

Tel: 314-889-1100 Fax: 314-889-1101 www.bdo.com 101 S Hanley Rd, Suite 800 St. Louis, MO 63105

REPORT OF THE INDEPENDENT ACCOUNTANT

To the Management of Visa U.S.A. Inc. ("Visa"):

We have examined for Visa's certification authority ("CA") operations at Highlands Ranch, Colorado and Ashburn, Virginia for,

- Visa's disclosure of its SSL certificate lifecycle management business practices, including its commitment to provide SSL certificates in conformity with the CA/Browser Forum Requirements on the Visa repository
- the provision of such services in accordance its disclosed practices
- the effectiveness of its controls over:
 - key and SSL certificate integrity;
 - o the authenticity and confidentiality of SSL subscriber and relying party information;
 - o continuity of key and SSL certificate lifecycle management operations;
 - o development, maintenance, and operation of CA systems integrity; and
 - meeting the network and certificate system security requirements set forth by the CA/Browser Forum

throughout the period April 1, 2017 to March 31, 2018, for its CAs enumerated in <u>Attachment A</u> in scope for SSL Baseline Requirements and Network Security Requirements.

Visa's management is responsible for these disclosures and for maintaining effective controls based on the <u>WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities - SSL Baseline with</u> <u>Network Security, Version 2.2</u>. Our responsibility is to express an opinion based on our examination.

The relative effectiveness and significance of specific controls at Visa and their effect on assessments of control risk for subscribers and relying parties are dependent on their interaction with the controls, and other factors present at individual subscriber and relying party locations. Our examination did not extend to controls at individual subscriber and relying party locations and we have not evaluated the effectiveness of such controls.

Our examination was conducted in accordance with attestation standards established by the American Institute of Certified Public Accountants. Those standards require that we plan and perform the examination to obtain reasonable assurance about whether, throughout the period April 1, 2017 to March 31, 2018, for its CAs enumerated in <u>Attachment A</u>, in all material respects, Visa:

- disclosed its SSL certificate lifecycle management business practices, enumerated in <u>Attachment B</u>, including its commitment to provide SSL certificates in conformity with the CA/Browser Forum Requirements on the Visa <u>repository</u>
- provided such services in accordance with its disclosed practices

BDO USA, LLP, a Delaware limited liability partnership, is the U.S. member of BDO International Limited, a UK company limited by guarantee, and forms part of the international BDO network of independent member firms.



- maintained effective controls over:
 - key and SSL certificate integrity;
 - the authenticity and confidentiality of SSL subscriber and relying party information;
 - o continuity of key and SSL certificate lifecycle management operations;
 - o development, maintenance, and operation of CA systems integrity; and
 - meeting the Network and Certificate System Security Requirements as set forth by the CA/Browser Forum

based on the <u>WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities - SSL Baseline with</u> <u>Network Security, Version 2.2.</u>

Because of the nature and inherent limitations of controls, Visa's ability to meet the aforementioned criteria may be affected. For example, controls may not prevent, or detect and correct, error, fraud, unauthorized access to systems and information, or failure to comply with internal and external policies or requirements. Also, the projection of any conclusions based on our findings to future periods is subject to the risk that changes may alter the validity of such conclusions.

During our examination, we noted the following which caused a qualification of our opinion:

Impa	cted WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities - SSL Baseline with Network Security	Control Deficiency Noted
2-2.5	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that the extensions, key sizes, and certificate policy identifiers (including Reserved Certificate Policy Identifiers) of Subscriber certificates generated after the Effective Date (1 July 2012) conform to the Baseline Requirements.	For 1 of the 45 certificate issuances selected, we noted the extended key usage field was not present in accordance with the Baseline Requirements.
2-4.1	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that as of the date the Certificate was issued, the CA obtains confirmation in accordance with the SSL Baseline Requirements Sections 3.2.2.4, 3.2.2.5, 3.2.2.6 and 4.2.2 related to the Fully-Qualified Domain Name(s) (including wildcard domains and new gTLDs (generic top- level domains)) and IP address(es) listed in the Certificate.	For 5 of the 45 certificate issuance requests selected, we were unable to obtain domain validation evidence in accordance with the Baseline Requirements.
2-5.10	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that OCSP responses by CA's which have not been technically constrained in accordance with SSL Baseline Requirements Section 7.1.5 do not respond with a "good" status for Certificates that have not been issued.	The OCSP responder was configured to allow a response of "good" for a certificate that was not issued by the CA, until February 13, 2018.



