15 market has grown through customers who normally would
- never buy canvas, these mothers who buy for their
- 17 children now to fingerpaint on or to just paint upon.
- 18 That avenue was never available to them before.
- 19 Or these young couples in start-up
- 20 apartments who can just slap paint on a canvas and put
- 21 it on the wall like in Trading Spaces. The market has
- 22 grown, and my clients have grown the market. It has
- 23 not been grown by the people on the other side of the
- 24 room.
- My clients have been the innovators here.

1	They have turned the canvas outward so people like me
2	who are really impulse buyers who would never dream of
3	buying a canvas would do so. My wife would. She's an
4	artist. You know, they have grown their own business.
5	The customer base of Tara has eroded due to
6	its own stubbornness to adapt to the market and to
7	take my clients' offers up to mutually try to grow the
8	market with Tara.
9	You know, Mr. Straquadine I'm
10	mispronouncing his name stretched his claim of Tara
11	as an innovator, while we're talking about stretching
12	things. If he has concerns of infringement knock-offs
13	I would refer him to the proper government agency, the
14	Office of Copyright here in Washington, D.C.
15	Dan Klett showed you the pie chart
16	illustrating Tara's myopic view of the canvas market
17	as a commodity when non-price factors also are
18	extremely important. I urge you to look at that pie
19	chart, our view of the market, and look at all of
20	those other non-price factors and the other things

Tara has failed to provide the Commission the true reason for the erosion of its grasp of the market, and you see from the dearth of producers' questionnaires that have been received, as Mr. Jee

I've mentioned because they are key.

- observed, that other producers obviously have not
- 2 rallied behind Tara's cause. Their non-responsiveness
- 3 to the Commission speaks volumes, you know.
- With that, I will give my remaining time to
- 5 Mr. Klett.
- 6 MR. KLETT: I just want to make one point
- 7 and that is price is always important in these
- 8 investigations. We are not denying that price is a
- 9 factor, but I think the important distinction is
- 10 whether price competition from China has displaced
- domestic sales, which is the position of Tara.
- 12 To a certain extent there may have been some
- of that, but I think a much more important dimension
- of price is that the price that has been offered by
- 15 the Chinese has expanded the market and grown the
- 16 market, and I think even Tara in their testimony this
- morning admitted to that, that essentially being able
- 18 to offer the Chinese product at retail through
- 19 innovative promotional techniques at an attractive
- 20 price point has opened the market to customers that
- 21 would not otherwise have purchased, the consumer off
- the street as Mr. Gallas referred to.
- On that same note, when you look at the
- 24 exports from China to Europe, the point made that if
- 25 China exports to Europe are a precursor of what will

- 1 come into the U.S., you have to keep in mind that the
- 2 growth in imports from China has created a significant
- 3 growth in demand that would not otherwise have
- 4 occurred, so you cannot assume that that growth is
- 5 going to displace domestic production. I think that's
- an important element of price in this market
- 7 recognized by Tara as well.
- 8 Thank you.
- 9 MR. GALLAS: And with that we thank the
- 10 Commission for your great patience in today's hearing.
- 11 Thank you.
- MR. CARPENTER: Well, thank you. Thank you,
- gentlemen, for those remarks. I want to thank
- 14 everyone for coming here today to share your wisdom on
- 15 this industry with us.
- 16 Before concluding let me just mention a few
- dates to keep in mind. The deadline for both the
- 18 submission of corrections to the transcript and for
- 19 briefs in the investigation is Wednesday, April 27.
- 20 If briefs contain business proprietary information, a
- 21 public version is due on April 28.
- The Commission has not yet scheduled its
- 23 vote on the investigation. It will report its
- determination to the Secretary of Commerce on May 16.
- 25 Commissioners' opinions will be transmitted to

230

```
Commerce a week later.
 1
 2
                  Thank you for coming. This conference is
 3
       adjourned.
                  (Whereupon, at 3:05 p.m. the preliminary
 4
       conference in the above-entitled matter was
 5
 6
       concluded.)
 7
       //
       //
 8
 9
       //
       //
10
       //
11
       //
12
       //
13
       //
14
       //
15
16
       //
17
       //
       //
18
       //
19
20
       //
       //
21
22
       //
       //
23
       //
24
25
       //
```

## CERTIFICATION OF TRANSCRIPTION

TITLE: Artists' Canvas From China

INVESTIGATION NO.: 731-TA-1091 (Preliminary)

HEARING DATE: April 22, 2005

**LOCATION:** Washington, D.C.

NATURE OF HEARING: Preliminary Conference

I hereby certify that the foregoing/attached transcript is a true, correct and complete record of the above-referenced proceeding(s) of the U.S. International Trade Commission.

DATE: April 22, 2005

SIGNED: <u>LaShonne Robinson</u>

Signature of the Contractor or the Authorized Contractor's Representative

1220 L Street, N.W. - Suite 600

Washington, D.C. 20005

I hereby certify that I am not the Court Reporter and that I have proofread the above-referenced transcript of the proceeding(s) of the U.S. International Trade Commission, against the aforementioned Court Reporter's notes and recordings, for accuracy in transcription in the spelling, hyphenation, punctuation and speaker-identification, and did not make any changes of a substantive nature. The foregoing/attached transcript is a true, correct and complete transcription of the proceeding(s).

SIGNED: <u>Carlos</u> Gamez

Signature of Proofreader

I hereby certify that I reported the abovereferenced proceeding(s) of the U.S. International Trade Commission and caused to be prepared from my tapes and notes of the proceedings a true, correct and complete verbatim recording of the proceeding(s).

SIGNED: Renee Katz

Signature of Court Reporter