

#### PC nr. ACVPR 776

Period-of-time audit Date: from 2020-09-07 to 2020-09-16

**Trust Service Provider (TSP) Organization:** 

# TÜBİTAK-BİLGEM Kamu Sertifikasyon Merkezi (Governmental Certification Center, TÜBİTAK BİLGEM Kamu SM)

# Registered office: PK: 74, 41470 Gebze / Kocaeli Türkiye

Sites involved in the services mentioned in the scope and to which the Certification applies:

| Addresses   | Site Type |               | TSP services supplied at site<br>((Refer to the services listed in the scope of certification) |
|---|-----------|---------------|--|
| TÜBİTAK BİLGEM PK: 74<br>41470 Gebze / Kocaeli<br>Türkiye                         | Main      | Primary HSM   | Root CA<br>Sub CA  |
| Çamlıca Mahallesi, 408. Cad. No. 136, C Blok<br>06200 Çankaya / Ankara<br>Türkiye | Secondary | Secondary HSM | Root CA as Disaster recovery site<br>Sub CA as Disaster recovery site                          |

Audit standards and regulations requirements:

- Regulation (EU) 910/2014 eIDAS
- ETSI EN 319 401 version 2.2.1
- ETSI EN 319 411-1 version 1.2.2
- ETSI EN 319 411-2 version 2.2.2
- CA/Browser Forum Baseline Requirements for the Issuance and Management of Publicly-Trusted Certificates version 1.7.1

| Trusted Services (TS)                             | Laws, Regulations and Standards reference (last editions published at the time of the audit)                                 |             |
|---|--|-------------|
| Registration Authority<br>Certification Authority | Turkish Electronic Signature Law no. 5070 dated 2004-01-15<br>Turkish Personal Data Protection Law no. 6698 dated 2016-04-07 |             |
| (Digital certificates for websites - SSL)         | Regulation (EU) 910/2014 – eIDAS<br>ETSI EN 319 401 version 2.2.1<br>ETSI EN 319 411-1 version 1.2.2                         | $\boxtimes$ |
|   | ETSI EN 319 411-2 version 2.2.2<br>CA/Browser Forum Baseline Requirements version 1.7.1                                      |             |

Audit type: Surveillance/Renewal Audit (full audit)

OBJECTIVES of the Audit: Evaluate the conformity of the certified trust services to the requirements set out in the audit reference documents.

Language used for audit (if different from the language of the auditor and/or the Customer Organization): English

| Accredited legal entity: | KIWA CERMET ITALIA S.p.A.          |
|--------------------------|------------------------------------|
|                          | Via Cadriano, 23                   |
|                          | 40057 - GRANAROLO DELL'EMILIA (BO) |
|                          | Italia                             |

# KIWA CERMET personnel<sup>1</sup>:

| Name and Surname                   | Role                           |
|------------------------------------|--------------------------------|
| Rutilio Mazza (Kiwa Italy)         | Lead Auditor (RGA)             |
| Fabrizio Cirilli (Kiwa Italy)      | Training Lead Auditor (AA-RGA) |
| Gabriele Picchi (Kiwa Italy)       | Auditor (AA)                   |
| Ufuk Yilmaz (Kiwa Turkey)          | Technical Expert (TE)          |
| Emin Beytullah Çamur (Kiwa Turkey) | Witness (SA)                   |

ATTACHED DOCUMENTS to the report and consigned to the Organization:

Audit plan Stage 1 MOD PO31B

Detailed Activity plan **MOD PO31P** 

Management of NC - MOD PO 31C

Checklist EN 319 421

Checklist EN319 411-1 Checklist EN319 **411**-2

Other: List of participants, List of

internal documents, copies of evidences

<sup>1</sup> Indicate, in addition to the members of the Audit Group, also any observers, auditors in training, translators and other roles.



#### Acceptance of the following KIWA N.V. and KIWA CERMET Italia regulations

#### Yes 🛛 No 🗌 N/A 🗌

SD.001\_E General Terms and Conditions Kiwa N.V. Rev. of 2014-12-08

General Terms and Conditions Kiwa Cermet Italia Rev. of 2017-08-03

PSC 05SF - Regulations for the Certification of Trust Services providers Rev. 3 of 2018-02-26

The Organization declares that it obey and meets the applicable local and international legislative requirements and the requirements for the certification (unless otherwise stated in the report of the present audit) as well as contractual agreements with Kiwa Cermet Italia. The Corporate Manager signatory of this report also declares, with specific reference to the activity of the audit: not to be aware of facts, litigation or legal measures related to the subject of the audit, not to have omitted or falsified information, not to be aware of situations of conflict of interest between the Audit Group and its Organization.