2-7.3	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that audit logs generated after the Effective Date (1 July 2012) are retained for at least seven years.	We were unable to obtain evidence that firewall and router activity logs were being retained for the required seven year period.
-------	---	---

In our opinion, except for the effect of the matters described in the preceding table, throughout the period April 1, 2017 to March 31, 2018, Visa has, in all material respects:

- disclosed its SSL certificate lifecycle management business practices, enumerated in <u>Attachment B</u>, including its commitment to provide SSL certificates in conformity with the CA/Browser Forum Requirements on the Visa <u>repository</u>
- provided such services in accordance with its disclosed practices
- maintained effective controls over:
 - key and SSL certificate integrity;
 - the authenticity and confidentiality of SSL subscriber and relying party information;
 - o continuity of key and SSL certificate lifecycle management operations;
 - o development, maintenance, and operation of CA systems integrity; and
 - meeting the Network and Certificate System Security Requirements as set forth by the CA/Browser Forum

based on the <u>WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities - SSL Baseline with</u> <u>Network Security, Version 2.2.</u>

This report does not include any representation as to the quality of Visa's services beyond those covered by the <u>WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities – SSL Baseline with</u> <u>Network Security, Version 2.2</u>, nor the suitability of any of Visa's services for any customer's intended purpose.

BDG USA, LLP

Certified Public Accountants St. Louis, Missouri August 20, 2018



ATTACHMENT A - IN-SCOPE CAs

Root CAs

CA Name	Serial Number	SHA1 Thumbprint	SHA2 Thumbprint
CN = Visa eCommerce Root OU = Visa International Service Association O = VISA	13 86 35 4d 1d 3f 06 f2 c1 f9 65 05 d5 90 1c 62	70 17 9b 86 8c 00 a4 fa 60 91 52 22 3f 9f 3e 32 bd e0 05 62	69 fa c9 bd 55 fb 0a c7 8d 53 bb ee 5c f1 d5 97 98 9f d0 aa ab 20 a2 51 51 bd f1 73
C = US			3e e7 d1 22
CN = Visa eCommerce Root CA - G2 OU = Visa International	51 3e 96 00 00 00 68 10 fc 6e 08 a3 d6 14 67	fc 7e fd 44 ef b6 9a e2 12 f3 47 41 68 5f 90 ec ca 6b 0d	99 ae 4c 54 7f 36 11 2d 29 cf b8 c5 48 da c4 d7 e4 81 96 7b
Services Association O = VISA L = Ashburn		a8	bb 3a df b4 ad 28 5e 7a 55 ce b9 63
S = Virginia C = US			

Issuing CA

CA Name	Serial Number	SHA1 Thumbprint	SHA2 Thumbprint
CN = Visa eCommerce Issuing CA OU = Visa International Service Association O = VISA C = US	00 d8 74 61 30 41 fc 3c 44 a0 bc c6 5d 6c 36 f1 10	80 7a 77 b2 44 51 57 6c fb 3f b9 1e 97 73 52 27 fa b4 04 dd	c5 7a 3a cb e8 c0 6b a1 98 8a 83 48 5b f3 26 f2 44 87 75 37 98 49 de 01 ca 43 57 1a f3 57 e7 4b



ATTACHMENT B - POLICY VERSIONS IN-SCOPE

Certificate Policies

Policy Name	Version	Date
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Policy (CP)	3.3	March 29, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Policy (CP)	3.2	January 31, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Policy (CP)	3.1	March 31, 2017

Certification Practice Statements

Policy Name	Version	Date
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Practice Statement (CPS)	3.3	March 29, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Practice Statement (CPS)	3.2	January 31, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Practice Statement (CPS)	3.1	March 31, 2017



Page 1 Monday, August 20, 2018

Visa U.S.A. Inc. Management's Assertion

Visa U.S.A. Inc. ("Visa") operates the Certification Authority ("CA") known as the root and issuing CAs, collectively referred to as Visa eCommerce CAs, listed in <u>Attachment A</u> in scope for SSL Baseline Requirements and Network Security Requirements and provides SSL CA services.

Visa's management has assessed its disclosures of its certificate practices and controls over its SSL CA services. Based on that assessment, in providing its SSL CA services at Highlands Ranch, Colorado and Ashburn, Virginia, throughout the period April 1, 2017 to March 31 2018, Visa has:

- disclosed its SSL certificate lifecycle management business practices in its:
 - applicable versions of the Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certification Practice Statement ("CPS") and Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Policy ("CP") enumerated in <u>Attachment B;</u>
 - commitment to provide SSL certificates in conformity with the CA/Browser Forum Requirements on the Visa repository, and provided such services in accordance with its disclosed practices
- maintained effective controls to provide reasonable assurance that:
 - the integrity of keys and SSL certificates it manages is established and protected throughout their lifecycles; and
 - SSL subscriber information is properly authenticated
- maintained effective controls to provide reasonable assurance that:
 - logical and physical access to CA systems and data is restricted to authorized individuals;
 - o the continuity of key and certificate management operations is maintained; and
 - CA systems development, maintenance, and operations are properly authorized and performed to maintain CA systems integrity
- maintained effective controls to provide reasonable assurance that it meets the Network and Certificate System Security Requirements as set forth by the CA/Browser Forum

based on the <u>WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities - SSL Baseline with</u> <u>Network Security, Version 2.2</u>, except for the effects of the matters noted below:

Impacted WebTrust Principles and Criteria for Certification Authorities - SSL Baseline with Network Security	Control Deficiency Noted	Management Response
--	-----------------------------	---------------------



Page	2
------	---

2-2.5	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that the extensions, key sizes, and certificate policy identifiers (including Reserved Certificate Policy Identifiers) of Subscriber certificates generated after the Effective Date (1 July 2012) conform to the Baseline Requirements.	For 1 of the 45 certificate issuances selected, we noted the extended key usage field was not present in accordance with the Baseline Requirements.	Visa notes an incorrect template was used as it did not contain an extended key usage (EKU) field. Subsequently, this was corrected by adding the required EKU field. Management notes that the issue has been remediated.
2-4.1	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that as of the date the Certificate was issued, the CA obtains confirmation in accordance with the SSL Baseline Requirements Sections 3.2.2.4, 3.2.2.5, 3.2.2.6 and 4.2.2 related to the Fully- Qualified Domain Name(s) (including wildcard domains and new gTLDs (generic top-level domains)) and IP address(es) listed in the Certificate.	For 5 of the 45 certificate issuance requests selected, we were unable to obtain domain validation evidence in accordance with the Baseline Requirements.	Visa notes the respective system of record, used to track and store certificate requests and validation data, had been retired during the year. Access to the historical data was not maintained resulting in this observation. However, obtaining domain validation requirements are part of our continuous training; for which, Visa asserts domain validation was completed before issuing the certificate.
2- 5.10	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that OCSP responses by CA's which have not been technically constrained in accordance with SSL Baseline Requirements Section 7.1.5 do not respond with a "good" status for Certificates that have not been issued.	The OCSP responder was configured to allow a response of "good" for a certificate that was not issued by the CA, until February 13, 2018.	Visa notes the OCSP responder product deployed at the time was defective for which the vendor was unable to provide an acceptable resolution. As a result, Visa ceased operation of the faulty product and subsequently deployed an alternate solution. Management notes that the issue has been remediated.



Page 3

2-7.3	The CA maintains controls to provide reasonable assurance that audit logs generated after the Effective Date (1 July 2012) are retained for at least seven years.	We were unable to obtain evidence that firewall and router activity logs were being retained for the required seven year period.	Visa notes the current firewall log retention requirements follow Visa's global retention policy which do not align with WTBR's requirements. As a result, Visa will work with the relevant teams to determine the appropriate actions needed to align with the seven-year requirement.
-------	---	--	---

Adam Clark Senior Director of Applied Cryptography August 20, 2018



Page 4

ATTACHMENT A - IN-SCOPE CAS

Root CAs

CA Name	Serial Number	SHA1 Thumbprint	SHA2 Thumbprint
CN = Visa eCommerce Root OU = Visa International Service Association O = VISA C = US	13 86 35 4d 1d 3f 06 f2 c1 f9 65 05 d5 90 1c 62	70 17 9b 86 8c 00 a4 fa 60 91 52 22 3f 9f 3e 32 bd e0 05 62	69 fa c9 bd 55 fb 0a c7 8d 53 bb ee 5c f1 d5 97 98 9f d0 aa ab 20 a2 51 51 bd f1 73 3e e7 d1 22
CN = Visa eCommerce Root CA - G2 OU = Visa International Services Association O = VISA L = Ashburn S = Virginia C = US	51 3e 96 00 00 00 68 10 fc 6e 08 a3 d6 14 67	fc 7e fd 44 ef b6 9a e2 12 f3 47 41 68 5f 90 ec ca 6b 0d a8	99 ae 4c 54 7f 36 11 2d 29 cf b8 c5 48 da c4 d7 e4 81 96 7b bb 3a df b4 ad 28 5e 7a 55 ce b9 63

Issuing CA

CA Name	Serial Number	SHA1 Thumbprint	SHA2 Thumbprint
CN = Visa eCommerce Issuing CA OU = Visa International Service Association O = VISA C = US	00 d8 74 61 30 41 fc 3c 44 a0 bc c6 5d 6c 36 f1 10	80 7a 77 b2 44 51 57 6c fb 3f b9 1e 97 73 52 27 fa b4 04 dd	c5 7a 3a cb e8 c0 6b a1 98 8a 83 48 5b f3 26 f2 44 87 75 37 98 49 de 01 ca 43 57 1a f3 57 e7 4b



Page 5

ATTACHMENT B - POLICY VERSIONS IN-SCOPE

Certificate Policies

Policy Name	Version	Date
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Policy (CP)	3.3	March 29, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Policy (CP)	3.2	January 31, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Policy (CP)	3.1	March 31, 2017

Certification Practice Statements

Policy Name	Version	Date
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Practice Statement (CPS)	3.3	March 29, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Practice Statement (CPS)	3.2	January 31, 2018
Visa Public Key Infrastructure Certificate Practice Statement (CPS)	3.1	March 31, 2017

Visa 44901 Russell Branch Parkway Ashburn, VA 20147