The Head of the Audit Group, aware of civil liability and criminal penalties for false and mendacious declarations declares that:

- have carried out the audit in accordance with the established procedures, including time set and control methodologies;
- not to be aware of conflicts of interest with the Organization under audit in accordance with Kiwa Cermet procedures;
- have carried out a sampling of activities sufficient to determine the conclusions of this audit report.

#### Granarolo nell'Emilia – Italy, 2020-09-19

#### **Organization's Representative<sup>2</sup>**

(Signature and Stamp)

**Kiwa Cermet Italia Representative** 

RESERVED TO Kiwa Cermet Italia - Date:

Remarks:

Signature:

<sup>2</sup> La presente firma implica accettazione dei contenuti dell'intero rapporto di valutazione comprensivo degli allegati lasciati in copia



# **INITIAL AND CLOSING MEETING PARTICIPANTS**

| Abdullah Fahreddin ULUER | Network and Security Specialist  |
|--------------------------|--|
| Fatih ÖZCAN              | Team Leader of IT System Unit (System Administrator)   |
| Fatih ACAR               | Team Leader of IT Database Unit (System Administrator)                                       |
| Ömer GÜNEŞ               | Sistem Denetçisi (System Auditor)  |
| Kaan TEMUR               | Team Leader of Electronic Certificate Management Department (Certificate Issuance Personnel) |
| Emrah DURMAZ             | Head of Electronic Certificate Services Department   |
| Mesut UĞURLU             | Team Leader of Cyber Security Unit (Security Personnel)                                      |
| Caner MAMALI             | Cyber Security Specialist (Security Personnel)   |
| Necati ALASULU           | Team Leader of Information Security Unit (Security Personnel)                                |
| Nur Betül DEMİREL        | Information Security Specialist (Security Personnel)   |
| Büşra KARAYEL            | Team Leader of Customer Relations Department (Certificate Enrolment Personnel)               |
| Ecenur YILDIZ            | Customer Relations Specialist (Certificate Enrolment Personnel)                              |
| Tamer ERGUN              | Head of E-Signature Technologies Department  |
| Merve Melis ŞİMŞEK       | E-Signature Technologies Specialist  |

## NOTE:

The audit activity was conducted:

• in remote connection (MS-Teams) in accordance with Corona Virus Covid19 dispositions;

• in accordance with sampling criteria and on the basis of the information and the documents consigned by the Organization under audit, in compliance with the rules defined in applicable international reference standards and accreditation regulations.

The absence of non-conformity does not guarantee the total absence of anomalies in the audited areas as referenced at the services/processes/activities verified.

# **Reference documents of the Organization:**

|      | Document list     |  |         |               |
|------|-------------------|--|---------|---------------|
| Ref. | PUBLIC OR PRIVATE | DOCUMENT NAME  | VERSION | REVISION DATE |
| 1    | PUBLIC            | KAMU SM CERTIFICATE POLICY   | 1.0.1   | 16.10.2019    |
| 2    | PUBLIC            | KAMU SM CERTIFICATE PRACTICE STATEMENT   | 3.3.3   | 04.09.2020    |
| 3    | PUBLIC            | KAMU SM PKI DISCLOSURE STATEMENT (PRO.01.02)   | 1       | 25.10.2019    |
| 4    | PUBLIC            | GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) TAAHHÜTNAMESİ<br>(FRM.01.09)<br>KAMU SM SECURE SOCKETS LAYER (SSL) CERTIFICATE                        | 13      | 29.07.2020    |
|      |                   | SUBSCRIBER AGREEMENT (FRM.01.27)   | _       |               |
| 5    | PUBLIC            | GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) İPTAL BAŞVURU<br>FORMU (FRM.01.10)<br>(KAMU SM SECURE SOCKETS LAYER (SSL)<br>REVOCATION REQUEST FORM) | 6       | 11.05.2020    |
| 6    | PUBLIC            | GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) BAŞVURU FORMU<br>(FRM.01.11)<br>(KAMU SM SECURE SOCKETS LAYER (SSL)<br>APPLICATION FORM)              | 14      | 29.07.2020    |
| 7    | PUBLIC            | GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) FAALİYET TAKİP<br>FORMU (FRM.01.12)<br>(KAMU SM SECURE SOCKETS LAYER (SSL) ACTIVITY<br>TRACKING FORM) | 3       | 02.05.2019    |
| 8    | PUBLIC            | GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) VEKALET FORMU<br>(FRM.01.18)<br>(KAMU SM SECURE SOCKETS LAYER (SSL)<br>PROCURATORSHIP FORM)           | 6       | 04.09.2020    |



| 9  | PUBLIC  | KAMU SM GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) SAHİBİ<br>TAAHHÜTNAMESİ (FRM.01.20)   | 9  | 29.07.2020 |
|----|---------|--|----|------------|
| 5  | 1002.0  | (KAMU SM SECURE SOCKETS LAYER (SSL) CERTIFICATE<br>SUBSCRIBER AGREEMENT)   | 5  |            |
| 10 | PUBLIC  | KAMU SM GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKA (SSL) HİZMETİ<br>YÜKÜMLÜLÜKLERİ (FRM.01.21)<br>KAMU SM SECURE SOCKETS LAYER (SSL) CERTIFICATE | 5  | 17.10.2019 |
| 10 |         | SERVICE REPRESENTATIONS AND LIABILITIES<br>(FRM.01.28)   | 2  | 17.10.2019 |
| 11 | PUBLIC  | MÜŞTERİ ŞİKAYET YÖNETİMİ PROSEDÜRÜ (PRO.01.01)<br>(CUSTOMER COMPLAINT MANAGEMENT<br>PROCEDURE)                                 | 1  | 24.08.2020 |
| 12 | PUBLIC  | BİLGİ GÜVENLİĞİ POLİTİKASI (POL.03.01)<br>(INFORMATION SECURITY POLICY)  | 16 | 22.06.2020 |
| 13 | PRIVATE | SSL TEMİN SÜRECİ (SUR.01.02)<br>(SSL SUPPLY PROCESS)   | 2  | 02.09.2020 |
| 14 | PRIVATE | SSL İPTAL SÜRECİ (SUR.01.03)<br>(SSL REVOCATION PROCESS)   | 1  | 02.09.2020 |
| 15 | PUBLIC  | SONLANDIRMA PLANI (PLN.01.01)<br>(TERMINATION PLAN)  | 2  | 01.09.2020 |
| 16 | PRIVATE | ROL VE SORUMLULUKLAR YÖNERGESİ (YON.03.09)<br>(ROLES AND RESPONSIBILITIES INSTRUCTION)   | 32 | 21.08.2020 |
| 17 | PRIVATE | ERİŞİM YÖNETİM POLİTİKASI (POL.03.11)<br>(ACCESS MANAGEMENT POLICY)  | 19 | 27.09.2018 |
| 18 | PRIVATE | YEDEKLEME YÖNETİM POLİTİKASI (POL.03.13)<br>(BACKUP MANAGEMENT POLICY)   | 14 | 25.09.2018 |
| 19 | PRIVATE | ANAHTAR YÖNETİMİ PROSEDÜRÜ (PRO.03.12)<br>(KEY MANAGEMENT PROCEDURE)   | 1  | 25.09.2018 |
| 20 | PRIVATE | ANAHTAR ÜRETİMİ VE İMHA FORMU (FRM.01.25)<br>(KEY CREATION AND EXTERMINATION FORM)   | 2  | 07.09.2020 |
| 21 | PRIVATE | TEKNİK AÇIKLIK YÖNETİM POLİTİKASI (POL.03.12)<br>(TECHNICAL VULNERABILITY MANAGEMENT POLICY)                                   | 1  | 04.07.2018 |
| 22 | PRIVATE | İŞ SÜREKLİLİĞİ YÖNERGESİ (YON.03.04)<br>(BUSINESS CONTINUITY PLAN)   | 22 | 15.10.2019 |
| 23 | PRIVATE | VARLIK YÖNETIM POLITIKASI (POL.03.07)<br>(ASSET MANAGEMENT POLICY)   | 6  | 03.07.2018 |
| 24 | PRIVATE | BİLGİ VARLIKLARI PROSEDÜRÜ (PRO.03.03)<br>(INFORMATION ASSETS PROCEDURE)   | 08 | 20.02.2020 |
| 25 | PRIVATE | RİSK YÖNETİM POLİTİKASI (POL.03.06)<br>(RISK MANAGEMENT POLICY)  | 7  | 21.06.2018 |
| 26 | PRIVATE | FİZİKSEL VE ÇEVRESEL GÜVENLİK POLİTİKASI<br>(POL.03.16)<br>(PYHSICAL AND ENVIROMENTAL SECURITY POLICY)                         | 12 | 09.07.2018 |
| 27 | PRIVATE | DİSİPLİN YÖNERGESİ (YON.03.07)<br>(DISCIPLINARY INSTRUCTION)   | 02 | 13.08.2020 |
| 28 | PRIVATE | İMHA EDİLEN VARLIK KAYIT FORMU (FRM.03.14)<br>(DESTROYED ASSET REGISTRATION FORM)  | 03 | 11.07.2018 |
| 29 | PRIVATE | DEĞİŞİKLİK YÖNETİM PROSEDÜRÜ (PRO.03.09)<br>(CHANGE MANAGEMENT PROCEDURE)  | 14 | 27.09.2018 |
| 30 | PRIVATE | SIKILAŞTIRMA PROSEDÜRÜ (PRO.03.05)<br>(HARDENING PROCEDURE)  | 03 | 28.09.2018 |
| 31 | PRIVATE | SİSTEM TEMİN, İŞLETİM, BAKIM VE GÜVENLİĞİ<br>PROSEDÜRÜ (PRO.03.08)   | 07 | 23.10.2019 |



|    |         | (SYSTEM PROCUREMENT, OPERATION,<br>MAINTENANCE AND SAFETY PROCEDURE)  |    |            |
|----|---------|---|----|------------|
| 32 | PRIVATE | BİLGİ GÜVENLİĞİ İHLAL OLAYI YÖNETİM PROSEDÜRÜ<br>(PRO.03.01)<br>(INFORMATION SECURITY INCIDENT MANAGEMENT<br>PROCEDURE) | 11 | 04.08.2020 |
| 33 | PRIVATE | İŞ SÜREKLİLİĞİ YÖNETİM POLİTİKASI (POL.03.08)<br>( <b>BUSINESS CONTINUITY MANAGEMENT POLICY)</b>                        | 07 | 26.09.2018 |
| 34 | PRIVATE | GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) TEMİN SÜRECİ<br>KONTROL LİSTESİ (FRM.01.37)<br>(SSL SUPPLY PROCESS CHECKLIST)          | 01 | 07.09.2020 |
| 5  | PUBLIC  | GÜVENLİ SUNUCU SERTİFİKASI (SSL) İPTAL KONTROL<br>LİSTESİ (FRM.01.36)<br>(SSL REVOCATION CHECKLIST)                     | 01 | 07.09.2020 |

# Other references of the Organization:

|           | Distinguished Name and SHA256 fingerprint   |
|-----------|---|
| Reference | Content   |
| Root CA   | CN = TUBITAK Kamu SM SSL Kok Sertifikasi - Surum 1<br>OU = Kamu Sertifikasyon Merkezi - Kamu SM<br>O = Turkiye Bilimsel ve Teknolojik Arastirma Kurumu - TUBITAK<br>L = Gebze - Kocaeli<br>C = TR             |
|           | SHA-256 Fingerprint: 46EDC3689046D53A453FB3104AB80DCAEC658B2660EA1629DD7E867990648716   |
| Sub CA    | CN = TUBITAK Kamu SM SSL Sertifika Hizmet Saglayicisi - Surum 1<br>OU = Kamu Sertifikasyon Merkezi - Kamu SM<br>O = Turkiye Bilimsel ve Teknolojik Arastirma Kurumu - TUBITAK<br>L = Gebze- Kocaeli<br>C = TR |
|           | SHA-256 Fingerprint: BF32DA954571659AAF715C13EE703E3643DFCBAEEE2D82110CA68EB57CB67CE0   |

# Documentation examined, descriptive of physical environments and infrastructure in scope:

| Item                          | Туре  |
|-------------------------------|---|
| IT Infrastructure             | CMDB and Network Topology documentation and registrations |
| Disaster Recovery             | Procedures and instructions and registrations             |
| Physical and logical security | Procedures and instructions and registrations             |

Outcome of the review of the previous audits findings<sup>3</sup>: X positive negative (ref. findings: )

**Use of the trust mark and the certificate:** Complies Do not complies (ref. findings: )

# Confirmation of the Organization data declared to KIWA CERMET Italia (number of sites and employees):

Yes No (Indicate the changes):

# Consistency between the sites and the purpose of the certificate and the information included in the Organization registration certificate

Yes No (Indicate the changes):

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> To be performed e.g. for verification of transfer audit from another CAB.



# Confirmation of the Certificate (Scope, Addresses, Sites):

Yes No (indicate the changes or use specific form attached to the report)

# Total number of Category 1 (Major) Non-conformities: 0

## Total number of Category 2 (Minor) Non-conformities: 0

## Number of Non-conformities still not closed from previous audits: 0

The Organization must conduct an analysis of the root causes of non-conformities and communicate to Kiwa Cermet Italia the treatment and the corrective actions defined to solve the non-conformities within 20 days after the completion of this audit.

The implementation of the corrective actions and the closure of the Non-conformities will be verified in accordance with the PSC 05SF Certification Regulations and under the conditions approved by the Audit Group Manager indicated in the NON-CONFORMITY MANAGEMENT – MOD PO 31C module.

## References to the implementation of the security risk analysis:

Internally designed and developed EBA RISK SECURITY MANAGEMENT SYSTEM based on enhanced ISO 31000 specification and ISO/IEC 27001 Annex A controls.

## Period of time Audit Date Interval: from 2019-10-25 to 2020-09-16.

## On Site Audit Date Interval: from 2020-09-07 to 2020-09-16.

#### Details of Audit time:

| Activities                 | Expended time (Days) |
|----------------------------|----------------------|
| Document review            | 1                    |
| Risk analysis verification | 1                    |
| On site audit              | 11                   |
| Reporting                  | 1                    |

## Audit methodologies adopted:

| Activities                   | Description  |  |
|------------------------------|--|--|
| Survey methodology           | All processes were submitted to audit with the methodology specified<br>Kiwa Cermet Italia Regulation for the certification of Trust services PSC<br>05_SF Rev. 3 2018-02-26 |  |
|                              | The audit is a full audit, and the following parts of the criteria were applied: Part 1 (NCP+, OVCP) and Part 2 (Requirements for trust service providers)                   |  |
| Sampling methodology         | AQL (ISO 2859-1:1999 for acceptability levels 1,00%)   |  |
| Performed tests and controls | On Samples in Registration Authority and Certification Authority:<br>Request of new subscriptions (RA) and issues of new certificates (CA)                                   |  |

**Organizational Context and Management Commitment:** (also indicate any significant changes and the degree of maturity of the services/processes being certified)

- High commitment of Management
- Very high skill of all personnel involved in scope
- Use of first class devices
- High quality of internal developed applications both for SSL certificate testing and for general management
- Well managed system documentation with recurrent updates and revisions
- The improved eBA MS collect all the informations on the system status



# **Opportunities for Improvement:**

– none

**Criticalities:** (Report any situation that have conditioned the proper conduct of the audit, e.g. not access to staff / locations / information necessary to achieve the audit objectives)

- No criticalities

Improvement of Capabilities and Conformity Preservations Guarantees:

 Management motivations, personnel skills and continuous infrastructure enhancements ensure the maintenance of conformity and improvement of service performance

Services or activities included in the scope of certification and managed in outsourcing:

- Kamu SM Site and Datacenter managed by parent Company TÜBİTAK BİLGEM, with mutual formalized agreements
- PKI CA Software ESYA developed and maintained by group Company TÜBİTAK BİLGEM UEKAE MA3 with formalized agreement

| The Organization exposes Reserves:  | Yes <sup>4</sup>      | 🔀 No                                      |      |
|---|-----------------------|---|------|
| Satisfies the conditions for the emission of the                              | e certificate of cont | formity to the applicable standard: 🔀 Yes | 🗌 No |
| We declare that the the audit was performed as a full audit and in OVCP Level |                       |   |      |

We declare that the Organization subjected to the audit:

- IS COMPLIANT with the rules of the Accreditation scheme (Accredia Circular of 2017-03-27 prot.: DC2017SSV046), to the requirements of the applicable standards of the ETSI EN 319 Series and to the REGULATION (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council stated July, 23<sup>th</sup> 2014 on electronic identification and trusted services for electronic transactions, in the internal market that revoke the Directive 1999/93/EC, with particular reference to Articles 13, 15, 19, 24, 28, 29, 30 and 32 to 45 and Annexes, where relevant with the services in scope of the certification.
- □ IS NOT COMPLIANT with the rules of the Accreditation scheme (Accredia Circular of 2017-03-27 prot.: DC2017SSV046), to the requirements of the applicable standards of the ETSI EN 319 Series and to the REGULATION (EU) No 910/2014 of the European Parliament and of the Council stated July, 23<sup>th</sup> 2014 on electronic identification and trusted services for electronic transactions, in the internal market that revoke the Directive 1999/93/EC, with particular reference to Articles 13, 15, 19, 24, 28, 29, 30 and 32 to 45 and Annexes, where relevant with the services in scope of the certification. (ref. non conformities in this audit referenced to in the MOD PO 31C modules attached to this report).

DOCUMENTS ATTACHED to this report and consigned to Kiwa Cermet Italia:

Audit Program **MOD PO31** Non Conformity from previous audit nr. 0 of which closed nr. 0

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> The Organisation must formalize the reserves with formal communication, stamped and signed, to the Representative of Kiwa Cermet Italia